MISSION THROUGH JOURNALISM:
Elizabeth Hayes and the Annals of Our Lady of the Angels

Submitted by
Pauline Joan Shaw, B.Ed.St.

A thesis submitted in total fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

School of Theology (Qld.)
Faculty of Arts & Science

Australian Catholic University

Date of submission 30th June 2006
Statement of Sources

This thesis contains no material published elsewhere or extracted in whole or in part from a thesis by which I have qualified for or been awarded another degree or diploma.

No other person's work has been used without due acknowledgment in the main text of the thesis.

This thesis has not been submitted for the award of any degree or diploma in any other tertiary institution.

All research procedures reported in the thesis receive the approval of the relevant Ethics/Safety Committees (where required).

Acknowledgements

Acknowledgement is due to Sr. Marian Bandille and Sr. Helene Byrne who ensured that the Annals of Our Lady of the Angels, produced by Hayes in her lifetime, were transferred, in the Roman Motherhouse of the Missionary Franciscan Sisters archives, from fragile printed material to CD-ROM thus providing easier access and transportation. Special thanks to Dr. Patrick Colbourne who provided numerous introductions to enable research visits to European Franciscan archives and libraries. I acknowledge some initial translations by Sr. Bernadette Howes on selections of a few Italian nineteenth-century Franciscan journals that assisted research in Rome.

Thanks are due to librarians and archivists in Minnesota, especially to those in religious houses, diocesan offices and in historical societies in St. Paul, Bloomington, St. Cloud, Little Falls, St. Joseph and Brainerd; also to those at the Santa Barbara Mission, California. Acknowledgement is also due regarding selected sections and references from Mario Finauro's 1997 doctoral dissertation on the Italian Franciscan Annals (1870-1900) that were translated by Sr. M. Jeanne La Spina in Perth to assist research.

Particular thanks for the initial assistance received at Notre Dame University, Fremantle, where Dr. Catherine Kovesi was appointed as supervisor. Circumstances changed yet there was continuity of supervision through the University of Melbourne. For the final stage, acknowledgement is due to my principal supervisor, Dr. Rosa MacGinley and to co-supervisor, Dr. Chris Hanlon at Australian Catholic University.

Name: PAULINE JOAN SHAW                     Signature
Abstract

Nineteenth-century periodical literature, recognised today as a distinctive and significant feature of Victorian public communication, is voluminous. Yet in order to argue that the editor-publisher Elizabeth Hayes made a significant contribution to evangelising journalism, this thesis finds it imperative to situate her work within the enormous outpourings of the Victorian periodical press. For a Victorian woman to succeed in journalism was impressive and this investigation argues that Hayes capably led an international journal of religious ideas to stability and longevity.

The investigation will show that Hayes, foundress of an organisation which edited, published and distributed a Franciscan monthly journal - to date scarcely investigated - was prepared prior to 1872 for her subsequent journalistic mission. The argument that Hayes made a significant contribution to nineteenth-century Catholic journalism appears strongest when evidence of the immense power of the press for good and evil is provided. This is accomplished hopefully through an examination of both secular and religious periodical literature and in particular by situating Hayes' output within this milieu. The argument is further strengthened through a detailed examination of the actual contents of Hayes' Annals of Our Lady of the Angels, of the numerous contributions to her Annals and of the editing, publishing and distribution methods which she employed in her mission.

The argument shows Hayes' publication to be a significant contribution in the literary field to a growing body of research on late nineteenth-century professional women who enriched society with religious periodicals. The thesis argues that Hayes provided matter of interest to general readers and presented the progress and development of the Franciscan Order. The journal's range of themes adds weight to the growing body of evidence of how women's topics varied in the Victorian religious periodical press. It is argued that Hayes' diffusion of good literature was an authentic medium of evangelisation over twenty-one years. As writer, editor, publisher, manager of printing and distribution, it is argued that Hayes was a significant contributor to the Apostolate of the Press and that she used her journal as a tool of both adult education and entertainment.
Table of Contents

Introduction 1-17
(i) Objectives, Relevant Research and Methodology
(ii) Past Scholarship on Hayes
(iii) Argument, Research Plan and Restricted Approach
(iv) Resources and Structure

Chapter 1. Overview and Experiences that Shaped Hayes’ Life 18-47
(i) Family background and Guernsey. (1823 – c.1843/5)
(ii) Life in England - Oxford/Wantage. (c.1843/5 – 1856)
(iii) London - Greenwich/Blackheath, Bayswater. (1856 - 58)
(iv) Experiences in Glasgow and Jamaica. (1858 - 63)
(v) After Jamaica & before Belle Prairie. (1863 - 1872)
(vi) USA and Italy. (1872-94)

Chapter 2. Nineteenth-Century Periodical Literature – ‘Immense power for good or evil’ 48-66

Secular periodicals:
(i) Setting the scene
(ii) Irreligious publications
(iii) Insight through a major Victorian journalist
(iv) Age of the Periodical
(v) Central Minnesota Press

Religious periodicals: – Introduction

Non-Catholic religious periodicals
(i) Early in the century and 1830s
(ii) 1840s-60s
(iii) Century’s last quarter


Introduction and Hayes’ situation

England (i) Background
(ii) The Lamp
(iii) The Month
(iv) The Messenger

France (i) French influences on Hayes
(ii) Earlier French literary activities
(iii) French influences on the press of other countries
(iv) Missionary activities linked to periodicals

Italy (i) Background, including research problem
(ii) Pius IX’s pontificate and Rosminianism
(iii) Pope, Mermillod and Hayes’ Annals
(iv) Leo XIII in the ‘Age of Encyclicals’
(v) Fra Ludovico da Casoria and Cardinal Parocchi
Chapter 4. Hayes and the Catholic Periodical Press in America 95-113

(i) Ave Maria, Hudson and Hayes links
(ii) New York influence
(iii) Hecker, Brownson and Hayes connections
(iv) Irish-American relations and ‘Knownothingism’
(v) German migrant contribution

Chapter 5. Situating Hayes in Franciscan Periodical Literature 114-35

(i) Terms and meanings
(ii) European Franciscan periodical literature before 1874
(iii) Franciscan periodicals 1874-94 – Europe, Canada, America
(iv) Hayes’ Annals and the English Franciscan Annals

Chapter 6. Contents of Hayes’ Annals 136-69

Themes for the general reader:
(i) Original tales
(ii) Historical and biographical sketches
(iii) Lives of saints and contemporary holy people
(iv) Pilgrimage accounts
(v) Stories of missionary enterprise
(vi) Articles on devotions and Catholic life

Themes for the Franciscan reader:
(vii) Major Franciscan saints’ lives
(viii) Franciscan literature
(ix) Franciscan stories
(x) Franciscan devotions

Chapter 7. The Editor and Her Contributors 170-87

(i) Women Religious
(ii) Clergymen

Chapter 8. The Editor and More Contributors 188-212

(i) Franciscan Tertiaries
(ii) Other Laity

Chapter 9. Challenge of Production and Distribution 213-34

(i) Editing skills
(ii) Printing of words and illustrations
(iii) Publishing - including finance.
(iv) Distribution methods
(v) Readers

Conclusion 235-40

Appendices 241-56

Bibliography 257-72
List of Illustrations: From the Annals of Our Lady of the Angels

2.1 i Jesus advanced in wisdom and age … 1887, vol XII, no i.
   ii The Patronage and Cultus of the Most Blessed … 1890, vol XV, no xii.

2.2 i St. Veronica Galiani. 1884, vol IX, no i.
   iii St. Philip Neri. 1885, vol X, no v.
   iv St. Francis Preaching by the Wayside. 1886, vol XI, no iv.

2.3 i A Pilgrimage … Sanctuary of the Stigmata of St. Francis. 1886, vol XI, no ix.
   ii St. Elizabeth of Hungary. 1886, vol XI, no i.

2.4 i Vera Effigie di St Antonio di Padova. 1890, vol XV, no xi.
   ii True Likeness of St. Anthony of Padua. 1893, vol XVIII, no vi.
   iii Societas S. Antonii de Padua. Printed often.

2.5 Piazza Navona & the Church of St. Agnes, V. & M., Rome. 1890, vol XV, no i.

2.6 The Sanctuary of the Portiuncula, in Basilica of St Mary of Angels, Assisi. 1890, vol XV, no viii.

2.7 Small religious illustrations - trumpeting angel, passion symbols, angels worshipping the Eucharist, children with a guardian angel and Mary - in a number of issues.

2.8 Three Marian illustrations from monthly first pages. Printed often.

2.9 Hayes’ Annals cover with her Franciscan coat of arms. 1882, vol VII, no xii.

2.10* i French Annales Franciscaines’ cover. 1863.
   ii Irish Franciscan Tertiary’s cover. 1877.

2.11 Debernys’ St. Francis, St. Clare and St. Anthony - in a number of issues.

2.12 Debernys’ symbols for Mary, Eucharist, Papacy and floral pictures. Printed often.

2.13 i Debernys - The Nativity. 1890, vol XV, no xii. 1892, vol XVII, no iii.
   ii Debernys - The Angel of Prayers. 1893, vol XVIII, no iv.

   ii Spagna’s Assumption illustration. 1886, vol XI, no v; 1890, vol XV, no ix.

* (Exception – not in Hayes’ Annals.)
INTRODUCTION

Beware of laying down your pen. Unquestionably writing is a heavy vocation, but the press has become too important an agent to forsake one’s post. Let us write, not for glory or immortality, but for Jesus Christ. Let us take up our pen as a cross.¹

These words of Henri Lacordaire, famous nineteenth-century French Dominican religious writer and preacher, express the spirit of Elizabeth Hayes who, this thesis argues, was a significant contributor to late nineteenth-century evangelising journalism, sometimes called the Apostolate of the Press. This spirit of Hayes was exemplified in her editorship of a monthly religious periodical, the Annals of Our Lady of the Angels, whose publication she initiated in Minnesota in the United States in 1874. Hayes, aware of the strong anti-Christian capabilities displayed in much of the nineteenth-century press, wrote:

These capabilities have been recognized by the enemies of Christianity, and they have turned the Press into a huge instrument for the propagation of infidel, immoral, and revolutionary principles. In Paris alone, there are published daily, one million four hundred thousand newspapers; and of this number, not more than fifty-six thousand can be found that are not avowedly anti-religious, and directly hostile to Christianity. The aim which the Apostolic Press proposes to itself is this, that the Press, now the instrument of perdition, should be made the instrument of salvation.²

Periodicals came to constitute a literature in their own right in the nineteenth century. The periodical press not only increased output on such topics as politics, literature, science and art, but also multiplied the number of publications related to other professions and occupations.³ The term ‘periodical press’ covers newspapers as well as journals; however this investigation will confine its inquiry mainly to periodical

¹ Lacordaire’s words in a letter of 1839 in H. L. Sidney Lear, Henri Dominique Lacordaire: A Biographical Sketch (Waterloo Place, London: Rivingtons, 1882), 152.
² Elizabeth Hayes, "The Apostolate of the Press", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XV, no. iii (1890): 74. Hayes used Roman numerals for numbering volumes and issues so this will be retained throughout.
journals and will refer to newspapers only when relevant. Since the inquiry’s main argument is that Hayes made a significant contribution to the late nineteenth-century Catholic periodical press in the English language, it seems necessary, besides analysing her contribution, to situate it in the milieu of contemporary journalism. The method through which this will be achieved is through an examination of the so-called “power for good or evil” in nineteenth-century secular and religious periodical literature. The decision to adopt this approach, after exploration of press developments, was affirmed for the writer by Hayes’ own 1890 articles on the apostolate of the press.

Scholars point out that the potential of nineteenth-century periodicals as a rich field for research has scarcely been touched and quote renowned authority, John S. North, in this area. As this is the first full analysis of Hayes’ Annals, this explorer has aimed to uncover the journal’s potential yet has been cautious because of the magnitude of the surrounding journalistic field. The inquiry proceeds according to a careful plan so as not to be engulfed by the volume of the Victorian periodical press. The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels (hereafter called Annals) is used as the primary source to elucidate and explore Hayes’ contribution to the Apostolate of the Press and her specific commitment to the Catholic and Franciscan periodical press. The research endeavours to inquire into Hayes’ mission through study of the literary influences in her life’s experiences, examination of the nineteenth-century milieu of journalism, consideration of her journal’s content, including comparison with contemporaries, assessment of contributors to her periodical and interpretation of methods used in its production.

Objectives, Relevant Research and Methodology

In view of evangelising movements in nineteenth-century church history and in sections of the Victorian periodical press, the thesis presents Hayes’ illustrated monthly journal as an authentic tool of the Apostolic Press. By examining her twenty-one years, as editor-publisher and manager of both production and distribution, the thesis endeavours to show that Hayes achieved her twofold aim. This two-pronged aim was to provide ‘matter of interest to the general reader’ and to present ‘the progress and development of the Franciscan Order - its missions, new foundations

4 Ibid., 3.
and good works, as well as the past history, legends and traditions of the Franciscan Movement’. In the great ‘age of journalism’ Hayes, it is argued, was influenced by other religious journals and was in turn successful in the use of her journal as a tool of evangelisation. Three nineteenth-century characteristics - English conversions to Catholicism, missionary activities and the expansion of the Franciscan Movement - are strong threads that weave their way through the fabric of Hayes’ publication.

The periodical’s Franciscan title conveyed to readers its association with the Italian town of Assisi where the Franciscan Movement was born under the leadership of St. Francis in the thirteenth century. Hayes had a special love for this sacred place and for the little chapel of Our Lady of the Angels in which St. Francis and his followers first gathered. Hence she called her Franciscan periodical by the chapel’s name. It is argued that Hayes - an avid reader in English and French in such disparate places as Guernsey, Oxford, London, Glasgow, Jamaica, France, Minnesota and Rome - strengthened her literary talents before applying them in the publication of the Annals. At the time when ‘periodicals informed, instructed and amused virtually all of the people in the many segments of Victorian life’, it is shown here that Hayes used her Annals, not only as a channel of adult education and spiritual formation, but also as a means of entertainment. Hayes was aware of contributions made by her Oxford musical forebears to pre-Victorian publications. Her own life’s experiences brought her into a circle of literary friends among whom were household names of the Oxford Movement such as Manning, Newman, Faber, Pusey and Fullerton.

When Hayes died, her companions saw her mission of spreading the Christian message through the Annals as one of her greatest achievements. Her obituary described her as a foundress who had contributed greatly to the ‘propagation of good books’. Obviously, her religious Sisters had not read modern research on Victorian periodicals and the ‘power of the nineteenth-century periodical press’, but they knew that Hayes had recognised and made use of the power of the press. Some women launched themselves into professional writing for fame, fortune or other reasons but Hayes, it is argued, saw the potential for good in the press and used it to assist those

6 Vann and VanArsdel, eds., Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society, 3.
8 Vann and VanArsdel, eds., Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society, 8.
readers who desired soundly resourced, pleasantly presented, Catholic reading material.

This inquiry aims to show, after examining selected contents of secular, religious/church, Catholic and Franciscan journals, that the journal contents selected by Hayes reveal much about the editor herself. Like many nineteenth-century religious editors, Hayes did not sign or initial her personal contributions, so her choice of content and her selection of contributors appear crucial in gaining a fresh understanding of this woman and her mission. Recently, Elizabeth Jay claimed that ‘women’s contribution to and control of religious periodicals, magazines, and tract production would repay more detailed attention’. It is anticipated that this thesis will be an addition to this field of scholarship.

Current scholarship indicates that the massive volume of Victorian periodical literature can be daunting and Michael Wolff’s frustrating search serves as a warning. Wolff called for a comprehensive subject directory to complement the existing Indexes of Poole and Wellesley, titling his investigation of the riches of periodical history (1824-1900) “Charting the Golden Stream”. After twenty-three years he had to give up, crushed under the weight of the statistics, and his paper became known as “Damming the Golden Stream”. Continued growth in current research into nineteenth-century journals indicates room for another newcomer to this lively field.

While the cultural significance of the periodical press had been recognised earlier, a new wave of systematic indexing and listing of serial productions began in the 1960s, building on Poole’s *Index to Periodical Literature* (1853) which indexed Victorian materials by subject from 1802. Serious scholarship was initiated through the monumental *Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals* (1966-89) which produced tables of contents from the major Victorian periodicals, a partial author index but no subject index. This period witnessed the growth in acknowledgment that individual periodicals were legitimate objects of study. Books on these individual periodicals were published, not just on ‘higher journalism’ including such examples as the

---

Edinburgh, the Quarterly, Westminster and Blackwoods, but also on a multitude of more popular, middle class, monthly journals that also included fiction. Among this latter genre were journals like the well known Cornhill and Macmillan’s Magazine. Investigators may struggle at times with the varying classifications they encounter. When Shattock wrote about Arnold Bennett’s Journalism for Women: a Practical Guide in 1998, she referred to a cluster of ‘high-class general magazines’ and included Blackwood’s, Macmillan’s, the Cornhill, and Longman’s yet in another study Blackwood’s Magazine, Macmillan’s, Cornhill and others are labelled ‘upper middle class’. The Waterloo Directory of English Newspapers and Periodicals (1800 to 1900) commenced its scholarly contributions to studies of Victorian periodicals in 1969 and is invaluable. Today its availability on-line and on CD-ROM provides some 125,000 titles and descriptions achieved through its five-stage development under John S. North’s editorship. One critic, Scott Bennet in Investigating Victorian Journalism, called it ‘the best model now available for the bibliographic representation of Victorian periodicals’. The method applied in this directory’s compilation was the gathering of data from each journal’s issues and from secondary sources in order to establish up to 26 fields of information per title. The Waterloo Directory employed and refers to Indexes; for example, the Poole and Wellesley Indexes - subject lists, Union lists (Victorian serials), catalogues, advertising sales lists and bibliographies. Extensive cross-referencing between related titles and locations is employed as well as indexes according to subjects, places of publication, people - including editors, contributors, printers, proprietors and publishers - and also issuing bodies.

Current research continues to unravel the ubiquitous nature of nineteenth-century periodical literature from the 1950s work of Richard D. Altick and later research by J. Don Vann and Rosemary T. VanArsdel to the published papers of the Research Society for Victorian Periodicals and on to journals explored in The Victorian Web. Present-day scholars such as Joanne Shattock, Christopher Kent and Judy McKenzie have published widely on Victorian journalism while Barbara Garlick and Margaret Harris among other works have edited Victorian Journalism: Exotic and

14 Ibid. accessed.
Domestic (1998). The Australian Victorian Studies Association, as well as companion associations overseas, has added significantly to the current literature on journalism history. Examples are found in 1998 with the scholarly research of Carol Bock on “Victorian Periodicals” and Catharine Vaughan-Pow’s on “Girls’ Periodicals and the Windsor Magazine”, while a 1999 publication points out Helen Debenham’s investigation on the Victoria Magazine.15 Examples of twenty-first century scholarship are Valerie Sanders’ publication on Martineau and the Edinburgh Review,16 Graham Law’s Serializing Fiction in the Victorian Press17 and Kate Jackson’s research on George Newnes.18

This thesis made extensive use of the Internet Library of Early Journals, a project completed in 1999 by the Universities of Birmingham, Leeds, Manchester and Oxford. This project concentrated on three eighteenth and three nineteenth century journals, all of which were published for more than twenty years. These included the Gentleman’s Magazine, distinguished by its eclectic content, and the famous Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine, which started in 1817 as a Tory rival to the Whig Edinburgh Review. This thesis seeks to situate Hayes’ Annals among contemporary publications, emphasising the power of the press to promote good or evil. To effect this, a selection of significant Victorian journalistic personalities, writing for both non-Catholic and Catholic periodicals from Hayes’ lifetime, was examined. The researcher then assembled a dictionary of nineteenth-century Franciscan publications, which is a significant original contribution to scholarship in that such an attempt has never before been made. Finally, the thesis contends that Hayes’ Annals is an outstanding example of nineteenth-century Catholic journalism.

While religious periodicals, including the Catholic contribution, have been part of overall Victorian studies, a classic example of scholarship on religious periodicals is that of Josef L. Altholz, The Religious Press in Britain (1989), which postdates the scholarship of Michael Wolff and others.19 Altholz acknowledges Houghton’s

Wellesley Index yet claims that he combined his research with North’s Waterloo Directory and, after many difficulties, estimated at the time the existence of some 3,000 religious periodicals. Armstrong and Blake also acknowledge the importance of the Wellesley Index and explain that their microfilm primary resources supplement previous Victorian journals on microfilm with many religious periodicals located in their work. Of special assistance to the religious periodical investigator is their guidebook which includes religious/philosophical affiliation, manifesto, comparative contemporary titles and lengthy overviews for all reels concluded by 2002.

While studies on general Franciscan literature are overwhelming, attention to scholarship on nineteenth-century Franciscan periodicals is sadly lacking. The New York Franciscan University of St. Bonaventure lists in its periodical collection just one in Hayes’ lifetime while lack of research was evident in Roman archives with the discovery of only one dissertation on the Italian Franciscan Annals. This inquiry researched over thirty Franciscan periodicals (1874-94) and through this has developed the directory for this study mentioned above. The dearth of research on Hayes’ Annals means that to date no comparison with any contemporary periodicals, secular, religious, Catholic or Franciscan, has been attempted.

Past Scholarship on Hayes

In the past 100 years three biographies have been published on Hayes’ life as religious foundress but each has given very limited space to her journal, with no overall assessment of her publishing achievement. This research aims to go beyond the formal biography and to discover a more fully rounded image of Hayes through her role as a woman committed to taking advantage of the power of the press for spreading Christian values and beliefs. It is time to outline these three biographies and consider the limited state of past scholarship on the Annals.

Hayes’ first biographer was Angelica Switz Chaffee who, within months of Hayes’ death in 1894, had circulated through the Annals a sketch on Hayes’ life. Extending the sketch years later, Chaffee wrote the Memories of the Life and Works of Mother

20 Ibid., 2-4.
21 Isobel Armstrong and Laurel Brake eds., Nineteenth-Century British Periodicals (Reading, UK: Gale International Ltd, 2001), Microfilm & Guide.
Mary Ignatius of Jesus (hereafter called Memories). By 1954 these Memories had become the basis of an edited publication.23 Hayes’ most scholarly biography appears in the first half of Sr. Assumpta Ahles’ 1977 work, In the Shadow of His Wings - A History of the Franciscan Sisters.24 The most widely read biography, however, within the Institute of Missionary Franciscan Sisters and their Associates, was written by Brian de Breffny and entitled Unless the Seed Die - The Life of Elizabeth Hayes (Mother M. Ignatius O.S.F.) published in 1980.25 Each biography will be evaluated briefly for possible contribution to scholarship on Hayes’ publication.

To critique Chaffee’s writing it is important to look briefly at the person in view of later consequences. Born in 1843 in Enfield, Connecticut, Angelica Chaffee, before becoming a Franciscan novice with Hayes in 1876, had worked with a Chicago printing company. Besides helping Hayes in the printery, Chaffee often accompanied her on travels, was her secretary, and succeeded Hayes as Mother General of their Franciscan Sisterhood and editor of the Annals. Chaffee’s diary includes first-hand details of many experiences that she shared with Hayes, including facts about the Annals, and she used them when writing her Memories, completed around 1912. She treasured Hayes’ small diary which records her personal story from her Jamaican period onward.26 The Sisters who continued the Annals’ work were inspired by Chaffee’s fifty years retrospect through the private circulation of her Memories.27

The elderly Chaffee admitted that material to substantiate her work was unavailable at times, yet her literary contribution gave birth to further research. Hayes was loved by Chaffee – who described her admiration as - ‘almost to adoration’,28 strong words from one who had countless opportunities to see Hayes struggling with the stress of leadership and the strain of achieving editorial and publishing deadlines. Each

25 Brian de Breffny, Unless the Seed Die. The Life of Elizabeth Hayes (Mother M. Ignatius O.S.F.) Foundress of the Missionary Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception (Rome: Don Bosco Press, 1980). The initials O.S.F. represent Order of St. Francis but due to the large number of Franciscan Institutes some clarify their particular branch of the Third Order Regular by other initials. The Missionary Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception now use MFIC.
28 Ibid., 40.
biographer of Hayes has quoted, paraphrased and interpreted the *Memories* of Chaffee who wrote mainly for her religious Sisters, while this present inquiry has been undertaken for a wider audience. It is time to look at Chaffee's work with new eyes and to extract from her original manuscript new understandings about Hayes and the *Annals*. As companion, co-worker and confidante for nearly twenty years, Chaffee knew Hayes better than anyone, so her observations in relation to the *Annals* are carefully analysed.

Ahles' biography of Hayes, *In the Shadow of His Wings*, is a professional publication and its biographical dimension incorporates her earlier thesis.29 Ahles called the *Annals*' work an ‘apostolate which bore fruit for a hundred years, when it was finally decided … that its mission had been fulfilled’.30 These words have influenced the title chosen for this thesis which hopefully will contribute also to new research on founding women and their mission in religious institutes. Ahles delved into the historical works of Folwell, Yzermans, Barry, Blegen and other historians of the American frontier and through these resources she portrays Minnesota’s remoteness and accompanying difficulties when Hayes founded her Belle Prairie convent and monthly periodical. In assembling data, Ahles relied heavily upon American and European archives, on personal letters, on formal letters granting permissions, on decrees and rescripts, diaries, memoirs and records and on institute registers but not on Hayes' *Annals*.31 This significant omission in the most authoritative research accomplished on Hayes and her mission confirms the need for new research.

Despite the centrality of the *Annals* to Hayes' life and personal mission, Ahles devotes only seven pages out of a total of 467 to a discussion of the *Annals*. Ahles quotes nine significant archival sources (which will be used later in this thesis) and appends explanatory footnotes that direct an inquirer to other primary resources. In her reference to the *Annals*, Ahles succinctly points out Chaffee’s memories of the *Annals*’ foundation, the early journals’ ecumenical nature, their serial features and their foreign missions content. Ahles describes the *Annals*, based on a portion of a contemporary *Brainerd Tribune* newspaper extract, as ‘a thirty-six page magazine,

---

29 Sr. M. Assumpta Ahles, "The Missionary Dream of Mother Mary Ignatius Hayes" (MA, St. Louis, 1968).
30 Ahles, *In the Shadow of His Wings*, 79.
gotten up in the neatest style of the printing art and printed on fine tinted book paper and is edited with marked ability’. In addressing the need for further research on Hayes’ periodical, it is of significance that Ahles devoted two pages to commentary on only six articles which appeared in 1874-75 while this inquiry will discuss many articles in the overall period of Hayes’ editorship, 1874-94.

Ahles sprinkles brief comments about the Annals concerning its expansion, the Sisters who looked after its distribution and its different printing premises. The text comments briefly on propaganda and revenue, ‘questing’ for the Annals, how ‘solicitors’ joined the newly formed Little Falls branch group with destabilising effects on the Annals’ apostolate and about the 1893 expansion of the printing-publishing quarters. This investigation will examine methods of production much more fully, but more importantly will analyse the Annals’ content, investigate themes and discover information on contributors.

Irish-born scholar Brian de Breffny, commissioned to write a history of the beginnings of Hayes’ Institute, produced Unless the Seed Die – The Life of Elizabeth Hayes. He was provided with research, completed previously by Franciscan scholars, Benignus Millet and Canice Mooney. De Breffny’s work portrays Hayes against the historical, social, cultural and religious background of her lifetime but without any reference to the periodical press. The author recognises Hayes as a remarkable woman who realised achievements outside the realm of the home in the Victorian male-dominated world. De Breffny sees Hayes not only as a woman faithful to her adopted Catholic faith and desirous to share it, but also as a goal-oriented woman who because of her particular personality could be a sign of contradiction. Regarding foreign missionary enterprises, de Breffny, like Ahles, discovered a woman with a ‘passionate determination’ and, despite overwhelming difficulties, a woman with an ability never to give up. This study plans not only to explore these qualities in Hayes as editor-publisher but also to reveal their contribution to journalistic outcomes.

While de Breffny’s text is the most popular of those discussed, his reference to Hayes’ Annals is basically in regard to surrounding events, which means that readers

32 Ahles, In the Shadow of His Wings, 86.
33 Ibid., 155-57, 174-75, 195.
34 Ibid., 79, 235-36, 239, 276-77.
are deprived of much understanding of this woman’s true greatness. The story of the ‘Zelatrices’, who distributed the journals and collected subscriptions, is essential to the total story so de Breffny admits that it was the ‘Zelatrices on whose work the whole Institute depended for its income’. De Breffny does quote the important papal Rescript of 1866 and the subsequent Brief which classified the publication and diffusion of the Annals as a ‘true work of Mercy’ and allowed the canvassing and distribution by nuns labouring as zelatrices. Attention is drawn to an 1890 letter from a zelatrix who wrote about her willingness to distribute the Annals. The letter gives some indication of this woman’s feelings as she walked the streets of New York, Boston and other towns in all kinds of weather. The publication emphasises that zelatrices believed their ministry of distributing the journal was part of a religious mission and this will be further addressed, along with related methods of publication and trans-Atlantic distribution. De Breffny wrote nothing on the hundreds of articles contained in Hayes’ periodical nor about Hayes often struggling with major institutional concerns, while she was also editor-publisher of the Annals. This inquiry aims not only to balance the omissions but also to investigate afresh another successful professional Victorian woman.

Argument, Research Plan and Restricted Approach

It is clear that there is a great lack of scholarship in regard to the whole organisation and publication of Hayes’ Annals, its contents and its contributors. While Danielle Julien and Marian Bandille have peeped directly into a small fraction of Hayes’ Annals, no real in-depth investigation exists. This inquiry reveals a dimension of Hayes that so far is unknown and unappreciated; it is one more of John S. North’s periodicals whose potential has ‘scarcely been touched’. In an ‘Age of Journalism’ it is difficult to imagine how Hayes launched a new monthly periodical successfully – a periodical that, as Chaffee wrote, ‘bore fruit in the establishment of the Association for the Propagation of Good Books’. It is believed that by situating the Annals in their nineteenth-century journalistic environment and by looking at them through the

35 de Breffny, Unless the Seed Die, 8.
36 Literally, a zelatrix was a woman filled with zeal, i.e., a devotee or service volunteer.
37 Ibid., 216.
38 Ibid., 217.
39 Ibid., 220.
windows of content, contributors and publication methods, new understandings and fresh scholarship will result. Hayes’ missionary contribution, it will be argued, was a genuine and fruitful part of the Apostolate of the Press, a contemporary movement that strove to counterbalance anti-Catholic publications. Aware of Catholic Church pronouncements on the use of the mass media in the task of evangelization, this writer's reason for researching Hayes’ neglected Annals is that the Annals appear worthy of consideration as an authentic tool of nineteenth-century evangelization.  

As this understanding is substantiated, it will raise Hayes not only to the level of producer of a transnational journal of ideas but also to a position reached only by few of her contemporaries, women who were both writers and religious foundresses. Other international nineteenth-century foundresses and writers were Elizabeth Lockhart, Margaret A. Cusack, Frances M. Taylor, Helen de Chappotin and Mary T. Ledochowska. Sugg wrote of Victorian English women writers, friends of Newman, including Charlotte Yonge, Harriet Mosley, Lady Georgiana Fullerton and Emilly Bowles. Hayes stands among contemporary English foundresses like Margaret Hallahan, Frances M. Taylor, Elizabeth Lockhart and Catherine Bathurst (the latter three being converts also). However this research aims to show Hayes, English convert and foundress, as also an apostle of the periodical press. In achieving this, it will mark a contribution in one area to the growing scholarship on remarkable nineteenth-century women. This investigation plans to show through Hayes’ Annals that she was a woman fired with an awareness of the importance of the periodical press and with a determination to ‘diffuse good books’. To support the main argument, the thesis will look first at Hayes’ life experiences and her circle of friends, as both prepared her for the role of editor and ‘foundress of an Association for the propagation of good books’. Numerous religious foundresses are associated with a particular city or country but Hayes did not settle down in one town, county, state or

42 Ibid., 13.
43 Lives of these women and accounts of their foundations and writings are available in their published congregational histories - Bayswater Franciscan Sisters, Our Lady of St. Joseph of Peace, Poor Servants of the Mother of God, Franciscan Missionaries of Mary and Missionary Sisters of St. Peter Claver, respectively.
country. Instead she moved from the known to the unknown, successively from centre to periphery to centre as her travels illustrate, in her search both to serve on a frontier and to stabilise her work.  

The next stage of the inquiry looks at the nineteenth-century milieu into which the 1874 *Annals* entered. The pulsing life of secular, religious, Catholic and Franciscan periodicals in English will be considered and interpreted. Selected content of the *Annals’* prose and poetry from 1874-1894 will be examined – the themes, structure and serials, along with examples of the type of content on the wider religious journal scene. An overview of the *Annals’* yearbooks and an explanation of extant material for consideration will be provided.

The research examines the contents of Hayes’ illustrated monthly periodical progressively through the lens of prose themes and serials, verse and other contributions. Besides the focus on the articles themselves, they are situated in the wider scene, making use of late nineteenth-century *Franciscan Annals*, other Franciscan periodicals, selected Catholic periodicals and to a lesser extent other religious and secular journals in English. In awareness of selected known nineteenth-century authors of English prose and poetry, an examination of the *Annals’* contributors is undertaken.

Hayes had a wide circle of literary friends by the time her first volume rolled off the Brainerd Press, so while she produced a Franciscan periodical her contributors came from near and far and from different walks of life. A few contributors to the *Annals* died before Hayes published their work. The thesis, through analysing the production methods employed by the editor, aims to discover how Hayes’ *Annals* achieved success and was fruitful in its mission. This is demonstrated by looking at the techniques, styles, printing methods, illustrations, publication methods and mode of personal distribution, as well as the Association of St. Anthony of Padua to which the *Annals’* readers belonged. In order to examine the *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels*, the thesis, as indicated above, situates Hayes' publication in the periodical literature of nineteenth-century society. However, while accepting the now substantiated fact that the circulation of journals and newspapers was larger and probably more

influential than nineteenth-century printed books, this inquiry has had to be selective. It is restricted to selections from secular, religious, Catholic and Franciscan journals, respectively.

The term, ‘annals’, has a long religious history and a comment on it and related terms, ‘journals’, ‘periodicals’ and ‘magazines’ appears necessary. After Roman times, the English ‘ecclesiastic annals’ recorded a chronological list of events for Anglo-Saxon missionaries, and in the Middle Ages historical literature was often classified under the terms of chronicles, monastery annals and lives of the saints. The mendicant Orders cared less for charters and documents than their predecessors, the land-based and locally stable branches of Benedictines; in the Franciscan tradition, the best-known annals were the “Annales Minorum”. These were gathered from Roman, Gallican and Spanish archives and written over twenty-four years by Luke Wadding, a seventeenth-century Irish Franciscan largely based in Rome. In 1858, when Hayes was a member of the Franciscan community in Bayswater, their beginnings and significant events were recorded in a tome called the “Annals”. When Hayes commenced her Annals, the ‘Annals’ of Pauline Jaricot’s Association for the Propagation of the Faith were read widely and Hayes was aware of Franciscan Annals in French, Italian and Spanish, but there were none in English. Newspaper advertisements, archival material such as manuscripts and letters that accompanied early subscriptions, and Hayes’ own writings, show that from the birth of her Annals, it was called a periodical, a ‘little magazine’ and a monthly journal, so these terms appear also in the course of this thesis.

The thesis title, ‘Mission through Journalism’, is not meant to convey that Hayes was as prolific a religious writer as her female contemporaries, Margaret A. Cusack or Lady Georgiana Fullerton. Although many sources reveal Hayes’ ability as a writer, yet in the Annals, it takes time to calculate what she actually wrote herself. Much of her publication’s content consists of articles from contributors and poetry selected

47 Vann and VanArsdel, eds., Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society, 3.
50 The writer has researched these Annals held in MFIC archives, Braintree, Essex, England.
51 MacGinley, A Dynamic of Hope, 255.
52 The Brainerd Tribune, 27 December 1873 says, ‘A New Monthly Magazine. The initial number of a new 36 page monthly is now in press in the Tribune office, published under the auspices of the Sisters of St. Francis, of this city and is called, ‘ANNALS OF OUR LADY OF THE ANGELS’.”
from books, together with translations and edited material from other sources. The thesis attempts to address not only the questions, from where and from whom, Hayes obtained material for her journal, but also to provide an analysis and interpretation of why some household names were included and others, like Newman’s, were excluded or bypassed.

**Resources and Structure**
Morris Russell, proprietor, publisher and editor of the Brainerd newspaper in Minnesota, predicted in his *Brainerd Tribune*, that Hayes’ *Annals* would ‘finally become one of the finest religious magazines of the country’. To investigate this claim, and for the total investigation, it was vital to discover what Hayes actually published between 1874 and 1894. The primary resource basic to this research is housed in the Roman archives of the Missionary Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception (hereafter MFIC archives, Rome). The facts, about content, dates, any break in the publication, volume numbers, and identification of non-extant volumes and variations in indices, were ascertained and it was noted that, at the outset, Hayes was not only *Annals*’ editor but also the main contributor. It became apparent that the *Annals* could best be examined through a thematic approach and it became clearer that a vital question was: from where did Hayes obtain her material for the *Annals*? Some initial answers were found in nineteenth-century books held in the MFIC archives in Rome while others were found in archival correspondence related directly to the *Annals*.

Contemporary Franciscan periodicals are housed in the archives of the Order of Friars Minor, Capuchins and Observants. Complete sets of the *Franciscan Annals* published by the Franciscan Capuchins are available for examination in the Roman library/archives of the Pontificium Athenaeum Antonianum in French, Italian and English. Franciscan Capuchin houses in Erith (Kent) and in Oxford provided the writer with complete sets of their English yearbooks and these on examination yielded secrets and unlocked mysteries surrounding certain articles in Hayes’ periodical. In other archives and libraries in England and Ireland, especially those of

---

54 Morris C. Russell voiced this newspaper prediction on 17 January 1874 as he advertised Hayes’ *Annals*. ‘Already’, he wrote, ‘we claim it to be a great credit, in every respect, to our young city and to the *Tribune* office as a printing house’.
the Braintree Franciscan Sisters and the Killiney (Co. Dublin) Franciscan Provincialate, were found Catholic periodicals, acknowledged or referred to in Hayes’ *Annals*.

Hayes undertook an enormous project in setting out to edit, print and distribute her publication. This raises the question: what preceded Hayes’ missionary journalistic endeavour? An inner conviction or previous experience would seem to be the only explanation as to why, in a male-dominated society and profession, Hayes dared to undertake such a huge project in Minnesota’s wild west where a woman editor seems to have been almost anathema. The only instance I found, regarding the existence in Minnesota of a female editor in the 1870s, is that of St. Cloud editor, Jane Grey Swisshelm (1815-84) whose printing press was smashed by local men and thrown into the Mississippi River.

Fact-finding about nineteenth-century journals proved successful in my visits to archives and libraries of Minnesota, especially in the small towns of Belle Prairie, Brainerd, St. Cloud and their environs. The city of St Paul, home of the Minnesota Historical Society, provided me with significant religious data as well as historical facts about the period when Hayes was editing and publishing. Research carried out in Minnesota’s winter gave realism to Chaffee’s *Memories* when she recalled that the ink in the printer was often frozen.55 The sight of snow five feet deep around the replica of Hayes’ Belle Prairie log cabin beside the old abandoned convent stirred this researcher’s imagination and fired her search. Information on the mode of distribution of the *Annals* was sought; besides train travel, the only other means of transport for Hayes to travel from Belle Prairie to Brainerd in late 1873, to ensure early printing of her *Annals* in 1874, was by horse-drawn sleigh.

To enter into the enterprising and competitive market of nineteenth-century journalism, courage and confidence were required, while to evidence consistency and longevity in it was a great achievement for men and an even greater one for women. Hence, this thesis begins with an overview of Hayes’ life. This is followed by several chapters dealing with contemporary journal literature – secular, religious non-Catholic, Catholic and specifically Franciscan – treated in conjunction with Hayes’ experience and knowledge of this literature. Successive chapters explore the

55 Chaffee, "Memories".
contents of Hayes’ *Annals*, identify the contributors, and finally assess Hayes’ methods of production and distribution. If current research accepts Joanne Shattock’s work on Margaret Oliphant and *Blackwood’s*, along with Judith Johnson’s investigation of “Anna Brownell Jameson and the *Monthly Chronicle*”,56 it is time for a serious analysis of Elizabeth Hayes and the *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels*.

56 Both articles in Barbara Garlick and Margaret Harris, eds., *Victorian Journalism: Exotic and Domestic* (St. Lucia, Brisbane: University of Queensland Press, 1998).
Chapter 1

Overview and influences that shaped Hayes’ life

Things we have heard and known,
things that our fathers told us.
We will not keep them from our children;
we will tell the next generation.¹

Hayes’ family evidenced appreciation of journalism and skills associated with it both in the past and in Elizabeth’s lifetime. Elizabeth Hayes’ first fifty years were spent within an environment that prepared her for the Apostolate of the Press. Family attributes and those of circles of friends contributed to an educated religious literary environment. The phases of her life demonstrate that her background, its people and places, provided formational experiences that directed her later life toward a mission through journalism. These phases encompass: her family and Guernsey (1823-c1843/5), Oxford and Wantage (to 1856); London’s Greenwich and Bayswater (to 1858), Glasgow and Jamaica (to 1863), a period after Jamaica and before Belle Prairie (to 1872) and finally the period in the United States of America and Italy (to 1894).

Family and Guernsey

Three generations of Hayes’ Oxford forebears ushered in a woman’s life whose achievements equalled or surpassed theirs, and because of their influence deserve brief consideration, beginning here with her great grandfather. Dr. William Hayes (1708-77) was an important eighteenth-century English musician, apparently ‘possessed of considerable genius and abilities’; he held Oxford’s Heather Professorship of Music and published widely circulated writings on music and on every musical genre except opera.² As a member of London’s Royal Society of Musicians and a celebrity, he was responsible for directing many performances of Handel’s challenging vocal works and he championed Handel in the press when he was criticised unfairly.³ One of Hayes’ sons, Philip, who followed closely in his

¹ Good News Bible (Canberra, The Bible Society in Australia, 1976), Ps. 78, 3-4.
³ Ibid., vol 1, 6.
footsteps, published his biography as well as musical and literary works. The name of Dr. William Hayes appeared in eighteenth-century journals and newspapers, and in the 1840s and 50s when Elizabeth Hayes often visited Oxford, besides seeing the Hayes’ names displayed on the organists’ board of the University Church, she saw her forebears’ portraits hanging in Oxford’s Music Faculty. Elizabeth Hayes had direct ancestors of whom she could be justly proud and from whom she possibly gained some genes for journalism. 

Hayes apparently inherited from her grandfather, another William Hayes, a talent for singing and knowledge of church music, both of which were to assist in her choice of verse for her publication. Her grandfather received his MA at New College and as organist moved to Worcester Cathedral where he published in the Gentleman’s Magazine (May 1765), “Rules necessary to be observed by all Cathedral-Singers in this Kingdom”. The familiarity of Rev. William Hayes with the Gentleman’s Magazine is noteworthy for this long-popular English periodical (1731-1914) stood with Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine in the top six periodicals of his day.

The Gentleman’s Magazine featured an assembly of essays and articles culled from numerous sources for each monthly issue, an arrangement later employed by Hayes in her Annals. An examination of the covers of both journals reveals also a similarity in the style. It is possible that the Gentleman’s Magazine was a favourite of the Hayes family just as in the same period the Quarterly was favoured by the May family as described by Charlotte Yonge. Mr. William Hayes was a Minor Canon at Saint Paul’s Cathedral, London, and later an Anglican clergyman who published a number of sermons and preached at All Hallows in Barking. The Gentleman’s Magazine in the Rev. William Hayes’ obituary noted these facts and more.

---

4 de Breffny, Unless the Seed Die, 14. Also see Heighes, “The Life and Works of William and Philip Hayes”, vol 1, 15, 62, 71, 85; vol 2, 6, 11-13, 17-18, 113; vol 3, 89, 91, 200.
5 Heighes, “The Life and Works of William and Philip Hayes”, vol 1, 3, 6, 10, 23-24, 42.
6 Ibid., vol 1, 14, 86; vol 2, 6.
8 Ibid. accessed.
Elizabeth Hayes’ father, the Rev. Philip Hayes (1781-1841), was an Oxford chorister at Magdalen College, gained his BA,11 became an Anglican clergyman yet embraced the teaching profession and educated London boys for many years. Elizabeth Hayes’ parents, Rev. Philip and Mary (née Thomasine Rainals) Hayes married in England and after the birth of their first son, William, moved to Guernsey where Rev. Philip Hayes established his successful school in the Plaiderie that prepared boys for matriculation. The rest of the Hayes’ ten children were born on Guernsey with Elizabeth, their youngest surviving child,12 born in 1823.

Girls’ education was not ignored on Guernsey and Hayes’ parents developed her early love for reading that became the foundation of her later journalistic success. Besides books, clergymen read not only general magazines but usually ordered Church of England and other clerical publications and there is no reason to believe Philip Hayes did otherwise. Philip’s London lifestyle and later visits exposed him to London’s growing journalistic developments, for example, the establishment in 1802 of the Edinburgh Review and, in 1811, of the Quarterly Review. Also Guernsey received its share of London’s periodical press via sailing ships and later steamships.13 Hayes’ siblings enjoyed Guernsey’s social life but apparently Elizabeth preferred to remain at home to enjoy her reading.14 She was so fluent in French that her father called her his ‘little French girl’.15 Rev. Philip Hayes made it possible for his daughter to be immersed in the surrounding French culture and language that later made it possible for her to read and adapt French Catholic literature and journals.

The Channel Island of Guernsey provided a rich and diverse environment for Hayes in her developmental years. Wealthy Guernsey, proud of its history and culture, boasted five-storey buildings along the St. Peter Port’s harbour waterfront when Elizabeth Hayes was baptised at the Anglican ‘Town Church’.16 Hayes’ firm handwriting, flawless spelling and grammar, noteworthy command of the English

11 The original headstone on Hayes’ grave in Candie cemetery, Guernsey, read ‘Rev. Philip Hayes B.A. All Souls College, Oxford.’ However, this college is traditionally known for conferring post-graduate degrees so which college granted the B.A. remains uncertain.
12 Facts about Hayes’ life were provided by a relation. Letter of Frances (née Hayes) Dynham re her Aunt Elizabeth to Sr. M. Benignus Holland, Rome. 15 June 1913, MFIC archives, Rome.
14 Chaffée, "Memories", 2.
15 Ibid., 1.
language, accompanied by an impressive vocabulary, have been attributed to the foundations laid by Aunt Sophie Hayes who conducted the Allez Street young ladies’ seminary.\textsuperscript{17} While the child’s French nurse was a devout Catholic,\textsuperscript{18} the Hayes family attended services in St. James Anglican Church; the environment was distinctly Protestant with Catholicism just beginning to creep back in Guernsey in spite of some violent opposition.\textsuperscript{19}

When Elizabeth Hayes was aged eight, St. Peter Port’s population was almost 14,000, trading ships filled the harbour and the town was a stimulating place with people aware of contemporary movements.\textsuperscript{20} Amid the relative obscurity of Hayes’ Guernsey life is the certainty of her preoccupation with reading\textsuperscript{21} but precisely what she read in the 1830s can only be surmised through what was available to a clergyman’s daughter and a young lady of her class. It could have included the works of William Blake, Robert Burns, William Wordsworth, Sir Walter Scott, Jane Austen, Thomas Carlyle, Edward B. Pusey or John Henry Newman. Family reading, besides family musicals,\textsuperscript{22} was part of orderly life in the Hayes home; there were plenty of journals from which they could choose and to which a new generation of writers was contributing. By 1829, for example, the young William Makepeace Thackeray was already a contributor to the \textit{Edinburgh Review}.\textsuperscript{23} Just before the first Royal Visit of Queen Victoria and Prince Albert, Elizabeth Hayes left Guernsey. This occurred between 1843 and 1845 - a more precise date cannot be established since Guernsey’s shipping records indicated arrivals but not departures.

\textbf{Life in England - Oxford and Wantage}

If Hayes dreamt of a literary profession, it was not revealed at this early stage, but at an impressionable age, she did arrive in England and her London, Oxford and Wantage experiences, which included teaching, shaped her thinking and her struggle. No doubt these experiences enriched her and helped to build in her a confidence that one day would launch her into journalism. Hayes witnessed ‘Literary

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{17} de Breffny, \textit{Unless the Seed Die}, 23.
\textsuperscript{18} Chaffee, "Memories", 1.
\textsuperscript{21} Chaffee, "Memories", 2.
\textsuperscript{22} Ibid.
\end{flushright}
London’ of the 1840s that boasted a newly developed magazine-publishing industry along with the thriving publication of books and newspapers. She was advantaged by this greater access to publications, and if her teacher’s income inhibited her, the practice of relatives and friends lending to one another sufficed.\textsuperscript{24} Hayes saw the great difficulties that faced English women writers since journalism was considered basically a male profession. Some female writers felt that the only way readers would accept their work was to make it sound masculine. For example, Marian Evans used the pseudonym George Elliot; Harriet Martineau when volunteering to write an article for the \textit{Edinburgh Review} used the phrase, ‘I’m your man’, while the three Bronte sisters submitted their 1847 manuscripts to publishers under male names.

The power of the periodical press was witnessed by Hayes as people read increasingly and publications on religion were widely debated, often fuelled by the Oxford Movement’s attempts to restore to the Church of England certain Catholic teachings and practices short of uniting with Rome. Lady Georgiana Fullerton’s novel, \textit{Mrs. Gerald’s Niece}, caught the contemporary mood through her characters who discussed the division between ‘Roman Catholics’ and Oxford Movement followers. Hayes followed the controversies often published by periodicals, for example, in the \textit{London Review}, \textit{Edinburgh Review} and the \textit{British Critic}. Her relatives introduced her to Dr. Edward B. Pusey and Rev. John Keble, the two remaining leaders of the Oxford Movement after Froude’s death and John Henry Newman’s conversion to Catholicism. As a Puseyite\textsuperscript{25} Hayes read the Oxford Tracts and in the first tract Newman warned of what he called ‘evil times’:

\begin{quote}
Fellow labourers, I am but one of yourselves – a Presbyter; and therefore I conceal my name, lest I take too much on myself by speaking in my own person. Yet speak I must; for the times are very evil, yet no one speaks against them.\textsuperscript{26}
\end{quote}

Little did Hayes know that it would be almost another thirty years before she would engage in the same mission of taking up the pen to support what she believed was the cause for good literature. Newman once declared that ‘through Pusey the

\begin{footnotes}
\item[24] Chaffee, "Memories", 5.
\end{footnotes}
character of the tracts was changed’, 27 thereby attributing to Pusey much of the success of the publications. Newman regarded Pusey highly for he wrote of him:

I had known him well since 1827-8, and felt for him an enthusiastic admiration. … His great learning, his immense diligence, his scholarlike (sic) mind, his simple devotion to the cause of religion, overcame me; and great of course was my joy, when in the last days of 1833 he showed a disposition to make common cause with us. … He at once gave to us a position and a name. 28

As with Newman, Pusey had impressed the ‘very logical mind of Hayes’ 29 and the extent of Pusey’s influence on Hayes may be gauged from one incident. Hayes evidently had confidence in herself and on one occasion after Pusey preached against practices of the Church of Rome, confession and vows in particular, Hayes went to him in the vestry to put forward her questions and objections. 30 A person of Pusey’s theological, linguistic and literary stature may well have had a lasting influence on her. Hayes loved poetry and, like other Puseyites, was influenced by Keble’s The Christian Year, a widely used volume of poems for Sundays and festivals of the church year. 31 ‘To quote Keble’s poetry was like a profession of faith in Anglicanism’ 32 and this was the faith of Hayes until 1856.

Hayes’ interest grew in the Anglican Sisterhoods which, as part of the renewal movement, were initiated and supported by Dr. Edward Pusey, a handful of other clerics, Lord John Manners and William (later Prime Minister) Gladstone. 33 In 1841 Hayes’ friend, Marian Rebecca Hughes, under the guidance of Pusey, had been the first woman to take Anglican vows 34 even before Puseyite communities commenced with St. Katharine’s near Regent Park in 1844. A circle of women Puseyites, Hayes included, interacted with the pioneer Anglican Sisters and Hayes resolved to join them. 35 Hayes looked to Lydia Priscilla Sellon’s Devonport community, as did well-
educated women like Fanny Taylor and Catharine Chambers, but after an interview she decided in 1850 in favour of Wantage in Bishop Samuel Wilberforce’s Oxford diocese. In the Oxford diocese, the three strongest communities became Wantage, Clewer and Marian Hughes’ group.

Literary conscious Tractarians whose friendships interconnected with other enclaves of well-educated friends encircled the 1848 Wantage Sisterhood venture led by the Vicar, Rev. William Butler. The project, which encompassed both a school and a shelter for unmarried mothers and ex-prostitutes, would not have been possible without the cooperation and finances of Elizabeth Lockhart who, despite the conversion to Catholicism of her famous half-brother, William, and of her stepmother, became the founding Sister. On Lockhart’s 1850 departure from the Sisters, Dr. Edward Pusey recommended to Rev. William Butler that Elizabeth Hayes should be her replacement. So amid the significant events of 1850, when Punch cartoons poked fun at the Puseyites and, along with The Times, lampooned the Catholic Church which had restored the hierarchy of bishops under the leadership of Cardinal Wiseman, Hayes took over the care of the shelter. Hayes’ educational talents were recognised and within a month she replaced Elizabeth Ashington in the school.

Hayes was initially a lay teacher, later the school principal and on 25 July 1855 became the Anglican Sister Superior of St. Mary the Virgin School and Convent. Dr. Edward Pusey preached on this unique occasion. Hayes worked tirelessly to develop the different types of schools needed; she gained the necessary

---

36 Mother Sellon established her first communities at Devonport and then Ascot; later she became leader of the Park Village community. Pusey hoped that Sellon would one day be the leader of all the English Anglican Sisterhoods. Chadwick, *The Victorian Church, Part One, 1829-1859*, 506. For more on Chambers, see Jennifer Cameron, *A Dangerous Innovator: Mary Ward (1585-1645)* (Strathfield, NSW: St Pauls Publications - Society of St Paul, 2000), 255.

37 Chadwick, *The Victorian Church, Part One, 1829-1859*, 511.


39 For connections among the Lockhart family, Cardinal Manning and the Meynels regarding literature and periodicals, see Altholz, *The Religious Press in Britain, 1760-1900*, 103-4.

40 The Gorham case, one major event with major consequences, brought to a climax the struggle between Church and State showing that authority, even in matters of doctrine, resided in the Crown.


43 Particulars given in Chaffee, "Memories", 3.
Government Certification for a headmistress and established an education complex on a sound foundation.\textsuperscript{44} The school grew to become and remains a respected Wantage institution and the Wantage Sisterhood developed to become the Anglican Church’s largest in England.\textsuperscript{45} Hayes’ ability to be abreast of rapid advancements in the educational field was exemplified by her introduction of pupil teachers. It seems reasonable to deduce that, in a period of the growing sense of professionalism and professional identity,\textsuperscript{46} Hayes studied the educational periodicals and books of her time; later her knowledge of educational publications was evident in her numerous Annals’ articles. The Tractarian-inspired atmosphere around Hayes in Wantage, enriched with regular clerical visitors from Oxford, must have further increased her thirst for reading and academic development which one day would be so necessary to writing, publishing and editorship.\textsuperscript{47} After some time Butler did not see eye to eye with Hayes\textsuperscript{48} and she opted to follow another path.

**London’s Greenwich and Bayswater**

The London Catholic revival scene that Hayes experienced from 1856-58 proved for her to be a fresh period of religious and journalistic initiation. The return to England of Religious Orders and Congregations at this time was significant and those that affected Hayes most were the Jesuits, Rosminians, Oblates of St. Charles Borromeo, the Oratorians of St. Philip Neri and the Franciscans.\textsuperscript{49} A significant number of Tractarian convert clergymen of literary giftedness together with well-educated convert elite women, including ex-Anglican Sisters, enriched the Catholic revival. Some joined the religious houses while some males joined the secular clergy or followed an academic career with Christian dedication. Hayes’ awareness of publications of author-converts would be evidenced later in her journal publication. Hayes, having read her way into Catholicism, made her abjuration of heresy and was conditionally baptised in the Jesuits’ Mayfair Church, known as Farm Street, a place

\textsuperscript{44} This success was acknowledged. Norton, "A History of the Community of St. Mary the Virgin, Wantage", v.

\textsuperscript{45} Philip, *Victorian Wantage*, 20.

\textsuperscript{46} For nineteenth-century growth of professionalism, see Vann and VanArsdel, eds., *Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society*, 7.

\textsuperscript{47} Hayes in her desire to procure more Catholic literature took her pony chaise and drove to a clerical friend. Chaffee, "Memories”, 3.

\textsuperscript{48} An insight into the situation, predominantly a personality clash and accompanied by differences of opinion over authority and finances, is given by Sr. M. Cuthbert McCarthy, "Elizabeth Hayes - a Woman of Her Time: An Examination of the History of Victorian England and an Attempt by an Englishwoman to Trace Its Influence on Mother Mary Ignatius Hayes, 1823-1894”, in *Passageways*, ed. Helene Byrne (Rome: MFIC, 1995).
popularly chosen by converts and central to London Catholic life from 1849. Manning along with Newman, Faber and Wiseman preached from Farm Street’s pulpit but it was Manning who had the strongest spiritual and literary influence on Hayes. The literary environment that encircled the Farm Street Jesuits, Hayes and their friends was so strong that gradually the place earned the name of the ‘Scriptorium’. Farm Street’s respected contemporary Jesuit writers of this period included H. J. Coleridge, Hathaway, Gallwey, Parkinson and Harper.

When Hayes chose to join the new Greenwich Rosminian Sisters group, she re-situated herself within the Lockharts’ influential literary circles of friends, relations and connections. The extent of the Lockhart’s connections is evident in numerous sources through the names of religious and secular friends, letters quoted in books, lists of contributors to Catholic periodicals and biographies of literary or otherwise significant figures. One interesting example was William H. Anderdon who began his literary apostolate by publishing Catholic tales, and later wrote for newspapers and religious journals; Hayes in her Annals indicates that she had read religious journals including the English Messenger of the Sacred Heart, to which Anderdon contributed. Hayes discussed with Manning, her spiritual director, the possibility of joining the Franciscan Poor Clare community or Catherine McAuley’s Sisters of Mercy, but selected the educated and refined women under the leadership of Elizabeth Lockhart and Manning’s spiritual guidance.

---

52 Elizabeth and Martha Lockhart were Rosminians at Loughborough but in 1852 Elizabeth Lockhart purchased a large Greenwich house at no. 66 Crooms Hill. "Dowry Register", in Bayswater Franciscan Records, MFIC archives, Braintree, Essex: n.d. Shortly the Rosminians moved into no. 70 and in 1856, the year Elizabeth Hayes joined the community, they purchased also no. 72. Property Records, examined 30 July 1994, Blackheath Historical Library. The Lockharts were related to Sir Walter Scott and his son-in-law, John Gibson Lockhart, successful editor and author. For more on the Lockharts see Father Lockhart of the Institute of Charity (1819-1892), Catholic Biographies (London: Catholic Truth Society, 1923). McEvoy, A Short Life of Mother Mary Elizabeth Lockhart and Brief History of Her Franciscan Sisters, 8-9. Significant Scots - John Gibson Lockhart, Electric Scotland, http://www.electricscotland.com/history/other/lockhart_john.htm; accessed 2 June 2003.
54 When others left the Anglican Sisterhoods they usually considered themselves free of their vows but Hayes did not as she had made them to the ‘Church of God’. Chaffee, "Memories", 4.
In this same year Fr. William Lockhart’s life changed from an itinerant one of preaching missions to a settled life in North London where the Rosminian Fathers of Charity established a new house at Kingsland.\textsuperscript{56} So William Lockhart had parish responsibilities for schools and many pastoral activities yet his journalistic enterprises continued to please his circle of friends. Lockhart’s literary undertakings included the institution of St. Joseph’s Press for the training and employment of journeymen printers and pressmen, and the purchase and editorship of \textit{The Lamp} and of \textit{Catholic Opinion}.\textsuperscript{57} Hayes was surrounded by a religious environment where writing journal articles, translating books and publishing were recognised as the Apostolate of the Press and were practised compatibly with teaching poor children, caring for orphans, assisting converts or visiting the sick. Men and women like Manning, Newman, the Lockharts, Fullerton and others in Hayes’ circle were of high moral and intellectual endowments and she saw how they used their gifts against the perceived evils of the time and the enemies of the Church. Hayes was in the right place at the right time to experience the intensity of their Apostolate of the Press but her life’s journey had to face more challenges before she was to join their ranks.

In 1857 Dr. Henry Manning and the Oblates he had inaugurated needed help in the new Bayswater Parish of Our Lady of the Angels and he turned again to Elizabeth Lockhart. Hayes accompanied Lockhart, six professed Sisters and four other postulants to Bayswater where the community established themselves in three Elgin Street houses.\textsuperscript{58} Two weeks later Hayes and other community members were teaching in the poor school for girls attached to the parish church,\textsuperscript{59} preparing converts for reception into the Church and doing charitable works. Later Manning went to Rome and the Jesuit who temporarily replaced him observed that the Sisters might not be fully approved by Roman authorities. The Sisters were following a Rosminian Rule at a time when Rosmini’s writings were in question.\textsuperscript{60} Up to the twentieth century, legislation from the Fourth Lateran Council in 1215 directed new religious communities who wished to be recognised canonically to adopt the Rules of

\textsuperscript{56} \textit{Father Lockhart}, 25.
\textsuperscript{57} Ibid., 26-7. One source claims Mrs. Lockhart as founder of \textit{Catholic Opinion} with William Lockhart as its editor. \textit{Altholz, The Religious Press in Britain, 1760-1900}, 105.
\textsuperscript{58} "Chronicles 1857-1904", in \textit{Bayswater Franciscan Records}, n.d., MFIC archives, Braintree, Essex.
\textsuperscript{59} Ibid., 1.
\textsuperscript{60} Chaffee, "Memories", 6.
Basil, Benedict, Augustine and then later Francis. Manning recommended that the Sisters look to the Franciscan Rule and observances and suggested contact with the Glasgow Franciscans. Events that followed were to influence Hayes and her journalistic talents for the rest of her life. Mother Elizabeth Lockhart and Sr. M. Francis Burton went to Glasgow while three Glasgow Sisters came to assist the Bayswater group in the transition period, which was difficult; some Sisters opted to leave the convent while Hayes remained.

When one of the Glasgow Sisters was recalled, the Bayswater Sisters and postulants, Hayes being one, were offered the opportunity to travel to Glasgow and join the larger and more firmly established Franciscan house there. Hayes knew that the Glasgow Sisters had a mission in Jamaica and so, with her heart set on being a foreign missionary, she received the Franciscan habit in a ceremony presided over by Dr. Henry Manning on 25 November 1858, after which she departed immediately with a group for Glasgow. Hayes had left Bayswater when Lockhart published her translation of *The Life of the Curé of Ars* and later works, but her vocational determination had been strengthened and she had witnessed the influence of Apostles of the Press; both had been valuable experiences that would assist her in later years.

**Glasgow and Jamaica**

In Glasgow, Hayes was introduced to the poor end of town and in particular to the Sisters in Charlotte Street Convent. Mother Veronica Cordier, one of the Glasgow

---

64 These Franciscan Sisters were the first Religious Order to settle in the West of Scotland since the Reformation. *Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception. Celebrating 150 Years in Glasgow: 1847-1997*, (Glasgow: Franciscan Sisters & Milton Press, 1997), 122.
65 Hayes, "Diary", 20.
founders, believed that if the city’s poverty was to be overcome, education was the solution. Hence Hayes was called on soon to assist the education mission and undertook a strenuous teaching workload.\textsuperscript{69} Sisters walked daily to and from poor parish schools to teach the children; in the cold foggy evenings they returned again to teach working girls and a letter reports that Hayes became exhausted.\textsuperscript{70} Cordier herself with three other sisters had set out in 1857 to establish a mission in Jamaica for she believed that the Church existed for mission. The home mission, with assistance from Catholic periodicals and literature, had been promoting and developing Catholicism in the first half of the century,\textsuperscript{71} but Jamaica was considered a foreign mission and this was what attracted Hayes.

When Hayes made her profession of the vows of poverty, chastity and obedience, she added a voluntary fourth vow, ‘to devote myself to the foreign missions’.\textsuperscript{72} The community Council had approved of her making of this fourth vow as well as her leaving to join the Jamaican community.\textsuperscript{73} The continued significance of this vow will become more evident in the \textit{Annals} for Hayes ensured articles on Franciscan and foreign missions were a special emphasis. Hayes travelled to Southampton and boarded the \textit{Atrato} which sailed on 2 December 1859 for St. Thomas and Jamaica.\textsuperscript{74} Hayes may have known of the \textit{Atrato} already because engravings depicting the ship’s launching had been published some years before.\textsuperscript{75}

Hayes arrived at Kingston where most of the people lived in great poverty and where only a handful ministered to the Catholic population.\textsuperscript{76} Again Hayes was back in the classroom, only instead of teaching poor children, as she desired, she found herself educating wealthy plantation owners’ daughters in the Academy run by the

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{69} Chaffee, "Memories", 7.
  \item \textsuperscript{70} Bishop Smith, Letter, 30 Nov. 1858. Chaffee, "Memories", 7.
  \item \textsuperscript{71} An account of Scottish Catholics’ response to periodical literature, the involvement of Rev. Peter Forbes (staunch friend of the Glasgow Sisters) and Bishop Murdoch’s controversy with McGavin of \textit{The Protestant} can be found in the Catholic press as recorded in “Emancipation and Catholic Revival 1793-1878”, in Leslie J. Macfarlane and Rev. J. McIntyre, eds., \textit{Scotland and the Holy See. The Story of Scotland's Links with the Papacy Down the Centuries} (Edinburgh: Heritage Commission of the Scottish Catholic Hierarchy, 1982), 13.
  \item \textsuperscript{72} Elizabeth Hayes, 'Act of Profession of Sister M. Ignatius Hayes', in "Profession Register, 1859", Franciscan Sisters archives, Glasgow. The recorder had noted at the end of the Act, 'Left for Jamaica, December, 1859'.
  \item \textsuperscript{73} "Minutes of Council of the Convent of the Immaculate Conception. Glasgow. 1854 ...", Franciscan Sisters archives, Glasgow.
  \item \textsuperscript{74} J. M. Wraight, Letter from Greenwich Maritime Information Centre to P. J. Shaw, 3 October 1994, MFIC archives, Brisbane, Australia.
  \item \textsuperscript{75} \textit{Illustrated London News}, 1853, vol 22, 352.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
Religious community life in Jamaica also posed frustration for Hayes. The Sisters’ Rule and Constitutions, followed strictly by Cordier and the community, were unclear as to whether the Sisters’ vows were solemn or simple which meant that the degree of cloister to which the Sisters were bound was uncertain. Cordier had been trained in Tourcoing where the French convent of Grey Sisters (Third Order) were rooted in genuine medieval origins, tracing their foundation back through Comines community to Angela of Foligno and to St. Francis. For greater legal security as well as canonical recognition, some Third Order groups were accorded solemn vows in the early 16th century but later legal uncertainty arose and the actual status of such groups became uncertain. Hayes experienced great disappointment, for in trying to fulfil her fourth vow, her efforts met with obstacles, failure, illness and discouragement. She wrote in her diary:

My soul (is) in a martyrdom of loneliness and misery but I resolved to offer this suffering, this very absence of all support of any friend on earth, as part of the penance taken when the vow was made.

Two-thirds of what became known traditionally as Hayes’ Diary was written in Jamaica and since, before her death, Hayes burnt her personal letters from key people like Manning, Pusey, various archbishops and bishops and the Hon. Fanny Montgomery, these Jamaican writings are significant. To understand Hayes’ missionary heart and mind, attention to her Diary is essential; without this understanding it would be difficult to appreciate her later role as Annals’ editor. Diary entries include for example an incident with a Jesuit army cleric, Fr. J. Sidney Woollett, which displays Hayes’ strength of character. The incident was occasioned by what Hayes called the ‘false logic’ of Woollett who ‘argued on false premises’ and apparently was not open and honest with the Sisters. Hayes wrote:

Father Woollett may lay down the law and insist as much as he pleases but a Sub-Prioress, chosen by the Prioress and appointed by her in her place, is not

---

77 For a description of the Academy see Cochrane, "In the Beginning", 50.
78 The evolving currents that brought the simple-vow groups into full canonical recognition are a major factor in tracing their history. See MacGinley, *A Dynamic of Hope*, 26-27, 59-60, 172.
79 Hayes, "Diary", 24.
the duly constituted Superioress elected by the voice of the Community, as recognized in our Holy Rule.\textsuperscript{81}

The Diary contains quotations from French spiritual books, for Hayes’ versatility in French provided her with wider reading experiences, but at this time less enjoyable in Jamaica’s ‘intolerable’ heat.\textsuperscript{82}

Toward the end of 1862, Hayes discerned that she was not obliged to stay and drafted a letter to the Vicar Apostolic in Jamaica, Monsignor Dupeyron, to obtain the necessary permission to leave Jamaica. The letter asked him to treat her as he had treated Cordier when poor health forced her return to France, and to give her liberty to leave so long as she obtained the consent of any bishop to receive her vows.\textsuperscript{83} In the following May, Dupeyron authorized Hayes to leave Jamaica and Sr. M. Francis de Sales O’Neill was to accompany her. They hoped either to return to a mission on St. Thomas Island or to affiliate themselves with a French Franciscan community.\textsuperscript{84} Years later, Hayes published a contribution to the \textit{Annals} that provided young readers with an insight into her West Indian life.\textsuperscript{85}

Period after Jamaica and before Belle Prairie

Hayes, during the voyage to England, decided that her companion was not the person with whom to open a new mission, so they separated.\textsuperscript{86} In 1864, the year famous for the publication of Newman’s \textit{Apologia} in London and the \textit{Syllabus of Errors} in Rome, Hayes travelled to Paris and wrote, ‘Now the question is what to do with myself’.\textsuperscript{87} She planned to meet Cordier, regarding their shared plan to open a new mission but Cordier changed her mind, or had it changed for her by a doctor and

\textsuperscript{80} Chaffee, "Memories", 7.
\textsuperscript{82} Hayes, "Diary", 27.
\textsuperscript{83} Ibid., 28. Bishop Murdoch was ecclesiastical superior of the Glasgow Franciscan community, where Hayes had made her formal religious vows, and was empowered to enable her to transfer the ecclesiastical authorisation of these vows to another bishop.
\textsuperscript{84} Ibid., 42-3.
\textsuperscript{85} Hon. Mrs. F. Montgomery, "Clare, or the Child of Our Lady of the Angels", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} I, no. ii (1874): 63.
\textsuperscript{86} Hayes, "Diary", 43-5. O’Neill went to the York Poor Clares; later events proved that Hayes had made the right decision. de Breffny, \textit{Unless the Seed Die}, 91, 202-03.
\textsuperscript{87} Hayes, "Diary", 46.
religious authorities, and the plan was aborted.\(^8\) Hayes wrote of her struggle as to whether she should enter the well-established Franciscan Convent in Calais or go to Saint Thomas Island.\(^8\) Finally she chose neither and visited the Archbishop of Paris, Georges Darboy, a well-known ecclesiastical writer, and put forward a proposal to found a Franciscan community that would serve the needs of his city’s poor immigrants. Again Hayes was in touch with a highly respected Catholic writer, once professor at the Grand Seminaire of Langres, now archbishop since 1862. Darboy, recognised for his contributions to the *Correspondant* (1847–55) and directorship (1850) of *Moniteur Catholique*, had published numerous religious books from 1845-58. The archbishop liked Hayes’ plan but expected her to purchase a convent and not to use a rented house.\(^9\) Without the necessary finance for this kind of Paris project, Hayes looked for another place to carry out the same ministry and contemporaneously to build up a religious community which would contribute to foreign missions.

Amid Parisian political unrest, Hayes was acting with a definite purpose for she wanted to establish a stable Franciscan community along with achieving the fulfilment of her fourth vow to foreign missions. Hayes had clear objectives from the time she made her decision to go to Glasgow; they remained a constant, namely stability, a sound authorisation for her ministry and the missionary horizon.\(^9\) Exposure to French Catholic mission annals at this time and in the late 1860s may have influenced the model for Hayes’ later Franciscan mission-orientated periodical.\(^9\) Hayes and her Parisian Catholic friends were surrounded daily with Catholic foreign mission news which was widely published in French Catholic newspapers, journals, reviews, pamphlets and books. *L’Univers*, founded in 1833, was one of the best-known Catholic newspapers while *Le Correspondant* was considered a very popular review. The most widely known French mission periodical, published in Lyons since 1822, was *Annales de la Propagation de la Foi*. This organ belonged to the Society for the Propagation of the Faith but had been conceived by

---


\(^9\) Hayes, "Diary", 47.

\(^9\) "Personnel File Card of Sister Ignatius".


\(^9\) Ibid.
Pauline Jaricot. The *Annales de la Propagation de la Foi* contained letters from missionaries, news of the missions, and reports of all money received and apportioned by the Society. The earlier Society of the Foreign Missions of Paris, grew rapidly again in the nineteenth century and provided much mission content for publications, especially stories about their many missionary martyrs in the East.

The Bishop of Orleans, Felix Antoine P. Dupanloup, one of the ablest French bishops of his day and a prolific writer, was pleased to welcome Hayes into his diocese and by the summer of 1864 she had completed plans for a foundation at Orleans. In late July of 1864 Hayes was in Lyon collecting money for her Orleans foundation and this city, well known for its numerous Catholic printing houses, gave Hayes an opportunity to see Apostolate of the Press activities. Hayes’ plans were obstructed when Dupanloup questioned the validity of the Glasgow Constitutions that she intended to implement. In September 1864 Hayes travelled to Rome to seek definite clarification and arrived at Civitavecchia, north of Rome, two days later in the company of Dupeyron who is credited with having stopped for her enroute to the beatification of Margaret Mary Alacoque.

Roman ecclesiastical authorities, whose activities would one day interest Hayes’ readers, decided that a complete revision of the Constitutions was essential. They invited Hayes to undertake the painstaking work, which would require living in Rome, reading volumes of material, researching and rectifying the reason for the

---

93 Jaricot’s work for the support of foreign missionaries grew into a worldwide major financial project.
97 "Personnel File Card of Sister Ignatius".
99 "Personnel File Card of Sister Ignatius".
100 Hayes was in Marseilles on 12 September as indicated, "Passport Issued to Mary Ignatius Hayes," in 'Passports (1864-6, 1871) and papers relating to the Franco-Prussian War', MFIC archives, Rome, section B, folder 3, item 1.
102 "Personnel File Card of Sister Ignatius".
Constitutions’ loss of validity, and meetings with Franciscan and ecclesiastical authorities. Hayes accepted the challenge, aware that her French foundation was impossible without a pontifically approved Franciscan Rule and Constitutions. During the course of her lonely work, living in a convent as a parlour boarder and suffering from the extremes of heat and cold, Hayes was requested by the Glasgow and Bayswater Franciscan Sisters to update and help seek approval for their respective Constitutions also. During this period Hayes’ pen was always busy and she unearthed the truth of diocesan bishops’ interference in the earlier Rule and Constitutions, without pontifical knowledge, going back as far as the seventeenth century. A Tourcoing letter of 1864 clearly admitted, ‘Our Holy Rule is not a Rule of the Third Order of St. Francis’. The Minister General of the Friars Minor by his response to Hayes showed the necessity of leaving intact the Rule of the Third Order approved by the Holy See, with freedom to write Constitutions in accordance with the Franciscan Rule and Church laws. So Hayes wrote in her introduction to the Rule and Constitutions:

The Rule for a religious community is like a ray of divine light; it is the expression of the evangelical counsels and the foundation of a religious life. The Constitutions, which are ordinarily attached to the Rule, are its explanation and development. The Rule, says St. Francis de Sales, is the road, and the Constitutions are the roadposts or indications by which it becomes known, and which are placed for the direction and assistance of those who travel on it; or, as some holy and learned men have expressed it, the Rules propose the means of arriving at perfection, while the Constitutions point out how these means are to be employed.

---

103 Hayes, "Diary", 59.
106 Sr. M. Alphonsine Sufgencit, "Letter from the Franciscan Prioress of Tourcoing Convent", in Bayswater Franciscan Records, ed. Franciscan Father, 1864, MFIC archives, Braintree, Essex. As noted earlier, Hayes had belonged to the Glasgow Franciscan Sisters who traced their roots to the Tourcoing tertiary Grey Sisters who, because of Pius V’s Circa pastoralis, were required to take solemn vows and accept enclosure. Hayes lived in a time of ambiguity before simple-vow communities obtained a clear canonical validation.
Hayes' writing indicates her wide reading of the masters of the spiritual life\textsuperscript{109} while in her segment on education she showed her knowledge of the writings of the celebrated French bishop, Fénelon.\textsuperscript{110} Her Roman experience of almost two years provided Hayes with an opportunity to meet people and to move in a circle of literary and influential friends of whom many were English and who later were to influence her publishing mission in North America and Italy. The Vatican attracted many English visitors, among them literary names whom Hayes had known previously; she continued in later years to correspond with a number of them.\textsuperscript{111} Finally Hayes' work was presented to the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide\textsuperscript{112} and, being assured that Pope Pius IX would sign the approbation of the Rule and Constitutions soon, she left for France in August of 1866.\textsuperscript{113} In the following year her written work was printed and bound.\textsuperscript{114} Also, due to Hayes' work while at the Vatican, Cardinal Alexander Barnabo signed a new Decree for the Glasgow Franciscans in August\textsuperscript{115} and a Rescript for the Bayswater Franciscans in September.\textsuperscript{116}

Hayes returned to Orleans only to discover that another religious community had commenced an educational ministry there, so she resurrected a former plan for Sèvres with the Bishop of Versailles, who gave her ‘a house, chapel and chaplain’ with his blessing to establish a school for boarders and a novitiate.\textsuperscript{117} On 8 December, the special feast of the Immaculate Conception of the Blessed Virgin Mary under whose patronage Hayes’ community was founded, Mass was celebrated in Sèvres' convent chapel; by the 15\textsuperscript{th}, Monsignor Talbot at the Vatican replied in length to Hayes’ letter from ‘13 Bellevue Avenue, Sèvres, près Paris’.\textsuperscript{118} By this time,

\begin{itemize}
\item[109] Such masters that Hayes referred to include Anselm, Augustine, Rodriguez and Francis de Sales.
\item[110] Fénelon (1651-1715) wrote \textit{Traité de l’éducation des filles}, a celebrated educational document. Perhaps even more famous, because of its place in the Quietist debate, is his \textit{Maximes des Saints}.
\item[112] This Roman Congregation dealt with all affairs in foreign mission areas and countries with non-Catholic rulers.
\item[113] "Passport Issued to Mary Ignatius Hayes". Passport’s reverse side indicates Hayes returned to France on 8 August 1866.
\item[114] Hayes, "Rule and Constitutions".
\item[115] "Franciscan Convent of the Immaculate Conception Glasgow: Records", 118. Ahles, \textit{In the Shadow of His Wings}, 471.
\item[116] "Franciscan Convent of the Immaculate Conception Glasgow: Records", 119.
\item[118] "Letter from Monsignor George Talbot to Sœur Marie Ignace", 1866, MFIC archives, Rome, section B, folder 1, item 17. Chaffee, "Memories", 21-2.
\end{itemize}
Hayes had gathered several companions as foundation members of her new community.

Hayes' new Sèvres mission needed financial assistance so Hon. Fanny Montgomery collected funds and involved Talbot in the project.\textsuperscript{119} Hayes' proximity to Paris,\textsuperscript{120} with Montgomery's presence there,\textsuperscript{121} provided her with opportunity to observe French Catholic periodicals, such as \textit{L'Avenir} and \textit{Le Correspondant}, to read publications from outstanding Catholic writers like Mermillod, Lacordaire and Lamennais, and to be aware of the irreligious press that France, like other countries, was producing. Hayes and her community flourished for over three years until the outbreak of the Franco-Prussian war when the convent was forced to close and the community was disbanded.\textsuperscript{122} Hayes, accompanied by three English-born companions, community member Sr. Mary Clare Peet, Hon. Mrs. Montgomery and Rosalie, a young orphan, set out toward the French-German border. Railway authorizations testify that the English group was permitted to travel first to Nancy and then Saarbrücken.\textsuperscript{123} The horrific conditions under which travellers moved were described in detail by Hayes' former Vicar, Butler of Wantage, who was in Germany and France at this time.\textsuperscript{124} Butler, descriptive with his pen, wrote regularly to his wife from late August to mid-October while working in Cologne, Arlon, around Sedan and in Saarbrücken on a Red Cross commission. While no meeting was recorded, Hayes was also working for the Red Cross and nursed wounded French soldiers.\textsuperscript{125} They numbered many, many thousands in hospitals, formerly large chateaux, castles or convents, or in village hotels and homes spread around battlefields.\textsuperscript{126} Hayes and her companions made their way to Berlin where their 'Accreditation for Voluntary Care of the Sick' was signed on 24 October and in January 1871 they were given

\textsuperscript{119} Talbot was asked by Montgomery to obtain a cameo from the Pope. Even Empress Eugenie and Napoleon III were expected to assist. de Brefiny, \textit{Unless the Seed Die}, 108.

\textsuperscript{120} Hayes had written to Talbot. ‘We shall only be a quarter of an hour’s distance from Paris and directly in a line with the Champs Elysees and the English Mission’. "Sister Mary Ignatius of Jesus (Hayes) to Monsignor George Talbot", Mooney, Millett, and Power, "First Installment of Facts", 23.

\textsuperscript{121} Montgomery’s fashionable address was Rue St. Honore close to the Palace Royal and the Louvre.

\textsuperscript{122} Chaffee, "Memories", 23-4.


\textsuperscript{124} Ibid., 251-52, 255, 272.

\textsuperscript{125} Chaffee, "Memories", 24.

passports, signed by Lord Augustus Loftus, as British subjects travelling on the continent.  

The exact movements of Hayes and her group in Germany and France for many months remain obscure but it is confirmed that other English groups, including doctors, nurses, religious Sisters and Red Cross volunteers, helped the many wounded soldiers. Hayes and Montgomery observed people and events and with the outbreak of the *Kulturkampf*, whose secularization drive consolidated the Catholic resolve, they witnessed first hand the necessity for and power of the Catholic press. The ecclesiastico-political struggle caused numerous small papers to spring up and even while Hayes was in Protestant Berlin a Catholic newspaper, *Germania*, commenced as the most important organ of the Catholic Centre Party. It appears from a broad examination of events that Franciscanism and literary interests guided some of Montgomery and Hayes' activities in 1871. Both women were committed to Franciscanism and writing while Montgomery's wealth and influence, plus the presence of Sisters in Franciscan habits, facilitated their common interests.

Fulda was a place of special attraction to English people like Hayes because of its associations with, and of being the burial place of the English missionary, St. Boniface; it was also of interest to Franciscans because St. Francis' followers had lived here for over two hundred years. Dusseldorf was another important Franciscan centre with both friars and sisters working there. The city also gained interest for English people after Florence Nightingale came to Kaiserswerth, a suburb of Dusseldorf, to study nursing. German hospitals were numbered among the world's best with Dusseldorf held in high esteem; wounded soldiers were sent there

---

127 "Passport Issued to Mary Ignatius Hayes", in "Passports (1864-6, 1871) and papers relating to the Franco-Prussian War", MFIC archives, Rome, section B, folder 3, item 2: 1871.
129 Bismark’s *Kulturkampf*, through measures such as the closure of convents and the dispersal of religious communities, produced consolidation among Catholics in consequence. Cf. Gerard Manly Hopkins’ poem, “The Wreck of the ‘Deutschland’”, as an example of its effect in Britain.
131 German Franciscan friars impressed Hayes, for only three years later she asked for them to be sent to Minnesota and to be attached to the Cologne mission in Missouri.
132 The Franciscan friary has overlooked the city since 1623. Hayes’ visit to Fulda when she was in Europe mid 1875-6 indicates an earlier visit and that she knew the Fulda Franciscans.
133 Research in Dusseldorf Friary indicated that the OFM Capuchins were stronger in Cologne and the OFM Observants more numerous in Dusseldorf where the Poor Clares had arrived in 1859.
via Cologne in Rhine River steamboats. Montgomery, who later contributed constantly to Hayes’ Annals, wrote Misunderstood the year after her 1871 experiences and her book was published at Leipzig. Though some distance from the major battlefields, this Saxon city played a significant role in the transportation of soldiers, including the movement of wounded soldiers to numerous German destinations. Montgomery was not the only English Catholic writer and friend of Hayes to use Leipzig for publishing purposes as Rev. William Lockhart had connections here also. Wherever Hayes and her companions moved in 1871, they obviously kept away from Paris where the Commune, which lasted barely two months, brought about the massacre of thousands of citizens and was directly responsible for the deaths of Archbishop Darboy and five Jesuits.

Events of this historic period were to have a profound influence on the development of socialism and communism with their associated press and literary influence, but for Hayes in early 1872 it was time to follow her missionary vision again. She accepted the invitation of a Belgian Redemptorist, Fr. Louis de Buggenoms, to go to the West Indies again, this time to the Island of St. Thomas. Hayes and Peet arrived in the port of St. Thomas where passengers were quarantined; unfortunately Hayes was given a room in which the former occupant had died from yellow fever and she became very ill. Conflicting comments about numerous difficulties at the mission have circulated over the years but the outcome at the time was that Hayes and Peet withdrew and headed for New York.

Period in USA and Italy

It is not known precisely why Hayes chose a passage to New York. However factors such as the availability of shipping, knowledge of Franciscan hospitality there, insights gained in Germany about the pastoral needs of their people in Minnesota

134 Nightingale’s story was widely published but not the fact that she was introduced to the Deaconess Institute through reading its Annual Reports, a gift from London’s Prussian ambassador. Anna Sticker, Florence Nightingale Curriculum Vitae, 3rd ed. (Dusseldorf: Diakoniewerk Kaiserswerth, 1987), 8.
135 Butler, Life and Letters of William John Butler, 246.
136 Hon. Mrs. F. Montgomery, Misunderstood (Leipzig: Bernard Tauchnitz, 1872).
139 Hayes and Peet were expected by Buggenoms in February of 1872. de Breffny, Unless the Seed Die, 111-12. Mooney, Millett, and Power, “First Installment of Facts”, 27-29.
and the financial backing of the Hon. Fanny Montgomery, may well have contributed to her significant decision. While it was known that bishops saw the need for missionaries in the mid west of North America,\textsuperscript{141} no written record exists to explain exactly why in New York, Hayes and Daniel Mason of Belle Prairie signed a deed dated 6 September 1872 for the purchase of land in Belle Prairie.\textsuperscript{142} White settlers came to northern Minnesota in 1851\textsuperscript{143} and the next year Rev. Francis Pierz came to labour among the Chippewa Indians. In the following years the railroads gradually supplanted the horse and carriage as the main means of transport and Hayes with her companion availed themselves of both in order to reach Belle Prairie.

By 1872 the presence of many German people in Minnesota may have been an attraction for Hayes as well as the fact that the Catholic community at Belle Prairie was under the care of German-born Fr. Joseph Buh. Hayes’ ten-acre purchase was beside the St. Paul Northern Pacific Rail Road\textsuperscript{144} and later she purchased land on the opposite side of the railroad line beside the church and reaching down to the Mississippi River. It was on this site that Hayes would build her first convent with its own printing room. Hayes’ numerous missionary experiences enriched her with skills required of a journalist and shortly her wealth of experiences would bear fruit.

This final period of Hayes’ life was so inter-woven with her \textit{Annals}’ work that the following overview of places of residence, major events and travel should serve to highlight her courage and ability to meet editing and publishing commitments regardless of circumstances. Before Mark Twain wrote of his Mississippi River adventures,\textsuperscript{145} Hayes and Peet were established in their Belle Prairie log cabin close to this great river’s upper reaches beyond the unnavigable St. Anthony Falls at St. Paul. In 1872 Belle Prairie was in the St. Paul diocese, under Bishop Grace, but in the following years the diocesan boundaries were to change and Hayes was to negotiate successfully with the later church authorities, Rt. Rev. Rupert Seidenbush,

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{140} Chaffee, "Memories", 24.
\bibitem{142} "Warranty Deed", 1872, MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 11, item 14.
\bibitem{143} Coburn and Smith, \textit{Spirited Lives}, 100.
\bibitem{144} An old plat (handmade map with a scale of 2 inches to the mile) shows ‘E. Hayes. 10’ marked on the corner of Rosenkranz’s huge property. "Plat of Belle Prairie Township 41 North, Ranges 31-32 West", n.d., Morrison County Historical Society Museum archives, Little Falls, Morrison County, Mn.
\bibitem{145} Samuel Langhorne Clemens, pen named Mark Twain, produced \textit{The Adventures of Tom Sawyer} (1876), \textit{Life on the Mississippi} (1883) and \textit{The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn} (1884).
\end{thebibliography}
Bishop John Ireland and Rt. Rev. Dr. Otto Zardetti. Bishop Grace resigned in 1884 and was replaced by Bishop John Ireland, already known to Hayes and later a regular subscriber to her *Annals*.

Hayes initiated plans for new buildings and took advantage of Minnesota’s newspapers to announce that St. Anthony’s Academy for young ladies, offering an impressive curriculum and boarding facilities, would be opened at Belle Prairie on 1 January 1873. In July Hayes travelled to the West Coast to obtain financial assistance on the Californian gold fields and to visit the old Santa Barbara Mission where she met with Fr. Jose M. Romo, the community’s Guardian. This meeting was most significant for it confirmed Hayes’ resolve to proceed with her plans to move into the lively and highly competitive world of the periodical press. Past accounts of this meeting have given Romo credit for suggesting a Franciscan periodical to Hayes but all these accounts rest on interpretations of Chaffee’s written work. Chaffee claimed that Romo ‘urged’ Hayes to proceed, as there was ‘no Franciscan periodical at that time printed in America’; the latter would not have been news to Hayes who read widely. If Romo had seen himself as instigator of Hayes’ journal then surely he would have recorded it in his diary. Examination of Romo’s diaries, in particular of July and August 1873, indicate no record of the event. Besides affording affirmation for her project, the wisdom of Hayes’ visit would be indicated in later years for she had further positioned herself in the North American friars’ networks, in particular that of St. Paul/Jordon, St. Louis and Indiana. Santa Barbara community, after the 1884 visit of Fr. Ferdinand Bergmeyer, became annexed to Indiana and Bergermeyer accepted leadership at Santa Barbara.

---

146 In 1875 the Rt. Rev. Rupert Seidenbush became Vicar Apostolic of Northern Minnesota residing at St. Cloud while in 1889 Belle Prairie came into the new diocese of St. Cloud with the Rt. Rev. Dr. Otto Zardetti its first bishop. John Ireland was to become the famous archbishop of St. Paul.

147 Four new wooden buildings and their different uses were described in *St. Cloud Times*, 12 February 1873, p. 3, column 2.

148 The newspapers included *St. Cloud Press, The Brainerd Tribune, St. Paul Northwestern Chronicle* and *The Minneapolis Daily Tribune* – copies of articles are held in the archives of the Little Falls Franciscan Sisters and the MFIC archives in Rome.

149 This Mission was part of the chain of over twenty-one Franciscan missions along the West Coast.

150 Romo’s travels suggest that Hayes or her friends may have met him previously, see Zephyrin Engelhardt, *Santa Barbara Mission: The Missions and Missionaries of California* (San Francisco, Cal.: The James H. Barry Company, 1923), 414-15.

151 Chaffee, “Memories”, 25.


Hayes’ continued interest in California was reflected later in Annals articles. The fact that within months of the Santa Barbara visit, Hayes’ first issue was printed, appears to be good evidence to support a claim that for years Hayes’ experiences had been preparing her for editorship and that now her preparation was sufficient.

Belle Prairie had been the starting point of Fr. Pierz’s outpost mission; a log cabin was available to Hayes on church property and Bishop Grace must have authorized her to go there. However, Hayes also felt free to inquire about property options in Brainerd, a railroad town twenty-eight miles further north, which was mushrooming and was expected to become one of Minnesota’s major centres. Hayes opened a school in Brainerd but it was short lived. She directed it from 25 November 1873 to February 1874 at the corner of Tenth and Main (now Washington) Streets and, according to a local newspaper, it offered a curriculum similar to the Belle Prairie school. Apparently since French Canadians and German migrants were numerous in the area, Hayes and Peet’s language skills were well received. In 1874 Hayes wrote to the Lake Superior and Puget Sound Company asking for lots in block 131, in accord with the Company’s Christian practice to allot land to charitable organizations, but was unsuccessful. Ahles suspected that Hayes wanted to make Brainerd her main centre. The most important outcome of her short-lived Brainerd venture was her opportunity to meet the town’s newspaper printer, Morris C. Russell, who became the Sisters’ advocate and the first printer of Hayes’ Annals.

The Annals rolled off the Brainerd press successfully for eighteen months, then came a pause to allow Hayes to set out for Europe. She visited the Franciscan Minister General in Rome, renewed old acquaintances, discussed plans for a chaplain back home and sought tirelessly to gain more Sisters for the Belle Prairie community. After


156 Articles about the school were in The Brainerd Tribune 22 November, 6 December 1873 and 7 March 1874. Franciscan Sisters archives, Little Falls and MFIC, Rome. Also reference in Ingolf Dillan, Brainerd’s Half Century (Brainerd, Mn: publisher unknown, 1923), 31.


158 Hayes, Sisters of St. Francis to T. H. Canfield, Letter of 1874.

159 Ahles, In the Shadow of His Wings, 76.

160 Brainerd’s Historical Museum throws light on life in the town in 1873-4, including the former printery houses, the railway station and St. Francis of Assisi Catholic Church near the old Courthouse.
sixteen months with many trials and difficulties, including the frustration of dealing with Rome's Cardinal Vicar and a Minister General who feared sending two volunteer Poor Clare nuns to Minnesota,\(^{161}\) Hayes with these Bentivoglio blood sisters, Maddalena and Constance, plus a Franciscan friar, finally crossed the Atlantic and returned to New York. However there, to her great disappointment, the intended new chaplain lost heart for the West, which in turn caused the two Poor Clare nuns to feel obliged not to proceed to Belle Prairie with Hayes. One consolation was that, since Hayes stayed with the Allegany Franciscan Sisters during her visit, true to her nature, she did not miss the opportunity to update herself on New York’s vibrant periodical press and Catholic journalism. Clearly, one New York printing contact was recorded.\(^{162}\)

Hayes still needed recruits so, in the spring of 1876, she travelled to Montreal and the fact that five young women received the habit of St. Francis later that year shows that her Canadian visit was successful. The training of more new members, solicitude for the academy, the opening of a new chapel, the development of the self-supporting farm and concerns over local vandalism, prevented Hayes from returning to her editorship until preparations for the January 1878 edition. This year marked the death of the Pope, Pius IX, whom Hayes had known, followed by the election of Leo XIII. These events were reflected in her Annals’ articles. Some writers have sought peace and quiet in order to accomplish their task; Hayes’ editorial work in Belle Prairie seems to have benefited from a pastoral environment such as the following description suggests:

Life lay in the far West, on the banks of the Mississippi, in a large quaint convent, built chiefly of wood, and with a church attached to it, a farm-yard close by, a well-stocked garden, many flowers for the altar, and some grand old trees spared by the recent settlers. Green meadows are all around, where the kine feed knee deep in the rich herbage, ‘Forty feeding as one’, and where you hear the mighty river whispering along its banks amid the reeds and sedges …\(^{163}\)

---

\(^{161}\) Hayes, "Diary", 70-74.

\(^{162}\) “Brother Stanislaus Clarke to Mother M. Ignatius”, letter, 30 January 1879, MFIC archives, Rome.

Perhaps the writer, Fanny Montgomery, saw through rose-coloured glasses yet the description is a rare one and from first-hand observation. Another rarity are the sketches of the Belle Prairie Convent's printing rooms along with Chaffee's memories which indicate that the *Annals* were being printed by the Sisters in 1878. But things were about to change; Hayes was planning to establish a branch house in Augusta, Georgia, where assistance could be offered to children of emancipated slaves. Hayes was in communication with Indiana's Notre Dame University Press through Br. Stan Clarke whose printing experience lessened the challenge of transferring the printing of the *Annals* to the South. Clarke's letter also provides an insight into another circle of Hayes' friends, as Clarke knew William Gross, Bishop of Savannah. The Augusta ministry included the opening of an industrial school for youth where printing was included. In 1879 Hayes not only opened another house and school on the Isle of Hope, Savannah, assisting many Protestant Afro-American children, but was busy also with extensions in the Augusta complex. Hayes was called back to Belle Prairie to deal with tensions caused by Peet who shortly left the institute. The establishment of a novitiate kept Hayes very busy but by December 1880 she and Chaffee set off for Rome with the intention of establishing a Generalate there. To the advantage of the *Annals*, while they were in Rome they lived with a family whose relative was a Jesuit Brother, a printer, working on the influential Jesuit newspaper, *Civitella Cattolica*. The task involved a period of seven months yet the *Annals* publication was uninterrupted, and before the year was ended Hayes was back in the USA. She then returned to Rome to take up permanent residency on the Via Alfieri. In the same year Hayes also planned for a house in her beloved Assisi which would be close to the Chapel of Our Lady of the Angels. Young Italians were asking to join the community so that in the following year more women received the habit of St. Francis in her community.

The year 1883 witnessed the transfer of the printing of the *Annals* to Rome and early in the summer of 1885 the business of the institute required Hayes to travel to America, via New York again, to Belle Prairie and Augusta, also to Montreal. In Belle Prairie there were difficulties with a problematic Fr. Lemay and, among the Sisters,

---

164 Chaffee, "Memories", 26, 32.
167 Chaffee, "Memories", 35.
168 Ibid., 36.
increased opposition to a Generalate in Rome.\textsuperscript{170} Her visit lasted six months and when she returned to Rome, ten prospective members accompanied her. The Belle Prairie situation worsened, Fr. Lemay was deprived of religious faculties; the Sisters in Augusta, aware that Bishop Becker, successor to Bishop Gross, preferred religious who were directly under diocesan control, consulted with him, then requested separation from Hayes’ institute - which they gained.\textsuperscript{171}

Among the joys and difficulties of 1887, Hayes also opened a convent in Naples for sick Sisters, guided the profession of fourteen young members, some of whom were due to return to North America to help distribute the \textit{Annals}, and worried over the unrest among her Sisters in America. Hayes wanted to visit America again but was prevented because of ecclesiastical pressure on her to open another Roman establishment. The following year Hayes opened the Testaccio Convent beside the River Tiber but it caused her great anxiety for it commenced, against her better judgement, in an unhealthy, rough area. This same year Hayes established a Confraternity in relation to the \textit{Annals} and transferred the Generalate to Villa Spada on the Janiculum Hill. Villa Spada, an impressive building, was to become a source of great anxiety because of the legal problems that evolved due to corrupt contractors. Hayes received news that her friend and regular correspondent, Bishop Ireland, was appointed first Archbishop of St. Paul. Ireland became a particularly powerful figure in the US hierarchy.

For Hayes, 1889 brought great suffering for in April the supporters of Fr. Lemay vented their anger against the Belle Prairie Sisters whom they suspected of being associated with those who brought about the priest’s dismissal. These adversaries set fire to and completely burnt down the convent-school buildings but the Sisters and their pupils escaped.\textsuperscript{172} By November the unrest among her Sisters in America increased as those from Augusta joined those who had moved to Little Falls after the fire. Hayes consulted with Archbishop Ireland and he advised her not to rebuild in Belle Prairie.\textsuperscript{173} Ireland wrote to assure Hayes that order had been re-established

\textsuperscript{169} The term institute is used to mean the whole religious community or congregation.
\textsuperscript{170} de Breffny, \textit{Unless the Seed Die}, 172-73, 176-77. Ahles, \textit{In the Shadow of His Wings}, 185-86, 198.
\textsuperscript{171} de Breffny, \textit{Unless the Seed Die}, 203-04.
\textsuperscript{172} Ibid., 196.
\textsuperscript{173} Chaffee, "Memories", 56.
and that two ‘rebellious clergymen’, Lemay and Forties, had left Minnesota. Nothing of all these events was reflected in the Annals and its editor remained faithful to its publication, regardless of her busy office and the anxiety that beset her as leader.

The Sisters in America were under stress when Hayes apparently did not reply to their letters and relationships with the Generalate deteriorated. Without Hayes’ permission a group of Sisters from Augusta left their Augusta convent, went ahead with their own plans to join the Sisters in Minnesota and soon the new bishop, Dr. Otto Zardetti, was involved. To date, nothing has been written to link Zardetti’s behaviour with ‘Knownothingism’, a revised anti-foreigners attitude in the United States, but his behaviour seemingly aligned him to it. Zardetti, at first hesitant, recommended that the Belle Prairie Sisters shake off Hayes’ authority as Mother General in Rome and encouraged (demanded, according to one oral tradition) that the Sisters separate and establish their own diocesan autonomy as long as a Franciscan spiritual director was involved.

This situation was not unique to Hayes’ community; the Sisters of St. Joseph of Carondelet (CSJS) had a similar experience with bishops encouraging the idea of creating an independent American identity. Archbishop John Ireland, who advised the CSCJ’s against central government, also advised Hayes in 1889 ‘to give them (American houses) a certain Provincial autonomy’. However Hayes, perhaps because of her small numbers or her aversion to splinter groups, remained committed to centralised government and she did not follow the advice of the powerful archbishop. This whole situation in the American houses had very serious implications for the Annals.

1890 brought with it a lawsuit over Villa Spada, acceptance of the bitter disappointment over the separation of the American Sisters, led by the Little Falls community, and financial difficulties with declining Annals subscriptions resulting from the unrest. Hayes was not left alone in these difficult days for, according to Chaffee,

175 de Breffny, Unless the Seed Die, 210.
176 Coburn and Smith, Spirited Lives, 57-61.
177 John Ireland to Mother M. Ignatius, letter, 19 June, 1889, MFIC archives, Rome.
her friend, Cardinal Vicar Parocchi, came to lend support.\textsuperscript{178} Representatives of the separated Sisters visited Propaganda Fide to obtain formal separation and Hayes at this stage did not oppose their action. Young women continued to join Hayes but by 1891, because of the separation, her numbers in Italy counted only twenty-five professed sisters and four novices. Sr. M. Anna Flannery alone returned as directed by Hayes from America.\textsuperscript{179} However, a new group of \textit{Annals} distributors, including Flannery, were farewelled to America, while in Rome with Hayes still as editor, the printing, stitching, binding and dispatching of the \textit{Annals} continued. The leaders of the Little Falls group tried to attract the newly arrived Sisters and this incensed Hayes for it discredited her institute. In Little Falls on 1 March the Sisters rejoiced as Bishop Zardetti issued the formal decree for the Franciscan Little Falls diocesan congregation; by July however the Sacred Congregation of Bishops did expel some members for their errors. Hayes during this period had been required to produce much official paper work for the Vatican and it showed not only her integrity but also her outstanding talent for writing.

In 1892 Hayes watched the growth of the institute but still suffered from the disagreeable consequences of the American separation that dragged on into the next year. Parocchi, Rome’s Cardinal Vicar, asked Hayes to explain happenings further, in particular to answer accusations from the new diocesan congregation. Hayes responded with the conciseness and clarity of an experienced editor and foundress so that the cardinal’s inquiry was completely satisfied.\textsuperscript{180} In June 1893 Hayes left Rome for Naples enroute to New York but severe sickness prevented her from travelling across the Atlantic again. Early December found Hayes back in Rome to celebrate one of her favourite Marian feasts, the Immaculate Conception – titular feast of her religious institute, but the days of her personal missionary endeavours were drawing to a close.

Death approached for Hayes in 1894 and on 6 May her Franciscan leadership role, as well as her editorship of the \textit{Annals}, was assumed by her faithful companion and former secretary, Sr. M. of the Angels Chaffee. As Hayes lay dying surrounded by her Sisters, the Franciscan General - her German-born friend from Fulda - gave her

\textsuperscript{178} Chaffee, "Memories", 57.
\textsuperscript{179} de Breffny, \textit{Unless the Seed Die}, 221-22.
\textsuperscript{180} Ibid., 231-32.
the last rites of the Church.\textsuperscript{181} Without Chaffee's recorded memories of this and so many other events, told briefly in the 1894 Annals and later in greater detail, much of Hayes' extraordinary trans-Atlantic life would have remained unknown.

So many experiences in Hayes' life prepared her to be a fitting Apostle of the Press and she remained committed to it to the end. Her life is also manifestly an example of a woman who dared to break with the dominant stereotype of Victorian life by stepping into Catholic journalism and who through her spirituality, struggles and literary influences turned a large part of her life's mission into 'the propagation of good books'.

\footnote{Chaffee, "Memories", 59.}
Chapter 2

Nineteenth Century Periodical Literature – ‘Immense power for good or evil’

To achieve adequate exploration of this field, four main steps will be undertaken. In this chapter secular and non-Catholic religious journals will be considered in order to set the broad stage. The following two chapters will deal respectively with Catholic periodical literature in Europe and in North America, more specifically the United States, while chapter 5 will treat the wide field of Franciscan publications. Each of these chapters will contain relevant illustration of Hayes’ experience and knowledge of each of the milieux in which these categories of periodical literature were generated and sustained.

Secular Periodicals:
To deal with the volume of periodicals available, particular writers and journals have been selected to guide the search of secular journals. The plan is to briefly set the scene, consider irreligious publications, gain insight through a major Victorian journalist, examine the ‘Age of the Periodical’, and then focus on the Central Minnesota Press.

Setting the scene
Work and wages, commerce and finance, exploiting and exploited, these subjects were of keen interest to many nineteenth-century people in an era of intellectual and social ferment. In a high proportion of nineteenth-century journals the reader was provided with references to *The Times*; for example, this influential newspaper published a social justice article in which Manning stated that ‘every man has a right to work or to bread’. The article was widely denounced in the periodical press as socialistic and anarchistic.¹ This reaction to *The Times*’ article indicates something of the period’s climate, a time of change, revolution and transition. Manning, the ‘Dockers’ Cardinal’, concerned for poor workers and their families, negotiated in the Workers Strike of 1889. Such, so called, clerical interference in the workers’ question was disliked by Marx who had written to Engels regarding the German clergy, ‘We

have to combat the clerics vigorously, especially in the Catholic areas ... the scoundrels are flirting with the worker’s question whenever it seems appropriate.\(^2\)

In her *Annals*, Hayes defined the Internationale that originated from Marx and his friends, as ‘a sort of international trades-union founded upon socialistic and anti-religious principles’ and recognised its widespread influence.\(^3\) Hayes was writing about Canon Schorderet who realised that the Catholic press needed to be completely ‘independent of free-masonry and socialism’. In nineteenth-century Europe and other countries, the influence was spreading of the German political philosopher and revolutionary, Karl Marx, who with Engels had produced the *Communistic Manifesto*. Marx, having been banished from Belgium, went to Paris, then to the Rhineland, and in Cologne he took advantage of the power of the press by establishing and editing a communist periodical.\(^4\) Later in London Marx contributed articles on contemporary and social events to republican European and American newspapers - for example the *New York Tribune* and the *New American Cyclopedia* - and maintained contact with followers whose aim was to form revolutionary organisations. In the 1860s when Marx’s activities and writings were given press coverage, Hayes lived and moved around France, Italy and Germany, so events in Europe influenced her and shaped her ideas about the powerful influence of the press.

This is not the place to look at socialism’s many faces but since the *Annals* of Hayes form part of the Christian reaction to the period’s socialist and anti-religious literature, some points require consideration. The Industrial Revolution had brought new kinds of world products and a new style of world economy. The new working class suffered from appalling conditions and there arose trade unions and socialist philosophers who denounced capitalism, writers who raised public awareness and social workers who alleviated suffering. Added to this complex scene were scientists such as Darwin who, through the publication of *The Origin of the Species* and later *The Descent of Man* with its theory of evolution by natural selection, undermined traditional religious

\(^2\) J. Derek Holmes and Bernard W. Bickers, "The Church, Revolution and Reaction, 1789-1914", in *A Short History of the Catholic Church* (Tunbridge Wells, Kent: Burns & Oates, 1984), 228.

\(^3\) Hayes, "The Apostolate of the Press", 35.

\(^4\) Charles Sowerwine, "Marxism and History" (paper presented at the History Unit 131084, Methods and Research, University of Melbourne, 15 August 2001). Marx’s periodical was the *Neue Rheinische Zeitung*. 
beliefs. Darwin’s work, at times indebted to Natural History Periodicals,\(^5\) challenged the way the Bible had been interpreted and the churches strongly opposed his theory. One famous 1860 debate was between the Bishop of Oxford, known to Hayes, and Thomas H. Huxley who supported the evolutionary theory. Every epoch displays what many at the time regard as a wedge of evil. In the nineteenth century, in this context good periodical literature appeared to some to be a remedy for contagious secularism which could threaten deeply held religious and social values.

**Irreligious publications**

The nineteenth-century marketplace was flooded with literature on “isms” including Socialism, Darwinianism and Malthusianism, to name just a few; many of these were indifferent or hostile to traditional Christian religion. While conversions to Catholicism were numerous in England, many European, including English, Christians, listened to the literary prophets of the day. The religious press struggled against its secular critics while the Catholic Apostolate of the Press clarified its purpose and tried to counterbalance what Hayes called, ‘irreligious publications’. What did this term ‘irreligious’ mean for Hayes and some other contemporary Christian thinkers? Religion, belief in a superhuman power, for Christians involved faith in a personal God entitled to obedience, love and worship. Literature published contrary to this was seen as irreligious.

Whether it was the Garret club viewed as a bizarre form of socialism,\(^6\) or concern that so-called Christian Socialists proclaimed socialism as a development and outcome of Christianity,\(^7\) opinions on Socialism were broad and many, and appear to have come under the umbrella of irreligious. The link between the three named ‘isms’ is only a small part of the whole scene, but it will be considered a little further with the help of one major Victorian journalist. Harriet Martineau can provide an insight into the period’s turbulent intellectual atmosphere, the world of journals, and the ‘immense power for good or evil which in these days is inherent in the Press’.\(^8\)

---


\(^7\) The Christian socialist movement from 1848 published a weekly journal. One Christian Socialist was Thomas Hughes, politician, judge, college principal, and friend of Charles Kingsley who clashed with J. H. Newman.

\(^8\) Hayes, "The Apostolate of the Press", 73.
Insight through a major Victorian journalist

Harriet Martineau (1802-76) lived at a time when many intellectual women were challenging the view that women were inferior to men, especially in regard to scientific knowledge. Martineau travelled in ‘Bible lands’, wrote a critical study on the Bible, visited New York, wrote at her home in England’s Lake District and found satisfying alternatives to the popular male clubs. The writer embraced scientific materialism, and was both lionised and vilified as her writings, characterised by advanced views on social, economic, and religious questions, caused considerable controversy. Martineau was most famous for *Illustrations of Political Economy* (1832-34) while, besides numerous other writings and translations, she wrote for a wide range of newspapers and a number of major periodicals, including the *Westminster, Cornhill, Dublin University Magazine, Quarterly* and *Macmillan’s*. The strongest con-temporary criticism of Martineau was reserved for her as a woman meddling in the male’s domain of science.

Scientific pamphlets and journals of the 1860s were proclaiming atheism and Martineau had joined the crusade of rationalists who put their faith in the scientific method. At a time when religion and science were seen as incompatible, Martineau chose the new culture of materialism with its emphasis on self-sufficiency, achievement and production. This contradicted the Christian concept of a bountiful God who gives life and sustains it, and who invites collaborators to transform history into God’s reign of justice and love. Secular journals that acclaimed human achievement as the centre of life were seen by Christians as irreligious. When Kingsley was tired of battling in his struggle with faith and materialism, he asked, ‘What does God require of us?’ He found an answer in Scripture: ‘Act justly, love tenderly and walk humbly with your God’. Contrary to Kingsley’s answer, Martineau took her own path. She busied herself, through the power of the press, in popularizing and disseminating the new knowledge of contemporary economic,

---

10 Sanders, "I'm Your Man.' Harriet Martineau and the Edinburgh Review", 38.
political and philosophical ideas. Martineau linked many disciplines and besides drawing on the radical and democratic ideas of Adam Smith, she, like Darwin, drew also on Malthusian theories. In keeping with her embrace of scientific materialism and secularism, her writings on moral duty stressed the basis of morality as non-religious.

On reading the Martineau-Atkinson *Letters on the Laws of Man’s Nature and Development* (1851) Charlotte Bronte, a clergyman’s daughter like Hayes, was shocked by the scientific approach and wrote:

> It is the first exposition of avowed atheism and materialism I have ever read; the first unequivocal declaration of disbelief in the existence of a God or a future life I have ever seen. In judging of such exposition and declaration, one would wish entirely to put aside the sort of instinctive horror they awaken, and to consider them in an impartial spirit and collected mood. This I find it difficult to do. ... If this be Truth, man or woman who beholds her can but curse the day he or she was born.\(^\text{16}\)

Bronte’s words provide an example of how committed Christian people could feel on seeing irreligious publications and of Christian people’s concern for Truth. Hayes expressed her concern for Truth by quoting Monsignor Mermillod, exiled bishop of Geneva, who said:

> Truth is held captive by the revolution throughout the world; the press is enslaved, and at the mercy of error; but it can be sanctified by sacrifice and prayer. Good literature, he said, can carry the bread of Truth to a society, which is dying of sheer want of justice, and peace, and liberty.\(^\text{17}\)

In Martineau’s circle of friends was Marian Evans, alias George Eliot and first rate novelist,\(^\text{18}\) who had cast off her Evangelical faith under the influence of biblical

\(^{18}\) Eliot contributed successfully to *Blackwood’s Magazine* with her serial *Scenes of Clerical Life* (1858); her most famous work is the novel, *Adam Bede*. 
criticism. Martineau, unlike Evans, did not use a male pseudonym, but she conveyed the idea that a successful woman must really be a man. Evans’ family was torn asunder, as were many other Victorian families, when a member converted to another Church or to outright agnosticism. Hayes had suffered also and knew the pain of being cut off from family and friends. Hayes wished to bring to the periodical press her particular kind of convert zeal, something very different from what Martineau stood for when she wrote:

How could it matter to me that the adherents of a decaying mythology … were fiercely clinging to their Man-God, their scheme of salvation, their reward and punishment … as ordered by their mythology? … To the emancipated, it is a small matter that those who remain imprisoned are shocked at the daring which goes forth into the sunshine and under the stars, to study and enjoy, without leave asked, or fear of penalty.

‘Age of the Periodical’

In 1840, in the ‘Age of the Periodical’, Robert Montgomery, editor of the Colonial Times, penned the following thus providing readers with his insight into the importance of the secular periodical press not only in Europe but also in other countries:

Periodicals are amongst the peculiar characteristics of the present age: emanating from the womb of circumstances, and imbued with the vitality of existing events, they direct the current of living thought and active energy, and give a form, a tone, and hue to society.

In this age, publications, whether titled journals or magazines, spread new insights about economics, commerce, women’s issues, the need for temperance and the

19 Houghton, The Victorian Frame of Mind 1830-1870, 50.
21 Hayes, "Diary", 3.
struggle of workers, and also addressed student and children’s needs. Developing technology, faster distribution and lower prices made the periodicals possible for a greater number of readers. Even Marian Evans was worried that the amount of time consumed by the reading of periodicals, along with train excursions, visits to museums and the pursuit of scientific interests, would cause the death of her kind of leisure.

Among major British secular periodicals that flooded the market, two outstanding ones were *The Edinburgh Review* (1802-1929) and *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*. Amongst the European periodical equivalents were placed the *French Revue des Deux Mondes* (founded 1829 and continues) and the German *Literarisches Wochenblatt* (1820-98). Well-known British secular journals were shipped to America, Australia and other countries and included, *Punch, The English Family Herald, Household Words, Tit-bits, All the Year Round* and *Illustrated London News*. To ascertain if these publications, which arrived at many nineteenth-century coastal ports in the United States, reached the American Midwest, investigations were conducted in some Minnesota libraries in order to discover the kind of literary situation Hayes’ *Annals* encountered.

The number, variety and readership of attractively designed periodicals grew enormously in the United States around 1850, ‘America’s Golden Age’. American literary reviews and magazines that reached Australia for example and were readily available included the *North American Review*, the *Atlantic Monthly*, *Harper’s Monthly Magazine* and *Scriber’s Magazine*, so what was available in the State of Minnesota? What periodicals were advertised for sale in the city of St. Cloud, situated south of Belle Prairie township and in between Hayes’ convent and the twin cities of Minneapolis/St Paul? Of the four periodicals quoted, three were advertised in the

---

26 One of the most influential critical journals of its day, numbering among its contributors Sir Walter Scott, Thomas Carlyle and Matthew Arnold.
28 Libraries included public and convent ones in St. Paul, Minneapolis, St. Joseph, St. Cloud, Little Falls and Brainerd.
29 *The Atlantic* - formerly *The Atlantic Monthly*, first published 1857 - was edited by eminent writers and critics.
30 *Harpers New Monthly Magazine* (first published 1850) led the advances with many woodcut illustrations and serialised fiction by popular English authors. ‘New’ was omitted by 1872.
1872-3 St. Cloud newspaper, the *St. Cloud Journal.*\(^{32}\) The *North American Review* (1815-1940), named in the early part of the century as one of the most important serious periodicals circulating in the United States, was absent; however this may indicate that it was so popular that it did not need advertising.\(^{33}\) In amongst much information about train and boat travel, points on farming and guidance for health care, were the Literary Notices that encouraged the purchase of periodicals. Hayes had been surrounded by a large number of secular journals in central Minnesota, some twenty-six at least.\(^{34}\) No reference was found to any journal published in Minnesota, a fact confirmed by Hayes’ printer who wrote in his *Brainerd Tribune,* ‘It [Hayes’ *Annals*] is the only monthly magazine now published in Minnesota’.\(^{35}\)

**Central Minnesota press**

Central Minnesota press records indicate that in the 1870s there was no shortage of local printing-houses, male editors and newspapers.\(^{36}\) Hayes chose initially to avail herself of a Brainerd printing house rather than one at St. Cloud where the controversial newspaper editor, Mrs. Jane Grey Swisshelm (1815-84) worked.\(^{37}\) Known as the St. Cloud firebrand, the first and only other local woman editor at the time, she experienced opposition resulting in mob violence, demolition of her press and disposal of its remains in the Mississippi River.\(^{38}\) Eventually Swisshelm sold her *Visitor* and the newspaper became the *St. Cloud Journal*;\(^{39}\) Hayes advertised her school in it but avoided its printing services.

Among the host of secular American periodicals that reached the environs of St. Cloud and the Mississippi River settlements, the most popular were *Godey’s Lady’s Book, Peterson’s Magazine* and *Vick’s Illustrated Magazine.*\(^{40}\) With confidence *Godey’s Lady’s Book* advertised itself:

---

\(^{32}\) Records in the Stearns History Museum and Research Centre, St. Cloud, Mn., microfilm.

\(^{33}\) Editors of the *North American Review* during its illustrious career included such literary figures as J. R. Lowell, Charles E. Norton, and Henry Adams; one reviews contributor was the novelist, Henry James.

\(^{34}\) Records of newspaper pages and “Literary notices” in the *St. Cloud Journal, 1872-73,* microfiche.

\(^{35}\) Morris C. Russell, "News Item", *Brainerd Tribune,* 26 September 1874, 1, col. 7.


\(^{38}\) Burnquist, ed., *Minnesota and Its People,* 69.

\(^{39}\) Ibid.

\(^{40}\) The Brainerd library also held the contemporary *New Monthly Magazine, Public Opinion, The Household and Browning’s Magazine.*
The unanimous voice of the Ladies of America, and the public press throughout the United States, have pronounced Godey’s Lady’s Book ‘not a luxury, but a necessity,’ in every well-regulated household.41

The journal’s lengthy table of contents showed a breadth of interests and even covered ‘Selections from the Writings of Fénélon’, whose famous reflections on the education of girls were familiar to Hayes.42 The first volume of Vick’s Illustrated Monthly Magazine commenced four years after Hayes launched her periodical. It deplored past experiences with related journals and argued for a new and more regular monthly publication.43 Hayes resonated to the wishes of Vick’s readers for she had begun with a monthly periodical. The editor provided an insight into the competitive and influential world of American journalism as follows:

For beauty we do not design to have it excelled by any journal in the world, and while it will have a character of its own, and be the index of what we think and feel and know, we may perhaps be allowed to express the hope, that, as a teacher of the people and a guide to the millions, it may prove without a rival.44

Peterson’s Magazine, another popular American journal, provides a sample of the flavour of the times. The contents of this publication by 1888 showed a special interest in English life; for example, issue one told the story of well-known English writer, Charles Kingsley.45 Everything in the account was familiar to Hayes and other English immigrants and illustrated how an American publication could successfully contain English content. The cover page of the July 1888 issue began with a story, “How a Great English Noble Lives”46 and while the publication’s contents ranged over numerous topics, links to the old country were evident. Peterson’s Magazine was studded with poetry, a popular nineteenth-century practice in secular periodicals that Hayes also employed successfully.

44 Ibid.
Hayes’ activity appears to sit well technically in the kind of journalistic milieu around her. However, her commitment to the Apostolate of the Press meant producing good literature to counteract in some degree the perceived irreligious outpourings of the secular press. As the monthly periodical became more and more the arena for serious discussion of life’s problems, it was logical and necessary that this literary form become popular for propagating religious ideas.

Religious Periodicals:

Introduction

Publishers of religious journals recognised the merits and demerits of the secular periodical Press, and wished to counterbalance the evil perceived in certain irreligious, sensational or scandal-filled magazines. Although religious journalistic literature had been taking shape in the eighteenth century, only in the next century did an increased number of individuals gain a greater realization of the power of the press and were able to lead their religious followers into journalistic action; yet others fearfully still held back.47 Hayes, as a committed Anglican for thirty-three years, was surrounded with religious literature, especially Tractarian, and was aware of the growing desire for periodical literature. Hayes realised the need for her Annals years before Stead claimed that:

The monthly magazine or review represents the higher thought of our time, and, hence, a good monthly magazine is as indispensable for the culture of a democracy as a well-endowed University, or a good common school’.48

Coming to the field of non-Catholic journals, it became clear that writer-converts to Catholicism had often written previously for Church of England journals, continued to read them, and made reference to them in later articles. Hayes read the Guardian,49 described as the most intelligent weekly among the churches and the leading journal of the Church of England.50 She also read The Quarterly Review,51 that according to

50 Chadwick, The Victorian Church, Part Two, 1860-1901, 125, 420.
*The Month* was ‘top of the list’ and she knew of *The Christian Work* published by the London Mission Society, supposedly a non-denominational journal yet considered to be Congregationalist. Among methods used by researchers in the examination of religious journals, some employed the headings of denominations and religious tendencies. This discussion however on non-Catholic journals favours a chronological approach guided by Hayes’ presence in England (1840s-50s). This, combined with an overview of major denominational movements and related journals, moves the investigation through the turbulent century so that Hayes’ contribution may be better situated.

Early in the century, traditional religious views were weakened by the general spread of knowledge and discussion, aided by the publication of sceptical secular and anti-Christian periodicals. Religious and sincere minds struggled with the difficulty of discriminating truth from error as more and more journals flooded the fast growing market. Many Victorians were:

> Simply perplexed, - frightened or rendered desperate, as the case may be - by the utter confusion into which late discoveries or speculations have thrown their most elementary ideas of religion. … Let them be fierce with you who have no experience of the difficulty with which error is discriminated from truth, and the way of life found amid the illusions of the world.

**Non-Catholic religious periodicals**

**Early in the century and 1830s**

Denominations faced internal struggles, which it seems undermined their readiness to respond adequately to a faith crisis; the real point of conflict was apparently the inadequate response of the churches. Both the critical spirit and the will to believe were further influenced by scientific journals and related publications. ‘The Bible and the Bible alone’ was the watchword of English Protestantism. A faith that interpreted the Bible literally, without understanding of deeper symbolic and metaphorical

---

53 See e.g., Altholz, *The Religious Press in Britain, 1760-1900*.
meaning, faced a crisis when confronted with the new scientific findings. Hayes captured this struggle in a young Englishman’s words:

We Protestants do not find much strength in our religion to keep us from evil, and help us to practise what is good. It is very difficult for us to find what is the right true religion, and what we should do to obtain the certainty of salvation. All is darkness and confusion, and in the midst of a multitude of teachers that there are among us, each holding different opinions, how is it possible to find one who can guide us into the truth? It creates in us a despair of ever discovering it …

Through periodicals, assisted by lectures and sermons, one prophet after another helped to create a ‘climate of opinion’, and so scepticism and the habit of doubt were unconsciously bred. The Church of England’s answer to this and to Charles Knight’s famous *Penny Magazine* (1832-45/6) was the *Saturday Magazine* (1832-44) published by John Parker for the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge. It combined general information and religious instruction with portraits of churchmen, scenes from the Holy Land, biblical illustration, and pictures of cathedrals and churches. In the same year the Methodists produced their *Evangelical Penny Magazine and Bible Illustrator*. These Methodists, in general seen as dissenters, sought in particular to counter the effect of Sabbath non-religious reading which was considered an evil in their eyes. The Methodists’ first issue displayed a woodcut of John Wesley and extracts from his religious diary were scattered throughout the journal. Hayes employed the stories of saints’ lives in the same way that this Methodist journal promoted the biographies of evangelical holy men. Since the guiding force of the periodical was zealouness without any lighter entertaining, its readership became very restricted.

Contemporary non-Catholic journals, including *The Evangelical Spectator*, *The Evangelist* and the *Evangelical Magazine*, continued in the market even when William and Robert Chambers with their *Chamber’s (Edinburgh) Journal* (1832-1955) strengthened competition. From 1834, the aim of the *Christian Keepsake and

---

60 The *Chamber’s Journal* went on to reach a circulation of 90,000 in 1845.
Missionary Annual (1834-39) was the promotion of piety and the diffusion of authentic information respecting the progress and effects of Christianity in different quarters of the globe. Its purpose was much the same as that of many other Victorian missionary periodicals published in London by denominational missionary societies or by missionary societies serving a group of denominations. Missionary magazines were a lively part of the religious press before the temperance journals entered the publishing scene in mid-nineteenth century.\(^{61}\)

The Christian Lady’s Magazine (1834-49), launched beside the new serious monthly and quarterly literary reviews, The Southern Literary Messenger and Graham’s Magazine (both connected with Edgar Allan Poe), exemplified Protestant religious journals which were ‘Christian’ in tone, anti-slavery and also anti-Catholic. Christian Lady’s Magazine published an essay on ‘Reasons for Leaving the Church of Rome’ and its pages spoke of ‘taking the Christian message to the Irish and removing them from the influence of Rome’. Charlotte E. Tonna, editor for most of the magazine’s life, sought to enhance women’s power through this instructive and educational magazine, yet she castigated the writings of Mary Wollstonecraft.\(^{62}\) Tonna’s journal far outlived its contemporary, the Christian Mother’s Magazine (1844-45) and the earlier Christian Lady’s Friend and Family Repository (September 1831-September 1833). Also published at this time was the Baptist Reporter (1836-57; 1864-65), a quasi-temperance periodical offering church news, cautionary anecdotes, and practical advice including suggestions for Sunday Schools.\(^{63}\) The Unitarian’s accessible journal, The National – A Library for the People (1839) was short lived even though Tennyson, Wordsworth, Keats and other famous poets contributed to it.\(^{64}\) The Christian Teacher (1835-39), first a monthly and then a quarterly, was intended for all denominations despite its strong Unitarian control. In 1838 an article indicated its awareness of the influence and responsibilities of periodical literature yet, after further attempts to revitalise and being renamed The National Review, it

\(^{61}\) Jerry Anne Dickel, Victorian Missionary Periodicals, Yale Divinity Library, http://www.library.yale.edu/div/exhibit_1.htm; accessed 15 July 2002. This exhibit was based on Altholz, The Religious Press in Britain, 1760-1900.


survived until only 1864.\textsuperscript{65} Many of these journals evidence the short life-span of religious periodicals.

1840s-60s

Writers of the Oxford Movement tracts gradually became contributors to Tractarian journals. In the early 1840s their \textit{British Critic} published articles by Dr. William G. Ward who soon converted to the Catholic community and then contributed to the latter’s journals. While Tractarians dwelt on doctrines, the Broad Church Camedenians, Cambridge Camden Society, focused on ritual solemnities, founding \textit{The Ecclesiologist} in 1841 to support their view.\textsuperscript{66} The \textit{Sacristy} (1871-81), a quarterly, addressed the architecture question which particularly interested the Camedenians with their adherence to Gothic style.

Anne Mozley, remembered for her review of Gaskell’s \textit{Life of Charlotte Bronte}, was better known as editor of the ‘moderate’ Anglican journal, the \textit{Christian Remembrancer} (1841-68). Mozley’s literary skill was such that in later life, John Henry Newman - a relative - invited her to edit his letters of Anglican days. Mozley also contributed reviews to three prominent secular periodicals of serious pretensions, \textit{Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine}, the \textit{Saturday Review} and the short-lived \textit{Bentley’s Quarterly Review}. However, since theology was a male preserve neither Mozley’s name or sex appeared. Mozley exemplified the blurring of distinctions between religious and secular journals; she contributed religious topics to a secular journal as seen in her Blackwood’s articles on “English Converts to Romanism” and “Convent Life”.\textsuperscript{67} Newman, as a Catholic, continued to read the Anglican \textit{Christian Remembrancer} \textsuperscript{68} and evidence suggests that Lockhart and Hayes read it in their Wantage Anglican Sisterhood days.\textsuperscript{69}

In the 1840s Hayes was surrounded by a kaleidoscope of journals, when religious ones had to compete with periodical giants including the \textit{London Journal},

---


\textsuperscript{66} Chadwick, \textit{The Victorian Church, Part One, 1829-1859}, 213.


\textsuperscript{68} Newman, \textit{Apologia Pro Vita Sua}, 156.

Westminster Review and Punch, the weekly magazine famous for its satirical cartoons, jokes and puns devoid of compassion for churchmen and politicians. The Ecclesiologist ‘monthly/bi-monthly’ was published between 1841-6870 while The Rector Magazine maintained its publication from 1845 to 1862, assisted between 1845-62 by contributions from young Rev. Charles Lutwidge Dodgson, alias Lewis Carroll of Alice in Wonderland fame. While the Clergy List struggled for survival, Transcendentalists in England watched the rise of an American New England journal, The Dial (1840-44), edited by Margaret Fuller and Ralph Waldo Emerson.71 In 1848 the Christian Socialism movement published a weekly journal, Politics for the People, and with Rev. Charles Kingsley’s help, supported working people and promoted the formation of workers’ associations with consequent social improvement.

In the 1850s amid the religious ferment of the age, Hayes was encircled by the press when quarterly, monthly and daily periodicals taught people what to think and say.72 The huge success of Charlotte Yonge’s novels, the most famous being The Heir of Redcliff (1853), propelled the success of the Tractarian journal for youth, the Monthly Packet, which Yonge edited for almost fifty years. Yonge, the same age as Hayes, belonged initially to the Keble-Lockhart-Dyson-Butler circle of friends,73 then later to the Butler-Wantage enclave74 who were literary people full of admiration for Tractarian leaders well known to Hayes.75 Yonge, above all other women and editors, has provided this investigation with hitherto unacknowledged insights into Hayes’ mid-century literary world.

Religious journals were challenged by the popular secular magazines to present serial articles and illustrations, such as in Dickens’ family journal - Household Words and his All the Year Round. Dickens’ periodicals could not be described as ‘religious’ yet, as his activity as a social reformer increased, his serialised periodical contributions appeared to hold a greater power for good. This was evidenced in the serialisation of Bleak House between 1852-53 and in Little Dorrit, serialised monthly

---

70 Vann and VanArsdel, eds., Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society, 56.
74 Norton, “A History of the Community of St Mary the Virgin, Wantage”, 42.
between 1855-57. Later in *All the Year Round*, *A Tale of Two Cities* appeared in serial form also. Dickens’ serialised fiction did much to highlight the worst abuses of nineteenth-century society, was a cry for social reform and pricked the public conscience. Hayes recognised the success of serialisation in periodicals and from her first volume serials were included. Major serialised stories in Hayes’ *Annals* include numerous lives of saints, stories for the young, fiction, Franciscan history, “Souvenirs of Mgr de Segur”, “The Royal Recluse”, Manning’s “Confidence in God” and Vansittart’s English history.

As a London teacher, Hayes would have known that most Victorian temperance societies had youth sections that attempted to inculcate temperance ideals in children, along with the practice of charity, thrift and self-discipline. The largest and most successful of these groups was the non-denominational Band of Hope which in the late 1840s published regional and local temperance periodicals and newspapers for working-class children. In 1851 its London based organisation launched its official journal, *Band of Hope Review*, and since its first priority was abstinence, it provided young readers with moralistic tales, anecdotes, poems, and songs that promoted temperance values and the qualities of self-control, diligence and providence. This large-sized *Review* also reflected the organisation’s close connection with Sunday-school work and its commitment to the Ragged Schools Movement, anti-slavery and peace.

By 1854 the journal, *Sunday at Home*, was published by the Religious Tract Society and was similar to many Sunday magazines that offered appropriate Sabbath reading such as articles about foreign missions, religious poetry, Bible tales, and uplifting fiction. When Hayes later published her *Annals* it contained these same four elements. *Sunday at Home* had accompanying illustrations, included many high quality wood engravings, some on tinted paper and a few colour lithographs, so that its longevity was assured for the rest of the century.

In between two very successful organs in 1857-58, the American *Harper’s Weekly* and *All the Year Round*, the Temperance movement bravely originated *Meliora* (1858-70) with its assortment of interests. In its attempt to provide good literature, the

---

76 Montgomery, "Clare, or the Child of Our Lady of the Angels".
77 Vann and VanArsdel, eds., *Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society*, 268-69.
78 Ibid., 94.
first volume contained broad topics that ranged from reformatory schools to business morality and from the social influences of the clergy to the wages question. The introduction of mass production by the giants of periodical literature did not deter smaller adventurers; Cassell’s Illustrated Family Bible, packed with illustrations, was sold to thousands of poor people in separate instalments for a penny each week. The Quiver (1861-1900+), initially edited also by Cassell and a weekly publication, contained general fiction and non-fiction with strong religious and moralistic overtones. Cassell’s publications provide examples of secular periodicals attempting to mitigate perceived evils in society through the influence of religion.79

As the industrialised society moved through the 1860s, the newly literate classes increasingly found that periodicals became their primary source of entertainment, instruction and information. The journals that hoped to turn people away from the two great evils of slavery and drunkenness were characterised in particular by their appeals to anti-slavery and temperance movements. Recognizing the power of the press, yet observing the indifference of the general press to the formation of the Church of England Total Absence Society, the Society launched its own official organ, the monthly Church of England Temperance Magazine (1862-72).80 Later, further organisation of the Anglican temperance ministry caused the creation of a revamped organ, Church of England Temperance Chronicle.81 The Methodists were successful also, especially with the Methodist Temperance Magazine (1869-1900+) which aimed at all Methodist teetotallers and while its contents were firmly orientated toward the ‘cause’, it had a lighter touch than in the early teetotal press.82 The abuse of alcohol was also addressed in the Templar and later also by The Sons of Temperance that was linked to it.

The United Kingdom’s religious magazines, like the long running monthly Good Words and The Quiver, were the first sixpenny magazines and were illustrated throughout. Good Words edited by Presbyterians who collected eminent English writers, including Gladstone, mixed religious content overtly with entertainment in the form of serial fiction and short essays on general subjects. Other Protestant journal organs, their cause recognizable in their titles, were The Church Builder, a successful

---
79 Ibid., 140.
81 Vann and VanArsdel, eds., Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society, 264.
quarterly from 1862 for those interested in church architecture, the *Church Times* from 1863, the *Rock* founded in 1868 and the *St. Paul's Magazine* (1867-74). The last named was initially edited by Anthony Trollope and was noted for its collection of serialised novels including a contribution from Trollope. It was illustrated and contained poetry, criticism and reviews. The name of this publication alone would have meant much to Hayes as family members had been associated with St. Paul’s. Religious periodicals were overshadowed from 1864 by one of the great nineteenth-century reviews, *Fortnightly Review* (1864-1954), to whose pages churchmen such as Newman at times contributed. However, sufficient non-Catholic journals were able to hold to their course in providing good literature because their smaller readership remained faithful.

**Century’s last quarter**

In the nineteenth century’s last quarter, with journals far outnumbering printed books, the churches became more fully aware of the power of the press. Religious journals, sometimes called ‘weekly papers’, struggled harder against the increased tide of secular periodicals and some were not just ecclesiastical; the *Church Times*, the *Rock* and the *Record* now fell under this category. Of greater circulation, however, and still not narrowly ecclesiastical were the *British Weekly* and the *Guardian*. The most important publication that the Anglican clergyman, J. Erskine Clarke, had introduced was *The Parish Magazine* and it proved a launching pad for local parish magazines. By 1885 many Anglican parish clergymen were committed to organising their own monthly magazine, Rev. William Butler of Wantage included, as his parish had its own printing press.

The linked family entertainment magazines similar to *Good Words* now appeared, *Boys Own Paper* (1879) and *Girl's Own Paper* (1880). In the latter the self-appointed missionary, Kate Marsden, contributed the first part of her later famous book on her mission to Russia and Siberia. Associated still with the goal of temperance, outstanding stories surround the Good Templars’ youth ministry that was served by

---

82 Ibid., 265.
83 Chadwick, *The Victorian Church, Part Two, 1860-1901*, 426.
several magazines, including the *Teetotal Star*, and the *Young Templar* from 1873 and taken by the *Juvenile Templar* into the next century. The illustrated *Young Templar* offered the stories, songs, poetry, and music found in other Band journals, but with the temperance message softened to a degree. Young Rechabites enjoyed the *Juvenile Rechabites Magazine* founded in 1844 and which later became the *Juvenile Rechabite*. The Sons of Temperance published for their youthful associates the *Cadet's Own* from 1874 onward. Among religious temperance journals, Dr. Manning's *League of the Cross Magazine*, (1884-86) lasted only a few years yet in this same period Hayes became a gentle achiever using her *Annals* to touch the hearts of international nineteenth-century readers.

While research on non-Catholic religious journals is fraught with difficulties, the outstanding challenge remains the breadth of the task. It was an amazing milieu, one that not only witnessed successful women editors like Charlotte Yonge, Charlotte E. Tonna and Anne Mozely, but one in which there emerged alternative editing and publishing networks to the 'male club-land'. It was a period when women, as well as men, began to raise a public voice in middle-class homes through religious journals and to make religion a cultural force supporting goodness and truth.

---

86 Vann and VanArsdel, eds., *Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society*, 269.
Chapter 3

Hayes and the Catholic Periodical Press in Europe

Introduction and Hayes’ situation
Many nineteenth-century Catholic writers in Europe and North America appreciated the potential for good that was achievable in periodical literature. Nineteenth-century church history is punctuated with the names of leading Catholic figures, men and women, clerical and lay, who made mighty efforts to combat the flood of anti-Christ, anti-Pope and anti-Church literature. The full flourishing of Catholic life was possible in England only after the Catholic Emancipation Act of 1829. To situate Hayes in this arena so as to appreciate her contribution to Catholic journalism, there needs to be an examination of this broad Catholic periodical response. Despite my finding overseas a number of primary resources, there appears a shortage of critical secondary resources in this area.¹ The most fruitful results emerged through an examination of selected journalists whose lives and writings shed light on Hayes’ period and the environment she experienced around 1874-94.

Hayes began her publishing career in the Minnesota beginnings of her final and lasting religious institute where Bishop Thomas L. Grace, with publishing experience, gave his approval to her enterprise but feared that the periodical would not survive. He wrote:

My fears are not as to your ability to make the publication such as will be worthy of a large patronage; of your capability I am fully convinced; but the knowledge I have of the fate that has awaited so very many efforts of the kind, made under the most favourable circumstances, causes me to fear that you will only embarrass yourself and perhaps others.²

So the bishop’s fears for Hayes were related significantly to finance and to stories from England and North America of numerous Catholic periodicals being plagued with financial troubles. The letter further indicates the bishop’s recent meeting with

¹ One resource for Catholic periodical literature of the nineteenth-century is in the classic 1912 edition of The Catholic Encyclopedia available on website or CD-ROM.
Hayes’ printer who had assured the bishop that ‘he would be willing to stop publication’ and release Hayes ‘from the obligation of the contract at any moment’. Besides the financial risks, Hayes, though encouraged by the success of English Catholic women writers, was also aware of the competitive market created by established periodicals. However, Hayes had other factors in her favour as she embarked on this momentous undertaking. She was absolutely committed to the Apostolate of the Press, as is evidenced later in her publishing of Monsignor Mermillod’s words:

   It is necessary to baptize the press, and to consecrate it, and herein lies a great work for women to do. Women shall come to the assistance of the Press as they came in former days to the assistance of Jesus Christ, of His apostles, and of His martyrs. They shall help in this apostolate, as they have helped in all others, by their heroism, their generosity, their prayers, their labours, and their lives.3

Another factor in her favour was indicated in Morris Russell’s newspaper when he not only seconded the bishop’s conviction about Hayes’ capability, by describing her as ‘a lady of extraordinary attainments’, but by also adding, ‘and great piety’.4 The latter virtue, interpreted in the light of her encounter with Eminenza Patrizi, meant a woman with great faith in God.5 In her own words, ‘Faith never changes. Confidence in God never changes’ and again, ‘it could only be done for God and in God’.6 This kind of faith-filled determination in Hayes, emphasised by her biographers, surely stood by her as she entered the periodical arena.

By walking in Hayes’ footprints through the Annals one becomes aware of the surprising breadth of her international interests and concerns. Hayes, because of her extraordinary web of literary connections in different countries, also reveals much of her Apostolate of the Press commitment through individuals in her circle of associates. As a typical nineteenth-century woman, Hayes wrote many letters to

---

4 Russell, "News Item".
5 This encounter with Rome’s Cardinal Vicar on 21 April 1875 is recorded in Hayes’ diary. Hayes, from a faith stance, argued the need to take Poor Clare nuns to Belle Prairie while the hierarchy differed and stressed the human obstacles.
these people but since they are no longer extant\textsuperscript{7} there is need in this broad Catholic periodical examination to rely on others with similar backgrounds and experiences and to draw parallels.

\textbf{England}

\textbf{Background}

Outstanding among the English women, who understood the power of periodical articles for the Catholic cause, was Fanny Margaret Taylor, former Crimean War nurse, once Hayes' Bayswater neighbour and one who appreciated Manning’s spiritual direction.\textsuperscript{8} Taylor, like a number of other women writers, had eased her way into the literary scene by contributing translations, and discovered that it was unnecessary to translate or write a book in the 1860s when periodical literature was flourishing.\textsuperscript{9} Taylor wrote for the high profile Catholic periodical, \textit{The Dublin Review}. This quarterly, read by prominent figures involved in the period's great religious, literary and scientific movements and founded by Wiseman and O'Connell in 1836, had a territorial title that was influenced by Blackwood’s \textit{Edinburgh Review}'s fame yet, from the beginning, it was edited and published in London. The influence of \textit{The Dublin Review} may be judged by its effect on Newman who claimed that one of its articles on St. Augustine became a turning point for him.\textsuperscript{10} Three other English periodicals important to this discussion are \textit{The Lamp}, \textit{The Month} and \textit{The Messenger}, all of which were known to Hayes.

\textit{The Lamp}, a monthly penny magazine that continued from 1846, although its editor often faced financial problems, accepted women contributors. Writers who contributed to \textit{The Lamp} were Elizabeth Lockhart - respected writer, translator of religious books and staff writer for \textit{The Dublin Review} - and her half-brother, William Lockhart, one-time editor of \textit{Catholic Opinion} and theological editor for \textit{The Universe}. The latter was London’s first Catholic penny paper, commenced in late 1860, after Nicholas Wiseman expressed the urgent need for a paper, like Louis Veuillot’s

\textsuperscript{6} Hayes, "Diary", 70. For Hayes’ confidence in God see Pauline J. Shaw, \textit{Companion to the Diary: Sister Mary Ignatius of Jesus (Elizabeth Hayes)} (Brisbane: MFIC & Parish Youth Ministry Services, 1996), 52.

\textsuperscript{7} Chaffee, “Memories”, 7-8.

\textsuperscript{8} While it appears very likely that Hayes knew Taylor, or knew of her through Manning, no proof of this is available.

\textsuperscript{9} Sugg, \textit{Ever Yours Affly}, 157.

L’Univers, to contradict press articles against the Holy See. As noted earlier, the Lockharts’ friendship with Hayes seemed to have secured literary connections for her. Other contributors to The Lamp included Lady Georgiana Fullerton - close friend of Fanny Taylor\(^\text{11}\) - Augusta T. Drane, Henry E. Manning (later Cardinal), and Fathers Edward Caswell and Henry A. Rawes. All of these writers in time contributed to Hayes’ Annals. In 1862 Taylor became the successful proprietor and editor of The Lamp. She was encircled with influential literary friends including the Farm Street Jesuits, most of them known to Hayes, also John Henry Newman, Dr. Edward B. Pusey, Fathers Gallway, Goldie, and Formby, Mrs. Parsons, Cecilia Caddell, and Bessie R. Parkes, many of whom contributed to other Catholic periodicals as well.\(^\text{12}\) Newman’s most famous contribution to Taylor’s periodical was his Dream of Gerontius (1865). Taylor, after a visit to Ireland, published a series of articles for The Lamp which were reissued under the title of Irish Homes and Irish Hearts and advertised in The Dublin Review of 1867.\(^\text{13}\) Catholic journals co-operated with one another to help their common mission. In the 1870s Hon. Fanny Montgomery clearly adopted this growing serialisation style in her major contribution to Hayes’ Annals.\(^\text{14}\) Due to financial difficulties - the perennial Catholic struggle - The Lamp was abandoned in 1871.

Taylor’s Eastern Hospitals and English Nurses (1856) had been well accepted but in 1859 she told the English martyrs’ story, Tyborne, and Who Went Thither; this made her so famous that afterwards she could simply sign her publications ‘Author of Tyborne’. Lady Georgiana Fullerton, considered the period’s most distinguished Catholic woman writer, was full of praise for it.\(^\text{15}\) Tyborne is said to have won its place immediately as a standard Catholic story, and it ensured the acceptance of Taylor as a leading contributor to Catholic periodicals. In 1887-88 almost thirty years later, Hayes published from Rome her version of “The English Martyrs” in a series of eight articles. It commenced with the new “Decree of the Congregation of Sacred Rites” and referred to his Eminence Cardinal Manning and other English bishops who

---

11 See Devas, Mother Mary Magdalen of the Sacred Heart, 247.
13 Devas, Mother Mary Magdalen of the Sacred Heart, 69.
14 The Honourable Mrs. Alfred (Fanny) Montgomery, author, close friend and financial supporter of Hayes, contributed “Clare; or, The Child of Our Lady of the Angels” in 1874-75 and 1878-79 Annals issues.
15 Devas, Mother Mary Magdalen of the Sacred Heart, 65.
had recently petitioned Pope Leo XIII on this matter.\textsuperscript{16} Hayes’ series concluded with a personal exhortation to her readers:

Let us so live, and let us so die, that we may be with the martyrs in Heaven. In living and in dying, we, like them, must be on God’s side always, cost us what it may.’\textsuperscript{17}

The words have two levels of meaning, for Hayes was aware also of the ‘martyrs of the Press’ and they suggest how seriously Hayes wished to carry out her evangelising press mission.

\textit{The Month}, a magazine and review, whose aim was to deal with important questions and to take a Catholic stance on historical, religious, scientific and literary subjects, was firmly founded in 1864 by Taylor in cooperation with the English Jesuits. It was hoped that \textit{The Month} could be of a kindred nature to \textit{The Dublin Review} and, once under way, its editorship and ownership were taken over by the Jesuits. Expenses were always an owner’s greatest problem since, besides the cost of printing and paper, contributors, some of whom were known to Hayes, had to be paid with the exception of Fullerton who donated her Constance Sherwood.\textsuperscript{18} It became common practice for articles to appear in Catholic journals first in serial form and then later to be published in book form. Taylor continued to write almost countless stories, articles, and sketches for \textit{The Month} and other contemporary Catholic periodicals.\textsuperscript{19}

\textit{The Messenger}: Hayes in her 1880s \textit{Annals} clearly acknowledged her use of \textit{The Messenger of the Sacred Heart of Jesus} as her resource for “The Holy Man of Tours”, “Scenes in a Soldier’s Life”, “Reparation by Religious Orders” and “Story of a Recent Conversion”.\textsuperscript{20} \textit{The Messenger}’s history is another example of Taylor’s editorial influence and is also of significance to this investigation because of

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Ibid., 47.
\item Devas, \textit{Mother Mary Magdalen of the Sacred Heart}, 320.
\item Ibid., 316.
\item Hayes, “Scenes in a Soldier's Life”, \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} V, no. iv, v (1880): 101-05, 134-35.
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
its French connections. The journal’s title was sub-headed ‘Organ of the Apostolate of Prayer’. 24 The ‘Apostolate of Prayer or League of the Sacred Heart’ had been founded at Vals, near Le Puy, in France in 1844 and had been introduced into England in 1865 by a Jesuit priest, William Maher. The periodical’s circulation fell into decline until in 1882 Fr. Dignam, well known to Taylor, planned a new approach and sought her assistance. In 1884 The Messenger was restyled by Taylor and it became the Penny Messenger which then could be purchased by the poor. The periodical’s most zealous promoters were the Poor Servants of the Mother of God, the religious congregation founded by Taylor. Wherever these Sisters were found, the Apostolate of Prayer flourished and there is seen in them, along with the Jesuit printer, Br. James Stanley, a leading example of commitment to the English Catholic periodical press.

France
The French Catholic Press had a major influence on those Catholics who contributed to periodicals in the 1870s. Considered here are: the French influences on Hayes, earlier French literary influences, French influence on the Catholic press of other countries and missionary activities linked to Catholic periodicals.

French influences on Hayes: Besides the traditional influence of the French Church on Irish Catholics, Hayes brought to her Annals her unique set of French experiences - life on French-speaking Guernsey, living with French Sisters in Glasgow and Jamaica, and living for some years near Paris. When her project began she already had a deep conviction about the power of the press. This conviction apparently grew out of her knowledge, not only of her English friends’ literary success, but also of the immense influence for good or for evil seen by her in the French press.

This French influence in the Annals is seen, for example, when Hayes devoted a series of three articles to “The Apostolate of the Press”. 25 Her series informed readers of the French origins and activities of Canon Schorderet’s press apostolate. Then Hayes drew attention to the fact that Fr. Kleiser had arrived in England in 1874 for the same apostolate and, finally, showed that young French women, like

---

24 Original copies researched in holdings at MFIC library, Braintree, Essex.
Marguerite Durantet, Marie Weber and Catherine Sturney, had sacrificed their lives for the Apostolate of the Press. The other article on the Catholic press affirmed the importance of what Hayes and other editors of Catholic periodicals had been doing, namely, the dissemination of good writings. Hayes wrote:

The Immense power for good or evil which in these days is inherent in the Press, is too obvious to require our dwelling upon it at any length. In these days of universal decay, the Press is the one human power which holds its own. We see in it the rapid universal agent of human thought, overflowing with fire and energy, welcomed alike by rich and poor, and possessing complete and irresponsible freedom of action. These capabilities have been recognized by the enemies of Christianity, and they have turned the Press into a huge instrument for the propagation of infidel, immoral, and revolutionary principles.26

Early French literary activities: The 1870s response of the French Catholic periodical press calls for a brief investigation into earlier French literary activities. Three significant figures in French Catholic literature are Louis Veuillot, Count de Montalembert and Fr. Lacordaire. All were intellectuals and distinguished writers with Veuillot seen as committed to Catholic authoritarianism while the latter two were renowned for their adherence to French Catholic Liberalism. There is significant difference in the meaning of the French form of Liberalism from the English one, as Newman once noted.27 Veuillot, the champion of the conservative French press, was at seventeen the editor of a Rouen newspaper and because of his talent, style and wit he entered Parisian journalism. A friend of Veuillot took him to Rome, he converted to the Catholic faith and, on his return to Paris, devoted himself to the Catholic cause.28

Many French people had been influenced by the anti-religious ideas diffused by Voltaire and the Revolution. In contrast, Veuillot wrote a number of works entirely devoted to the beauty of Christian doctrine and life; he discovered L’Univers, a little known newspaper lacking financial resources. Position and money were offered to Veuillot, but he refused both to take the path of Catholic journalism. Around the

26 Ibid., 74.
27 Newman, Apologia Pro Vita Sua, 191.
second half of the 1840s, a major French discussion topic was the Catholics’ thrust for liberty in education and teaching - spearheaded by Montalembert, a well-known Catholic writer and historian who contributed to the French liberal-catholic periodicals, *Le Correspondent* and *L’Avenir*. Veuillot resurrected *L’Univers*, Montalembert was associated with it and *L’Univers* became a major Catholic organ with a distinctly Roman tendency. The periodical assured a widespread circulation to episcopal claims and to Lacordaire and Montalembert’s speeches.

Veuillot, after the 1850 gain in the liberty of education issue, found himself in conflict with former friend Montalembert, with some bishops and especially with Monseigneur Dupanloup, bishop of Orleans, a prolific writer and a man of action. Hayes in 1864 had the patronage of Dupanloup to make a foundation at Orleans; Bishop Murdoch of Glasgow licenced Hayes’ transfer of vows to another bishop and later he wrote approvingly that she would be in the diocese of a prelate of international renown. Dupanloup was very influential in the highest educational circles and his writings encouraging the total development of the student were well ahead of his times. Hayes never lost interest in French Catholic education for in her 1880 *Annals* she published “The Bill against Religious Education in France”.

Veuillot combatted ‘free-thinking’ which had assumed a philosophical dimension and, as the liberal world sought to reconcile religion with modern ideas, he was accused of carrying ‘doctrinal intransigentism’ too far and of defending religion too vehemently. Veuillot warned that Napoleonic policies would bring about the destruction of the pope’s temporal sovereignty. Soon the Government suppressed *L’Univers* for its 1860 publication of an Encyclical, “Nullis certe”, in which Pius IX denounced the

---

32 Bishop Murdoch, letter to Sister M. Ignatius, 27 September 1864. MFIC archives, Rome. Murdoch was ecclesiastical superior of the Glasgow Franciscan community and Hayes required a letter of authorisation from him for this transfer.
33 Dupanloup’s writings encouraged the total development of the student - intellectually, spiritually, morally and physically - disapproved of ‘mug-jug’ methods, embraced the concept of learning as process and recommended utilising games.
same dangers that the editor foresaw. Deprived of his periodical, Veuillot devoted himself to writing pamphlets and books, then he initiated the newspaper, *Le Monde*. His writings were devoted to the cause of religious truth but they caused more controversy. By 1867, Veuillot was once again publishing *L'Univers*, where he accelerated topical discussions on the decline of the ancient imperial regime – the Holy Roman Empire, long represented by the Austrian emperor – with its historical association with the Church, on the pope’s temporal power and the forthcoming Vatican Council. Veuillot is said to have withstood the opposition of ten newspapers. His adversaries, some of whom were Catholic, represented freethinkers, current philosophical trends, and secular anti-religious liberalism. Later, when some bishops attacked *L'Univers*, others defended it, including Pius IX.

Dupanloup, prior to the Vatican Council (December 1869-70), was vocal in his sentiments and at times clashed with such organs as *L'Univers* and the Italian Jesuit-run paper, *Civiltà Cattolica*. As leader of the minority group which for political reasons opposed the opportuneness of a definition on Papal Infallibility, Dupanloup was fearless and energetic; however, once the dogma was defined his adherence was without question. Dupanloup had asked Newman to be his theologian at the Council but the latter tactfully declined; however Dupanloup’s action indicated once again that a circle of friends was significant to understanding contemporary events. In 1874 Hayes considered the Papal Infallibility issue still topical and so she edited articles on “The Infallibility of the Church” and another entitled “The Pope Infallible”. The same year another article showed Hayes in tune with the French desire for liberty in her day.

French influence on the press of other countries: Press-related writings provide evidence that many bishops, clergy and editors read widely. One example in the 1870s was Fr. Robert Dunne, later first Archbishop of Brisbane, who received at his Toowoomba presbytery each week fourteen French, Australian, English, Italian and

---

Irish newspapers. Bishop Grace and Hayes would seem to have followed events in the Catholic press with great interest, including the topical history of the infallibility claim and education issues, especially in the periodicals from France, Rome, England and Germany. The writings of Veuillot, known as one of France’s greatest prose writers, would have been familiar to them since he contributed enormously to political and religious history. He, along with the future Cardinal Ledochowski - Nuncio at Brussels - the future Cardinal Pie (Bishop of Poitiers), Monsignor George Talbot (private Chamberlain to Pius IX) and Civiltà Cattolica’s Jesuit editors had been alarmed by Montalembert’s opinions expressed in the well known review Le Correspondant. However, Montalembert was supported and defended by the future Cardinals Lavigerie and Guibert, Cardinal Sterckx (Archbishop of Mechlin), many well-known Parisian Jesuits and especially by Bishop Dupanloup. Hayes’ later articles - on Archbishop Ledochowski and his imprisonment, contribution by Ledochowski on Leo XIII’s Jubilee and the mission-related articles of Cardinal Lavigerie - indicate her interest in these French ecclesiastics’ activities.

The respect that was shown, both in America and England, for Veuillot’s journalistic ability and his mission in spreading the faith is indicated in selected archival cuttings and commentaries. Fr. Ireland, before replacing Bishop Grace as bishop of St. Paul, made a collection of cuttings from current periodicals with one headed ‘Eugene Veuillot’s Views – The Pope, America and France’. The first sentence reads:

The veteran French Catholic journalist, M. Louis Veuillot, has published an admirable article in L’Univers in which he pours hot shot in his own inimitable style into the ranks of the French and American canard mongers, whose pernicious activity has been so prominent lately.
In England Cardinal Wiseman said, ‘Cannot the Society of St. Vincent de Paul do something to answer those frightful calumnies by publishing truths, as M. Louis Veuillot is doing in Paris in *L’Univers*?’ The result was the formation of a committee for this purpose; George Widley, who secured a foreign news service for the paper from Veuillot’s Paris Office, named the new English publication *The Universe*.  

Another editor who was strongly influenced by Veuillot was English-born Fr. Julian Tenison Woods who published monthly Catholic journals in Adelaide in Australia (1867-1872). Woods, a recognised author of scientific and literary works, also contributed to scientific journals and wrote articles for the press, in particular the *Melbourne Australasian*. Woods, with his knowledge of English convert circles, his French religious experience, his attraction to neo-Franciscanism, his interests in education and commitment to the press, was comparable to Hayes in a number of ways. Suffice it is to note that in his religious journals he published articles that refer to leading bishops known to Hayes and, in his monthly item on “Catholic News”, he offered a rare public international comment on Elizabeth Lockhart’s death. Wood’s monthly periodicals suggest his wide reading of English, French and other overseas periodicals and books, thus providing many insights into ‘who knows whom’ and the literary climate of the time. Amongst the wealth of Woods’ literary work, two aspects in particular stand out, much as for Hayes: his continued French associations and the benefit of being a translator of Catholic writings in French.

**Missionary activities linked to periodicals:** French missionary enthusiasm experienced a peak period in the nineteenth century. Catholic periodical output was influenced not only by the revival of older French religious congregations but also by the founding of new missionary ones, including the ‘White Fathers’, known to Hayes. The Association for the spreading of the Faith, initiated in 1819 by the young

---

50 The *Southern Cross* and *Catholic Herald* (September 1867 - September 1869), *Chaplet and Advocate of the Children of Mary* (May 1870 - March 1871) and *The Chaplet and Southern Cross* (April 1871 - July 1872) are held in the Adelaide Church archives, Catholic Diocesan Centre.
52 It reads: ‘The sister of the eminent convert, the Rev. Father Lockhart, died recently in London. She was superior of the Franciscan Convent, at Bayswater, and was distinguished for the works of piety she published from time to time. She was the authoress of the life of St. Teresa, edited by Archbishop Manning’. Julien Tenison Woods, "Catholic News", *Chaplet and Advocate of the Children of Mary* I, no. 8 (1870): 121. Woods may have been the only one who reported it internationally; it indicates his awareness of the Lockhart family.
Lyonnaise woman, Marie-Pauline Jaricot, had developed quickly throughout Europe and America. The Association’s official publication, *Annales de la Propagation de la Foi*, had begun to appear regularly in 1824 and was disseminated widely. Mission literature with vivid accounts of missionary experiences read by the early Belle Prairie Sisters most likely included these *Annals of the Propagation of the Faith*. Chaffee wrote, ‘Our dear Mother [Hayes], who had such love for the Foreign Mission work, would, in order to cultivate in us this spirit, often let us read magazines devoted to them’. It is reasonable to consider that Hayes was influenced by this particular French production, the *Annals of the Propagation of the Faith*, the most widely known of these publications.

Cardinal Lavigerie, founder (1868) of the French Missionaries of Africa (known as the White Fathers) and friend of foundress, Hélène de Chappotin, appealed to women with literary gifts to help the anti-slavery cause. Young Mary Theresa Ledochowska, after contact with de Chappotin’s Franciscan Missionaries of Mary in Salzburg, read of Lavigerie’s crusade. In 1889 Ledochowska published a periodical called *Echo from Africa*, which was to become known worldwide, and which continues. Ledochowska founded the Missionary Sisters of St. Peter Claver, a community of lay and religious women for the African missions. She purchased a property outside Salzburg and renamed it ‘Maria Borg’; it became the centre of an extensive press apostolate. In the same year that Lavigerie influenced Ledochowska, Hayes published two translations related to Lavigerie. The second translation followed a communication from Lavigerie to the pope and was related to a ceremony when twenty new missionaries were about to leave Algiers for remoter parts of Africa.

Another contemporary French missionary initiative that linked Lavigerie, missionary activities and the Apostolate of the Press was that begun by Hélène de Chappotin de

---

53 Holmes and Bickers, “The Church, Revolution and Reaction, 1789-1914”, 230. Holmes and Bickers dated the establishment as 1822 but 1819 was stated more recently. MacGinley, *A Dynamic of Hope*, 93.
54 MacGinley, *A Dynamic of Hope*, 255.
55 Chaffee, "Memories", 54.
56 Observation expressed by religious historian, MacGinley, "Elizabeth Hayes: Religious Foundress".
57 MacGinley, *A Dynamic of Hope*, 301.
Neuville.\textsuperscript{60} This foundress, after the example of the Franciscans in Mexico in the sixteenth century and later the Jesuits in India, China and Paraguay, wanted her missionary Sisters to have printing presses. De Chappotin knew that the press apostolate would ensure the diffusion of Christian teaching and propaganda for the new missions that needed wide support.\textsuperscript{61} Every two months after 1886 the trained Sisters produced and printed in Paris their own Annals of the Institute. Through this they ensured an extensive network of communication among their rapidly expanding missions in numerous countries as well as demonstrating the skills needed for introducing their press apostolate in foreign places.

The Franciscan Capuchins had been publishing \textit{Annales Franciscaines} in Paris since 1863 but the story of their influential monthly periodical will be examined under Franciscan periodicals. Other religious congregations in France, whose periodicals had been suspended as a consequence of the decrees of 1880 against religious congregations, re-established their publications later in the century; included were the Jesuits’ semi-monthly in 1888, the Assumptionists’ \textit{Revue Augustinienne} and the Dominicans’ \textit{Review Thomiste} in 1893. A range of Catholic periodicals were also associated with Catholic universities as well as publications linked to a now powerful movement of Catholic social journalism.\textsuperscript{62}

\section*{Italy}

\textbf{Background, including research problem:} In awareness of the Italians’ creative genius and their long history of literature, this investigation must be confined to the period of Pius IX and Leo XIII, a time of ‘material loss and spiritual gain’.\textsuperscript{63} The term ‘gazette’ originates from the word ‘gazzetta’ which in the sixteenth century was the price paid for the Italian ‘Avvisi’, usually composed of manuscripts - the equivalent of modern newspapers. The fact that three Jesuits were among the chief prose writers of the seventeenth century may be considered a prelude to the famous nineteenth-century Jesuit Catholic paper, \textit{Civilita Cattolica}.

\begin{itemize}
\item[] \textsuperscript{60} Later initiatives of French-born de Chappotin took place in France; her institute of Franciscan Missionaries of Mary actually originated in India and spread quickly to many countries.
\item[] \textsuperscript{61} Georges Goyau, \textit{Valiant Women: Mother Mary of the Passion and the Franciscan Missionaries of Mary}, trans. Mgr. George Telford (Sydney: O'Loughlin Bros., 1953), 191.
\item[] \textsuperscript{62} Goyau, \textit{Periodical Literature - France}, accessed.
\item[] \textsuperscript{63} \textit{Loss and Gain} was Newman’s contemporary book.
\end{itemize}
The search for a directory of Italian Catholic periodicals published in Hayes’ lifetime produced a catalogue, “An Alphabetical Collection of Weekly Magazines.” It provided an overview of 1291 listings of titles accompanied by brief descriptions of magazines from Italy and other countries, including many published during the nineteenth century. To a degree its reliability was weakened later upon comparisons being made with primary sources and inaccuracies discovered in some entries regarding English publications. In terms of its title, the collection includes what this investigation, using primary sources, has defined as ‘monthly periodicals’, for example, *The Month*, *Annales Franciscaines* and Hayes’ *Annals*. Thus the plan to distinguish between newspapers and regular periodicals in these Italian entries proved unsatisfactory. Umberto Benigni discovered this same difficulty when examining the “Annuario Ecclesiastico” which supposedly registered all Catholic ‘papers’ published throughout Italy. Hence not always will it be possible to distinguish between the ‘paper’ and the monthly or quarterly journal so the term ‘periodical’ will be used in these cases.

Pius IX’s pontificate and Rosminianism: One historian saw the Italian periodical press scene as ‘*Civiltà Cattolica*, the *Osservatore Romano* and the rest of the Catholic press’. These two major papers, other papers/periodicals and individuals have been selected for this analysis in order to help situate Hayes’ journal in these often ‘troublesome times’. *Civiltà Cattolica*, widely quoted in books, periodicals and papers, has been called a ‘Jesuit journal’ and a ‘Jesuit paper’. After the Jesuits were restored to their full liberties in Rome, Pius IX encouraged the founding of a new periodical and so the Jesuits launched *Civiltà Cattolica*. Despite differences at times between the pope and its editors, it became and has remained an authoritative but not the official organ of Catholic thought on religious and political matters. Hayes, moving among the key ecclesiastics and religious in Rome, must have read *Civiltà Cattolica* when the Encyclical *Quanta Cura* of December 1864 was released. The Encyclical was accompanied by the famous *Syllabus Errorum*, a table of eighty previously

---

65 Listed numbers in the Catalogue included: no. 89 for *Annales Franciscaines*, no. 97 for Hayes’ *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels*, and no. 737 for *The Month*.
68 Holmes and Bickers, “The Church, Revolution and Reaction, 1789-1914”, 240.
censured propositions dealing with the ‘modern religious errors’ and with special condemnation of ‘false liberalism’. According to the *Syllabus*, modern religious errors could be grouped under pantheism, naturalism, rationalism, indifferentism, socialism, communism, freemasonry and religious liberalism. In the Catholic press the ‘errors’ constituted the evils that it was trying to combat and *Civiltà Cattolica* strongly defended the pope’s condemnation of these perceived evils.

As national borders changed, due to wars and political upheavals during a complex time in Italian politics, so did periodicals. For example, in Venice was printed the *Monitore lombardo-veneto-traspadano*, but when Venice became Austrian the former name disappeared and a new one arose. Also before the division of Church and State, all periodicals were called Catholic. In Italy’s ‘Reign of Terror’ the publication of Catholic journals became impossible, then during the period of papal restoration from 1850, which marked an important turning point in the modern history of the papacy, the Italian government censored the press in political matters but allowed periodicals advocating Catholicism to continue.\(^69\) The conservative periodical, *Voce della Verità*, arose to be followed by others in opposition, and with Pius IX’s return to Rome in 1850 the *Giornale di Roma* was founded. To this publication was added the evening ‘paper’ that was to become the Vatican’s voice, *Osservatore Romano*, which has continued long after the parent publication was suspended.

Hayes obviously kept herself abreast of contemporary journals and Italian events. She was disturbed in 1874 that one hundred Franciscans had been evicted from San Francesco-a-Ripa and others from the Ara Coeli, both locations known to her. To give news of the persecution in “The Convents of Rome and the Revolution”, she quoted a French source, *Semaine Religieuse de Rennes*: ‘peaceful and defenceless inhabitants of the Roman Monasteries have been robbed of their own and driven out homeless upon the streets by the Italian Junta’.\(^71\) Hayes’ 1874 *Annals* also carried “Extracts of News from Rome” relating that on the 27 November the previous year, the Franciscan Father General has been forced by a hostile and sacreligious hand to quit the Ara Coeli.\(^72\)

---


\(^70\) Benigni, *Catholic Periodical Literature - Italy*, accessed.


A window into Hayes’ awareness of Italian events and press connections can be gained also in an *Annals*’ article where she shows her knowledge of the 1867 battle of Mentana when the Papal Zouaves foiled an attempt by Garibaldi to seize Rome.\(^{73}\) Cardinal Antonelli, a leading figure known to Hayes, was charged with the temporal rule of Rome for some twenty-seven years. He recognised that the defence of the pope rested upon the French Government’s good will. France was compelled to withdraw her troops during the Franco-Prussian War and the Piedmontese army did not fail a second time, so around 1870 there was a new wave of governmental and sectarian opposition to the Catholic press. This occurred not only in Rome but also in regional parts of Italy with a resulting increase in the Catholic response and in particular, that of periodicals.\(^{74}\) Comparably with French Catholic periodicals around the Vatican Council time, *Civilta Cattolica* caused vibrations by writing about the liberals of Dupanloup and Montalembert’s school as though they were not fully Catholics. The Catholic press has been accused of stirring up passionate feeling about the infallibility issue and *Civilta Cattolica* was later credited with helping to bring about the success of Ultramontanism.\(^{75}\)

In 1860 the pope helped to establish the *Osservatore Romano* in order that Catholics worldwide might be informed of his intentions, opinions and attitudes.\(^{76}\) Among numerous periodicals, published predominantly in the north rather than the south, the *Osservatore Cattolica* was founded at Milan (1864) with Don Albertario as editor.\(^{77}\) The paper was known not only for its fidelity in advocating papal policy but also for its refutation of Rosminian interpretations. Since Hayes was once a Rosminian Sister, she would have followed events concerning Rosminianism. Numerous Italian newspapers and other periodicals gave attention to the writings of Antonio Rosmini who founded a religious congregation, the Rosminian Institute of Charity, received papal directives regarding the mission to write and authored numerous works including a philosophical masterpiece, *Nuovo Saggio* (1823, translated as *The Origin of Ideas*, London, 1883-84). Several volumes of Rosmini’s works were translated

---

74 Benigni, *Catholic Periodical Literature - Italy*, accessed.
76 Holmes and Bickers, "The Church, Revolution and Reaction, 1789-1914", 240.
77 Benigni, *Catholic Periodical Literature - Italy*, accessed.
either by William Lockhart or under his supervision. Rosmini continued to explain his system of philosophy in articles for periodicals even though all his previous works had been denounced to the Holy See and some 300 censures had been circulated against him. The Armonia of Turin, later called the Armonia of Florence, published several of his articles. In 1876 some Catholic newspapers and other periodicals in Italy, interpreting the “Dimittantur” decree of 1854, which was seen by the Rosminian school as a guarantee that the books examined contained nothing worthy of censure, declared that Rosmini’s works were open to criticism and to censure. A key Church authority took a different view and in a letter to the Osservatore Romano (16 June 1876) reminded the editor of the silence enjoined on both parties and stated that no theological censure could be inflicted. A month later, the Osservatore Cattolico of Milan acknowledged its interpretation to be erroneous and for a time the Rosminian controversy ceased to be an issue for the press.

Pope, Mermillod and Hayes’ Annals: In the year when Leo XIII created Swiss-born Gaspard Mermillod a cardinal, Hayes’ Annals published in Rome a story of this strong advocate of the Apostolate of the Press. Mermillod as a young curate had established in Geneva in the late 1840s two periodicals, L’Observateur Catholique and Les Annales Catholiques. 1864 marked the year Mermillod was appointed titular Bishop of Hebron and auxiliary of the Bishop of Lausanne for the canton of Geneva, with residence at Geneva. The next year Pius IX felt the need of a politico-religious organ for the support of his own ecclesial programme, to refute ‘pernicious doctrines’ and to serve as a medium of official communication to all Catholics. This was achieved through the Acta Sanctae Sedis and the Correspondance de Rome, the latter’s purpose being the support of the Holy See and opposition to those

---

78 Rosmini’s works and material by Lockhart are available at the Rosminain Fathers library, Glencomeragh, Kilsheehan, County Tipperary, Ireland, accessed 14-16 January 2001. Among Lockhart’s publications is his Life of Rosmini (1886).
79 In 2001, L’Osservatore Romano published an article that included: ‘The Decree stated: "All the works of Antonio Rosmini Serbati that have recently been examined, are to be dismissed (Dimittantur opera Antonii Rosmini) and this examination in no way detracts from the good name of the author, nor of the religious Society founded by him, nor from his life and singular merits towards the Church".’ Richard Malone, Historical Overview of the Rosmini Case (L’Osservatore Romano, English Edition, Baltimore, MD), Eternal Word Television Network, www.ewtn.com/library/Theology/ROSMINI.HTM; accessed 18 October 2005.
labelled Liberal Catholics and Opportunists. Mermillod in 1870 moved the *Correspondance* to Geneva where it supported the intransigent party favoured by the pope but not by the powerful Cardinal Antonelli. Soon the radical government of the canton protested when the Holy See appointed Mermillod the independent Administrator of Geneva; finally he was expelled from Switzerland and went to live in Ferney on French soil. In the first issue of Hayes’ *Annals* her readers learnt that Mermillod, only months earlier, was in Paray Le Monial with English pilgrims. The same year, *The Month and Catholic Review* praised Lady Herbert, a contributor to Hayes’ *Annals*, for her translation of Mermillod’s Conferences, published as *The Supernatural Life*. 

Hayes introduced readers to Mermillod’s story set around 1876, which indicated him in favour of the new Institute of Saint Paul, also known as Apostolate of the Press, founded by Canon Schorderet in Fribourg, Switzerland. In the words of the *Annals*:

> For many years Canon Schorderet had been greatly occupied with the subject of the ravages wrought among all classes by the spread of bad literature. In order to counteract the evil effects of the Press in his own country he had started a paper “La Liberte”, now the chief organ of the canton of Fribourg. But he soon realised that the Catholic Press could never hope to vie with its adversaries unless it were supported by some apostolic institution, animated by the spirit of faith and of true devotion, and unless it could render itself independent of freemasonry and socialism.

Hayes’ *Annals’* article recalled how the printing workers, affiliated to Marxist-influenced international trade unionism, as were many other groups of workers on the Continent, were under pressure to strike time and time again. Union leaders planned to bring about the ruin of the Catholic *La Liberté*. While this struggle was going on, seven young Fribourg women wanted to give their lives to God through prayer and active ministry. Mermillod offered advice and proposed that there could be no greater

---

83 Benigni, *Catholic Periodical Literature - Italy*, accessed.
85 *The Month and Catholic Review* (1874) June, 245.
86 Hayes, "The Apostolate of the Press", 35.
ministry than to devote themselves to the cause of Catholic literature. Schorderet seconded Mermillod’s words and Hayes wrote of the founder:

He represented to them the beauty of a life of combined labour and contemplation, and showed them how, whilst working with their hands in the production of books for the glory of God, and the service of the Church, they might sanctify their own souls by constant prayer and meditation, and invest the Press with somewhat of the supernatural, by the free and continual immolation of their lives for the good of souls.87

The young women responded positively and on their way to Lyons88 to learn the skill of typography, they stopped at Ferney to visit the exiled Mermillod who encouraged them strongly, saying:

The Press is perhaps the greatest power that exists in these days. Ideas govern the world, and ideas are spread abroad by the Press, which acts as the great artery of human thought.89

From the article’s convincing tone and the number of Mermillod’s quotes endorsed by Hayes, we may conclude that Mermillod’s views about the power of the press were hers also.

Hayes wrote more about this Apostolate of the Press story. About the time of the women’s return from Lyons, Schorderet’s private plan to provide Institute of Saint Paul workers was discovered, so a letter informed him, and the printer’s union demanded a permanent strike. However, in a Roanne printing office were women compositors, including a Mademoiselle Marguerite Marie Durantet who was interested in the Institute of Saint of Paul. At Schorderet’s urgent plea for help she, two other companions and the newly trained members from Lyons joined forces and La Liberté was printed on time.90 The Annals tells how the Institute of Saint Paul grew from strength to strength, opening successful printing houses in Paris and Bar-le-Duc, publishing ‘several important Catholic journals’, receiving the sanction of Pius

87 Ibid., 36.
88 Lyons was the headquarters of Society of the Propagation of the Faith where Pauline Jaricot’s Annals, Missions Catholiques, were published.
90 Ibid., 38-9.
IX and the protection of Cardinal Parocchi, Archbishop of Bologna. Pius IX personally encouraged Schorderet who pledged to further ‘the spread of the pure doctrines of Christ’s church’. Hayes concluded her first article on this topic by saying that Pius IX in subsequent years ‘testified his interest in the work by no less than five separate Briefs’. This, combined with the attention that Hayes gave to papal writings in her Annals, emphasises her belief that the popes in her time were calling writers to use their gifts in the Apostolate of the Press.

During the closing years of Pius IX’s life, the ‘Liberal’ Press insinuated that at the time of the next papal election, the Italian Government would take a hand in the matter and occupy the Vatican. However, the press had not foreseen the Russo-Turkish War nor the death of Victor Emmanuel II in early 1878 and their prognostications were buried under other issues. At the death of Pius IX (1878), the condition of Catholic ‘journals’ was described as very favourable and among them Unita Cattolica was especially distinguished. The Catholic papers have been acknowledged as possibly inferior in format, but ‘unrivalled as to the ability of their writers and the vigour and intelligence of the polemics’. This was the same year when Hayes decided to move her printing press from Minnesota to Georgia. In this year Leo XIII was elected and so the Catholic world welcomed a prelate who even as a teenager had gained a classical facility in the use of Latin and Italian, a skill that would later be admired in his official writings and poetry. During his earlier life this pope-to-be worked in and around Perugia, known as a ‘hotbed of the anti-papal revolutionary party’ and later he was appointed bishop of this town, a place traditionally linked with the youthful Saint Francis of Assisi. The significance of the bishop’s experiences for the Franciscan movement and Hayes’ Annals will appear later in this discussion.

Leo XIII in the ‘Age of Encyclicals’: Pope Leo XIII, known as a great writer, heralded the ‘Age of Encyclicals’. ‘Religious errors’ and ‘false liberalism’ were still rampant and the Catholic world looked to Rome for leadership on the important issues of the day. Besides letters and other writings on philosophical, theological and spiritual matters,

91 Cardinal Parocchi was known to Hayes. This connection will be discussed later in the period when Hayes lived permanently in Rome.
94 Benigni, Catholic Periodical Literature - Italy; accessed.
Catholic periodicals and papers became great instruments for diffusing the pope’s writings, and Hayes, like numerous other Catholic editors and journalists, contributed significantly to this apostolate. By 1881 Hayes saw the need to move her press to Rome.

In Leo XIII’s first year in office he lamented the oppressive evils of society and the evils of socialism, now thirty years after the Revolution of 1848. In the next year he produced *Aeterni Patris*, on restoring Christian Philosophy, which gave pre-eminence to the teaching of Saint Thomas Aquinas and opened the floodgates for a new set of papers and periodicals. Many of these reflected in their titles the content of the Encyclical, such as *Eco di S. Tommaso d’Aquino* in Parma (1879) and *Divus Thomas* in Piacenza (1880), while evidence suggests that *La Sapienza* of Turin (1879-86) led the field that reignited a new debate on non-Thomistic works.

Politics and Encyclicals were intertwined in the historical events of the period and periodicals engaged in spreading the battle of words. Numerous periodicals appeared with their particular kind of subject matter indicated by their titles. These titles varied from strictly religious, family-orientated and missionary news to scientific, literary and educational labels. The reignited Rosminian debate will be examined further for it highlights the strength and influence of the Italian periodical press and serves as a sample of the press’ activities. William Lockhart believed that ‘journalistic assassination’ was committed by ‘so-called Clerical journals’ in Italy that were the echoes of the *Civiltà Cattolica* in regard to the writings of Rosmini. *Osservatore Cattolica* of Milan, and many others, repeatedly accused the Rosminian position of being ‘opposed to the teaching of Saint Thomas’ and rebellious against the pope, and further claimed that it was ‘intended’ to be condemned by Leo XIII in his Encyclical, *Aeterni Patris*. *Osservatore Cattolica* of Milan was influential enough to be able to lead the opponents of Rosmini in Northern Italy in a large demonstration held on 7 March 1880. The demonstration presented ‘thank you’ addresses to Leo

---

95 *Inscrutabili Dei Consilio* (21 April 1878).
96 *Apostolic Muneris* (28 December 1878). This encyclical also contained special emphasis on the Catholic view of the social order.
99 Leo XIII had exhorted all those who were engaged in higher education to make St. Thomas Aquinas the standard of philosophical teaching but not the only resource.
XIII for Aeterni Patris, requested the pope to name Rosmini as an offender, and to force followers of Rosminian teachings to abandon them. These addresses were printed in the Osservatore Cattolica of Milan and in pious magazines in Italy.\(^{100}\)

The English Rosminians\(^{101}\) sent a representative to this same demonstration believing, like many Italian Catholics, that it was held to honour Saint Thomas Aquinas. The member chosen to represent them was Lockhart and he came to Rome for a dual purpose. Lockhart carried a letter written by his friend of over forty years, Cardinal Newman, to introduce him to Leo XIII. The purpose of the audience was to express the deep anxiety felt by the Rosminians because of the public statements made in periodicals by writers who carried weight with the public and who used the encyclical to further condemn Rosmini.\(^{102}\) Lockhart explained to the pope that Rosminians were ready to obey in all matters but what they could not accept was the ‘censures of Journalism as if this was the voice of the Holy See’.\(^{103}\) Leo XIII assured his visitor that it was never his intention to condemn the works of Rosmini or his followers and Lockhart assured the pope that Rosminians were not the ‘Liberali’ that they were reported to be in Italian periodicals.

Confident in their power, Civiltà Cattolica and other Italian papers continued their attacks on Rosmini’s works and in 1882 a series of articles from Civiltà Cattolica were published in book form.\(^{104}\) A clique of journalists who continued their anti-Rosmini campaign could not be dissuaded even when Vatican papers and posters on Roman church doors listed Fr. Lockhart as one of the authentic preachers of Catholic doctrine chosen by the pope’s cardinal vicar, Cardinal Parocchi, to preach during Lent. In October 1885, Civiltà Cattolica, summing up its verdict on Rosmini, stated ‘Rosmini is in Theology a Jansenist, in Philosophy a Pantheist, in Politics a Liberal!’ Other papers and magazines again echoed this powerful paper including Divino Salvatore, a magazine for Catholic families subtitled The Religious Week of Rome.\(^{105}\) Small wonder that Lockhart, appalled by ‘the very dangerous weapon of quasi-religious journalism’, observed that such abuse of the power for good by the

---

100 Lockhart, ed., Life of Antonio Rosmini Serbati, 355.
101 Rosmini had sent to England some of his most talented and committed young Italian preachers. As early as 1840 the Rosminians had set up their printing press at Prior Park.
102 The papal audience is described in Lockhart, ed., Life of Antonio Rosmini Serbati, 337-39.
103 Ibid., 337.
104 The book, published December 1882, was Rosminianism, a Synthesis of Ontologism and Pantheism.
periodical press brought about confusion and discord among Catholics. The situation was summed up by Lockhart saying that the stoic perseverance of *Civilta Cattolica* and its echoes was ‘worthy of a better cause’.106 This ‘better cause’ would have been the eradication of the evils spread by the anti-religious periodical press.

An examination of selected Catholic monthly periodicals (1874-94) in England, Ireland and Australia, show that *Civilta Cattolica* was the most popular source quoted under ‘Foreign Catholic Periodicals’. Leo XIII realised the need of a ‘papal journal’ through which he could communicate with the foreign press so he created the *Journal de Rome* but this paper did not live up to his expectations so it was succeeded by *Moniteur de Rome* (1881-95).107 Each year Leo XIII wrote new encyclicals, with the greatest number being published in 1888. While Hayes’ *Annals* kept abreast of these publications, the editor ensured that her readers were not swamped with them. Hayes’ selection and handling of Pope Leo’s writings and those of a few key ecclesiastics provide an insight into the editor herself. As Hayes’ time in Rome lengthened towards 1894 so too did her reliance on Italian publications and by 1893 the quantity of translations from these reached a maximum.

Reference has been made to Leo XIII’s links with Perugia and Saint Francis of Assisi. On the feast of the Stigmata of Saint Francis, 17 September 1882, Leo XIII issued *Auspicato Concessum* with its focus on Saint Francis. In March the following year, Hayes’ *Annals* carried the news that Cardinals Parocchi, Bartolini and sixteen other prelates had written to Leo XIII after a gathering in Assisi where many had celebrated ‘the centenary of the lawgiver and patriarch Saint Francis’. In the article the pope is quoted as expressing his pleasure that his prelates evince devotion and love for the Seraphic Father Francis, and his hope that this devotion would spread so that the fruits of faith and charity would be ‘revived among the men of this century’. The pope believed that membership in the Third Order of Saint Francis was a remedy for the social ills of the time. He said that nothing ‘could be more agreeable’ than ‘the wide diffusion of the sacred army of the Third Order because it opposes powerfully the evils of our century, and promises decided blessings both in public and private life’.

105 The editor of this publication is unknown.
thus bringing about ‘justice and peace’ in the world. This praise for the Franciscan Order brought about dramatic increase in membership in the three Franciscan Orders – the friars, religious women and seculars. Hayes caught the wave of opportunity, coupled it to her own giftedness and successfully provided readers with Franciscan spirituality, history and mission news.

In April that year, Hayes printed “Leo XIII and the Third Order”, announcing the pope’s recommendation, this time at an audience with various Roman arch-confraternities, ‘to inscribe yourselves in the Third Order of Saint Francis’. The words ‘now first given to the Press’ reminded people that in the previous month ‘the entire Catholic World celebrated … the seventh centenary of the birth of Saint Francis’. The quotation included, ‘Its scope is to preserve civil society from the corruption of the world by the sole means of sanctifying the most common and ordinary actions of life in shaping them after the true spirit of Jesus Christ’. The pope was quoted as saying how the Rule of Saint Francis is basically the observance of the Gospel and that for Third Order members ‘it proposes to heal social wounds’. The article concluded with a statistic claiming that 1,736 of the audience had joined the Third Order already. Again in 1885 in Hayes’ regular “Franciscan Record” segment, she inserted “The Pope and the 3rd Order” which echoed the pope’s same sentiment and in which he told Franciscan Generals how he prayed the Franciscan devotions himself. The pope, as a member of the Third Order of Saint Francis, preached what he practiced and the publication of this commitment apparently increased the sale of Franciscan journals.

Fra Ludovico da Casoria and Cardinal Parocchi: In the 1884 Annals, Hayes in her regular news segment linked the names of her Italian friends, Fra Ludovico da Casoria and Cardinal Parocchi. The article provided news that Ludovico, founder of ‘Frati Bigi’ and the ‘Suore Bigie’, had established a successful free extern school, as well as an intern orphanage, with workshops for several crafts and trades, as well as an intern orphanage, with workshops for several crafts and trades,

---

111 Franciscan friar Lucovico (Archangelo Palmentieri) was born at Casoria in 1811, entered the Reformed Minors of St. Peter of Alcantara, founded numerous institutions of charity, was known as a Grey Brother, and was the friar described by Hayes in her *Diary* - ‘like an angel from heaven’ - when he supported her in a critical decision with Rome’s cardinal vicar and the Franciscan minister general.
including printing. The following year Ludovico died in Naples so the May edition announced his death, provided a short summary of his holy life and named the religious communities and Italian charitable Institutions that he founded. The editor promised ‘to give a fuller account of this true Son of the Seraphic Saint Francis whom Our Holy Father Leo XIII tenderly named his beloved friend, il mio prediletto amico’. Hayes kept her promise with a print of Lucovico’s own ‘Testament’ and three articles, two of which provide insight into Ludovico’s Apostolate of the Press as well as into Hayes’ similar commitment. Hayes claimed that Ludovico, who had once been a Franciscan teacher in philosophy and mathematics, understood the ‘evils which are caused every day by bad literature and false science’. One remedy was his establishment of schools, the other - ‘in 1867 he founded a review called Charity and a periodical called The Orphan’. Hayes wrote, ‘He promoted the religious press with its typography, and erected stands for the sale of books of piety as against bad publications’. Education and the Apostolate of the Press were major commitments also for Hayes. In the November Annals the editor quoted at length Fr. Bonaventure who recorded that Ludovico had founded ‘a musical periodical of Christian melodies, of his own composition’ and ‘the publication of another religious periodical, entitled the Religious Indicator of Naples’. At the funeral service for Venerable Ludovico da Casoria he was described ‘as the revived St. Francis of the nineteenth century’.

Besides knowing Fr. Ludovico, for years Hayes had communicated with numerous other leading ecclesiastics in Rome, London and Paris. Like herself, these ecclesiastics often travelled from one city to another and kept in contact with friends. While the names of these males have found their way into so many books, Hayes’ name has not. In a handful of books or records that make a reference to her, it is often inaccurate while most current publications, or conference papers on nineteenth-century journalism, suitable for inclusion of her journalistic achievement, omit her

116 Fr. Bonaventure was a member of the Ludovico’s Grey Brothers community. The Sisters founded by Ludovico were called Elizabettines, a name taken from the Franciscan, St. Elizabeth of Hungary.
altogether. How a person who knew so many key Church and literary figures during her lifetime has been overlooked is difficult to explain, apart from the fact that she was a woman. The following discussion raises this question again.

Vicar of Rome, Cardinal Parocchi, had founded in 1878 the *Scuola Cattolica* that embraced all branches of theology and discipline.119 Hayes and her Sisters in Rome had gained the attention of Church authorities, including that of Cardinal Parocchi. He asked Hayes in 1886 to publish a very large work in Latin that would be used in the vicariate and by the bishops. Besides this and at the same time, Parocchi asked for a book, *Against Heresy*, to be translated from Italian into English and then to be printed.120 In the July’s *Annals* of the same year was a striking article by Parocchi, “Against Heresy in Catholic Garb”, subtitled with ‘Notification of the Most Eminent Lord Cardinal Parocchi, Vicar General of His Holiness the Pope’ and followed by ‘Translated and published by order of His Eminence’. The seven-page article deals with ‘These heretical teachers desiring to destroy the Catholic education of our people’ and who ‘raise the standard of discord’. It condemned strongly a group calling itself ‘Catholic and Italian’ who are ‘heretical and foreign’. Besides describing the group whose ‘notions’ are affiliated to a heretical sect of some fifteen years earlier, the article links the culprits to the ‘so-called Gallican Church and to Hyacinth Loyson’.121 It concluded with a reminder of the Church’s desire for justice, love and clemency. This article, the translation and the book’s printing, provides an insight into the confidence placed in Hayes by Parocchi and Church authorities. Cardinal Parocchi and the Prefect of Propaganda Fide, Cardinal Simeoni, visited Hayes’ convent in Via Alfieri this same year and inspected all the departments of the printing work, the press and the bindery.122 No wonder then when Hayes petitioned Leo XIII for a Rescript that would classify the printing and sale of the *Annals* as a ‘Work of Spiritual Mercy’ for the ‘propagation of good books’, not an industry or a commercial venture, her request was granted. Hayes’ lengthy letter of petition also acknowledged the encouragement that she had received from the pope and Cardinal Parocchi.123

---

118 Hayes, "Funeral and Obsequies of Father Ludovico Da Casoria", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels X*, no. xii (1885): 381-83.
120 de Breffny, *Unless the Seed Die*, 180.
121 Hyacinth Loyson (1827-1912) had been a popular French Carmelite preacher who refused to accept the definition of papal infallibility and left the Church.
122 de Breffny, *Unless the Seed Die*, 181.
123 Ibid., 182. The Rescript was absolutely necessary for the *Annals*’ distribution to continue in America.
The *Annals* of 1888 reflected the special celebrations in Rome of the Sacerdotal Jubilee of Leo XIII. Hayes published the “Encyclical Letter of His Holiness Pope Leo XIII”\(^{124}\) and chose the Jubilee theme for four articles.\(^{125}\) However, she allotted the most space, nineteen pages, to the pope’s Brief on the abolition of slavery.\(^{126}\) This topic would have touched the heart of Hayes who had witnessed both in Jamaica and Georgia the sufferings inflicted by slavery and she published the complete text. Another encyclical this year was *Libertas* which had political implications since it explored the nature of human liberty. Hayes published, not the encyclical itself but, considerate of her readership, called on her friend Cardinal Manning to present a commentary “On the Pope’s last Encyclical”\(^{127}\). Manning noted that in a world tossed by anti-Christian movements, ‘ideas have governed the world’, an echo of Mermillod’s words. Again the spread of ideas by the press gave it acknowledged power for good or evil.

Constraints of space will not allow a fuller examination of all the pope’s writings published in the *Annals* (1874-94), nor of the articles that show the influence of other Italian writings. However the overview that follows indicates the extent of the Italian press’ influence on Hayes and her periodical, and how she in turn spread the ‘good news’ in her effort to counterbalance ‘bad literature’. In 1891, besides printing a number of papal writings, Hayes entertained her readers with illustrations and articles on famous historical places in Rome.\(^{128}\) Also in 1892, the *Annals* printed what may be interpreted as an acknowledgment of its own Franciscan American roots, “The Papal allocution on Columbus”\(^{129}\). Four major writings on the Rosary devotion were


\(^{128}\) Titles of articles were “The Famous Cascade of Tivoli”, “The Quirinal Palace and Monte Cavallo”, “The Arch of Constantine”, “The Forum of Trojan”, “The Roman Forum” and “Temple of Concord”.

\(^{129}\) Pope Leo XIII, "The Papal Allocution on Columbus: Letter to Archbishops and Bishops of Spain, Italy and the Two Americas", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XVII, no. viii (1892): 239-46. Columbus was a Franciscan Third Order member.
promulgated by Leo XIII in each year 1891-94\textsuperscript{130} and Hayes published in full, almost ‘hot off the press’, the September 1892 encyclical, \textit{Magnae Dei Matris}, in the following month.\textsuperscript{131} Taking the Pope’s message to heart, Hayes edited for her 1892-94 issues, a series of articles entitled “Sanctuaries of Our Lady” which were acknowledged as based on a ‘translation from the Italian’. The articles were sub-titled with the names of many Italian Marian shrines.\textsuperscript{132} Amongst these Marian articles during the same three years was a series called “The Holy Angels” and again the editor recognised that they were translations from a nineteenth-century Italian source.

Cardinal Manning predicted:

‘The Pontificate of Leo XIII will be known in history as the time when upon a world torn and tossed by anti-Christian and anti-social revolutions, the abundant seed of Divine truths, sown broadest, revived the conscience of Christendom’.\textsuperscript{133}

Hayes was impressed and inspired, not only by how the pontiff sowed ‘the abundant seed of Divine truths’, but also by the quality of his writings which were considered models of classical style, of clarity and convincing logic. While Leo XIII exemplified what it was to be an ‘Apostle of the Press’, so too did Catholic writers and journalists like Hayes, Manning, the Lockharts, Mermillod, Ludovico da Casoria and Parocchi. Hayes’ \textit{Annals} helped the work of neutralising the anti-Catholic evil ‘exercised by the irreligious Press’, while she saw her mission as being one with the Italian Pontiff who wrote, ‘Our first duty is to spread the name and reign of Christ more widely’.\textsuperscript{134}

\textsuperscript{130} Octobri Mense (1891), \textit{Magnae Dei Matris} (1892), \textit{Laetitiae Sanctae} (1893) and \textit{Jucunda Semper} (1894).


\textsuperscript{132} E.g., “Our Lady ‘Ad Rupes’” – one of 7 in 1892; “Our Lady of St. Apollinaris, in Rome” – one of 9 in 1893; “Santa Maria di Montorella (sic), in the Diocese of Tivoli, near Rome” - one of 6 in 1894.

\textsuperscript{133} Manning, ”On the Pope’s Last Encyclical”, 339.

\textsuperscript{134} The introductory words of \textit{Christi Nomen} on the Propagation of faith and Eastern Churches (24 December 1894).
Chapter 4

Hayes and the Catholic Periodical Press in America

Americans in the nineteenth century experienced what has been called the ‘Catholic invasion’ and one consequence of the great migrant influx between 1825-50 was the development of the Catholic press.1 The rapid expansion of the Catholic Church, in the United States in particular, due especially to Irish and German immigration, was reflected in its periodical literature and, in looking at Hayes’ contribution, this dimension should be kept in mind. This was the period when, for the first time, the pope and his Roman Curia took into account the significance of American Catholicism for the whole Church’s future. The nineteenth century in America, as in England, witnessed the conversion of numerous writers to Catholicism and when some turned their attention to the cause of their new Faith, the results were outstanding as demonstrated in writings of Orestes A. Brownson, Maximilian Oertel, R. A. Bakewell and Isaac T. Hecker. The ephemeral nature of Catholic newspapers and magazines was characteristic of the period, as was the variety of the publications (ranging from dailies, weeklies, semi-weeklies to monthlies, semi-monthlies, by-monthlies, quarterlies and annuals) and the clear dominance of New York and the Eastern press over ‘the West’ and ‘the South’.

While Catholic periodical resources do not always clearly distinguish between newspapers and magazines - the terms are interchanged at times - there exists sufficient information to indicate a flood of periodical literature. Between 1809 and 1911 statistics claim that 550 Catholic periodicals, newspapers and magazines were begun in the United States, yet it seems that only five of these published in the first half of the century survived.2 Many Catholic bishops and clergy strongly advocated the value of Catholic papers and magazines and supported Catholic press initiatives. After the ‘hungry forties’, Irish immigrants brought about marked development in Catholic periodical literature with Irish names recorded as editors, publishers, printers and contributors.3 The same may be said of the contemporary secular press as

---

2 The survivors were The Irish American (New York), the Catholic Telegraph (Cincinnati), The Pilot (Boston), the Freeman’s Journal (New York) and the Catholic (Pittsburg).
3 E.g., Irish names included Thomas O’Connor of the Shamrock, or Hibernian Chronicle; James W. and John E. White, nephews of Irish novelist Gerald Griffin, editors of Freeman’s Journal; Patrick Lynch from
numerous secular publications advocated Irish interests though they were not recognised as religious publications. Names such as George and Isaac T. Hecker, Orestes A. Brownson and Patrick Donohoe first appeared in relation to newspapers and later reappeared with significant magazines or reviews. The Third Plenary Council at Baltimore (1884) furthered developments in periodical literature by stating that ‘Catholic papers should be fostered and encouraged’.4

The Pilot, which had to change its name seven times in order to survive between 1829-36, is an example of how Catholic papers had to struggle for survival. Apparently this paper, initiated by Bishop Fenwick, finally became the most important paper of national circulation and influence. One contributor was Irish-born Michael Hennessy, with the penname of ‘Laffan’ and a member of the New York daily Times editorial staff, while a significant editor at one period was Rev. John P. Roddan, member of Brownson’s circle and contributor to his Review.5 In the year when Hayes stayed in New York before her westward journey to Minnesota, she may have read Hickey’s newly established newspaper, The Catholic Review. Years later at Hickey’s death he was acknowledged as Brooklyn’s Apostle of the Press and his Catholic Review lived on. Hickey had surrendered the promise of a brilliant career and its financial rewards in order to found The Catholic Review under disheartening circumstances that he finally turned into success.6

Ave Maria, Hudson and Hayes links: Co-operation, not competition, was the hallmark of two Catholic publishing houses selected for this periodical press investigation and extant correspondence with Hayes has guided the choice. The Ave Maria (dating from 1865) was ‘the best known and most widely circulated Western publication’ and ‘a Catholic Journal, devoted to the honour of the Blessed Virgin, published weekly at Notre Dame, Indiana’.7 This publication is an example of how, in the nineteenth century, the terms, periodical, paper, magazine and journals, were interchanged. Brother Stanislaus Clarke, the Ave Maria’s correspondent with Hayes, usually referred to the publication simply by name, but he also called it a periodical and in

---

4 Editors, as in Donohoe’s Magazine, spread the statement in the article “Parochial Schools” (1884), 570, Poor Clares’ Kenmare library, Ireland; accessed 18 January 2001.
6 Donohoe’s Magazine (June 1889), 622, Poor Clares’ Kenmare library.
7 Ave Maria office letterhead of 1879, MFIC archives, Rome.
another letter a paper. On the other hand, he referred to Hayes’ *Annals* mostly as a magazine and once an ‘excellent periodical’. The *Ave Maria* was published weekly in a magazine form, with sequential numbers of volumes, issues and pages.

The University of Notre Dame du Lac in Northern Indiana, also the head house of the Holy Cross Fathers since 1842, established a university press which issued two weekly publications, a literary and a religious magazine. The latter was the *Ave Maria*, ‘contributed to by the best writers of Europe and America’.8 *Ave Maria*’s early editor and contributor was American-born Fr. Neal Henry Gillespie while his sister, Eliza Maria, also known as Mother Mary St. Angela, provided its initial ‘moving spirit’ and was a major contributor.9 Hayes may have known Eliza, outstanding educator and leader, for according to extant letters Hayes knew the Holy Cross Sisters at Notre Dame in 1878-9 and most likely took advantage of their hospitality during her visits. Five months after Hayes restarted her *Annals* in January 1878, the *Ave Maria* editor was Rev. Daniel E. Hudson, professor of English Literature at Notre Dame. Hayes and another Sister visited the campus in the early half of 187810 and Hudson published the following in the *Ave Maria* on 8 June 1878:

*The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* is the title of a neat little monthly magazine of thirty-two pages published at Belle Prairie, Morrison Co., Mn., by the Sisters Regular of the Third Order of St. Francis. It is well edited and neatly printed – being, by the way, exclusively the work of the Sisters themselves. It is, we see, in its third year, although new to us, for until now we had not been sent a copy of it and saw no notice of it in the Catholic Press. The subscription price is $1.25 a year. Contrary to what its title would seem to indicate, *The Annals* is not an exclusively devotional or ascetic work; a great portion of its contents is made up of interesting stories and sketches which cannot fail to make the magazine attractive to the general reader, and thus in a measure to counteract the growing appetite for nonsensical trash. The Contents of the present number are: I, The Gifts and Graces of Mary; II, Clare, or the Child of Our Lady of the Angels; III, Hail Mary; IV, Thoughts of a Tertiary Priest; V. California a Century Ago; VI, A

---

Hudson’s name was referred to in five of the seven extant letters that came from Ave Maria’s Office to Hayes in 1878-79 and provide evidence of exchanged articles between Hudson and Hayes. Br. Stanislaus Clarke wrote on behalf of Hudson, ‘So if you like, he will send you the “Ave Maria” containing the Sketches in exchange for “Clare, or the Child of Our Lady of the Angels”’. Clarke’s letter also conveyed information regarding rights to publish since the articles were written by the Hon. Mrs. F. Montgomery, and read as follows:

Rev. Mother, Since I last wrote you I spoke so enthusiastically of the story in your magazine, “The Annals”, to Rev. Father Hudson, that I tempted him to the desire of republishing it in the “Ave Maria”, and crediting the “Annals” with it. This would be a good way of making your magazine known to many, and perhaps of obtaining several subscriptions for it; but I also reminded him that you might not be free to permit its publication outside your own magazine. He said no difficulty could arise in this way, as the book was to be brought out on the other side of the Atlantic. But even if it were published in book form in this country it would but add to its popularity, as we know from the stories heretofore published in the “Ave Maria”. Those who had read them or read portions of them wished to obtain them afterwards in book form, but we were out of the book market and could not undertake so much additional work ourselves.

When Hudson asked for all back copies, ranging from January 1874 to June 1875, a hand note of Hayes on the letter indicated that along with other periodicals, she ‘put the “Ave Maria” in the exchange list of the “Annals”’. In an 1880 article, “The Tomb

---

12 The ‘Sketches’ referred to were explained as the “Sketches of the Early Missions on California” by Rev. F. Adam (Stanislaus Clarke, Notre Dame, Indiana, letter to Mother M. Ignatius Hayes, 16 June 1878, MFIC archives, Rome.) and Adam, “A Sketch of the Catholic Church in Upper California”, 221-26. There is only one extant article in the Annals 1878 index while by comparison what Hudson received was very lengthy, twenty-three articles known of from 1874-75, together with another one and more lost 1878-9, also possibly the book’s contents.
13 Clarke, letter to Mother M. Ignatius Hayes, 27 May 1878, MFIC archives, Rome.
of St. Peter of Alcantara”, Hayes acknowledged another exchange article. Other exchanges may have followed but there is no trace of them.

The Ave Maria’s contribution to the Apostolate of the Press, which Hayes appreciated and travelled a long distance to see in action, was recognised in its 1879 letterhead that carried the new ‘Approbation of and Blessing of Our Holy Father, Leo XIII’. It reiterates for the Catholic periodical scene in general, and for hard working pressroom individuals, their belief in the power of the press for good and its ability to counterbalance evil. The Approbation read:

I bless the editor with an especial blessing, the contributors, and all those engaged in its publication and propagation. I renew every word of this [Pope Pius IX’s] exceptional blessing. Indeed I wish with all my heart to see AVE MARIA more than ever prosperous and extending its usefulness over the country. Now that every land is deluged with wicked papers, can we ever sufficiently encourage the religious and sound press? Certainly the AVE MARIA deserves encouragement. May God bless it!

Hayes’ wisdom in turning to Ave Maria for advice, not to one of Saint Cloud’s secular publishing houses, highlights her deeply religious interests, and it also produced practical results. When she planned on opening a new Southern mission for the Afro-American people it was the Ave Maria, through Hudson, that quickly offered to include articles that would provide assistance. Living, reading and publishing in the South from 1878, Hayes knew that New Orleans of ‘the South’ produced the Morning Star paper (founded 1867) which she acknowledged in 1880 when she printed her translation of Paul Feval’s article. Paul Henri Corentin Feval was a novelist who contributed to important Parisian newspapers and who held the position of President of the ‘Société des Gens de Lettres’. Hayes’ Annals always carried poems and two contributing poets, the Rev. Abram J. Ryan and James R. Randall, were editors of the Morning Star for some time.

16 The original printing of the name, Ave Maria, in the extant 1880 index initiated present research since the 1880 contents are not extant. It provided the key to other MFIC archival material in Rome.
17 Stanislaus Clarke, Notre Dame, Indiana, letter to Mother M. Ignatius Hayes, 6 January 1879, MFIC archives, Rome.
New York influence: Among the Eastern magazines New York led the field, yet because of the ephemeral nature of Catholic journals, one could not know which journal might respond to the plea that Hayes printed in her mission news: ‘Would to God that a Catholic journal of New York might express our thanks’ wrote a missionary, who was so impressed with Catholic generosity, after returning from America to his foreign mission. It was 1883 and the visitor by calling on New York’s Catholic journalists gave himself what he felt was the best chance of being heard. However, the first Catholic magazine, the *Metropolitan or Catholic Monthly Magazine* (founded 1830), was not born in New York but in Baltimore; it appears to have survived only for short time. Twelve years later, Baltimore published the *Religious Cabinet*, which after a year changed its title to the *United States Catholic Magazine*; it enjoyed respected contributors but survived only until 1847 or 1848. The list of failures also included the New York *Catholic Expositor* (1842-44), the *Young Catholics’ Magazine* (March 1838 - February 1840), the short-lived monthly *National Catholic Register* of Philadelphia (founded January 1844) and the *Metropolitan* which surfaced again (1853) but failed to make a permanent contribution.

Nearer to the period when Hayes launched her magazine, included in an 1868-78 failures’ list was the *Catholic Record* of Philadelphia (in 1871), *Central Magazine* of St. Louis (in 1872) and the *Young Crusader* of Boston (founded 1868). High profile editors, Rev. James A. Corcoran, George D. Wolf and Archbishop Patrick J. Ryan, launched the *American Catholic Quarterly Review* in 1876 but its life span was not long and the *Ecclesiastical Review* in Philadelphia, founded in 1889 mainly to provide professional material for the clergy, struggled to survive. It was in late 1873, in this period of eastern failures, that Hayes asked Bishop Grace for permission to commence her *Annals*. It was probably his ‘knowledge’ of these many failures, of which he wrote ‘knowledge of the fate that has awaited so very many efforts of the

---

21 Contributors included Archbishop M. J. Spalding, Bishop Michael O’Connor, the Rev. Dr. C. C. Pise and B. N. Campbell. Spalding (1810-72) was once editor of the *Catholic Advocate* (1835), devoted much time to lectures and controversial writings in the Church’s defence, published books, became the seventh Archbishop of Baltimore and laboured much for the spread of Catholic truth. Authorities disagree on closure date, 1848 appears most likely. *Catholic Periodicals Collection from 1719 -*, Philadelphia Archdiocesan Historical Research Center, http://www.re.net/philadelphia/pahre/periodicals.html; accessed 21 October 2005.  
23 Ibid. accessed. The *Young Crusader* appears to have struggled until 1874, *Catholic Periodicals Collection*, accessed. Meehan’s article included in the failures’ list also *Donahoe’s Magazine* of Boston (1878). This appears incorrect as evidenced by an 1889 original copy (Poor Clares’ Kenmare library, Ireland) and because of facts on Donoghue given in Meehan’s article.
kind, made under the most favourable circumstances’, that was the basis of the
bishop’s fears for Hayes. 24 Within a year, however, the secular Saint Paul
Northwestern Chronicle published:

Francis of Assisi. This is a little monthly published by the good Sisters at
Brainerd, on the Northern Pacific R.R. and, naturally, filled with the most pious
writings and edifying selections. It is printed by our friend Russell, of the Brainerd
Tribune, and certainly speaks well for the workmanship of his office. We do not
see how it could be done much better in the east. This monthly is interesting,
besides its good reading, as a tide mark of the advance of Catholicity and
Catholic literature in this country. 25

In 1867 the Christian Brothers initiated De La Salle Monthly (1867) which later
became the Manhattan Monthly. 26 The Jesuit, Rev. B. Bestini, had founded the
successful Messenger of the Sacred Heart at Georgetown, D.C. in 1866. 27 New York
was the birthplace of its famous son, Isaac Thomas Hecker (1819-88) author,
missionary and founder of the Paulists who played a significant role in Catholic
journalism. Hecker was a friend of Hayes and his name was linked with a number of
important nineteenth-century journalists. By looking at his life and friendships, a
window is opened into the challenges and successes of American Catholic periodical
literature. Only by looking into these challenging times can Hayes’ extraordinary
success be comprehended.

Hecker, Brownson and Hayes connections: Hecker in his youth was a friend and
correspondent of Orestes A. Brownson (1803-76), a philosopher and social reformer,
later known also as essayist, influential convert, reviewer and intrepid advocate
among New York’s immigrant Catholics. 28 Brownson founded The Boston Quarterly

24 Bishop Thomas Grace, St. Paul, letter to Rev. Sister Mary Ignatius, Superior, Sisters' Institute, Brainerd,
Minnesota, 18 December 1873, MFIC archives, Rome.
Northwestern Chronicle, 1 August 1874, 5.
26 In the USA, the De La Salle Brothers are known as the Christian Brothers – contrary to Australia where the
title is applied to Edmund Rice’s Irish foundation.
27 It later moved to Woodstock in Maryland, Philadelphia and finally to New York (1893). This was a different
publication from the English and French journals by the same name.
28 Henry F. Brownson, Orestes Augustus Brownson, New Advent - Catholic Encyclopedia,
edited religious newspapers and periodicals, e.g., New York’s Free Enquirer, a Western New York journal,
Review in January 1838 which attracted literary contributors of note. Later he merged it with New York’s monthly U.S. Democratic Review with himself as a contributor, but by January 1844 he began his own Brownson’s Quarterly Review which became the first and most important Catholic quarterly. Brownson moved his Review to New York in 1855, suspended it for a time and resumed it until the last issue of October 1875.29 In 1844 New York’s Bishop McCloskey baptised Hecker who later studied in Belgium to become a Redemptorist and was ordained in London by Cardinal Wiseman.30 A year later, in 1851 he returned to New York to serve the rapidly increasing migrant population. A misunderstanding with his congregational leaders in Europe later caused Fr. Hecker and four companions to be released from their vows by Pius IX, when he gave them approval to begin the new Missionary Society of Saint Paul in the State of New York. The new community grew but became involved in the ‘intangible heresy’ called ‘Americanism’ which was unpopular with the ultra conservative clergy from Europe.31

In the 1860s the Paulists, led by the zealous Hecker, preached, wrote and delivered missions - especially to the ‘Gentiles’, and were seen to be ‘setting new standards in Catholic journalism’.32 Hecker founded the successful journal, Catholic World, in 1865 and for the first five years it appears that John R. G. Hassard was the editor.33 Hecker notably promoted the Apostolate of the Press among Catholics in America and besides his work for the influential Catholic World, he organised the Catholic Publication Society,34 directed a children’s paper called The Young Catholic and thus

The Gospel Advocate and The Philanthropist, and contributed to others including The Christian Examiner, the most significant of these publications.

29 Meehan, Catholic Periodical Literature - United States, accessed. Brownson, Orestes Augustus Brownson, accessed. Brownson became a Catholic in his forty-first year. In 1844 Fr. O’Brien of East Boston invited Brownson to join in the publication of The Catholic Observer but management skills were not his gift. Brownson, author of at least seven books, suspended publication of his Quarterly Review from January 1865 to October 1872 ‘because he was unwilling’, he said, ‘to continue a periodical which had not the full confidence of the Catholic hierarchy’.

30 Among his many works, Cardinal Wiseman was known to have encouraged a number of young writers, including Isaac T. Hecker, Margaret A. Cusack and Fanny Taylor, to commit their lives to the cause of Catholic literature.

31 The term ‘Americanism’ was understood by its advocates as applying to the characteristic qualities accepted as reflecting honour on the American people. A central tenet was separation of Church and State, an idea unacceptable to European political conservatives.


33 Meadows differed in his claim believing that Hecker was editor all the time right up to his death in 1888. Ibid.

34 Laurence Kehoe as publisher of Catholic World was associated with the success of the journal and the Catholic Publication Society. Meehan, Catholic Periodical Literature - United States, accessed.
created a new movement in Catholic literary activities. Hayes in her publication did not forget the children either and regularly included an article for them.

Hecker’s friend Brownson had helped to change New York Catholic immigrants’ fears when he boldly defended the Faith and challenged the ‘political atheism of Catholics’. At one stage Hecker had cause to write to his, at times, over enthusiastic friend and ask him to be more sensitive of others’ feelings, including those of the hierarchy. Brownson basically contributed one or two articles a month to Hecker’s Catholic World and he also wrote several articles for the weekly Ave Maria of Notre Dame, the same publication with which Hayes had literary exchanges. While Hecker wrote only three books in comparison with Cardinal Newman’s lengthy list, nonetheless Newman observed that ‘we had both begun a work of the same kind, he in America and I in England’. Newman made Catholic dogma and practices more acceptable to English people while Hecker brought the Catholic Faith closer to the democratic temper of the American people. Another English connection, and interconnected with Hayes, was Hecker’s friendship with and influence on William Lockhart who acknowledged how Hecker suggested to him a successful style in the presentation of Catholic doctrine. Lockhart wrote that ‘the idea of throwing Catholic doctrine into the form of conversations, and combining them together by a thread of narrative so as to form a tale’ was first suggested to him by Hecker. The first chapters of Lockhart’s book, The Old Religion, appeared in Hecker’s Catholic World while in England the story was published initially in Lockhart’s journal, Catholic Opinion. Lockhart believed that the success of the experiment was proved ‘by the greatly increased circulation given to his journal’ and by the ‘many letters of encouragement received, advising also that the work should be republished in a separate form’.

In 1885 Hayes and Chaffee were in New York. Having visited their American convents they were travelling back to Rome, so they ‘called at the Monastery of the

36 Carey’s recent publication provides insights into the high profile network to which Brownson and Hecker belonged. Patrick W. Carey, Orestes A. Brownson: American Religious Weathervane (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2004). Brownson as a Catholic also wrote leading articles in the New York Tablet; his last article was contributed to the American Catholic Quarterly Review (January 1876).
37 Smith, Isaac Thomas Hecker, accessed.
Paulist Fathers to see her [Hayes'] old friend Father Hecker. 39 Chaffee recorded that Hecker 'was exceedingly infirm, and very seldom came down' but he did so to see Hayes. 40 Hecker showed that he understood the difficulties that were being experienced by Hayes, and other religious congregational leaders, who had head houses in Europe during the ‘Americanism’ controversy. 41 Unfortunately Chaffee did not record any discussion about the Annals, the Catholic World or other periodical literature but did remember Hecker's advice to Hayes about going to see Bishop Wigger with regard to the Franciscan Sisters opening a house in New York. 42 Another insight has emerged from the Franciscan Sisters’ Union City chronicles to confirm Hecker and Hayes’ friendship, 43 yet neither of these Apostles of the Press were to know that later, in 1915, Hayes’ Annals would be printed and circulated again in Union City, New Jersey, and continue until the centennial of publication.

Another significant literary connection that linked Hayes and Hecker was their mutual friendship with Archbishop John Ireland who was among the most influential episcopal leaders in the USA. Hecker had striven unceasingly to recommend the Catholic Faith to the democratic American people, who in general had been reared in hostility to the Catholic Church on the pretence that ‘she’ was foreign and anti-democratic. As a convert and a European, Hayes appears to have understood the situation. Both Hecker, an ardent native-born American thinker, and Ireland, an Irish immigrant, were full of admiration for American institutions and perhaps Hayes was also. When The Life of Father Hecker was published in New York in 1891, it carried an introduction of approval by Archbishop John Ireland who was a subscriber to and admirer of Hayes’ Annals. In searching for the reasons behind the success of Hayes’ Annals, one suspects that it may have been her ability to speak to the heart of democratic Americans who made up the bulk of her subscribers.

39 Chaffee, "Memories", 51-2.
40 Hecker was actually sixty-six at the time and worn out; he lived only another three years.
41 Chaffee’s words were. ‘As soon as he saw Mother Ignatius [Hayes], he understood the reason of this secret internal movement’. These difficulties and the implications for the zealatrices will be considered later.
42 Chaffee’s manuscript recorded Hecker’s words. ‘Go to Wigger; Wigger is a good fellow and he will help you …’ Chaffee explained that Hayes wanted to open a house in New York ‘for the convenience of receiving postulants’ and that ‘when we opened a house later on in Jersey City, it was with the kind help of Bishop Wigger although these words of Father Hecker did not come to our mind at the time’. Chaffee, as Mother General, opened a house on 13 June 1899 in Sixth Street, Jersey City; two Sisters from the community were assigned as zealatrices for the Annals. Cahalane, History of the Immaculate Conception Province, 21-22.
43 ‘New Jersey State was the place chosen by Mother M. Ignatius Hayes after conferring with her friend, Father Isaac Hecker, … for a pied à terre’ - as it was described in the chronicles. She wanted a ‘foothold’ on the continent so that when the sisters arrived by ship in New York, they would have somewhere to stay. ‘Fr. Hecker advised against New York itself as Manhattan Island could be difficult to travel back and forth from’. MFIC Union City chronicles, reported by Moya Byrne in June 2001.
In his lifetime Hecker won the highest approval from the papacy, but the controversy on 'Americanism' was associated with his name after his death. The Catholic press added fuel to the fire, the flames being extinguished only after the bishops of the United States replied to the pope's Letter, *Testem Benevolentiae*. Catholic periodical literature in the USA was coloured to some degree not only with 'Americanism' and this controversy but also with Irish American relations. A look at the latter and some significant journals should cast further light on our search to explain how Hayes was able to contribute successfully to periodical literature in these challenging times.

Irish American relations and ‘Knownothingism’: A few years ago the history of nineteenth-century Irish American relations was highlighted by the *Irish Gazette*’s article on ‘the way the Irish have influenced history and participated in events that have shaped’ American lives. The Irish immigrants’ involvement in New York was recalled, for example, by the laying of St. Patrick Cathedral’s foundation stone in 1809, Bishop John Hughes’ need later to gather parishioners to prevent the anti-Catholic and anti-immigrant mob from burning the church, and Bishop John McCloskey’s reception of the cardinal’s ‘red hat’ in 1875. Alongside the Irish American relations that coloured periodicals, resources suggest that Catholic publications also broadcast the 'Irish versus the Native Americanism' struggle. During 1851-58 the Catholic press was busily engaged in responding to the charges made against the Church by the ‘Knownothing’ party that was a revived version of the Native American Movement of the earlier quarter century. Secular and religious newspapers of the ‘Knownothing’ party in the 1850s demonstrated the power of the press for evil in the form of encouraging violence against and bitter intolerance of innocent ‘foreigners’. The controversy between Archbishop Hughes and Senator Brooks over the New York Church Property Bill filled the newspaper organs of the

---

44 Rome’s suspicion at the time was that American Catholics desired a different Catholic Church from the rest of the world - rooted in the initial separation of Church and State, a situation Bishop Ireland, e.g., saw as advantageous.

45 The controversy was brought to a head when in the preface of the French translation of the *Life of Father Hecker*, an incorrect interpretation had been placed on some of Hecker’s publications. To defend ‘Americanism’, Bishop Ireland commenced a three-month stay in Rome on 27 January 1899.

Brownson summed up the history of ‘Knownothingism’ as a period when a prejudiced political party which was basically anti-Catholic, opposed chiefly to the Irish, wished to prevent them from having the rights of free citizens. The Catholic press responded mainly through newspapers to the books and anti-Catholic papers that were aimed at inflaming the passions of the mob against their Irish neighbours. Bishop Spalding’s letter to Bishop Kenrick told of ‘a reign of terror’.  

As the years moved on the Catholic periodical press continued to challenge the faithful to infuse the political arena with basic Christian principles. In an issue of *Donahoe’s Magazine*, the words of Hayes’ patriotic friend, John Ireland, headed the front page. It stated, ‘The future of the Irish people in this country will depend largely upon their capability of assuming an independent attitude in American politics’. Bishop Fenwick, long connected with Donahoe and admired by William Lockhart, started *The Jesuit or Catholic Sentinel* in 1829, and after acknowledging in his prospectus the rapid increase of Catholics in Boston, he stated clearly his intention to present traditional Catholic views. Like other publications it passed through a series of name changes, evolving finally into *The Pilot* which advocated Catholic and Irish interests, and grew into a significant paper of national circulation and influence.  

Two prominent figures in the periodical press, Archbishop John Hughes together with Orestes Brownson, were associated in 1856 with St. John’s College founded in Fordham, New York. As time progressed Brownson issued a rousing call for a new vision of the relationship between Catholicism and American civilisation, one that directly challenged the view formulated by Archbishop John Hughes, Archbishop

---

47 The nickname ‘Knownothing’ originated from the party members’ secrecy over naming its members and their reply to outsiders being, ‘I don’t know’. The ‘natives’ referred to were the American-born descendents of European, mainly British, settlers.  


49 The letter told of nearly 100 poor Irish people being butchered or burned and some 20 houses burnt to the ground. Other documents recorded the damage and suffering inflicted on churches and religious organisations, including convents.  

50 Patrick Donahoe, "Editor’s Note", *Donahoe’s*, June 1889. Irish American and Catholic interests were the focus not only in *Donahoe’s Magazine*, subtitled “A Journal Devoted to the Irish Race at Home & Abroad”, but also in Donahoe’s weekly paper, *The Pilot*.  

51 Fenwick’s first enterprise was in Connecticut where his short-lived journalistic venture was the *Catholic Press* begun in Hartford (11 July 1829). His aim next was to have ‘a newspaper in which the Doctrine of the Holy Catholic Church, ever the same, from the Apostolic Age down to our time, can truly be explained, and moderately, but firmly defended’.  


53 Hughes had become the first archbishop of New York in 1850.
Martin Spalding and Bishop John N. Neumann of Philadelphia. Brownson encouraged the ideal of American citizens being led by God’s Spirit, similar to some writings of his friends Isaac Hecker, John Keane and John P. Roddan. Hecker’s apologetic, founded on the combination of American natural rights and the Catholic teaching on justification, would not have occurred to Hughes, Spalding or Neumann. Hecker’s forward-thinking interpretation of the ‘Know-nothing campaign’ evidenced his belief in the providential course of history, while Hughes and his fellow thinkers held to an apologetic that looked back to the past. In his writings Hecker showed that he believed that the first principle of American constitutionalism was that ‘man was capable of governing himself’ - a principle that sat comfortably with Hayes’s words on governance – ‘What right have any of us to claim authority and not take responsibility?’

In this American struggle, the quarterly *Dublin Review* played a significant role in supporting Irish American relations for it was read in America by prominent Catholics, Bishop Ireland included. Nicholas Wiseman (later Cardinal Archbishop of Westminster) and Daniel O’Connell in 1836 founded the *Dublin Review* following Catholic Emancipation when Irish Catholics discovered the power of the press. The *Dublin Review* was general in character and Irish in more than name though it was published in London. Its list of editors was impressive including Dr. C. W. Russell, Dr. W. G. Ward, W. Michael Quin, W. Henry R. Bagshawe, John Cashel Hoey and Monsignor Moyes, some of whom were Irish-born. Besides this review, Irish

---


55 Both Hecker and Keane laboured to make people aware of the indwelling Spirit - Keane through his pastoral letters, his support of the Confraternity of the Servants of the Holy Ghost, and his diocesan visitations; Hecker through his numerous publications of mystical works, mission preaching and spiritual direction. Roddan, a Boston priest educated in Rome, was an editor of *The Pilot* and wrote for Brownson’s *Review*.

56 Chinnici, "The Spirituality of Americanism, 1866-1900", 96.

57 The gulf between Hecker and Keane’s writings, and those of the traditionalists - Hughes, Spalding and Neuman - could be compared, in Vatican II language, to the gulf between writings on ‘shared wisdom’ decision-making structures and traditional hierarchical church structures (that exclude women).

58 Hayes, "Diary", 73.

59 Ireland, *John Ireland Papers - Index Book (of Five Reviews)* 1863-93.

60 Cardinal Wiseman, friend of Newman, was a constant contributor, contriving to supply at least one article to almost every number that appeared in the 1850s when he was ceaselessly in demand in every part of England. His review articles covered almost every topic of the day including sociology, literature and the arts.

61 In the original series, at least half or more of its literary matter was produced in Ireland and its content contained Irish topics, political, social, educational and literary.

62 C. W. Russell, better known as a contributor of various papers for thirty years, was a professor of ecclesiastical history (1845), President of Maynooth (1857), author, translator, member of the Historical Manuscripts Commission (1869), contributor to *the Edinburgh Review*, the *Month* and the *Irish Monthly* (edited by his
journals and papers, including the popular monthly *Irish Ecclesiastical Record*, circulated in USA and they contained articles that assisted Catholic Irish-American-English relations.\(^{63}\) Contributors’ names that appeared in this *Record* as well as in Hayes’ *Annals* were Bridgett, de Vere and Knowles; this must have pleased her large number of Irish-American subscribers. The *Irish Monthly* boasted the longest continuous existence of all Irish Catholic magazines and it had the same Jesuit editor, Matthew Russell, for thirty-eight years. The names of the editor and of some contributors to this monthly can be found in Hayes’ *Annals* which she published in America between 1874 and 1883.\(^{64}\)

Cardinal Manning, longstanding contributor to the *Dublin Review*,\(^{65}\) was much admired by Minnesota’s Bishop Ireland and became his trusted friend.\(^{66}\) Manning was a contributor to Hayes’ *Annals* and Ireland, who for over fifty years was a dominant figure in the religious, social and political life of the United States, was a subscriber. When sending his *Annals’* subscriptions to Hayes, Ireland wrote, ‘I feel a pride in the fact that such talents as God has blessed you with has [sic] chosen our State as its field of labour’.\(^{67}\)

**German migrant contribution:** Besides the Irish immigrants’ influence on American Catholic periodical literature, the large number of Catholic German immigrants had necessitated ‘periodicals’, many weekly papers, and a good number of magazines in their own language. Bishop Ireland ‘more than anyone else guided a vast flood of
Catholic immigrants into the mainstream of American life, and among them many Germans came into his beloved Minnesota. In St. Paul, the German newspaper Der Wanderer, on 11 January 1873, advertised the Franciscan Sisters' presence in Belle Prairie, Morrison County, while Der Nordstern (1876-1885, 1887-1913) was another nearby German publication in St. Cloud. The English version of the German publication, the St. Paul Northwestern Chronicle, carried news of ‘Mother Hayes’ on a few occasions with one article (5 January 1878) advertising the ‘Annals of Our Lady of the Angels published by Members of the Third Order of St. Francis of Assisi - Belle Prairie’. Another article (4 January 1879) said of Hayes, ‘a convert to our Holy Faith, [she] is a lady of fine mental culture, and her zeal and devotedness are unlimited’. When this Minnesota news was published, Hayes was preparing the fourth volume of her Annals and by then she had more Sisters to assist her in the work of printing, publishing and distributing while she continued to do all the preparatory reading and editing herself.

Evidence of not only the Minnesota literature but of the fifty-one German periodicals, the second highest ethnic number in a total of 321 in the United States, is provided in the 1911 Catholic Directory. The first German Catholic paper Der Wahrheitsfreund, founded 1837, rolled off the press regularly until 1907 while the famous Bavarian convert, Dr. Maximilian Oertel, considered one of the most brilliant editors the Germans ever produced in America, founded the successful weekly, Katholische Kirchenzeitung. The record for the largest circulation among all Catholic weeklies was awarded to Rev. Jos Jessing who founded in 1873 the Ohio Waisenfreund. One source claims that the Germans in fact had two Catholic dailies before the United States English press could achieve a Catholic one. The German names of Benziger, Herder and Pustet became legends in the Catholic publishing world and

---

69 Archival copies at Franciscan Sisters, Little Falls, and MFIC, Rome.
70 Newspaper Time Index, Stearns History Museum and Research Centre, St. Cloud, Mn., microfilm.
71 Copies of both articles available, MFIC archives, Rome.
73 The two daily publications were the Amerika of Saint Louis, Mo. with editor, Dr. Edward Preuss, and the Volksfreund of Buffalo, New York, according to a 1909 source. Ibid. accessed. For dates re Amerika, published by the German Literary Society, sources differ a little; Schirp claims the founding was in 1878 but Notre Dame, USA, holdings support 1872. Catholic Newspapers, Notre Dame Archives Collection, http://archives.nd.edu/cathnews/cathinx.htm; accessed 21 October 2005.
Catholics admired the fearless Germans whose German Catholic press had many apostles who spoke out in defence of the Catholic cause.

As a young Puseyite, Hayes could not have been unaware of the German influence on her scholarly and spiritual adviser, Rev. E. B. Pusey. Pusey was greatly influenced by the writings of the Fathers of the Church whose works he brought back from Germany, through the influence of Augustus Neander. New research, especially that of American William H. Franklin, places the Oxford Movement in a wider perspective and highlights the impact of Germany on the Anglican Catholic Revival of the nineteenth century. Hayes’ Wantage pastor was wholly devoted to the Oxford Movement’s principles and position and he had an immense regard for Pusey. Of how Hayes viewed the German Catholic press in the 1870s there is no record, but her journey to Berlin after the Franco-Prussian war and the Belle Prairie presence of Sr. M. Alice Peet who spoke German fluently, facilitated the consideration of translations in her Annals.

During the 1860s, amid numerous other periodicals in Germany, a famous Jesuit organ, Stimmen aus Maria-Laach, appeared at irregular intervals and made its way to America, in particular to Minnesota. From Germany in 1882 also came the

---

74 It was said of Pusey by Dean Stanley, speaking of his 1838 lectures, ‘The whole atmosphere of the Professor breathed the spirit of Germany to a degree which I am convinced could be found in no other lecture-room in Oxford’. (R. William Franklin, "The Impact of Germany on the Anglican Catholic Revival in Nineteenth-Century Britain", Anglican and Episcopal History, Volume LXII, no. 3 (1993): 441, in E.G.W. Bill, University Reform in Nineteenth Century Oxford 1811-1885 (Oxford, 1973), 252-53.) Hayes was not in Oxford’s lecture rooms but Pusey used the same approach in his public sermons.

75 Neander was ‘a rather famous young German Church historian in Berlin’. Patristic theology and spirituality attracted Pusey, who had completed the equivalent of modern graduate studies for five years in German Universities in the 1820s. Pusey’s Hebrew linguistic scholarship earned him a chair in Oxford and he was a brilliant Hebraist. Allchin, "W. J. Butler - Sacraments and Society", 5.

76 Allchin worked in New York with W. H. Franklin who formerly was Professor of Church History at the University of St. John’s, Collegeville, Minnesota, founded and directed by the male Benedictines. An inquiry on 9 March 2001 revealed the library did not hold nineteenth-century journals; however some were located in the Benedictine Sisters’ library nearby.


78 Stimmen aus Maria-Laach was still being published ten times a year by Herder at Freiburg, at the beginning of the twentieth century, edition 5200. Loffler, Periodical Literature - Germany, accessed.

79 Stimmen aus Maria-Laach. Katholische Blätter. 1880, 1881, 1884 issues are available in the Benedictine Sisters Library at Saint Joseph, Mn., accessed 15 March 2001; the 1880 issue was printed in Germany but the
monthly periodical called *St. Benedikts-Stimmen: Tabernakel and Fegefeuer* which by 1889, like the monthly *Die Katholischen Missionen*, was printed in the German language but in America’s St. Louis, Missouri.\(^{80}\)

Wherever the German Society of the Word of God established houses in the world, their magazines spread widely in different languages and their publications provide elements of comparison with Hayes’ *Annals*.\(^{81}\) Forced by the *Kulturkampf* to found a German Mission House in the safety of Steyl in Holland, Arnold Janssen was able to pay for the house out of the donations he solicited in his first magazine, an action similar to Hayes’ method of supporting her missions through subscriptions to the *Annals*. In the nineteenth century’s last decade Janssen’s enterprise spread from Europe to both North and South America, also to Africa and New Guinea. Janssen’s first publication, *The Little Messenger of the Sacred Heart*, begun in the same year as Hayes’ *Annals*, grew out of the editor’s desire ‘to do more for the spiritual welfare of the Church and especially for the foreign Missions.’ He wrote, ‘The idea of finding time for publishing a popular magazine that would promote prayer and the spread of the holy faith led me on’.\(^{82}\) Though Janssen’s first magazine was different in language and layout from the *Annals*, as he used two columns on larger sized paper, yet, like Hayes’ publication, it was an illustrated monthly.

In 1878 the Society’s printing presses in Steyl published Janssen’s second and better-known magazine, *Stadt Gottes* (City of God), a weekly entertaining, instructive, religious pictorial which still circulates. It became a source of financial support not only for the Steyl house but also the sending and upkeep of missionaries. The early Holy Spirit Sisters worked in Steyl as Apostles of the Press; later the printing presses

---

80 *Die Katholischen Missionen*, Illustrierte Monatschrift or illustrated monthly, St. Louis, Mo., 1875, was introduced by neat pages of contents; articles were laid out in two columns of fine print with outstanding illustrations. These issues carried to the German people in America, news of Church events from many different countries including England and Italy, especially Roman news items. *St. Benedikts-Stimmen: Tabernakel and Fegefeuer*, Monats-Schrift, Lambach, 1882 & 1889, and *Die Katholischen Missionen*’s issue of 1875 are available in the Benedictine Sisters Library at Saint Joseph, Mn., accessed 15 March 2001.

81 The Society of the Word of God, better known as Divine Word Fathers, was founded by German-born Arnold Janssen (1837-1909). The Society’s women, Holy Spirit Sisters, were founded by German-born Helena Stollenwerk, in collaboration with Janssen.

in Modling (Austria) also supported the mission work. Hayes may have been familiar with the printing press that Butler had in Wantage in the late 1840s, and she possibly knew that Emily Faithful began London’s *Victoria Press* in 1860 with mainly women helpers. Unfortunately we simply do not know if, when Hayes was in Saarbrücken in 1870 or in other parts of Europe later, she was aware of women working presses in France or Germany and whether or not she was in contact with Janssen.

Finally, to bring this segment on the investigation into Hayes’ contribution to Catholic journals to a conclusion, it seems fair to make the following observation. Many German immigrants would have been aware of past and present happenings regarding the Catholic periodical press in Germany after the 1848 events, and after 1871 with the fierce onslaught of the *Kulturkampf*. The Germans gave the American Catholic press brave apostles, men and women who understood the immense power of the press and its potential for ’good and evil’. The *Irish Ecclesiastical Record* told of an Irish desire to have such Apostles of the Press. If only ’we had an organ of Irish opinion, conducted with the energy and singleness of purpose which characterise the management of the *Germania*’, and again, ’It is from Germany, too, that we get our best defence and our ablest expositions of Catholic doctrines’. Yet these German Apostles of the Press were not alone; there were other apostles in England,

---

85 Emily Faithful (1835-1894), English feminist and daughter of a clergyman, set up a printing establishment for women despite opposition. Faithful was appointed Printer and Publisher in Ordinary to Queen Victoria and in 1863 commenced the *Victoria Magazine* that continued for eighteen years. The periodical advocated women’s claim to remunerative employment. Faithful lectured widely, including visits to the USA between 1872 and 1882. Hayes was based there between 1872-81.
86 The large St. Wendel’s Centre, 25 kilometres from Saarbrücken, holds an exhibition of the Society’s history including photos of the early pressrooms and the workers, religious women and men. In 1888 Janssen opened a House of Studies in Rome where Hayes was printing, so it was possible that they met. Hayes published articles about the White Fathers’ missionary activities (1889, Vol XIV, no. iv, 107-09; 1890, Vol XV, no. x, 308-12) whose existence was paved by Janssen and his periodicals.
87 Before 1848 German Catholic journalism did not prosper; then came the political and religious emancipation which were of immense importance for Catholic life and the Catholic press. ’The freedom of the Press enabled the journals to express public opinion’. Loffler, *Periodical Literature - Germany*, accessed.
88 The *Kulturkampf*, instead of destroying the Catholic people’s faith, brought about an expansion of power and scattered the Catholic laity, religious and clergy to other countries, especially North America.
France and Italy, as well as the ‘native’ and Irish American ones. These journalists understood the violent challenge issued to revealed doctrine by pantheists, rationalists, materialists, Kantians, Hegelians, evolutionists and others. These Apostles of the Press appear to have grasped that the violence done to truth, as they understood it, was best answered by the propagation of good periodical literature. This could be achieved by a press utilising orthodox articles on doctrines of faith and morals, Church history and liturgy, sound education at different levels, spiritual and devotional exercises, and all else good that belonged to faith in a loving God. By investigation of these nineteenth-century Apostles of the Press, it is clear that Hayes was not a minor player among them.
Chapter 5

Situating Hayes in Franciscan Periodical Literature

To appreciate the significance of Hayes’ evangelising mission it is necessary to contextualise her journal within the wider Franciscan periodical scene both at the time she began publishing in 1874, and over the twenty-one years of her editorship. This context reveals that Hayes made a significant contribution as the first person to edit and publish a Franciscan journal in English; her early work spearheaded American Franciscan journals and her later *Annals* stood tall among respected European publications. While Hayes, like so many other religious women, shared in the teaching ministry, she was one of the few nineteenth-century religious foundresses committed to a mission through journalism.

Fleshing out this Franciscan context is not an easy matter, however, as to date there is no directory of nineteenth-century Franciscan journals produced for Europe, Canada or the United States. Appendix 1 is the result of an exhaustive search of Franciscan library holdings and is the first attempt to provide an alphabetical directory of nineteenth-century Franciscan journals. Whilst not claiming to be complete, this listing provides a comparative setting in which to examine the contribution of Hayes’ *Annals*.

Franciscans have a long and strong literary tradition developed over an 800-year history. In meeting the challenges of secular journals in the nineteenth century, Franciscan periodicals have drawn on this strong tradition. Hayes referred to the learned doctors among the Franciscan scholars, for example, when she translated the following from the *Revue Franciscaine*:
The Doctors and men of learning in this Order are more than ten thousand amongst which we do not comprehend any of those of the present day who notwithstanding are very numerous.¹

In another article, “The Seraphic Order”, Hayes wrote:

Franciscan doctors have occupied the first chairs of the most celebrated universities, such as Alexander of Hales, John de la Rochelle, St. Bonaventure, Adam de Marisco, Duns Scotus, Roger Bacon, Francis Mayronis, Nicholas de Lyre and many others. The Order, when still in its infancy, possessed the three-fold Aureola of martyrdom, apostleship and learning.²

The approach for examining Franciscan periodicals, after clarifying some Franciscan terms and meanings, will be to discover first what existed in Franciscan periodical literature when Hayes decided to prepare for her first publication in January 1874. Second, to analyse the growth pattern of Franciscan periodicals during her publication years, especially in Europe and America, and their influence on her. Third, to compare the English-language Franciscan Annals with Hayes’ publication.

Franciscan terms and meanings

It was important for Hayes that her readers understood the origin and structure of the Catholic Franciscan family that is composed of three Orders. The First Order for male religious, the Second Order for solemn-vowed nuns and the Third Order for lay men and women. The Third Order led to two categories, the Third Order Regular (religious communities, like Hayes’, with simple vows) and the Third Order Secular (Tertiaries living in their own homes).³ Hayes edited and published in a seven-part serial the traditional story of the foundation of the three Orders and their evolution.⁴ A desire for renewal within the three Orders led to the development of numerous branches of the one Franciscan family tree. Hayes’ group is an example of a Third Order Regular branch. Hayes initially belonged to a Third Order Franciscan community called the

---

Bayswater Franciscan Sisters, then she transferred to the Glasgow Franciscans because they had a mission in Jamaica; next she founded the short-lived Sèvres Franciscan community and finally she founded her enduring Franciscan institute at Belle Prairie, Minnesota. Later, from this foundation other independent groups were formed also and all belong as branches of the Third Order Regular. Hayes had an excellent understanding of the Third Order Sisters of her time and provided an overview in “The Order of Penance”. St. Francis is of course the first person alleged to have received the stigmata – the crucifixion wounds of Christ. According to tradition, Francis received the stigmata directly from the crucified Christ who appeared in the form a six-winged seraph. So over the centuries St. Francis has been called the Seraph of Assisi, with the term ‘Seraphic Order’ regularly substituted for the whole Franciscan Order.

In 1888 Hayes published an article on the First Order, that of the Friars Minor, to explain to her readers how the Discalced, Recollects and Reformed (from the Observants) evolved. It concluded with, ‘The Friars Minor of the Observance are still the most numerous and important family in the Seraphic Order and that which has produced the greatest number of Saints’. In the article Hayes reveals her knowledge of all the localities in Europe, Asia, Africa, North and South America and Oceania (including Sydney) where the Friars Minor served. She also lists the old Franciscan sanctuaries that the friars cared for, beginning with ‘St. Mary of the Angels’, the chapel which had inspired the choice of her Annals’ title. The friars were known by numerous names at different times and in different places. From 1897 just three First Order groups existed, the Friars Minor (Observants), the Capuchins and the Conventuals. The multiple names will be simplified here, even though periodicals before 1897 are being examined. Popular nicknames like ‘Greyfriars’, ‘Barefeet’ or ‘Cordeliers’ were interchangeable in the First Order and were used in some nineteenth-century Franciscan journals. Within the First Order the Capuchins were quicker than the Observants to develop their own periodical press with its Franciscan tradition and they also published a greater number of journals that became better known and continued longer.

---

5 Hayes, "The Seraphic Order - the Order of Penance", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XIV, no. v (1889): 130-35. The term, ‘Order of Penance’ was the original thirteenth-century label for tertiary movements.


Among the Second Order groups no nineteenth-century periodicals produced by them have been found. Franciscan and Catholic Church periodicals at times conveyed the Second Order history and stories, for example, a paper written on the occasion of the septicentennial commemoration of Saint Clare’s ‘conversion’ which appeared in 1912 in The Catholic World of New York. Although the Third Order Regular Franciscans were numerous in the late nineteenth century, the only two recorded communities that contributed to the growth of Franciscan periodicals were Hayes’ Franciscan Sisters and, later, Helen de Chappotin’s Franciscan Missionaries of Mary. De Chappotin, like Hayes, believed in the printing press’s value for the rapid diffusion of Christian teaching. Numerous Tertiaries were involved in the Apostolate of the Press; among the most famous were Cardinal Manning, Lady Georgiana Fullerton, Canon Oakley and Lady Herbert of Lea who, besides their major writings, contributed generously to Franciscan journals, including Hayes’ Annals.

European Franciscan Periodicals before 1874 and Hayes’ use of them
St. Francis in the Order’s early days was convinced that a great number of men and women from almost every country would join the Order. According to his first biographer, Celano, Francis said, ‘Frenchmen are coming, Spaniards are hastening, Germans and English are running, and a very great multitude of others speaking various tongues are hurrying.’ These words, quoted by Hayes, can be repeated to describe the growth and propagation of Franciscan periodical literature in Europe in the second half of the nineteenth century.

Overview of the pre-1874 European Franciscan journals to be discussed:

9 Literally hundreds of women’s congregations were founded in the nineteenth-century and the re-emergence of Third Order Regulars seems part of the nineteenth-century ‘neo-monastic movement’ which gained impetus from the 1850s. Among the many Third Order Regular Franciscans, communities followed the rule and constitutions to different degrees, and sometimes, by necessity or local clerical influences, they diverted from the original Franciscan charism. Hayes was thoroughly Franciscan-minded in leadership, ideals and missionary aspirations.
10 Goyau, Valiant Women, 191.
11 Oakley was a friend and mentor of Fr. Julian Tenison Woods who became a press apostle and significant religious founder in Australia.


The first nineteenth-century Franciscan journal, *Annales Franciscaines*, was founded in 1861 by the Capuchins of Paris. This journal’s significance has been recognised by numerous authorities. Another French Franciscan publication, *Annales du Tiers-Ordre de Saint Francois d’Assise*, was produced by the Aubanel friars of Avignon in 1865 but information on it is scarce.

1870 marked the beginning of *Annali Francescani*, published by the Capuchins of Milan. In its first number the editor, Fr. Egidio, stated that its goal was ‘to revive the spirit of the Seraphic S. Francis’ so that there would be a return to Christian practices, to virtue, and ‘to faith in Christ for our troubled humanity’. *Annali Francescani* intended to ‘attract spirits and minds and above all hearts to the imitation of the exemplary life and works of Saint Francis of Assisi’. Tertiaries especially were encouraged, as well as friar preachers and directors, to diffuse the periodical’s message and through it to be united in the spirit of the Seraph of Assisi. By 1890, Fr. Cyprian of Dugnano, another editor, wrote of the periodical’s main purpose and described it as ‘the growth, and better still, the organisation of the Holy Third Order of Penance’. Among *Annali Francescani’s* four major contributors was the Third Order

---


16 Friars Minor, "Antonianum", no. 88.


18 Ibid., 2.


20 Third Orders for lay people were generally known in the Middle Ages as Orders of Penance.
French bishop, Louis Gaston de Ségur, an authority on the Third Order and a contributor to Hayes’ *Annals* and other Franciscan journals.

1870 gave birth to the French journal, *Revue Franciscaine* while the next year the Cuneo Friars Minor published *Letture Francescane*, a periodical that continued until 1904. In 1873 the Capuchins at Naples launched their monthly periodical, *L'eco di S. Francesco D'Assisi*, which continued for thirty-one years although it had ‘a laboured existence’, with a five-year suspension at one period. The editor, Friar Bonaventure, began the first volume with a greeting to Franciscans and Catholics everywhere, followed by a strongly worded claim that the journal would counteract the evils of the day – the same as Hayes hoped for her *Annals*. Bonaventure compared ‘evil doers’, who write and work against the Church, with wolves and wild beasts. References to *L'eco di S. Francesco D'Assisi* appeared in numerous sources and it was different from most other journals in that it was not a periodical for the secular Third Order Franciscans but rather for First Order friars and intellectuals, as shown by its sub-title, *periodico mensile sacro-francescano*. For the Tertiaries, Bonaventure of Sorrento edited another publication, *La strenna del Terz'Ordine Francescano* (The Gift of the Third Order of St Francis) which was an illustrated monthly supplement provided, free of charge, to receivers of his publications, *L'eco di S. Francesco D'Assisi* and *Stelle e fiori*. Early in 1873 in Spain the Franciscan Fathers commenced their *La Revista Franciscana*, a monthly publication.

Hayes’ *Annals*, as well as her diary, reveal that she was familiar with or knew of these Franciscan journals and quoted from some of them on numerous occasions when they suited her topic. To let readers know the difficult situation facing Franciscans in other countries, Hayes borrowed from *Annales Franciscaines*:

---

22 *Letture Francescane*. Periodico mensile religioso dedicato ai Figli di San Francesco d'Assisi, a cura di sacerdoti della citta di Cuneo (Cuneo, 1871-1904) noted in Finauro, "Annali Francescani", xi. Also an 1871 copy is recorded in Friars Minor, "Antonianum", 641.
26 Finauro, "Annali Francesciani", 82.
27 Ibid., xi.
In our last number we announced the expulsion of these religious of the Third Order Regular of St. Francis, from Gniesen, in Prussia, by the government, we translate from the French Annals the following letter, assured that it will interest our readers.29

From the same journal for an article on missions Hayes wrote, ‘A few quotations from the Annals published at the present time in Europe will satisfy our inquiries.’30 Hayes showed how her lifelong proficiency in French was invaluable for translating *Annales Franciscaines* which she possibly read in Jamaica since French was the community’s basic language. Also easy access to *Annales Franciscaines* was likely after Hayes’ arrival in France, first in 1864 and then again from late 1866, until she left Sèvres around July 1870.

To demonstrate the flourishing state of the Franciscans in Italy, Hayes used statistical information from *Annali Francescani*:

In Italy, according to the statistics published by the Franciscan Annals of Milan, there are 30,740 known Tertiaries, of whom thirty-eight are Prelates, 264 pastors of parishes, 832 Priests, 716 religious of different orders, more than 8,000 men and 49,840 women. Half of these have been admitted during the last two years, which shows the astonishing progress of the Third Order in Italy. At Gabineto, diocese of Milan, out of 450 families which form the entire population there are 866 Tertiaries; Milan itself counts 3,110. … The Annals add that, including all the isolated members scattered in the different parts of the peninsula, the total number is estimated at over half a million!31

Hayes in her diary in the early 1870s made reference to the ‘Franciscan Annals of Milan’ and thereby indicated her awareness of the publication before she engaged in the same Franciscan Apostolate of the Press.32

---

31 Hayes, "The Progress and Development of the Third Order in Europe", 29.
32 Hayes, "Diary", 61.
To highlight the political situation faced by some Franciscan publishers, Hayes quoted from *Revue Franciscaine* to tell the story of “The Franciscans in Prussia”. It told of Third Order Franciscan Sisters - ‘several of the Sisters were French but the greater number were of Polish origin’ - who were expelled ‘for having published a collection of Hymns in honour of the Sacred Heart!’ This being true, what was the punishment for publishing a journal during the *Kulturkampf* in places under German/Prussian control? Writing about missions, the Franciscans or saints, Hayes at times called on *Revue Franciscaine*. Also Hayes was aware of the Franciscans at Cuneo who published *Letture Francescane* for she recorded that ‘At Cuneo there are 2,300 (Tertiaries)’. When Hayes wanted to tell of the Order's development in Spain, ‘notwithstanding that anarchy and revolution rend the country’, she claimed that the commencement of *La Revista Franciscana* was ‘evident proof the Third Order is spreading there’.

**Franciscan Periodicals 1874-94 in Europe, Canada and the United States**

Hayes was aware of the ‘growth and development of the Franciscan Order in Europe’ which she had witnessed first hand and recorded in her *Annals*. Between 1874-94, when Hayes was publishing, at least another thirty-five European Franciscan journals were founded across Italy, France, Spain, Germany, Austria, Belgium, England and Ireland. Some examination of these journals serves to illustrate the significance of Hayes’ contribution.

In **Italy** the three journals already discussed continued and another sixteen were founded. The Italian Franciscan Capuchins led the field in publishing journals and their “Periodica” in *Lexicon Capuccinorum* has provided assurance of these publishing events by naming the Order’s Provinces where the journals originated.

---


35 Hayes, "The Progress and Development of the Third Order in Europe", 29.

36 Ibid.

37 Ibid., 28-29.

is not known how many of these Franciscan journals Hayes read while living in Rome from 1881. In her final editing years, Hayes sometimes simply introduced her article with the words, ‘translation from the Italian’. Of these journals, a high proportion were short-lived. In 1888 the editor of Annali Francescani claimed that, besides his journal, there were only four others in circulation that were significant in Italy. To survive in a world of journalism was a great achievement; to be successful was extraordinary. Evidence indicates that these Italian journals existed to carry out the apostolate of instruction, encouragement and organisation among the Franciscan Tertiaries, a mission to which Hayes was totally committed.

In France the strong and continued success of the earlier widespread Annales Franciscaines, printed in Paris, meant decreased need for other French Franciscan journals and only five new ones were founded in this period. The effects of religious persecutions after the Franco-Prussian war had taken their toll but the need to instruct the French tertiaries was urgent and important, as Hayes, who had lived in the diocese of Versailles, pointed out:

On every side St. Francis finds new children. Special mention is made of the fervour of the congregations in the dioceses of Versailles, Moulin, Lucon, and Verdun. Tertiaries are also very numerous in Corsica. From Lille they write ... In the month of September (1873) last no less than 400 Sisters belonging to a congregation who have their Mother House at Bordeaux, entered the Third Order; another entire congregation gave the same example; the Ursulines do not forget that their saintly foundress was a Tertiary; and they also love to become the children of St. Francis. Thirty-eight of the religious of the convent of Dinan and three other Communities were lately received. Many of the children connected with their academies, desiring to follow the example of their instructresses were enrolled in the Arch-confraternity.

The French Annals of the Franciscan Missionaries of Mary were written initially by the foundress, Hélène de Chappotin, from 1886. In Paris, the Sisters set them up in type from 1899 and, from simple beginnings, the printing equipment gradually improved to

---

39 Annales des Franciscaines Missionnaires de Marie, Annales du Tiers-Orde Séraphique, La Voix de Saint Antoine, Revue Franciscaine and Grusse aus Nazareth. For details see appendix 1.
allow for greater artistic quality in their publications. The content of their *Annals* contrasted with Hayes’ *Annals* in that the latter did not record the life of her Institute in her journal. The Missionaries of Mary certainly had more mission news to report but Hayes’ *Annals* were published for a wider readership. Some time before 1890 the Friars Minor started *La Voix de Saint Antoine* which continued after 1897. The Franciscans in the city of Caen published the *Annales du Tiers Ordre Séraphique* which existed between 1890-93 according to two sources. The year before Hayes died, the Strasbourg Capuchins commenced the journal, *Grusse aus Nazareth*, but this lasted only three years, from 1893-96.

In Spain, besides *La Revista Franciscana* which continued, three new journals entered the arena - *El Mensajero Serafico*, *El Eco Franciscano*, and *El Misionero Franciscano: revista religiosa*. Perhaps Hayes knew of these Spanish journals through her neighbours, the Spanish Franciscans of San Pietro in Montorio, but there is no certainty. However in 1889 Eliza Allen Starr’s article on the Spanish “San Pietro in Montorio” was included in the *Annals*. Beginning in 1883 and continuing into 1885, Hayes published “A Peep into Spain”, a series of ten articles which were written by an unidentified ‘Tertiary’. This series appears to throw no direct light on Franciscan journals but it did coincide with Hayes and Chaffee’s visit to Spain in 1883 and places named by Chaffee match places described in the articles, “A Peep into Spain”.

---

41 Goyau, *Valiant Women*, 192. Goyau says that de Chappotin ensured that part of young missionaries’ training was to learn printing skills in order to take the benefits of the press to other countries and inculturate it for God’s glory.
42 A number of bishops and priests received Hayes’ *Annals* but the obituary lists confirm that a high proportion of the readers were seculars, often Third Order Secular Franciscans.
45 Capuchins, "Peregrinus - Periodica", 1320.
47 The Villa Spada Convent, where Hayes lived in Rome, was identified by the address - ‘near Pietro in Montorio’ where Spanish friars had a large monastery and old church.
50 Chaffee, "Memories", 42-45. Chaffee wrote of Hayes’ visit to Spanish holy places and of her wish to have a foundation in Rabida ‘to honour Christopher Columbus’ - a Tertiary.
There is a paucity of references to Franciscan German and Austrian periodicals in the 1860s and early 1870s. This is believed to be in part a reflection of the Franciscan struggles in Germany around the period of the Kulturkampf, a period when Church property was seized, when laws restricted the church’s political and social role - with many Franciscans forced to go to other countries. There were gains: for example, German Sisters and Friars made foundations in the USA and in turn a Cincinnati Franciscan periodical was published in German. Also German friars made an impact on Irish Franciscans which in turn encouraged Irish periodical literature. Nonetheless, there are some German examples as in Innsbruck. This city, at times included under German Franciscan publishing while at others with Tyrolean or Austrian, had Friars Minor who began publishing Sanct’ Francisci Gloecklein in 1877\(^{51}\) while in 1879 the Capuchins founded Sankt Franzisusblatt in Limburg.\(^{52}\) In Altotting, Seraphischer Kinderfreund was published by the Capuchins in 1890\(^{53}\) while in the same year the Capuchins of Ehrenbreitstein founded Seraphischer Kinderfreund und Marienkind.\(^{54}\) The existence of Austria’s Die Posaune des hl. Kreuzes received from the Viennese Franciscans was acknowledged by an Irish publication as existing in 1890-91.\(^{55}\)

Hayes’ interest in the Franciscans at Mönchengladbach - she called it Gladbach - was reflected in her 1890 publication of Dr. Fisher’s address when she quoted him as saying:

‘Franciscan Convents are springing up once more in our native land, and growing constantly in number, especially in the industrial districts. And so I am so glad that the foundation-stone of a new Franciscan Monastery is being laid today in this thriving city …’\(^{56}\)

---
\(^{53}\) Capuchins, "Peregrinus - Periodica", 1321.
\(^{54}\) Ibid.
\(^{56}\) Hayes’ account was substantiated in Joseph Gerwing, *100 Jahre Franziskaner in Mönchengladbach 1889-1989* (Gladbach: Rhenania Franciscana. Dietrich-Coelde-Verlag, Weri, 1989). Nearby Aachen had Franciscans living there in the 1850s with some going to USA in the 1860s.
This renewed growth of Franciscan monasteries and convents in Germany twenty
years after the Kulturkampf was necessary before their later journals flourished on
the Franciscan literature scene. What is interesting, however, is that Hayes was
clearly aware of these publications also. In 1890, for example, Hayes published two
other articles related to Germany, namely “The Religious Orders”\(^{57}\) and “A new step
of the Sovereign Pontiff toward alleviating the Social miseries. Letter of his Holiness
to the Archbishop of Cologne”.\(^{58}\) In 1892 Hayes published two separate German
translations on “Shrines of St. Anthony of Padua: The Miraculous Shrine at Kaltern in
the Austrian Tyrol”.\(^{59}\)

Like the German provinces, the Belgian province was affected badly by the French
Revolution and its aftermath and so far as is known only two journals were founded.
The Friars Minor produced Le Messager de Saint Francois d’Assise: Revue
mensuelle du Tiers-Order (1875-1931), first in Brussels and also by 1890 in
Antwerp.\(^{60}\) This city also published De Bode but minimal reference suggests a short
life.\(^{61}\) Antwerp was the final resting-place of the last Titular Guardian of Canterbury
(England), Fr. Leo Edgeworth ofm (d.1850) and it was from that city that the Belgium
Recollect Province sent Friars Minor to England.\(^{62}\) They opened houses, Gorton and
Manchester (1861), Glasgow (1868), and London and Stratford (1873), and this
paved the way for the 1880s English Franciscan revival.

Hayes wrote of England and Ireland in her 1874 article on “The Progress and
Development of the Third Order in Europe”:

Not only on the continent but also in Great Britain and Ireland the Order has
greatly increased within the last few years. In 1869 a new congregation of
Tertiaries was erected in Cork, in the Church of St. Francis of the Friars Minor

\(^{57}\) Weiss, "The Religious Orders", 342-44.

\(^{58}\) Pope Leo XIII, "A New Step of the Sovereign Pontiff toward Alleviating the Social Miseries. Letter of His

\(^{59}\) Hayes, "Shrines of St. Anthony of Padua: The Miraculous Shrine at Kaltern in the Austrian Tyrol", 27-32, 90-
96. An 1892 letter of 11 November to Hayes links ‘Kaltern M. Gladbach’ with the Sisters’ preparation and
printing of a pamphlet for St. Isidore’s College President, opening a research door to previously unexplored


\(^{62}\) Doyle, Canterbury and the Franciscans 1224-1974, 79. Recollects, a renewal branch of the Friars Minor
Observants, sought from the 16th century to live strictly in the spirit of St. Francis and the early Franciscans.
Obs [Observants]. It is very flourishing. The monthly reunion is made regularly ... The fraternity possesses a good library where the brothers and sisters find an abundance of pious and instructive reading. In the Church of the Friar Minor Cap [Capuchins] in the same city, there is also a congregation under the direction of the Fathers ... In Dublin, a new church, built by the Friars Minor Cap [Capuchins] has been in the course of erection during the last three years, and was solemnly dedicated by His Eminence Cardinal Cullen, Archbishop of Dublin, on the 13th of October last.63

So the Irish stage was set for the entrance of English and Irish Franciscan periodicals – three in particular. The Capuchins at Crawley (Sussex, England) entered in 1877 with the original cover page reading *The Franciscan Annals and Monthly Bulletin of the Third Order of St. Francis* and it became a highly respected and long running publication.64 The sub-heading indicated the periodical’s aims – it was clearly for the members of the Third Order of Saint Francis. In brief, the English *Franciscan Annals* contained a good deal of devotional and historical material, Franciscan news, lives of Franciscan saints, short stories, poems and other mixed material. Hayes included in her *Annals* a few selections from the *Franciscan Annals* but was not awed by them in any way. English *Franciscan Annals’* editors recycled some articles from old Franciscan literary sources and from the ‘companion’ Francisan Annals of Italy and France.65

In the *Franciscan Annals’* 1882 August issue, “The Miraculous Tree of Sienna” was borrowed from the *Annales Franciscaines* of Paris.66 The English editor was aware of *L’eco di S. Francesco* and included from it “A Sermon by S. Lawrence of Brindisi”.67 As the number of Tertiaries continued to grow so did the readership of the *Franciscan Annals*. A reader’s 1882 question led to a listing of the Franciscan Monastries, both

---

63 Hayes, "The Progress and Development of the Third Order in Europe", 58.
64 A complete set of year books from 1877 to 1894 was accessed at the Central Library of the Friars Minor Capuchins Historical Institute and International College, Rome; at the Capuchin’s Curia Library, Erith (Kent) and at the Greyfriars Oxford University College Library. It was called *Franciscan Annals and Tertiary Record* in Capuchins, "Peregrinus - Periodica", 1314. "Literary Notices", *Irish Franciscan Tertiary* I (1891): 128, 284. "Literary Notices", *Irish Franciscan Tertiary* II (1892): 405.
Capuchin and Recollect/Observant, indicating that this periodical was distributed in fifteen United Kingdom cities. Examination of the periodical indicates that it was a vehicle of instruction and unity in Great Britain and Ireland. Readers also appreciated contributions from the well-known figure, Lady Georgiana Chatterton who contributed long serials including, “The Cathedral Chorister” and “Old Nurse Eleanor; Or, Thirty Years Ago”.

An 1890 inspection of the magazine and its printing works by the Minister General of the worldwide Capuchins, Fr. Bernard of Andermatt, was reported publicly. It supports the claim that Franciscan journals and their editors made a significant contribution to the Apostolate of the Press. It read:

We … having learned all particulars concerning the “ANNALS,” are highly pleased with the magazine – its object, religious tone, and high standard of contents for a publication of its class. We consider it a very useful and effective medium for diffusing among Tertiaries the true spirit of our Seraphic Father and Founder, St. Francis, so much needed in these days for the welfare of Religion and Society. We specially bless the periodical, and wish all prosperity and happiness to its promoters and subscribers. It is our earnest desire to see it spread on all sides.

An 1887 copy of the Friars Minor Franciscan Herald: Monthly Remembrance for English Speaking Tertiaries had been published in Somerset by the Mercury Office, Clevedon and in 1890 the Dublin Friars Minor ushered in the Irish Franciscan Tertiary: A Monthly Journal for the Third Order of St. Francis. The aims of this

---

72 Friars Minor, "Antonianum", no. 481. This is the only record found and it is not to be confused with Franciscan Herald of Chicago founded in 1921 and which experienced a long life. Friars Minor, "Antonianum", no. 480.
73 Irish Franciscan Tertiary I, Friars Minor ed. (Dublin: The Freeman's Journal Ltd Printers, 1891; reprint, 1890 (May) - 1891 (April)). It is acknowledged, but its founding before 1890 is incorrectly indicated in Friars Minor, "Antonianum", no. 565.
journal basically reflected those of other Franciscan journals of the period. They were approved by the Minister Provincial, Fr. Cleary, who encouraged Fr. O'Reilly to proceed with the publication so that 'not only the Guardians and Directors of the Third Order' would benefit but that 'members of the Third Order in every part of Ireland' would be assisted by it. Accordingly, the Irish Franciscan Tertiary’s contents consisted of articles on Franciscan shrines, conferences on virtues or beliefs, lives of Franciscan Saints called 'Monthly Patrons', Franciscan and religious articles, poetry, tales and literary notices. Outstanding contributors, most of these different from Hayes’ contributors, were Katharine Tynan, Laura Grey, Agnes M. Manning, J. A. Jackman and Aubrey de Vere with a little from Lady Georgiana Fullerton. From Waverley in Sydney Fr. Kennedy wrote, ‘The monthly bulletin will be very welcome to every member of the Order, here as well as at home’. A New York friar significantly pointed out that ‘this journal helped to spread the knowledge of our Third Order among the people which is just what the Holy Father wished’. The latter comment is another confirmation of how many Catholics took to heart the pope’s example and words about following Franciscan spirituality in order to evangelise.

This publication confirmed the regularity among Franciscan editors of the international circulation of their journals. By the thirteenth issue the Irish periodical introduced illustrations in its pages besides on its cover, an action taken by Hayes early in her publishing career, and one that the English Franciscan Annals rarely imitated. That the activities of Hayes and her community were known to the English Franciscans is indicated by the fact that this journal published in 1892 the news that the Little Falls Franciscan community in Minnesota had separated formally from Hayes’ international institute.

To move to North America: Montreal’s Third Order membership after fluctuations over 200 years numbered in 1876 over 2,000 Tertiaries. They also had their own

---

75 "Correspondence", Irish Franciscan Tertiary I (1891): 32.
76 The journal carried news from the Annales Franciscaines of receptions of twelve, including four Irish born, new Franciscan Missionaries of Mary at Chatelets. "Franciscan Missionary Sisters", Irish Franciscan Tertiary I, no. 2 (1891): 64.
journal; from 1869-1876 the tertiarie published the monthly *Gazette des Familles.*

Hayes went to these Montreal tertiarie in 1876 to recruit women for her Belle Prairie mission. By 1884 the Montreal Jesuits published a Franciscan journal, *Petite Revue du Tiers Ordre et des intérêts du Coeur de Jesus,* which continued until 1891 when it was taken over by the Tertiaties of Montreal and renamed *Revue du Tiers-Ordre.*

As noted earlier, Hayes’ illustrated *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* appearing in 1874 was the first Franciscan periodical to be published in the United States. This finding stands on recent evidence, as well as on Chaffee’s memories regarding Hayes’ 1873 visit to Friar Joseph Romo at the Californian Santa Barbara Mission:

> It was from the Father Superior of the Mission, Rev. Joseph Romo, that our Mother received her inspiration of printing the Annals of Our Lady of the Angels, the Father having urged it on the grounds of there being no Franciscan periodical at that time printed in America.

The ‘printing in America’ continued when Hayes transferred the printing work to Augusta in Georgia during 1878, but by late 1881 Hayes was editing from Rome. Here Sisters printed, stitched and bound the *Annals* and shipped them to the United States. In cities, such as New York, Philadelphia, Boston and Chicago, Sisters canvassed for subscriptions, then personally delivered or mailed the *Annals* to the subscribers. In 1915 the *Annals*’ publication resumed in its country of origin, this time in Union City, New Jersey, (formerly West Hoboken) and then finally was transferred to Rome.

---


79 Reception of five Canadian recruits was on August 2, 1876. Chaffee, "Memories", 30. (Chaffee from Chicago made her novitiate with the Canadians). Ahles, *In the Shadow of His Wings,* 108-10. de Breffny, *Unless the Seed Die,* 134-36.

80 Friars Minor, "Antonianum", no. 830. (Recorded as 1884-91 without acknowledging the change over to Tertiarie).


82 Chaffee, "Memories", 25. That Hayes ‘received her inspiration’ from Romo can be argued to mean ‘outside inspiration’ from Romo for there is evidence to show that Hayes had the original inspiration and this visit was a confirmation of it. Romo continued his interest in Hayes’ publication for in 1889 he wrote to Hayes’ secretary, Chaffee, requesting that the *Annals* be sent to his new address in Egypt.
to Tenafly, NJ, in 1921.\textsuperscript{83} Hayes’ \textit{Annals} initiated American Franciscan literature when the editor-publisher seized the opportunity for mission through a periodical.

The history behind the German influence in Pennsylvania on Franciscan journals was published by the \textit{Franciscan Annals} in an article, “The Franciscan Capuchins in North America”.\textsuperscript{84} Yet, while the founding Capuchins arrived only twelve months after Hayes, the friars of Pennsylvania did not launch a journal until 1891 at Herman. It was known as \textit{The Echo}, and while their membership grew, ‘numbering about seventy religious and able to maintain itself as a distinct province of the Order’ by 1886, little can be found about the life of their journal.\textsuperscript{85}

Cincinnati was linked to United States Catholic periodical literature in the nineteenth century’s final quarter and for Franciscan journals, it also became a strong centre. Influenced by German friars, \textit{Der Sendbote des göttlichen Herzens Jesu} was founded by the Friars Minor in 1875 and continued to 1946.\textsuperscript{86} \textit{The Sodalist} was published 1884-1938 by the Friars Minor at St. Francis Parish as ‘A journal published monthly in the interest of Young Men’s Sodalities’.\textsuperscript{87} In 1892 the Friars Minor periodical, \textit{St. Franziskus Bote}, established to spread knowledge about friars and tertiaries, was founded in Cincinnati and continued for twenty-six years.\textsuperscript{88} Also founded in this city (1893) was the very successful \textit{St Anthony’s Messenger} which continues to the present and is available on-line also.\textsuperscript{89}

\textsuperscript{84} "The Franciscan Capuchins in North America", \textit{The Franciscan Annals and Monthly Bulletin of the Third Order of St. Francis} X (1886): 51.
\textsuperscript{85} Capuchins, "Peregrinus - Periodica", 1330.
\textsuperscript{87} Anderson, letter, 22 May 2004.
Franciscan Sisters’ activities in the United States in the period up to 1894 paralleled the missionary work of thousands of other Sisters. The mission of journalism was not recognised as a mainstream ministry for women religious in the late nineteenth century yet Hayes dared to be different and her fruitful mission through journalism was enduring. Pope Leo XIII’s example and call to the world to follow the gospel example of St. Francis of Assisi and his wish for the press to be an evangelising instrument had a great influence on the growth in tertiary membership and the publication of Franciscan journals. Active Franciscan networking was based on religious commitment, hard work and the sharing of resources, and Hayes, as a widely-read woman, thrived in the heart of this Franciscan periodical activity.

**Hayes’ Annals and the Franciscan Annals**

A final and deeper probe into Franciscan journals indicated the need to single out for particular comparison Hayes’ *Annals* and the *Franciscan Annals*. The fact that they were contemporary and both in English and especially because Hayes read the Capuchins’ journal, it is important to discover the degree to which Hayes’ publications, particularly her Franciscan serials, were influenced by the English *Franciscan Annals*. How much did Hayes rely on the *Franciscan Annals* and how did she edit the material from them? Hayes’ sources for her major Franciscan items have been divided here into *Franciscan Annals* (acknowledged) and other sources (including other Franciscan journals). Hayes’ major Franciscan serials relied mainly on multiple other resources; however, it is also clear that the *Franciscan Annals* were the major single source of her use of Franciscan journals.

Hayes published from January 1874 to June 1875, then she ceased printing because of other commitments (1876-77). It was in the latter year (1877) that the *Franciscan Annals* were first published in Crawley. It is not surprising that, when Hayes restarted with her volume three in January 1878, she was clearly mindful of the new monthly

---

91 Material related to ‘other Franciscan journals’, excluding the English *Franciscan Annals*, have been included in part 1-2.
92 Sources for major serials included: “The Third Order of St. Francis” (1874-76), series of 6 articles, chapters ‘Translated from the French of Monseigneur de Ségur by a Franciscan Tertiary’. In 1883 the first 3 chapters were published again. ‘Legacies of the Seraphic Father St. Francis’ (1887), serial of 4, taken from an unidentified source. “Our Lady of the Angels in Porziuncula” (1883), series of 5, contributed by ‘F.B. Assisi’. “The Stigmata of St. Francis” - 2 articles in 1887. “The Progress and Development of the Third Order in Europe” (1874), 2 articles, and “The Seraphic Order” (1888-89), 7 articles, give indication that they were written by Hayes with the help of original documents.
Franciscan Annals, a first for the Capuchins in the English language. Extant complete sets of the Franciscan Annals’ year books are housed in Rome, Erith and Oxford and research in these Capuchin libraries has thrown new light on Hayes’ Annals.  

Difficulty was experienced in identifying how Hayes used Franciscan Annals because extant texts of Hayes’ Annals printed before the press office was established in Rome in 1883 are thinly spread, because numerous Franciscan sources were used by Hayes and because of the similarity of Franciscan titles used by editors. Between 1878 and 1883 Hayes certainly used the Franciscan Annals for two serials, “The Franciscan Order in England” and “Letters from the Holy Land”.

Comparison of Hayes’ chapters of “The Franciscan Order in England”, published 1878-83, with the Capuchins’ introduction and thirty-four chapters of “Chronicle of the Franciscan Order in England”, printed 1877-82, is revealing. Hayes usually edited her sources carefully but for this particular series, which was based on Eccleston’s 13th Century Chronicles, she respected the original source and printed it word for word. Both texts have for example:

The cathedral and monastic schools were enlarged and multiplied as need arose: a wider range of subjects was included in their course of teaching, and then organisation was extended to keep pace with the growing intelligence of the age … Men from all countries of Europe and even from the East congregated in the lecture-halls desirous either to teach or to learn, and a new phase of society arose in these centres of intellectual life … For a long period the University of Paris was the most celebrated in Europe, but by the middle of the twelfth century [sic] Oxford rivalled Paris in renown, as the time when the Franciscans found their way thither the English University was famed throughout the known world.

93 Acknowledgement is due to Australian Capuchin scholar, Patrick Colbourne, who provided initial insights into the ‘companion’ Franciscan Annals and who tabled names and addresses of scholarly friars without whose assistance in Rome and England, research on the Franciscan Annals could not have been undertaken so fully.

94 Ability to examine articles printed in the Capuchins Franciscan Annals has led to better understanding of some now unavailable articles used in Hayes’ Annals.

Where Hayes' *Annals* are extant other matching examples exist. While the Capuchins reprinted the 'Chronicles' chapter by chapter, Hayes decided how many pages of the Chronicles she would give to her readers each month and made no reference to the chapter numbers. These two journals presented the chronicled history of the Franciscans in England beginning with their arrival at Dover in 1224 in Saint Francis of Assisi's lifetime.

It was appropriate that both the Capuchins and Hayes should publish a series of articles, “Letters from the Holy Land”, since St. Francis went to the Holy Land ‘to see for himself and experience the places where Christ had lived’. Franciscans ‘established a friary in Jerusalem between 1222 and 1230’, and their presence cost the Franciscan Order not less than the lives of over ten thousand friars; four thousand of them having been martyred for the faith in defending the sacred shrines entrusted to their care; six thousand six hundred and forty having fallen victims to the plague, from the thirteenth century to the year 1834 when the calculations were last made.

In 1880 Hayes acknowledged that she used the *Franciscan Annals* as the source for her “Letters from the Holy Land” so a search was conducted of the Capuchins’ lengthy series, “Letters from the Holy Land”, published 1879-82. However insufficient extant texts of Hayes’ *Annals* around the same period foiled a comparison. Hayes regularly showed interest in the Franciscans of the Holy Land. Hayes published in 1875 “Franciscan Devotions and Works” while the *Franciscan*
Annals (1882-3) printed “Franciscan Works and Devotions”. 102 Comparison of the two journal series reveals that Hayes’ articles preceded the Capuchins and therefore she used another Franciscan history source, which editors of both series did not acknowledge as their sources. 103 A different situation occurs when both journals published, “St Francis and Purgatory”. 104 The Franciscan Annals published this in 1880 and Hayes produced the same text, word for word, in 1885. 105 Hayes made no reference to the Franciscan Annals so she apparently used the same resource as earlier used by the Capuchins. 106

In 1885 the Capuchins included in their publication the article, “Wadding, the Historian” while Hayes printed “Wadding the Historian” the following year (1886). 107 Hayes made no reference to the Franciscan Annals but she did say, in paragraph two of her single article, ‘Besides this, and much more which must be passed over in our limited space, he established … ’, which suggests she culled a longer article. Without further overseas research on the Capuchins’ primary source, the comparison must end. Hayes also had access to other resources at St. Isidore’s Irish Franciscan College in Rome. 108

The comparison of Hayes’ Annals and the Franciscan Annals at times delivers unanticipated results. For example, the search related to Hayes’ 1883 article entitled “Leo XIII and the Third Order” uncovered similar titles and an instance of the same title in the Franciscan Annals (1881-85). 109 These examples highlight once again the...
connection between Leo XIII, growth in membership of the Third Order and the publication of Franciscan journals. As discussed previously, Leo XIII’s call to follow the gospel example of St. Francis of Assisi, and his proclaimed wish for the press to be an evangelising instrument, gave the seal of approval to the ventures of the Franciscan editors. This had an enormous influence on Franciscan periodical literature and the Catholic world. Hayes, with other Franciscan editors, especially the Capuchins, by their religious commitment, sharing of resources and hard work, were truly pioneering Apostles of the Press.110 Hayes, the first Franciscan woman to edit and publish a successful Catholic journal and the first publisher of a Franciscan journal in the English language, was a missionary and pioneer in Franciscan periodical literature.


110 Following on from these pioneers, Franciscan journals continued to spread. By 1907 Acta Ordinis of the Friars Minor named 122 monthly Franciscan periodicals, and four years later Catholic authorities acknowledged that in ‘almost all ‘civilized’ languages numerous (Franciscan) monthly periodicals’ were facilitating unity while providing the faithful with edification and instruction. Acta Ordinis Frat. Min, XXVI, Quaracchi, 1907, 255-58, in Cuthbert and al, Third Orders: The Franciscans, accessed.
Chapter 6

Analysis of Annals’ Content

The New Journalism connoted the shift toward a mass circulation commercial press to meet the needs of the increased numbers of literate citizens. Hayes recognised this and, while in her younger days she desired to be a travelling foreign missionary, in her last twenty-one years this desire evolved into taking others on a religious journey by using her literary talents. Besides time devoted to her role as leader among her religious Sisters, her other passion was her monthly periodical. Hayes, as editor and publisher of a successful Franciscan Catholic journal, not only selected particular topics acceptable to her readers and designed for their enrichment but in doing so she revealed dimensions of herself.

Of the nineteen volumes that Hayes edited between 1874-94, the Annals experienced only one pause, July 1875 to December 1877, when she travelled to Europe and Canada in search of new recruits, after which she needed time to initiate them into religious life. Volumes VIII to XIX printed in Rome, 1883-94, are extant while some of the prior American issues have been lost. Though the full texts of the 1878-82 issues are unavailable, one issue for both 1879 and 1882 is extant along with the monthly indices for 1878 and 1880, thus leaving only 1881 with no records. The monthly Annals were bound into a yearbook so, from nineteen yearbooks, fourteen complete ones now exist - with texts and monthly indices, along with parts of four other years’ publications. Data in some monthly indices at times provided vital information, such as a contributor’s name that was not in the text; though of course textual analysis provides the best insights. Hayes, like many nineteenth-century editors, did not sign her name to any articles and was careful most times to acknowledge her sources. Only after the study of each Annals’ article containing insightful lines can an indication of authorship be gained. In the 1870s Hayes personally contributed a larger proportion of the Annals’ content than in later years when she took more advantage of readily available Italian material for translations. Hayes’ yearbooks contain copies of the original monthly index in page order. This meant that comparison initially of each particular year’s index print proved unwieldy, particularly in regard to identifying serials. To overcome this challenge, the monthly
index lists have been supplemented through the building of alphabetical lists of yearly contents.

Over the years, among some of Hayes’ followers, an oral myth developed about the Annal’s content that specific research now shows to be inadequate. A superficial glance at Hayes’ overall contents led some to say that her text was composed merely of bits of books, periodicals and news. Yet herein lies partially the secret of her success and a model used by others. George Newnes, for instance, in 1881 turned his hobby of collecting printed titbits into the publishing of a penny magazine, Tit-Bits from all the Most interesting Books, Periodicals and Contributors in the World.¹ Shortened later to Tit-Bits, in a sixteen page weekly format, its successful founder has been hailed as one of the British New Journalism’s pioneers. The Review of Reviews founded by Albert Shaw, sought similarly to condense material for the reader while the American Readers Digest by 1922 achieved its success also by addressing the need for concise reading matter. Just as Tit-Bits often contained short stories, snippets of information, pieces of advice and correspondence, so did Hayes’ Annals. However Hayes’ criteria were fundamentally different from those of Newnes for she sought primarily to evangelize souls.

Before analysing the specific content of Hayes’ Annals, they need to be placed in their literary context which includes other Franciscan journals discussed in the previous chapter. Hayes’ approach to content was different from Annali Francescani (Milan) and L’Eco di S. Francesco D’Assisi (Naples) because these two journals were specifically targeted at Franciscans, while the English Franciscan Annals, though aimed also at Franciscans, included some more general matter.² Hayes uniquely provided a balance of material for both the general reader and the Franciscans. Also in her Annals, Hayes shows a leaning toward the thematic approach of Annali Francescani which expressed in its indices the themes that were umbrella titles for the articles.³ In Finauro’s analysis of Annali Francescani, he describes the practice of relying on the Franciscans’ rich literary heritage and of gathering together material

² Lady Georgiana Chatterton’s serial contributions, “The Cathedral Chorister” and “Old Nurse Eleanor”, exemplify Franciscan Annals’ general stories from 1885 to 1890 that were not specifically Franciscan.
from other magazines and publications; Hayes’ content matches his description yet, as will be seen, she did it uniquely her way.

Analysis of nineteenth-century periodical literature has enjoyed a revival in the past forty years or so. Generally scholars have sought to analyse such periodicals by concentrating either on the genre’s formal properties, or its subject matter. A thematic analysis will be pursued here, focusing on the themes Hayes herself selected yet also analysing the *Annals’* formal properties. Hayes published not only for her Franciscan readers, but for those whom she called the ‘general reader’ as stated in her original 1874 aims and again in those of 1882. The *Annals* encouraged general readers to be more religious not only through inspirational or devotional content but also through interesting and educational articles. Intentionally, Hayes set out to entertain and enlighten her readers with a variety of themes including ‘original tales, historical and biographical sketches’, poetry, ‘lives of the saints’ and of contemporary holy people, pilgrimage accounts, stories of ‘missionary enterprise’ and articles on devotions and Catholic life. To illustrate how Hayes’ evangelizing mission operated, samples of six of these thematic content types will be considered both as presented to the general reader and to her Franciscan audience.

**Themes for the general reader: Original tales**

In selecting material to interest the general reader, Hayes at times chose popular authors writing on subjects that dealt with religious issues. For instance, she serialised “Germaine” taken from one of Lady Georgiana Fullerton’s lesser known works, *Germaine Cousin – A Dramatic Tale.* The writer’s popularity since her first

---

3 Umbrella titles included: Spiritual Conferences, Franciscan History & Hagiography, Articles on the Third Order, Articles for Different Occasions, Franciscan History, News of the Franciscan Missions, Franciscan Thought – historical, literary and religious sketches, and Obituary.

4 Finario, “Annali Francescani”, 304.

5 Scholars include J. Don Vann, Rosemary T. VanArsdel, Josef Altholz, John S. North, Isobel Armstrong, Laurel Brake, Valerie Sanders, Joanne Shattock and Judy McKenzie.

6 The original aims, quoted previously, occur in volume I (January) and were repeated in volume VII (December).

7 This major thematic overview was confirmed later through the finding of un-numbered advertisement pages behind the texts of the December 1882 and 1888 issues. Terms used by Hayes are indicated above.

8 “Germaine” extended from September 1880 to February 1883. Reference has already been made to Lady Georgiana Fullerton as distinguished convert writer, friend of Hayes’ literary connections, especially Fanny Taylor and Elizabeth Lockhart, and as Franciscan tertiary. Lady Georgiana Fullerton’s important contribution to the Apostolate of the Press through prose and poetry has been acknowledged in a number of biographies including one in French (1888) by Mrs. Craven and translated into English by the Farm Street Jesuit, Fr. Coleridge. Another biography is by her close friend, Fanny Taylor, *The Inner Life of Lady Georgiana*
book *Ellen Middleton* (1844) obviously precluded the inclusion of her best sellers like *Grantley Manor* (1847), *Lady Bird* (1852) or *La Comtesse de Bonneval* (Paris, 1857; London, 1858). For Hayes the serial “Germaine” was considered an ‘original tale’ and there were others.

Five original stories by Rev. Francis Drew, four set in England and one in Germany, were selected by Hayes for serials from 1883-85 and all had a clear religious message. Drew’s style is typically nineteenth century with ample paragraphs devoted to descriptions of characters and nature. The religious commitment of a priest author is sensed throughout each tale and his conclusions are strongly religious. The author has proved somewhat elusive yet judging from his writing, he shows himself to have been an English convert with personal knowledge of Oxford University life. He writes about conversion with the strength of personal conviction and refers to English works, including Carroll’s *Through the Looking-glass* and Wiseman’s *Fabiola*. One gripping serialised tale for the general reader is entitled “Tristam’s Friends” which begins with a shipwreck and the story of the only survivor, a baby, who in the final episode is revealed to be Lord Catesby. Two parts of the “Tristam’s Friends” serial were printed in 1887 with another five parts the next year. Hayes did not indicate the author’s name but since the character, Lord Catesby, appeared earlier in another article by Drew, it is evidently his contribution. However, the style is more exciting in this article yet common threads of conversion and an English setting, characteristic of Drew’s stories, are present. The tale’s religious message comes in the second last paragraph through Tristam’s words when he discovers his true identity:

> Every night and morning I have prayed to the Saints to pray for me. And they have been very good friends, and in their goodly company I hope to live and die;

---

*Fullerton* (London, 1899), while Yonge includes the writer in her *Women Novelists of Queen Victoria’s Reign* (London, 1897).

they first made me think of the Catholic religion, and brought me to inquire into it altogether.  

The editor’s placement of “Story of a Conversion” immediately after the tale gives added emphasis to Tristam’s conversion.

Like other contemporary Catholic journal editors, Hayes felt free, in ‘the cause of diffusion of good books’ as it was commonly called, to select original tales from Catholic journals and to edit and publish them. As noted earlier, Hayes in 1880 selected from an earlier English Messenger of the Sacred Heart, three different tales which she named, “Scenes in a Soldier’s Life”, “Story of a Recent Conversion” and “The Holy Man of Tours”. Though the texts of Hayes’ versions are unavailable, those of the Messenger of the Sacred Heart are and it can be observed that for the first tale the editor adapted the title from “Three Scenes from a French Soldier’s Life”, then she split the ‘original’ September 1879 article into two further parts for her April and May 1880 editions. The delightful scenes, described in the first person and set around 1830s to 1850s, involve in particular a Cavalier Meyer, a Sister Marthe (a French Sister of Charity) and the writer. The theme of Christian charity links the scenes together and the storyteller suggests that some highly educated people, even those who listened in Paris to the renowned eloquence of Father Lacordaire, may understand less philosophy than an ‘ex-soldier and peasant’ who practised kind deeds that were ‘clear and eloquent in the ear of God’.

Hayes acknowledged her indebtedness for educational material to ‘A. T. Drane’, a name familiar to educated nineteenth-century English Catholics. Like Hayes, Augusta Theodosia Drane read widely, was influenced by the Oxford Movement, consulted Pusey, knew Keble, converted and then, unlike Hayes, was attracted to the

10 Hayes, “Tristam’s Friends”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XIII, no. vii (1888): 200. Hayes has operated here as editor as she followed a pattern of omitting an author’s name if an ‘original’ had been modified.
11 Editor of the English Franciscan Annals acknowledged material taken from Annali Francescani of Milan for his “Franciscan Chronicle” and from L’Eco di S. Francesco for his “Sermon by S. Lawrence fo Brindisi”. The former acknowledgement is found in “Franciscan Chronicle”, The Franciscan Annals and Monthly Bulletin of the Third Order of St. Francis VI, no. 65 (1882). The second acknowledgement is in the same volume, no. 67 (1882).
13 Ibid., 160.
Dominicans whose community at Stone she joined.\textsuperscript{14} Through the writings of Drane, whose life spanned the same years as Hayes and whose name in Dominican circles was Mother Frances Raphael, \textit{Annals’} readers received the ideas of a respected convert educator. Newman, friend of the Stone Dominicans,\textsuperscript{15} remarked that there were two main reasons for Catholic writing: to edify Catholics, and to build up a moral and intellectual state of mind in converts.\textsuperscript{16} These evangelical reasons were embraced by Drane whose 1867 educational work, \textit{Christian Schools and Scholars}, suited the aim of Hayes’ publication, so that she selected three different topics from the text. Each one, “Rise of the Christian Schools”, “Schools of Britain and Ireland” and “The Anglo-Saxon Schools” was presented as a serial of five, four and six parts respectively.\textsuperscript{17} As stated earlier, the \textit{Irish Monthly} published works of ‘Mother Raphael Drane’ and Hayes’ \textit{Annals} also published two of her religious poems.\textsuperscript{18}

**Historical and biographical sketches**

Among the recommendations of books and periodicals issued by the 1884 Third Plenary Council of Baltimore and taken seriously by evangelical editors like Hayes, was the urging of ‘good reading’ that would lead the faithful ‘to a love of history and biography’.\textsuperscript{19} This is exemplified in Hayes’ three-part historical and biographical sketch, “Edmund Gennings”. In the sixteenth century Gennings converted to Catholicism, received ordination at Reims’ English College and returned to England under the assumed name of Ironmonger when Queen Elizabeth’s newly introduced statute 27 was being enforced. Genning’s missionary career was cut short for he was captured in London and executed in 1591, aged twenty-four, his death enormously

\textsuperscript{14} These were Margaret Hallahan’s Third Order Dominicans who came to Adelaide in the 1880s. Mother Drane wrote a biography of Mother M. Hallahan. Drane’s second name, Theodosia, is maintained in this thesis although Theodora is found in some sources.

\textsuperscript{15} Minnie Poole, second provincial, talented in music and languages, was a convert and friend of Newman. Drane, well known for her \textit{History of England - for family and School}, became Stone’s third provincial with responsibility for convent schools in Bishop Ullathorne’s diocese where Stone was situated. This was an impressive literary circle of friends.


\textsuperscript{19} "Good Reading", \textit{The Franciscan Annals and Monthly Bulletin of the Third Order of St. Francis X}, no. n.g. (1886): 58.
affecting his brother, John.\textsuperscript{20} The Annals' text indicates that Hayes had access to an unnamed old Franciscan source which relied on John Gennings' biography of his younger brother which then provided her with numerous quotations.\textsuperscript{21} Hayes shows sensitivity to her general as well as to her Franciscan readers in this sketch which also illustrates a type of general catechising; for example, Edmund Gennings says:

\begin{quote}
God, who knows my desire, will provide and supply the want. Can it be possible that He who clothes the lilies of the field and feeds the fowls of the air will forsake him who forsakes all to fulfil His divine precept: 'Seek first the kingdom of God, and His justice, and all other things shall be given to you'? Finally … 'Whosoever shall forsake home, or brethren, or sisters, or father or mother, for My sake, shall receive a hundredfold and possess life everlasting.'\textsuperscript{22}
\end{quote}

Only in the story's final paragraph does the editor explain that Edmund's brother John 'entered the Franciscan Order, which by his instrumentality, was set up again in England, … [when] he was appointed the first Provincial'.\textsuperscript{23}

“The Royal Recluse”, a biographical tale for the general reader set in Spain is a serial of twelve parts, April 1886 to March 1887, which gradually reveals the life and death of ‘Charles V of Augsburg, King of Spain & Emperor of Germany’. Catholic Spain shines through the serial, the monastery of Yuste is an ever present theme and the descriptive flowing style of the unnamed author carries the reader to the final lines which recall the Battle of Lepanto where Europe, under the leadership of Don John of Austria, was saved from a second Muslim invasion. Another significant example of Hayes’ selection of historical and biographical sketches is Vansittart’s serial, “Christianity under the Heptarchy: A Page from English history”, which will be considered later.

Lives of saints and contemporary holy people

\textsuperscript{21} John Gennings, a famous Franciscan who led the restoration of the English Observants Province and then established the Taunton Franciscan nuns, published the biography in 1614 at St. Oner.
\textsuperscript{22} Hayes, "Edmund Gennings", 113.
\textsuperscript{23} Ibid., 218.
Hayes emphasised the theme of Saints and explained the importance of saints’ lives as follows:

The glory of a Saint is always proportioned to the grandeur of his mission and the glory he has given to God; and as nothing glorifies Our Blessed Lord more than the redemption of souls, the more a Saint has co-operated in this work, the greater is his glory.24

‘St. Mary the Virgin’ and ‘St. Mary of the Angels’ are two Marian titles favoured by Hayes; in every volume she included particular Marian topics with the greatest number of Marian articles printed in the early 1890s when the Annals published a lengthy sequence focusing on ‘Sanctuaries of Mary’. An 1890 article in the sequence, into which the editor drew three other writers, reminds the general reader why the periodical was called The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels.25 In 1891 four more Marian topics, spread over six articles, were ‘translated from the Italian’; while in the next year their Italian source, Sanctuaries of Our Lady, was named for another six Marian headings featuring in ten articles. Included in 1892 was a two-part article, “Our Lady ‘Ad Rupes’”, which Hayes ensured coincided with the Franciscan friars’ return to the Ad Rupes ancient sanctuary at Castel Sant’Elia. Hayes concluded the article’s second part by updating her readers with the lastest news on the sanctuary and assuring pilgrims that their spiritual needs would be accommodated. The Annals article led to an immediate request from the friars’ ‘Father President’ to prepare and print a separate booklet about the sanctuary. Letters acknowledged Hayes’ commitment to a high degree of accuracy and truthfulness26 and the friars satisfaction with Hayes’ final work was expressed in Br. Anthony’s letter: ‘Father President feels extremely grateful to Reverend Mother for all she has done for the “Madonna ad Rupes”...’.27

26 Seven letters between 12 September 1892 and 1 March 1893 were received by Hayes at Villa Spada from V. Rev. Fr. President (Nicholas), from St. Isidore’s, Rome, and then from Castel Sant’Elia. MFIC archives, Rome, section A, box 3, folder 9.
The 1893 pattern was repeated the following year as Hayes presented nine different sanctuaries, mainly in Rome, where Mary was honoured under different titles. Finally in 1894 six Marian themes from Sanctuaries of Our Lady were spread over eleven numbers, amongst them one three-part serial, “Our Lady of Galloro, in the Diocese of Albano, near Rome”. Mary’s status as ‘immaculate’ was defined by the Vatican in 1854 and the title, ‘of the Immaculate Conception’, was incorporated via the Glasgow Franciscan Sisters into the official name of Hayes’ Institute. Hence it is not surprising that articles related to this title, and to the belief in Mary’s apparitions to Bernadette Soubirous at Lourdes, appear in numerous volumes. Hayes’ desire to spread Marian devotion in volumes XI and XII is reflected in her selection from Reverend T. E. Bridgett’s work, Our Lady’s Dowry; or How England Gained and Lost That Title. Bridgett’s contribution will be discussed later as it provides an example of how Hayes edited another’s text.

Hayes edified her early 1890s readers through two series, the saintly lives of Venerable Nunzio Sulprizio and Venerable Mary Christine of Savoy, translations from the French Saints and Servants of God of the Nineteenth Century. Numerous other heroines and heroes were upheld by Hayes for imitation in most volumes through single articles that ranged from “St. Frances of Rome” to “Blessed Imelda” and from “St. Benedict the Moor” to “Edmund Campion”.

Pilgrimage accounts

Hayes’ Pilgrimage theme is found, for example, in “La Sainte Baume, St. Mary Magdalene’s Retreat” which commenced with an explanation of the site’s origin, its destruction during the French Revolution and its partial restoration. According to the article, by 1862 the celebrated Dominican writer-preacher, Père Lacordaire, had

---

27 Br. Anthony, Rome, letter to the Secretary of the Annals, begins: On behalf of Fr. President and the whole community, 1 March 1893, MFIC archives, Rome.
29 Articles on “The Immaculate Conception” appeared in volumes I, III, V, X, XI, XIV, XV and XVI. Besides single articles on Bernadette Soubirous, to whom the Immaculate Mary was believed to have appeared and said, ’I am the Immaculate Conception’, two serials were printed; one Hayes entitled “Bernadette” which ran through 1884. On its conclusion another commenced, “Bernadette - a Translation”, followed by an article in every 1885 issue, concluding the serial of twenty instalments with another seven 1886 articles.
30 The seven part serial on Nunzio Sulprizio, a young artisan of Naples, ran during 1892, volume XVII, unevenly spread from February to December, while the life of Mary Christine of Savoy in twelve part instalments was covered in volumes XVIII-XIV, 1893-94, with six parts each year.
31 The introduction was written either by Hayes or by Hon. Mrs. F. Montgomery.
encouraged Mademoiselle Lautard to build a hospice for pilgrims who wished to visit the retreat place where it was believed St. Mary Magdalen lived as a solitary penitent after escaping persecution in Jerusalem. Then followed “Pilgrimage to la Sainte Baume”\(^{32}\) in which Hon. Mrs. Montgomery detailed her nine-day journey from England to Marseilles, the breakdown of her carriage and subsequent ‘quick twenty minutes of hard walking in a pelting shower’ and her overnight sleepless stay at the ‘unfinished’ hospice – ‘roughing it in true pilgrim fashion’. While the author was pleased to visit St. Mary Magdalen’s grotto and to attend Masses and Benediction with her women’s group, she concluded her article with a thankful prayer that ‘pilgrimages were not the only road to Heaven’.

Hayes commenced ‘Pilgrimage to Iona’ with reference to Saints Cuthbert and Columba and painted a picture of pilgrims arriving in Oban ‘from every quarter of Scotland, as well as from the north of England and some parts of Ireland’.\(^{33}\) After a description of the journey and various religious events, Hayes concluded her account by quoting ‘a correspondent who was present’. He explained the processions, told of sermons in English and Gaelic and provided the aristocratic names of pilgrimage participants. Another pilgrimage or travel theme is exemplified in “A Peep into Spain” which was composed in letter-form under the pen name of ‘Daisy’: a series of ten articles spread over three volumes.\(^{34}\) ‘Daisy’ wrote her supposed letters to ‘Hattie’, her younger sister back in England, telling of the family’s journey to Spain and their religious adventures. This lengthy interesting story, Catholic in tone and repeatedly referring to the priest in the family’s company, had the potential to further readers’ knowledge of Catholic culture and to strengthen their relationship with God. Hayes acknowledged the author as ‘A Tertiary’, while the text provides hints that its author may have been Lady Herbert of Lea, a Franciscan Tertiary, who in 1866 had published *Impressions of Spain*. Lady Herbert of Lea, a major contributor to Hayes’ *Annals*, also wrote another pilgrimage account called “Travels to the Holy Land”.

**Stories of missionary enterprise**

---

\(^{32}\) Hon. Mrs. F. Montgomery, "Pilgrimage to La Sainte Baume", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XVII, no. i (1892): 6-10.

\(^{33}\) ‘Pilgrims to Iona’ is part of a longer article; Hayes, "Echoes from Distant Lands", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XIII, no. viii (1888): 255.

The comprehensive missionary enterprise that marked the nineteenth century and Hayes' life and writings within this have been discussed. The five-part serial, "Echoes from Distant Lands", is one example of how this mission theme was woven into the *Annals,*\(^{35}\) but besides articles about foreign mission Hayes also created a special title, "Missionary Notes". It entered the *Annals* in every issue of volume five and flowed along, at times unevenly, until the April issue of volume ten.\(^{36}\) In volume eight alone "Missionary Notes" provide the general reader with news of missions in North Japan, Asia, Borneo, India and among Southern Californian Indians while three of nine missionary articles in 1884 recall the story of the ‘martyrdoms in Tonkin’. Since journals were meant to contain up-to-date news, Hayes reintroduced in 1886 news items on home and foreign missions under “Miscellaneous".\(^{37}\) The September issue of volume XI published a reminder of the diffusion of news to home and foreign missions, this time regarding the pope’s jubilee celebrations; we read that ‘All Catholic journals of every country are invited to republish’ it.\(^{38}\)

**Articles on devotions and Catholic life**

However, it was not just missionary endeavour that Hayes sought to support and encourage for she also fostered particular local devotions among the laity. Devotions, as part of American Catholic life, had reached a more widespread community level when Hayes commenced her journal. After the American Civil War and a further migrant boom, the formation of devotional confraternities and associations increased rapidly. Women parishioners joined the Sacred Heart Sodality, the men belonged to a similar group, later called the Holy Name Society, and children were enrolled in the Holy Angels Confraternity. As each local association recited appropriate prayers and received Holy Communion together, a corporate sense of belonging grew in the local parish community. Among the particular devotions that Hayes encouraged, through articles, were devotion to the Sacred Heart of Christ and to the Holy Angels. Like the periodical, *Ave Maria,*\(^{39}\) Hayes' *Annals* caught the contemporary devotional mood,

---


\(^{36}\) “Missionary Notes” appears in every monthly issue in 1880; there is no way of knowing for sure in 1881; focus on Borneo and ‘Corea’ (Korea) in December 1882; there are 8 articles in 1883; 6 articles in 1884; 3 articles in 1885 with emphasis on China in the April issue.


\(^{38}\) Ibid., 285.

\(^{39}\) *Ave Maria*, the American Catholic publication familiar to Hayes, was dedicated to popular piety and was reputed for its devotional tone. Joseph P. Chinnici, "The Immigrant Vision, 1830-1866", in *Living Stones:
including in her first volume four single articles on the Sacred Heart, with one of them by the Hon. Mrs. Montgomery.\textsuperscript{40} The high point of Hayes' writing on angels was her eighteen-part translation, “The Holy Angels”, in Volumes XVI to XIX based on an unnamed Italian source.\textsuperscript{41} The articles provide evidence that Hayes felt at liberty to edit the original Italian source.\textsuperscript{42} Brownlow’s \textit{Angels Ever in our Midst} shows the popularity of angels for numerous nineteenth-century writers\textsuperscript{43} but Hayes waited until the 1890s to give the angel theme a high profile. Of course, in earlier issues she had included stories of angels in her Christmas articles besides reference to the Queen of the Angels in her Marian ones. In Hayes’ poetry selections she had chosen the work of Adelaide Anne Procter (1825-64), popular English convert known for her writings in numerous magazines, who produced a narrative poem, \textit{The Angel’s Story}. Brownlow recalls three of Procter’s angel themes, including lines called ‘Angel Psalm’ from her lyric “A Lost Chord”. Hayes published Procter’s “The Angel of Prayers” in her volume XVIII.\textsuperscript{44}

Hayes, to further her Apostolate of the Press, selected material on two elements in particular of Catholic life, which she presented under the headings Christian Virtues and Spiritual Reading. For these topics Hayes turned to writings by high profile ecclesiastics, such as Archbishop Ullathorne and Cardinal Manning. The \textit{Annals} reproduced “Cheerfulness” by Ullathorne in three instalments; then another ‘original’ of his, “Our Daily Duties”, was presented in a four-part serial.\textsuperscript{45} Hayes made no comment on these two ‘original’ works. The two series could have been extracted from a major work since the topic of Christian Virtues had engaged Ullathorne’s pen.
in publications during the 1880s. Between 1888-90 Hayes provided her readers with “Confidence in God” by Manning in an eleven-part serial. Manning’s style was easy to read and invited spiritual reflection:

Remember God, forget yourselves, and forget yourselves in remembering God. The more you contemplate God the more you live with the eyes of your mind opened and illuminated, as the Apostle says, so as to gaze upon the length, and breadth, and depth, and height, and to know the love of Christ, which passes knowledge, and through the Sacred Heart of Jesus to ascend to the infinite perfections of God, to the full-orbed harmony of the glorious perfections of God, of His love, sanctity, tenderness, pity, compassion and Fatherly care.

The Annals’ articles, telling readers that the virtue of ‘hope matures into confidence’, were selected from Manning’s major work, Confidence in God. While in general Manning’s writings and ministry appealed to the editor, she printed only a few articles by him at a time when he was not always popular in certain English Catholic circles. Manning was known to be an ultramontane who challenged social pretensions and political conservatism.

On the topic of Spiritual Reading, Hayes published articles by the English bishop, Herbert Vaughn, to celebrate his reception of the cardinal’s red hat from the hands of Leo XIII. For such a major Roman event, a description of proceedings, a biographical sketch, or an account of his achievements as bishop of Salford could have been expected but Hayes chose differently. Vaughn, after a United States visit

48 Ibid., 183.
49 By 1886 this publication was into its third edition. Confidence in God, a popular contemporary topic, was given attention also by another Franciscan editor. "Confidence in God", The Franciscan Annals and Monthly Bulletin of the Third Order of St. Francis I, no. n.g. (1877): 82-3.
51 Oliver Rafferty provides an insightful article on Manning and this point, taken from the London Catholic Herald, in Ian Boyd, ed., The Chesterton Review: Cardinal Manning Special Issue, vol. XVIII, no. 4, November (Saskatoon, Saskatchewan: Chesterton Society, 1992), 587-88.
in the early 1860s, had developed a strong appreciation of the power of the press.53

Vaughn’s words on Spiritual Reading sound like a justification of Hayes’ work and her inclusion of so many articles on saint’s lives:

To see and understand, we must read and reflect. Doctrinal, moral, ascetical and mystical works teach us, either scientifically or popularly, to understand the service and the love of Christ. The lives of the Saints and servants of God present us with persuasive examples of the service and the love of Christ triumphing in frail human creatures like ourselves. The Saints are, therefore, our example and our encouragement in the midst of trials and difficulties.54

Themes for the Franciscan reader:

Hayes was, of course, committed to the Franciscan Third Order movement, especially to the many secular Third Order members of whom the majority were women. As Annals’ editor, Hayes aimed to help her Franciscan readers find God more fully through original Franciscan stories, through historical and biographical Franciscan sketches - especially through the lives of Franciscan saints - through accounts of pilgrimages to Franciscan shrines, stories of Franciscan missionary activities and through articles on Franciscan devotions. While each of these themes can be identified in the content Hayes prepared for the Franciscan reader, to single out each theme for separate analysis appears to fracture the content which is often a combination of a few of these themes. So in awareness that Franciscan literature has often amalgamated original stories, history, biography and other writings, analysis of the themes will commence with major Franciscan saints’ lives, followed by Franciscan literature, Franciscan stories and then Franciscan devotions.

Major Franciscan saints’ lives

A major feature in English culture for much of the nineteenth century was admiration of the hero or heroine.55 This was reflected in general English literature so religious writings took advantage of it by presenting saints as great heroes and heroines.

53 Vaughn’s direct editorship of the Tablet was noted previously. ‘Vaughan’ is now more generally used, e.g., for his brother, Archbishop Roger Vaughan in Australia, as well as later spelling of the cardinal’s name.
54 Vaughn, "What Are Spiritual Reading Books", 17.
Hayes ensured that one of the principal ways her *Annals* achieved its aims was through the promotion of biographies of Franciscan holy men and women. Hayes at times displayed Franciscan saints' feastdays and ensured that some of these particular saints’ stories were included in the month containing their feastdays according to the Franciscan Calendar. The stories of major Franciscan saints’ lives lent themselves to serials, a form popular in secular and religious journals of the period, and it proved successful for the *Annals* as readers looked forward to the next installment. Here Saints Francis of Assisi, Clare, Anthony, Elizabeth of Hungary, Collette and John Vianney, serve to illustrate leading Franciscan saints.

The first *Annals*’ serial on the life of St. Francis appeared in 1884-85 in thirteen instalments. While much on the Franciscan Order had been published as articles since 1874, the founder’s biography had not. Hayes sprinkled ‘sayings’ and ‘maxims’ of St. Francis in her later publications, for example, in volumes XVI and XVII. An 1887 long single article, “The Stigmata of St. Francis”, reads like a traditional thirteenth-century chronicle and the unsigned text reveals no other clue as to its origin. Another methodically laid out serial story, “Legacies of the Seraphic Father St. Francis”, appears also to have been edited by Hayes.

An analysis of Hayes’ articles on St. Francis’ life raises questions about availability of sources. Celano was the first biographer of St. Francis in the thirteenth century. Numerous lives of the saint were written later, including a popular late nineteenth century translation from Chalippe’s French life based on the labours of Irish Franciscan, Luke Wadding, and translated by Hayes’ London Oratorian friends. The Allegany New York Franciscans, whom Hayes also knew, republished it in America. The first American 1877 edition of Chalippe’s work predated Hayes’ 1884-85 articles while Moorman, Anglican Franciscan scholar, has pointed out that the first *Life of St. Francis* to be written in English appeared in 1870, only four years before the commencement of Hayes’ *Annals*. This *Life of St. Francis* by Mrs. Margaret Oliphant

---

56 Apart from saints honoured in the Roman Calendar, the Franciscan Order has its own calendar of saints. The Franciscan Calendar is based on the General Roman Calendar but it omits ‘optional memorials’ of saints and includes instead saints from the official Franciscan family calendar.
57 Hayes, “The Sacred Stigmata of St. Francis”.
58 Hayes, "Legacies of the Seraphic Father St. Francis", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XII, no. iii, iv, vi, viii (1887). Hayes is credited as editor; no other source is named.
Oliphant, a prolific writer, produced several highly ranked novels and stories, and contributed frequently to *Blackwood’s Magazine* as well as many others. Recognised as a fitting example of a professional woman journalist, Oliphant’s name does not appear in Hayes’ *Annals* and no explanation for this has been found. However, Oliphant’s words to Blackwood in 1870, ‘Anonymity is a great institution’, may offer a clue to Hayes’ key in negotiating the masculine world of journalism as they did for Oliphant. Hayes and her few assistants had the ability to translate French, Italian, German and Latin sources yet in the reality of her mid-west and Georgian American mission convents, how far could she stretch her human resources? How many translations could she include per month? Elizabeth Lockhart’s death in 1870 ended her contributions to Franciscan translations but other Franciscans in England continued to work, at Baddesley and Taunton in particular, and Hayes availed herself of these translations on Franciscan saints.

The eight-part serial on the “Life of St. Clare”, the first woman to follow St. Francis’ way of life in Assisi, ran from November 1883 to July the following year. During its serialisation it was accompanied, often in the same issue, with the “Life of St. Anthony” but the sources of both remain a mystery amid the mountain of Franciscan Italian hagiography. Clare’s writings are the basis of the Poor Clares’ spirituality and charism, as well as being a primary source of historical information for the life of St. Francis himself.

Hayes reserved for St. Anthony of Padua (1195-1231) the greatest number of articles - above all other Franciscan saints - beginning an eleven-part serial on the “Life of Saint Anthony” in her first issue. Later, “The Life of St. Anthony of Padua” was presented again in the *Annals*, this time in sixteen sequential parts between April

---

62 Ibid.
1883 and September 1884. The author's anonymity and the lack of any particular named source strongly suggest that Hayes herself wrote the articles, using multiple and often foreign sources.

The underlying mysteries of the Catholic faith that St. Anthony strongly believed in, lived and preached, were what people of every age have sought to proclaim, remember and celebrate through commemoration of the saint's life. The editor foresaw the question as to why she gave so much attention to this saint and provided her answer in an article which commenced and concluded with:

If then you ask why so much glory is paid to St. Anthony, I answer you in the words which the Church uses in the Office of the Apostle loved by Jesus.

‘Children of men, listen and learn the glory of the Saint well-beloved of the Lord.’

St. Anthony's life which inspired devotion in Hayes and her readers will be further considered under Franciscan devotions because devotion to St. Anthony created an unique inseparable association with the Annals.

An analysis of Hayes' serial, “Life of St. Elizabeth of Hungary”, provides another example of how the Annals' editor read from sources and then composed her own articles on the subject. A footnote in the first of her thirteen articles indicates that one resource at Hayes' elbow was written by the 'chivalrous biographer', the Comte de Montalembert. He married a descendant of the saint and had published his Vie de Saint Elizabeth de Hongrie in 1836; this is claimed to have restored hagiography in France and restored a taste in Catholics for the supernatural as exemplified in saints' lives.

The message to Franciscans in Hayes' introduction reveals her own attitude:

---


66 Hayes, "Why Is So Much Glory Paid to St. Anthony?", 164.

There are few names in the calendar of the saints so full of tender and poetical associations as hers who has come down to us through six long centuries, as the ‘dear Saint Elizabeth’. Her history has the brilliancy of a romance of chivalry with the deep pathos of a tale of human affection, added to the more sacred interest which belongs to the biography of a saint.69

Hayes’ use of ‘dear Saint Elizabeth’ indicates her knowledge of the German people’s favourite way of speaking of the saint who at her canonization was called ‘the greatest woman of the German Middle Ages’. Hayes’ other resources were ‘chronicles’ and historical accounts referred to and quoted in her articles. According to Franciscan historians, Franciscans arrived in Germany in St. Francis’ lifetime and one of the first Germans who joined them was for a time the spiritual director of Elizabeth at Wartburg. Along with her maids, Elizabeth (1207-1231) later embraced the Franciscan ideals, wore the habit of St. Francis, was among the first Third Order German members, built the Franciscan hospital at Marburg and devoted herself to the poor and sick. It is not possible to know which resource Hayes used as accounts are to be found as far back as the original letters sent by Conrad of Marburg to Pope Gregory IX in 1232. Commentators on works about St. Elizabeth of Hungary indicate that around 1888 there began an upsurge in writings on St. Elizabeth due to forthcoming celebrations in 1907, especially in Germany and Austria, to honour the seven-hundredth anniversary of her birth, and so Hayes’ articles of 1885-86 were forerunners.

In “St. Collette – Her Mission and Her Times”, printed in 1875, a few unique characteristics are evident. The four-part fifteenth-century based serial70 began not with references or quotations from historians but with Hayes’ consciousness of present papal difficulties, comparable to those in St. Collette’s lifetime, accompanied by a rare glimpse into the writer’s personal juggling of time commitments. Hayes, whose ‘incessant labors’ at this time included conducting both the Belle Prairie and Brainerd schools, wrote:

68 Goyau, *Comte De Montalembert*, accessed. Oliphant was the author of one of the count’s biographies.
I set myself to the work, but I must say, I required something more for the glory of St. Collette than the few shreds of time torn here and there from the requirements of the cloister, and the incessant labors of the apostolic life. I claim therefore the indulgence of the reader.71

Hayes used subheadings to show her readers key points in her story which was based on a number of resources. Hayes stresses repeatedly how St. Collette was a woman with a passion for unity in the Church, how she prayed and did penance and how she in practice brought about peace. This interesting serial tells of the problems related to anti-popes in the Church of St. Collette’s times, including the Great Schism (1378-1417). Hayes shows the strong character of St. Collette who in spite of being on good terms with the anti-pope Benedict XIII - who had approved her Poor Clare reform - joined with St. Vincent Ferrer to oppose him when God directed her to do so. Numerous references are made to the General Council of Constance (1414-17) and the following peaceful period under Martin V. Hayes called St. Collette an ‘oracle and pillar of the Church’ because of her successful involvement in helping to bring about unity. The serial informed readers that Collette founded seventeen Franciscan convents and was gifted with remarkable moral power over others, including the Cardinal Legate of the Holy See, bishops, King James of Aragon and the Duke of Savoy. Hayes concluded what she called a ‘short study of the mission of our Saint’, actually some twenty-three pages of small print, with the question:

Does it not seem appropriate to propose St. Collette to the Christian people in the present afflictions as a help and model? In her life all the faithful may learn what is their duty during the sufferings of their common Father, and how efficacious prayers and intercessions are to obtain peace and blessing for the Church.72

As for the sources available to Hayes in frontier Belle Prairie, while she made no reference to French texts, research suggests that beside the possible availability of old Franciscan literature, a likely source would be a French life by Père Sellier or that of Abbé Douille. In 1879 Mrs. Parsons, at the request of the Poor Clare Colletines of

---

71 Ibid., 384.
72 Ibid., 565.
Baddesley (England), published the first book on the saint in English. The opening lines of “The Cure of Ars”, one of the Annals’ longest serials, leaves the reader in no doubt as to why Hayes prepared and published this Franciscan lifestory:

John Baptist Marie Vianney – universally known as the Cure of Ars, whose saintly life is still revered in living memories and whose Cause for Beatification we are told is rapidly advancing, was a Tertiary of the Third Order Secular of St. Francis of Assisi; whose simplicity of intention for God’s glory, and the salvation of souls; whose charity, poverty, and marvellous self-abnegation would place him in the holy category of the first followers of his Seraphic Patron.

Hayes’ serial followed Vianney’s life, lived 1786-1859, and included numerous references to Monseigneur Monnin who, as the articles explain, was friend and co-worker of John Vianney. Abbé Alfred Monnin on his bishop’s request wrote Le Curé d’Ars which was published in Paris in 1861. The preface of the first English translation was completed by Manning, Hayes’ old friend, but the translator’s name was omitted. Evidence suggests that Hayes probably not only used this translation of Monnin’s text as her basic source, with anonymity for herself again, and that it was the translation accomplished by her friend, Mother Elizabeth Lockhart. Analysis of this lifestory further clarifies how Hayes often read her sources and then wrote her

---

73 Mrs. Parsons, The Life of Saint Collette: The Reformer of the Three Orders of St. Francis, Especially of the Poor Clares, among Whom She Revived the First Fervour of Their Illustrious Founder (London: Burns and Oates, 1879). Parsons acknowledged that her two main sources, beside old documents, were the work of Père Sellier published at Ghent (1853) and another life by Abbe Douillé published in Paris (1869).
74 In the same year (1879), according to Parsons, the May number of Analecta Juris Pontificii, published a life of St. Collette and many of her letters.
75 The seventeen parts were composed of four in 1887, seven in 1888, ending with six in 1889.
76 Hayes, ”The Cure of Ars”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XII, no. viii (1887): 240.
77 Hayes wrote many times, ‘M. Monnin writes’, ‘says M. Monnin’ and ‘In 1859 M. Monnin writes’.
78 English editions of Monnin’s book are held in the MFIC’s libraries in Rome and Braintree.
79 Manning (later Cardinal) wrote numerous prefaces for texts and translations but he did not always name the translators. In the preface for the translation of The Little Flowers of St. Francis executed by ‘three women’, discussed earlier, at least he acknowledged the ‘Rev. Mother Vicaress’ who was Elizabeth Lockhart.
own unsigned mission-orientated version. The lives of other significant Franciscan saints were also presented in *Annals*’ serials, while at times Hayes published many single stories on lesser known Franciscan saints. An analysis of how Hayes used Fr. Léon de Clary’s *Lives of the Saints and Blessed of the Three Orders of St. Francis* to achieve her aims will be discussed later.

### Franciscan literature

We have already discussed Hayes’ articles relating to the Order, so the Franciscan literature theme will be limited to examples concerned with the Franciscan Order, Bonaventure’s writings, the old classic - *Little Flowers of St. Francis* - and an account of the English Grey Friars. “The Franciscan Order in England”, Hayes’ longest serial on the Order, was based on the “Chronicle of the Franciscan Order in England” published in the English *Franciscan Annals*. In line with her aim to present the Franciscan Order’s history, Hayes published a six-part serial, “The Third Order of St. Francis”, which she had translated in 1874 from the work of French expert on Franciscan literature, Monseigneur Louis Gaston de Ségur.

In the consideration of how Hayes used her *Annals* as an instrument for mission, her application of Saint Bonaventure’s writings to achieve her aims is intriguing. St. Bonaventure (1217-74) was described by Hayes as great in the science of God; a saint who ‘passed successively from the lowest ranks of a simple religious to the honours of Doctor, General of the Order of Friars Minor, Bishop, and Cardinal’. While Hayes’ inclusion of Bonaventure’s works followed a strong Franciscan tradition, she excluded, among his many famous writings, his important life of St. Francis. Instead, her articles on Bonaventure drew attention to events that celebrated the sixth century

---

81 For example, a serial of seventeen articles on “St. Angela Merici, Tertiary of St. Francis, Foundress of the Ursulines” was printed between August 1884 and June 1886.

82 Fr. Léon de Clary’s four French volumes, *L Auréole Séraphique*, were translated and printed by the Taunton Franciscans (1885-87). Hayes used these publications as direct and edited sources. De Clary’s Italian edition, *L Auréola Sérafica* from Quaracchi (1898-1900) should not be confused with an Italian text called ‘Saints of the Seraphic Order’ by Hayes and from which she translated material, e.g., five 1893 instalments of “Venerable Bonaventure of Barcelona”.

83 It was first presented between 1878 and 1883.

84 Later in 1883, Hayes edited the 1874 serial into a shorter version.


86 As far back as the fourteenth-century the Franciscans used a compendium of practical piety edited by Fra Giacomo of Milan who drew freely from Bonaventure’s devotional writings. *Meditationes Vitae Christi and Stimulus Amoris* represented two classes of Franciscan devotional literature, which derived their inspiration from Bonaventure’s mystical writings. Cuthbert, *The Romanticism of St Francis*, 187-88.
after his death, to news about Fr. de Fanna’s research and publications based on the *Echoes of the Vatican* - these indicate Hayes’ enormous reading capacity. In later volumes Hayes moves into the practice of giving Bonaventure’s words in snippets when taking the opportunity of unused space after the conclusion of another topic, for example:

‘PERFECT Christians have always before their minds the shortness of life: they live as if they were to die each day, and prepare themselves with as much care for the future life as if they regarded the things of time with the light of eternity. - *St. Bonaventure*.  

Hayes waited until 1893 to reproduce three of Bonaventure’s more pastoral writings, followed the next year by three different selections from *Conferences of the Gospel of St. John* and a serial on the *Conferences on the Passion*. About the unique source of these *Conferences*, Hayes wrote:

The Latin text of this priceless treasure (Collationes in Evangelium S. Johannis) has been recently, for the first time, put into print, in the printing press of the Franciscan Order at Quaracchi near Florence, having previously lain hidden in the obscurity of ancient manuscripts.

---

87 Hayes, "The Sixth Century of the Seraphic Doctor of the Church", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* I, no. vi (1874). This included Bernardine of Portogruaro’s invitation to Franciscan writers to contribute to new publications.


89 Hayes, "St. Bonaventure, the Seraphic Doctor of the Church", 220-21.

90 Saint Bonaventure, (Untitled) *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XIV, no. vi (1889): 188.


Hayes had not attempted to diffuse the deepest Bonaventurian writings, particularly those described as using ‘the language of Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite’, yet she did ensure that her readers received something of Bonaventure’s pastoral assistance, particularly a taste of his scripturally-based sermons. A fuller appreciation of Hayes’ broad and deep readings of St. Bonaventure which prefaced her selections of Bonaventure’s work for the *Annals* would be ideal; just to present one aspect of Bonaventure’s literature, Hayes had to choose from seventy-nine conferences on St. John’s Gospel.\(^94\)

Sources suggest that Hayes was ahead of her time by producing Bonaventurian writings to the English-speaking world when availability of his works to English readers was extremely rare.\(^95\) The 1978 translation from the Latin by Ewert Cousins of Bonaventure’s trilogy, *Itinerarum mentis in Deum*, *Lignum Vitae* and *Legenda Maior*, heightens awareness of Hayes’ industry in achieving her mission.\(^96\) Hayes’ attitude appears aligned with the comment of a later Franciscan author who wrote of Bonaventure’s work, ‘presented are so many ways in which he sought to understand and to nourish in himself and in others, the love needed to heed that invitation of the Master’.\(^97\)

Hayes evangelised not only through the Franciscan writings in her *Annals*’ content but also through her recommendations of new Franciscan literary translations, as exemplified in two 1888 articles, different yet both entitled, “The Little Flowers of St. Francis”. The *Fioretti* (Little Flowers of St. Francis) is a Franciscan Italian fourteenth-century literary masterpiece, a collection of charming and instructive anecdotes about St. Francis and his early friars. Hayes wrote:


\(^{95}\) Fehlmer, "Bonaventure. Rooted in Faith", x, xiii, xiv.

\(^{96}\) Only in the 1970s did the English-speaking world have easy access to three Franciscan literary masterpieces in one text; Saint Bonaventure, *Bonaventure: The Soul's Journey into God - the Tree of Life - the Life of St. Francis*, trans. Ewert Cousins (New York: Paulist Press, 1978).

\(^{97}\) Ignatius Brady in the preface of *ibid.*, xviii.
We shall not attempt to quote any fragments for the benefit of those who may be unacquainted with the work, but prefer to recommend all such to lose no time in making it their own.\(^98\)

Hayes rejoiced over the Bayswater Franciscans’ second edition of the Fioretti\(^99\) which she, among others, regarded not only as a manual of devotional reading, but also of spiritual value and of historical importance. Hayes wrote:

As a historical work the volume is a record of men whom many even of those who fail to appreciate the true soul animating their lives, have ranked among the chief benefactors of their kind, because of their genuine philanthropy, their recognition of the claims of the poor, their example and preaching of unselfishness, mutual helpfulness and ceaseless beneficence. They were men whose lives ought to be known to all the world.\(^100\)

The second article is initialled ‘P. F.’ and commences with a tale of an unnamed convert, later priest, who became attracted to St. Francis, then it moves on to resonate with Hayes’ article.\(^101\) P. F.’s article praises ‘the recent edition of a unique book’ especially the quality of its translation despite being transplanted ‘into our harsher tongue’.\(^102\) Hayes’ article concludes with a suggestion that study of the new publication would be fruitful:

The real actual lives of the saints, when by rare fortune they find, as in the case of the early Franciscans, worthy chroniclers, present to those who study them


\(^99\) The 2nd edition carried the Bayswater Franciscan’s motto, ‘Monast Immaculatae Conceptionis’, representing the community who first taught Hayes to be Franciscan. Hayes’ personal 2nd edition, held in the MFIC’s archives, Rome, is dated 1887.

\(^100\) Hayes, ”The Little Flowers of St. Francis”, 182.

\(^101\) The initials may represent Paul Feval (1817-87) whose work Hayes translated for another article. Hayes recognised the translation’s ‘peculiar charm’, how it retained ‘the amiable simplicity of the original Italian style’, yet admitted that, ‘in spite of the translator’s best efforts’, the ‘expressive diminutives cannot be translated into English’.

with undarkened eyes, a combination of Truth and Poetry, of Beauty and Utility.103

A final example of Franciscan literature in the *Annals* is the historical article, “The Grey Friars”. The editor’s brief introductory words are, ‘Dr. St. George Mivart contributes an interesting article to *The New Review*, in which he says:’ – then the traditional, yet particularly Greenwich-orientated Franciscans’ story of arrival and struggle in England commences.104 The reader’s attention is ensured because the famous contemporary name, Mivart, not normally associated with history but with scientific and philosophical works, explains the historical topic.105 Once again Hayes shows her breadth of reading and her ability to pluck material from unexpected sources. The article concludes with a news update on the opening of Guilford’s Observant Franciscan novitiate, an historical Franciscan event of 1887.

**Franciscan stories**

Among her Franciscan stories, Hayes created the “Franciscan Record” as a regular feature in her *Annals* in 1878 as a means of reporting news and collecting stories about recent Franciscan events and retained it until 1887.106 The editor’s method is exemplified in her 1879 “Franciscan Record” articles on the ‘Archconfraternity of the Cord of St. Francis’ which announced the two latest decrees promulgated that year on the Archconfraternity.107 In volume VII Hayes used her “Franciscan Record” to provide her readers with news of the Capuchins’ missions, stories from Europe and answers to correspondents.108 In 1884 the “Franciscan Record” concluded with

---

103 Hayes, "The Little Flowers of St. Francis", 184.
105 St. George Jackson Mivart, Ph.D., M.D., F.R.S., V.P.Z.S., F.Z.S. (1827-1900) was a London convert whom Darwin regarded a ‘distinguished biologist’. Mivart’s *Annals*’ contribution provides a contemporary link to secular periodicals for he wrote articles for the *Quarterly Review*, *Popular Science Review*, the *Contemporary Review*, the *Fortnightly Review*, the *Nineteenth Century* and the *Dublin Review*, among others.
106 Per volume this topic ranged numerically from twelve insertions, one every issue as in 1880, to three as in 1884, 1885 and 1887. The contemporary *Franciscan Annals* called its own similar approach “Franciscan Chronicles” initially and changed to “Franciscan News” in 1886.
Roman news about ‘another large Religious Congregation, all of whose members are Third Order Franciscans’. 109

The story of “The Present State of the Franciscan Missions” throughout the world was reported by Hayes in three 1874 articles through her own explanatory introduction and notes, including a translated statistical type ‘catalogue’ as she called it. 110 The story covers Franciscan missions in Europe, the Holy Land, Asia, Africa, North and South America and, near the conclusion, missions in ‘Oceanica’ which includes:

A Province with two hundred and seventy-eight religious, who direct sixteen missions amongst the Infidels, and supply the duty of one hundred and thirty-four Parishes, containing about 798,000 Catholics. 111

**Franciscan devotions**

Nineteenth-century Franciscan devotions were numerous and many were woven into general Catholic practices, 112 yet traditionally Franciscan devotions to Christ’s humanity revolved essentially around God’s love expressed through the ‘Crib’, ‘Cross’ and ‘Eucharist’. Hayes built many *Annals* articles around these three topics and related ones, especially the love of the Sacred Heart. Illustrations of this are revealing as well as examples of articles that focus on Franciscan devotion to Mary, and, in particular, devotion to Saint Anthony. 113 Traditionally, Franciscans were also especially devoted to the Holy Father and so Hayes did not ignore this theme.

---

110 Hayes and Bernardine (Father General) of Portogruaro, "The Present State of the Franciscan Missions", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* I, no. vi, viii, ix (1874): 176-80, 238-41, 271-76. The story’s facts, originally written by the Observant Franciscan General, were previously published according to Hayes in the September and December 1873 *Revue Franciscaine*.
111 Ibid., no. ix: 276.
113 Hayes, "Franciscan Devotions and Works", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* II, no. i, iv, vi (1875): 399-404, 482-85, 565-71. No source was named but the contemporary English *Franciscan Annals* produced a similar article which suggests that the same source was used. "Franciscan Works and Devotions", *The Franciscan Annals and Monthly Bulletin of the Third Order of St. Francis* VI, no. 71 (1882): 312-16, 357-61; with more in 1883 and 1884.
Devotion to the crib, according to the *Franciscan Annals*, was inaugurated by St. Francis of Assisi. Hayes, more restrained, reminded her readers:

It was St. Francis who popularised, perhaps even inaugurated, in Italy the devotion of the crib. It was in 1223. Being at Rome he obtained the authorisation of the Sovereign Pontiff to go and celebrate the birth of the Saviour at Greccio, to assemble his brethren and the neighbouring population, and give this feast unwonted honour.

Alongside her use of poetry, Hayes sometimes drew upon correspondence received from Franciscans in the Holy Land. The first occasion she did this was in the article entitled “Christmas night at Bethlehem.” Late the same year, Hayes shared with readers her own Roman Christmas experience, entitled “Christmas Day in Rome”, and recalled:

Out again to wander among the countless churches of God's city, and visit some of the “Bambinos”, as the Italian name is, the images of the Divine Infant, which are placed in all the churches, to preach to the eye of the poor and the unlearned the gospel of God's birth, and to wake in the hearts of all thoughts of love for the Babe who stooped so low.

Devotion to the Infant in the crib was encouraged through a number of general and specific articles. Franciscan devotion to the cross was understood to focus on Christ's sufferings and death and traditionally Franciscans have been credited with spreading the devotion known as The Stations of the Cross. Under the heading, “Stations of the Cross”, Hayes republished for her Third Order Franciscan readers

---

114 The caption accompanying the detailed illustration of the Greccio crib indicated ‘at midnight on 24th December, 1224’. "Illustration", *The Franciscan Annals and Monthly Bulletin of the Third Order of St. Francis* V, no. 60 (1881): 334. Other sources, including Hayes, indicate 1223.


116 Procter’s first line was ‘Oh to have dwelt in Bethlehem …’. Another example (author unnamed), "There Was No Room for Them in the Inn", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XVII, no. xii (1892): 365-66. Author still unnamed, "There Was No Room for Them in the Inn", *The Franciscan Annals and Monthly Bulletin of the Third Order of St. Francis* VI, no. 72 (1882): 354.


118 Hayes, "Christmas Day in Rome", 329.

short questions to and replies from the Sacred Congregation of Indulgences in regard to this devotion.\textsuperscript{120}

The articles, “Jerusalem and the Holy places”, introduced with Pope Leo XIII’s reminder that Christ became ‘obedient unto death, even the death of the Cross’ in Jerusalem, goes on to state that the Franciscans, the custodians of the Holy Places, in trying to restore the sacred sites were in need of the faithful’s financial support and outlined a plan of action. Hayes then elaborated on the Pope’s ‘Brief’ - calling the faithful’s opportunity to assist, an ‘act of devotion to the Gospel’.\textsuperscript{121} Lady Herbert’s “Jerusalem and the Holy Sepulchre” contains similar references to the Franciscans’ devotion to and care of Calvary, other holy places and the pilgrims whom, as a pilgrim herself, she describes at some length.\textsuperscript{122} Other examples of articles intended by Hayes to produce increased devotion to the cross are “The Miraculous Cross”,\textsuperscript{123} and the “Legend of the Repentant Thief”.\textsuperscript{124}

First among Hayes’ principal attractions in prayer was devotion ‘towards our Blessed Lord in the Holy Eucharist’\textsuperscript{125} so, as to be expected, \textit{Annals’} articles include ones on devotion to the Eucharist, with the most outstanding by Hayes’ former mentor and continuing friend, Cardinal Manning.\textsuperscript{126} This scripturally-based, theologically-rich devotional explanation is addressed in particular to English readers\textsuperscript{127} and its source, not indicated by the editor, is most likely Manning’s book by the same title.\textsuperscript{128}

\textsuperscript{120} Hayes, "Stations of the Cross", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} IX, no. iii (1884): 86.
\textsuperscript{123} Feval, "The Miraculous Cross", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} V, no. iii (1880): 82-5. Taken from the American Catholic periodical, the \textit{Morning Star}.
\textsuperscript{124} Hayes, "Legend of the Repentant Thief", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} V, no. iii (1880): 91-2.
\textsuperscript{125} Chaffee, "A Brief Sketch of the Life of the Late Sister Mary Ignatius of Jesus, O.S.F.", 293.
\textsuperscript{126} It consists of two parts covering twenty-two pages of small print. Henry E. Cardinal Manning, "The Blessed Sacrament the Centre of Immutable Truth", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} XII, no. vi, vii (1887): 178-86, 193-205.
\textsuperscript{127} One textual example was reference to English preachers, Sts. Augustine, Paulinus and Winifrid, and to the time ‘when the truth and grace which went out from Canterbury and York spread throughout the whole of England … Jesus dwelt there in the Divine Mystery of the Holy Eucharist’. Ibid.: 200-01. Lingard’s History of England was quoted to support the claim of ‘the love of Jesus in the Holy Eucharist’ by Catholics of Northern and Western England who took up arms in defence of their belief. Manning, “The Blessed Sacrament the Centre of Immutable Truth”, 204.
\textsuperscript{128} An 1886 catalogue list of Burns & Oates advertised ‘A new and revised edition’ of Manning’s book.
Hayes encouraged Eucharistic devotion by publishing an article of her Franciscan friend, Fanny Montgomery, “Corpus Christi, the Feast of the Most Blessed Sacrament” which highlights the experience of Fr. Herman Cohen, a converted Jew, to the Eucharistic Divine Presence and the establishment of his ‘Association of Perpetual Adoration of the Holy Sacrament’. Another Annals example is “The Miracle of the Most Blessed Sacrament” which is a Franciscan story about the Blessed Sacrament, St. Anthony of Padua, the people of Bourges including the unbeliever, Guillard, and a donkey – leading to Guillard’s marvellous conversion.

Hayes’ motivation for her selection of Franciscan devotions relating to the Crib, Cross and Eucharist could be considered encapsulated in “God So Little Loved” by Faber. Hayes made this selection in Belle Prairie when Fr. Faber's writings were very popular in the United States, especially his book The Blessed Sacrament, which Chinnici claims illustrates the connection between alienation, social identity, moralism and devotional feelings.

The Annals' editor, wishing to evangelise through her selected themes, highlights God’s love in a special way through devotion to the Sacred Heart which she summarises in one particular paragraph:

The devotion to the Sacred Heart has for its object the adorable Heart of Jesus, and the immense love with which it was inflamed for us. It has for its end to render love for love, to thank Him for his benefits and to repair the outrages which He daily receives.

---


132 Chinnici, "The Spirituality of Americanism, 1866-1900", 78.

Franciscans participated in the increased devotion to the Sacred Heart of Jesus developing through the nineteenth century, so Hayes in 1874 provided her readers with news of the collective petition to the pope from the Franciscan Ministers General regarding consecration to the Sacred Heart and with a summary of French Tertiaries’ activities related to this same devotion. Later in 1883 Hayes read an old manuscript showing that Franciscans had a long tradition of this devotion and her own words best describe the source:

In these few notes translated from a valuable work, entitled *Arbor Vitae*, written in 1305 by a holy son of Saint Francis, Friar Ubertino di Casale, we have a remarkable exposition of the devotion to the Sacred Heart of Jesus three centuries and a half before the revelation of the Blessed Margaret Mary; four centuries and more before the devotion to the Heart of Jesus was propagated in the Church.

What Hayes called ‘these few notes’ actually consists of a three-part serial. This is not the place to discuss at length the significance of Friar Ubertino di Casale, author of *Arbor Vitae Crucifixae Jesu* (*The Tree of Life of Jesus Crucified*) or his other fourteenth-century writings, but this series included by Hayes using Ubertino’s old manuscript, probably a Venetian copy of 1485, shows her again to be ahead of her times in reading, translating and presenting in English an old Franciscan writing. The whole work has been acknowledged as Ubertino’s masterwork, an extended allegory. It compares the life, suffering and death of Jesus Christ to the roots, the trunk, branches and fruit of the Tree of Life and it contains stirring meditations on the inner life of Christ, his suffering prompted by love, and that love itself as the moving force of salvation. It was the love in Christ’s heart for God’s people that Hayes carefully

---

conveyed to her readers. A final 1890s article on the devotion to the Sacred Heart was also published by Hayes.140

Mary’s place in Franciscan devotions is illustrated especially by Hayes’ 1883 publication of a five-part serial, “Our Lady of the Angels in Porziuncula”.141 The initial article emphasises that devotion to Mary on this site commenced some fifteen centuries earlier, before it came into the possession of Benedictine monks and was later given to St. Francis of Assisi. The latter’s acceptance of the gift, also called ‘the Church of St. Mary of the Porziuncula’, is described as follows:

‘Never any donation could have been more agreeable to him, and there was no difficulty in promising that his dear Porziuncula should always be the head and mother of his Order as by nature and origin it was already the mother and cradle of the Order of the Friars Minor.’142

While Catholics have recited for centuries the Joyful, Sorrowful and Glorious Mysteries of the Rosary on beads with five decades, Franciscans have prayed also the traditional Franciscan Crown on beads with seven decades to recall the seven joys of Mary. Hayes on two occasions explained the origin and prayer method of “The Franciscan Crown” to her readers and encouraged them to pray it.143 Hayes called on the Franciscan Doctor, St. Bonaventure, to help promote devotion to Mary144 and wrote about St. Anthony of Padua’s strong devotion to Mary, which also captures her own evangelizing missionary desire, as in the words:

Would you have your life and your death sweetened by this devotion? then never forget that Mary … must be obeyed with obsequious promptness; that she must be loved, and loved above all else, by observing the law given by her divine Son, which is Charity – love of God and neighbour.145

141 F.B. (Assisi), "Our Lady of the Angels in Porziuncula", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels VIII, no. v, vi, viii-x (1883): 129-31, 161-64, 225-29, 273-77, 308-12. F.B. of Assisi used numerous Franciscan sources to enrich the articles, including Lumi Seraphiel, St. Bonaventure’s writings, the Legend of the Three Companions (ch. v, ix) and Thomas of Celano’s life of St. Francis (ch. xi, xii).
142 Ibid., 310.
144 For example, Saint Bonaventure, "The Most Holy Name of Mary", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XVIII, no. v (1893): 136-49.
Hayes in her many devotional stories of St. Anthony, encouraged Franciscans to believe that ‘God only is glorious in His Saints’. Besides devotional stories, hymns and prayers to the saint, in December 1884 she introduced the Annals’ first article on the “Association of the Clients of St. Anthony of Padua”. Significantly by then, under Hayes’ leadership, the Annals’ subscribers had formed an Association, known in brief as the Association of St. Anthony. The Association’s organisation was composed of Clients (Associates), Zelatrices (Promoters) and Benefactors. From 1884 to 1893 Hayes edited a series of articles under the title of “To the Clients of St. Anthony” in which she provided titbits of news about St. Anthony’s followers. Pope Leo XIII, in a Brief dated 31 July 1886, declared that the work of the Association of St. Anthony of Padua was truly a spiritual work of mercy. Time would show how important this Brief was to Hayes’ evangelising mission through the press, for it saved the work when it was later threatened. That same year Hayes published an article “On Confraternities” in which she commenced, ‘All the modern saints extol pious sodalities as the best means of enkindling and preserving the fervour of charity in the hearts of the faithful’. Hayes also included a segment from Cardinal Raphael Monago La Valletta’s 1884 instruction to all bishops regarding the desirability of associations and confraternities, concluding with the Franciscan Order’s history of twenty-six confraternities since 1267.

The Association of St. Anthony of Padua was raised to the status of a Confraternity in May 1888 by the Cardinal Vicar of Rome at the time, Cardinal Lucido M. Parocchi, and it was canonically erected under that title in the Roman oratory of Hayes’ Franciscan generalate. The new Confraternity remained under the protection of Mary. Statutes, containing the Confraternity’s objectives, means of attaining these objectives, conditions for admission, the organisation, spiritual advantages of the

146 Tales regarding St. Anthony were sprinkled in every volume from 1885 to 1893 then climaxed with eight articles in 1894. They range from the saint’s wisdom to his humility, from his defence of Mary’s Assumption to bread for the poor.
148 The famous hymn, Si Quaeris Miracula, words by St. Bonaventure and music by Cavalier Antonio Quadrini (organist at Rome’s St. John Lateran Arch-Basilica), appeared in the June 1891 issue and was referred to in a number of other articles.
149 News included e.g., recent celebrations of St. Anthony’s feast in Rome and Padua or St. Anthony’s Brief, and a blessing which was a kind of talisman. Hayes, “To the Clients of St. Anthony of Padua”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XVII, no. ix (1892): 247-48.
151 Hayes credited Prendergast with the article and prefaced it with La Valletta’s letter after her own introduction.
members and the Confraternity’s principal feasts, were printed in the *Annals*. The first means of attaining objectives was stated clearly: ‘to aid in the printing and propagation of good Books and pious Pictures’.

In 1891 in June, the month when the Church celebrates St. Anthony’s feast, Hayes devoted all the articles of the issue except one to topics around St. Anthony. Of particular interest is the number of times reference was made to the *Annals*’ ‘Work of printing and propagating good books for the purpose of instruction in those things which lead to the acquisition of eternal life’. The Cardinal Vicar’s 1888 Decree also reminded Associates of St. Anthony of Padua how important it was ‘to have good books spread among the people’ when a ‘multitude of bad books’ existed and when a ‘fierce war’ was being ‘waged both against religion and against the persons and things consecrated to religion’.

Like other contemporary religious journal editors, Hayes aimed to foster a corporate feeling among her Associates, called ‘Clients of St. Anthony’. Hayes achieved this by uniting them through prayer in a number of ways. One means was the commencement of an *Annals*’ “Obituary” which appeared bimonthly from 1886 and always commenced with, ‘The prayers of the Clients of St. Anthony of Padua are requested for the repose of the Souls of the following Associates deceased.’ Such a list could only be composed after Associates’ letters were received and this communication further fostered members’ corporate feeling. The *Annals* often advised Associates of St. Anthony to address their letters to ‘The Secretary of the Confraternity of the Clients, Villa Spada, near San Pietro in Montorio, Rome. Italy’. Another means of bonding her associates was the printing over 1891-1894 of twenty-one articles headed “Intentions for St. Anthony’s Association” which listed all the intentions the Associates had provided. These intentions could range from ‘reconciliation and peace in seven families and between four friends living in discord’ to ‘the successful examination of six convent schools’ and from the ‘cure of mental

---


malady of two afflicted patients’ to protecting ‘the voyages of two Associate Sea-Captains’.\textsuperscript{154}

Hayes wrote:

\textit{It is really wonderful when we consider amongst how many individuals, nations, kingdoms and empires has arisen so great a confidence in the powerful Thaumaturgus, St. Anthony of Padua, on account of the constant protection and innumerable benefits he continually lavishes upon all those who invoke him.}\textsuperscript{155}

Hayes concluded this two-part article by quoting St. Bonaventure’s advice: ‘If you want miracles, go to St. Anthony of Padua; for whatsoever you ask, believing, you shall receive!’ It was this kind of trust in God, in the saints and in the spiritual life that Hayes endeavoured to diffuse through her \textit{Annals}’ themes.

The various themes that have been analysed provide a special insight into the mind and heart of Hayes. The editor delighted in history, revelled in biographical sketches especially saints’ lives, appreciated poetry, and showed a sense of adventure through her travel and pilgrimage accounts. In particular, Hayes admired the courage, faith and endurance of missionaries in distant lands, and above all else, she held most precious her Catholic faith, her Franciscan calling and her religious life. In analysing the predominant themes in the \textit{Annals}, it seems evident that Hayes was a generous caring person who laboured tirelessly for the Apostolate of the Press because she wished to share with others what she believed was most valuable and enduring.

\textsuperscript{154} Hayes, "Intentions for St. Anthony’s Association", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XVI}, no. vi (1891): 175-76.

The dissemination of good writings is a matter of sovereign importance. Those who by infidelity are cut off from the Church do battle with their pens, and use them as redoubtable weapons in the cause of evil; and from their efforts spring a deluge of bad books, and newspapers, organs of disorder and iniquity, whose excesses law itself is powerless to restrain. This terrible evil is gaining ground day by day, and its progress must be arrested. … Furthermore, we must oppose writing to writing, and of this powerful engine for ruin make an equally powerful instrument for salvation.¹

Hayes, determined to ‘oppose writing to writing’, published not in a void but rather in the midst of enormous journalistic outpourings of which the Catholic output comprised only a fraction of the current periodical press. Even then, from a wide range of contributors to Catholic literature, Hayes needed to select those who would provide the type of content that matched her particular advertised aims.² Hayes, whose breadth and depth of personal reading were paramount for the success of her Annals, was poised in an advantageous position. Yet besides the better-known writers and poets, as will be seen, Hayes also introduced some new contributors whose work was unique to her publication. There is also a bulk of unsigned poetry that enriches the Annals. While it seems likely that Hayes herself wrote some poems to suit thematic topics, there is no proof that she did so.

In scrutinising Hayes’ Annals, it becomes evident that in order to gain suitable prose and poetry for her Catholic journal, she relied on individual writers, women and men, whose lives and literary works exhibited deep religious commitment. Her contributors are identifiable under four categories – Women Religious, Clergy, Third Order secular Franciscans and committed lay Catholic writers. While most writers contributed either prose or poetry, a few contributed both; here the focus will be more on the contributor than on which genre provided content. Discussion will concentrate on the direct

contributors whose names are provided by the *Annals*’ editor. A detailed analysis of every named contributor and his/her work cannot be presented here so major contributors in each category will be discussed with a brief reference to minor contributors who were high-profile contemporaries. Women religious and clergymen will be discussed in this chapter with the other two categories in the next chapter.

**Women Religious**

Hayes, in her efforts to increase religious reading, published the poetry of an Irish religious, ‘Sr. M. Josephine, Poor Clare, Dublin’, when, according to Orby Shipley, other Catholic journals and hymn books were spreading the verses of Irish men like Aubrey de Vere, Dennis F. McCarthy and Richard D. Williams. Numerically in the *Annals* this nun’s poetic contribution was the greatest, some thirty-three known titles, while the variety of genre within her devotional poetry is noteworthy. How Hayes found this Dublin contributor remains a mystery, even after research in the archives of her Order and in the period’s published Catholic verse.

Elizabeth (Sr. M. Josephine) Brett (1851-1906) belonged to a branch of the Second Order Franciscans known as the Poor Clares but who since 1973 are known as the Sisters of Saint Clare. Another writer, Margaret Anna (Sr. Francis Clare) Cusack, better known as the Dublin born ‘Nun of Kenmare’ had made Brett’s convent at Harolds Cross famous. Brett contributed to the *Annals* from 1885 until after Hayes’

---

2 These aims have been discussed - to provide ‘matter of interest to the general reader’ and to present ‘the progress and development of the Franciscan Order – its missions, new foundations and good works, as well as the past history, legends and traditions of the Franciscan Movement’.

3 Contributions to the *Annals* may be described as direct and indirect. The researcher has interpreted indirect contributors as those writers whose work Hayes used as a resource for her edited articles. Some overlap is unavoidable.


5 Hayes had connections with Continental Poor Clares; had brought the Bentivoglio Poor Clares from Via Panisperna to New York, but no links with Dublin’s Poor Clares have been discovered.

6 In Dublin, Sr. M. Josephine had lived at Harolds Cross. Investigations cancelled out the Poor Clare Donnybrook (County Dublin) convent; it opened later in 1906. Archivist, Sr. Marie Feely, declared that neither the Poor Clare convent archives nor oral history among senior nuns at Harolds Cross reveal any knowledge that their Sr. M. Josephine wrote poetry; however a copy of her death certificate was located.

7 To date, Sr. M. Josephine’s name has not been located in contemporary journals discussed earlier, including Franciscan *Annals* (1877-94), *Irish Ecclesiastical Record* (1864-94), The *Month* (1873-83), *The Messenger of the Sacred Heart* (1868-70; 1877-80), *Irish Franciscan Tertiary* (1890-91), *Irish Monthly* (1873-94) and others.

8 These Sisters are often called the active or teaching Poor Clares. Poor Clares have been associated with Dublin since 1629. Conlan, *Franciscan Ireland*, 91.

9 Cusack is said to have written more than fifty books and pamphlets. Irene Firench Eagar, *The Nun of Kenmare* (Cork: The Mercier Press, 1970), 16. Sr. Philomena McCarthy, who cares for the Cusack Collection in Kenmare, corrected this in an interview to about one hundred publications. The political storm caused by
death, with a pause in the years 1888-90, while the variety of her works includes verses, a sonnet, a sequence, translations and short reflections.

In Brett's devotional themes those surrounding Mary, the Mother of God, are conspicuous; one contribution includes a translation from the Latin of Pope Leo XIII's "In Honour of the Blessed Virgin Mary" which lost its rhyme in the translation yet retained its spirit. This translation shows Brett to be a well educated 'choir nun'; her versatility in Latin flows over into a few titles. Brett's Marian sonnet provides lovely imagery combined with religious beliefs as in:

IMMACULATE! what human words can say
What thought conceive the beauty of thy name
Above all names save His. Oh! who art thou?
The first fair dawn that softly heralds in
The golden day of grace. The lily fair
Into whose pearly chalice, heavenly dew
So long desired, shall gently fall to earth.
But ah! Be silent O my human soul
And listen to the sweet celestial praise
So softly murmured by the Angels' lips.
The music floating on the midnight air
Is wafted from the far bright land above

some of Cusack’s writings led Cardinal McCabe of Dublin to forbid her to stay at Harolds Cross. Yet in the early 1880s, it was to this same Harolds Cross Convent that this writer came to seek shelter - much to the nuns’ anxiety. McCarthy, The Nun of Kenmare, 38, 44-45. Comparison of dates indicates that Brett was probably one of the anxious nuns; if not, she certainly lived with nuns who were acquainted with the situation.


'Choir nuns' recited the Office in Latin; a 'lay sister' did not. A choir nun was essentially a solemn-vow religious as recognised in canon law. Lay Sisters, who were not canonically nuns, had simple vows. It was only in 1900 that those with simple vows were canonically recognised as religious.

And let it find an echo in thy love
‘Ave Maria’ – sine Macula? 14

Brett, as a vowed Franciscan, provided Hayes with verses about St. Francis of Assisi especially appropriate for the Franciscan readers. 15 In one substantial poem Brett calls St. Francis “The Saint of the Beatitudes” 16 and in another, also of some length, she presents a major event in the saint’s life, “St. Francis before the Crucifix in St. Damian’s”, which commences:

He knelt within the dim old church
In humble fervent prayer,
And like the incense sweet,
his words embalmed the silent air. 17

Verse twelve would have pleased the editor because of her own love of and commitment to St. Francis’ Rule. It reads:

His Rule is like a living voice
That tells us day by day:
‘Be poor in spirit; your reward
Shall never pass away’. 18

An analysis of Brett’s considerable poetic contributions reveals that overall her verses were God-centred, simple and reflected her Franciscan lifestyle. This is exhibited especially in her contribution, “To St. Clare”, in which she neatly composed a play on the word light - the meaning of Clare’s name in both Italian and Latin. Light also is a traditional Franciscan symbol for St. Clare. 19 Hayes’ wide choice of Franciscan

17 Brett, "St. Francis before the Crucifix in St. Damian’s", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XVIII, no. x (1893): 278.
18 Ibid.: 280. The editor prefaced the poem with a lengthy explanation to help readers understand the full significance of Francis’ call to ‘repair God’s house’.
19 Brett, "To St. Clare", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XVIII, no. vii (1893): 214. Brett’s poems varied in length; this one had just three stanzas with four lines to each.
devotional themes was supplemented by Brett's sequence on the Holy Name of Jesus.\textsuperscript{20} The poet sometimes chose to introduce her work with an inspirational quotation; in one instance it was Fr. Faber's words, 'The years rob us as they pass';\textsuperscript{21} in another it was, 'Pure lilies of eternal peace, whose odours haunt my dreams', Tennyson's line in “Sir Galahad”.\textsuperscript{22}

The idea of death, which fascinated numerous nineteenth-century poets, found its way into sensitive poems whose content conveys the message of eternal life and hope.\textsuperscript{23} Brett's devotional verses include Trinitarian themes as in “Behold Thy Son”, “An Advice” and in her free translation of “Veni Sancte Spiritus”.\textsuperscript{24} Hayes often highlighted her poetry by positioning it on the issue’s first page. Hayes, alert to Church celebrations, special events and feast-days, published poetry that was timely and appropriate in order to strengthen her reader’s faith. An example of this is Brett’s contribution after the pope’s ‘Decree of the Beatification and Canonization of the Venerable Servant of God Nunzio Sulprizio’. After the actual 21 June 1891 ‘Decree’, Hayes translated from the French the story of Nunzio Sulprizio, who died in Naples aged nineteen years. She published in the Annals six instalments of the translation, then Brett’s poem, the final installment, and lastly Vincenzo Nussi’s account of the ‘Decree’.\textsuperscript{25}

When Brett commenced her work for the Annals, she was a hidden unknown female religious in her mid-thirties, yet Hayes dared to publish her poetry among professional, highly respected names like Procter, Faber, Fullerton, Drane, Russell,

Montgomery and Rawes. Hayes recognised in Brett a woman with a passion for her God and through the inclusion of her many and varied contributions was able to achieve better the goals of the *Annals*.

When Hayes selected poems from Augusta Theodosia Drane, she chose one on Mary and another, “Faith and Sense”, while the 1883 *Irish Monthly* favoured, by contrast, "The Life of Love", "Light on the Clouds" and "The Mountain Summit". Drane’s verses on Mary and St. Dominic can be found published as hymns.

Drane’s *Christian Schools and Scholars*, described as ‘one of the most able and learned works ever composed by a woman’, was a contribution acknowledged clearly by Hayes for her educational content yet intertwined with it for two years is a tale, “The Chapel of the Angels” which initially appears unrelated. The tale, a ‘literary recreation’, showing chapter headings and concluding with ‘Something about the Angels’, had obviously been ‘selected’ from a longer story to enhance the editor’s theme of angels. Comparison proves that this tale consists of the first eight chapters of Drane’s work, “Uriel; or The Chapel of the Holy Angels”. The ninth section suitably refers to Milton’s knowledge of angels:

> ‘I seem to know one of those names,’ said Paxton; ‘does not Milton tell us something about

Uriel, gliding through the even on a sunbeam?

---

26 In 1886, Brett’s three poems are alongside those of Lady Georgiana Fullerton and Fr. Faber; in 1892, Brett’s seven poems are amongst those of Fr. Rawes, Hon. Mrs. Fanny Montgomery, Mother Drane and Fr. Matt Russell; in 1893 Brett provided six poems while the well-known Procter provided nine and Rawes one.

27 A few months after Hayes’ death, the *Annals* recorded the death of ‘Mrs. Mary Brett, the beloved mother of Sr. M. Josephine, Poor Clare, … late of Ireland’, which confirmed the contributor’s surname and her continued association with the *Annals*. Angelica S. Chaffee, "Obituary", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XIX, no. x (1894): 300.


29 The 1883 *Irish Monthly* published Drane’s contribution under "Poems and Miscellaneous Papers" and all were credited to ‘the author of *Songs in the Night*’, published in 1876.

30 "The Clouds Hang Thick O’er Israel’s Camp" and “Thou, Who Hero-Like Hast Striven” in Healey Willan, ed., *St. Basil’s Hymnal: An Extensive Collection of English and Latin Hymns for Church, School and Home*, 36th ed. (New York: J. Fischer & Bro., 1935), 96, 118. Many times publications did not print Mother Drane’s name or initials but rather ‘By the author of *Lady Glastonbury’s Boudoir*’ or ‘By the author of *Songs in the Night*’ or by another of her works; an indication of how widely her books and articles were read.


32 The *Annals’* fifteen articles were examined previously under educational themes.


'He does, indeed', said the chaplain, taking a volume from a bookshelf near him as he spoke. ‘Milton was learned in all the literature of the angels, whether scriptural or rabbinical. Nothing escaped him; and out of the bare interpretation of a name he has given us the magnificent portrait of this glorious angel as

The name whom John saw also in the sun.

For the name is held to signify ‘the light, or fire of God’, and so the great poet has worked up his picture of -

Th’ Archangel Uriel, one of the seven
Who in God’s presence, nearest to His throne,
Stand ready at command, and are His eyes
That run through all the heavens, and down to earth.35

Drane, a Dominican not a Franciscan, produced a Franciscan work, "A Page from the Life of Blessed Angela of Foligno",36 but Hayes chose instead to edit a section from Brother Arnaldo’s book on Blessed Angela of Foligno ‘for the edification of the children of St. Francis’.37

Clergymen

Outstanding Annals’ contributors from among over eighteen clergymen were Fathers Léon de Clary, T. E. Bridgett, Louis G. de Ségur and Francis Drew with poet priests, Henry A. Rawes and William F. Faber. Hayes had the kind of personality, intelligence and character that was admired by male Church leaders and the number of influential ecclesiastics who respected her is impressive.38 Besides Hayes’ dealings with two popes, she also knew to varying degrees numerous high ranking Church officials whose writings had added significance for her and her mission for the Church. These officials included His Eminence Cardinal Parocchi - Vicar of Rome - Cardinals Barnabo, Ledochowski, Manning, Newman, Vaughn and Lavigerie; Bishops

37 Hayes, “Counsels of Perfection by Blessed Angela of Foligno”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XVII, no. v (1892): 154-58. Hayes could have used a French copy but more likely the London 1871 translation of The Book of the Visions and Instructions of Blessed Angela of Foligno - ‘as taken down from her own lips by Brother Arnold of the Friars Minor’. Copy held in the MFIC archives, Rome.
38 This kind of male helpfulness and appreciation from Church authorities toward religious foundresses was not always the case. The history of many women’s congregations involved a power struggle for clerical male dominance over women religious; often exacerbated by an unclear canonical situation.
Murdoch, Smith, Dupanloup, Seidenbush, Grace, Ireland, Ullathorne, Gross, and other high profile clergy. On appropriate occasions Hayes included encyclicals and addresses of two popes, papal Briefs and letters of cardinals as contributions to her *Annals.*\(^{39}\) Evidence confirms that the editor did things her own way and with a definite purpose; no stranger to the Vatican, Hayes printed papal communications very speedily after their official announcement and often waved aside part of a serial story to give preference to the ‘voice of Rome’. Examples of this include an 1886 papal encyclical and the pope’s letter to Bishop Ireland and the American Catholic Total Abstinence Union.\(^{40}\) Also, after printing “The Apostolate of the Press” serial, Hayes next published an extract from Leo XIII’s encyclical address on the Catholic Press to Italian archbishops and bishops.\(^{41}\)

Among those who heeded the pope’s words and placed ‘the salvation of souls and the integrity of the Cause’ before their own peace and personal interests were two contemporary French Fathers called Léon.\(^{42}\) In order to better carry out her mission, Hayes had turned to the Franciscan Léon de Clary’s *Aureole Seraphique* (Paris, 1882) for stories of lesser-known Franciscan saints. The Taunton Franciscan Sisters translated de Clary’s work\(^{43}\) which Hayes simply called *Franciscan Saints*,\(^{44}\) and she was quick to diffuse these lesser-known Franciscan saints’ stories once she had de Clary’s four volumes.\(^{45}\) While Hayes was capable of translating the original source herself, her earlier contact with the Taunton Franciscans,\(^{46}\) together with an examination of the text and the dates of de Clary’s editions, indicate that the editor used the Taunton translations.

---

\(^{39}\) Her use differed from the way some Catholic journals handled like material, e.g., the contemporary *Irish Ecclesiastical Record* chose to include such Church items in an appendix.


\(^{41}\) Leo XIII, "The Catholic Press", 189-91.

\(^{42}\) The surname de Clary was rarely used for Fr. Léon who was for a time the provincial leader of the French Observant Friars Minor. The second well-known writer was Abbe Léon Monnier.

\(^{43}\) Léon de Clary, *Lives of the Saints and Blessed of the Three Orders of Saint Francis*, trans. Taunton Franciscan Sisters, 4 vols., vol 1 (Taunton, Somerset: Taunton Franciscan Convent, 1885). It was followed in 1886 by volume 2 and 3; in 1887 volume 4. Hayes own short title for de Clary’s work is *Franciscan Saints*.

\(^{44}\) The 1894 issues with de Clary’s contributions were headed slightly differently, “Saints of the Seraphic Order”.

\(^{45}\) As discussed earlier, the major Franciscan saints’ lives had been already printed in the *Annals* before 1888.

\(^{46}\) Sr. M. Annunciata Roberts, ‘a woman of means’, who had been professed in Glasgow with Hayes, after a short time in Exeter, spent the remainder of her life with the Taunton Franciscan Sisters. de Breffny, *Unless the Seed Die*, 79.
Identification of de Clary’s contribution has been possible mainly because of access to original volumes and comparison of thirty-two articles on nineteen saints shows that Hayes at times published from ‘Franciscan Saints’ directly, although for many issues she edited de Clary’s work in varying degrees. De Clary devoted seventeen pages to his life of St. Jeanne of Valois so the editor, without changing one word, simply spread it over two instalments.

In the “St. Margaret of Cortona” article, when de Clary’s work was initially used, Hayes edited forty-one pages into ten for the Annals. The editor felt free at times to omit scholarly footnotes if they did not serve her purpose and at other times to include and even extend them in her article. In examining how Hayes edited de Clary’s contribution, it is clear that she not only selected content carefully but also was very particular about grammatical correctness. This is evident in the story of Blessed Jeanne Marie de Maille where Hayes basically presents de Clary’s pages in four Annals’ articles. Whether Hayes edited material or not, from the May 1890 article on “Blessed Crispin of Viterbo” to “Blessed Margaret Colonna, Virgin” in December 1891, the Annals’ index acknowledges the Franciscan Saints as the source.

Hayes had her own way of selecting which lives of Franciscan saints were to be disseminated. It is certainly not de Clary’s volume by volume presentation, but a selection according to her distinct thematic needs. One of these was to provide a particular saint’s story during the month in which a saint’s feast-day was celebrated.

47 Hayes’ own copies are in the MFIC archives, Rome.
50 For example, the footnote 8 reference to ‘Annals Minorum, vol XX, p. 262’ given by de Clary, Franciscan Saints, 189.
51 An example, Hayes was editing in Rome; de Clary referred to Rome so the editor provided more details. Hayes, "Blessed Nicholas Factor”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XIII, no. xii (1888): 373-80. de Clary, Franciscan Saints, 178-91.
52 Hayes‘ former teaching skills as well as her command of language are revealed in her ability to reshape a story without disturbing the original flow.
55 Comparison of Annals’ articles with de Clary’s volumes indicate that Hayes had the four volumes in 1888 and that her selection jumped from volume one to four to one to two and so on.
56 An example of matching a feast-day to a month’s issue was that of Blessed Helena Enselmini on 6th November. Hayes, "Blessed Helena Enselmini", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XIII, no. xi (1888): 349-
The author’s stories were often sub-headed with facts about birth, death or celebratory events and Hayes often converted this data into a more interesting historical introduction. In de Clary’s fourth volume, he wrote “Historical Sketch of the Order of Saint Francis” in which he explains the three Orders of St. Francis with their numerous branches but Hayes decided not to use it and instead she provided her readers with a similar history derived from other Franciscan literature.

As a committed Franciscan, not seeking worldly fame or fortune, Léon de Clary would not have been concerned how Hayes revamped his work, for like her, his main concern was the ‘diffusion of good books’ for the extension of God’s reign. Hayes, so often ahead of her times, was diffusing de Clary’s stories of Franciscan Saints to English readers well before the Quaracchi Franciscan press made them available in Italy. The editor, always sensitive to her general readers as well as the Franciscans, planned that in each 1894 issue over consecutive months a saint’s story was taken from a non-Franciscan source.

Redemptorist priest contributor, Thomas E. Bridgett (1829-99), was another English convert committed to the apostolate of the pen. He successfully entered the arena of religious publications with *In Spirit and in Truth* (1867) which became famous in later editions as *The Ritual of the New Testament: An essay on the principles and origin of Catholic ritual*. In order to enrich her Marian devotion articles, Hayes

---

50. The editor’s resource was Léon de Clary, *Lives of the Saints and Blessed of the Three Orders of Saint Francis*, 36-38.
52. De Clary’s fourth volume indicates that a fifth was planned on the lives of all the Franciscans who suffered for the Faith in England from 1534-1729. On this topic Mrs. Hope’s *Franciscan Martyrs in England* (1878) and Mary Jean Stone’s *Faithful Unto Death* (1892) were available but Hayes selected yet other resources for her articles on the English Franciscan Martyrs.
53. The Italian translations of *Aureola Serafica* were not published until 1898 and 1900. The *Irish Ecclesiastical Record* praised volume one, printed a segment of Manning’s introduction in it and claimed it was ‘the best panegyric of the Third Order, the lives of its Saints.’ A. Murphy, “Notices of Books: *Lives of the Saints and Blessed of the Three Orders of Saint Francis*”, *The Irish Ecclesiastical Record* VII, no. n.g. (1886): 382-83.
54. The acknowledged source, translated from French and used also in 1892-93, was *Saints and Servants of God of the Nineteenth Century*, date and place unknown.
55. Bridgett’s books include *Our Lady's Dowry* (1875), *Life of Blessed John Fisher* (1888) and *Life of Blessed Thomas More* (1891). These and more are available in the Franciscan Sisters’ library, Braintree, Essex.
56. Bridgett’s book on Catholic Ritual attracted favourable ‘opinions of the press’; *Church News* wrote. ‘If we were to quote all the especially pregnant passages of this most masterly summary of Christian argument, we should, literally speaking, have to reproduce five-sixths of the book’. T. E. Bridgett, ed., *Our Lady's Dowry; or How England Gained and Lost That Title* (London: Burns and Oates, 1875), 487. High praise also came from the *Tablet, English Churchman, Freeman, Month, Watchman and Wesleyan Advertiser, Literary World, Brownson's Quarterly Review, Christian Observer and Church Times*. Bridgett, ed., *Our Lady's Dowry*, 487.
turned to Bridgett’s popular *Our Lady’s Dowry, or How England gained and lost that Title* which illustrated from history and literature, medieval England’s devotion to Mary. Bridgett claimed ‘that in the fourteenth century England was commonly called, throughout Europe, Our Lady’s Dowry’.63

Hayes helped in the restoration of English Marian devotion. At first the editor published a serial, “The Holy House of Loretto” which focused on Walsingham.64 Initially Hayes did not indicate her source and, without the text’s availability, identification of this source and two others would have been impossible. The following year the source was revealed as Bridgett’s work when Hayes edited two more Marian articles.65 How Hayes edited these articles reveals much about the minds of editor and author. Hayes’ selections from Bridgett’s text show her to be painstaking in her choices and indicate that she copied or edited only passages with which she fully agreed and genuinely wanted for her readers. Bridgett divided his book into three parts, one containing doctrine written by ‘native writers’ that was current in earlier centuries, and the second containing illustrations of the various methods by which English forefathers showed their love and veneration for God’s Mother. Thirdly, he asked, ‘How did their Lady lose her English Dowry?’ then answered it by tracing a phase in Reformation history.66 Hayes accentuated Bridgett’s writings on English and Irish Franciscan writers who defended Mary’s Immaculate Conception.67

In the search to discover what further guided Hayes’ selections, three modes of her use of selection and adaptation emerged. In the article, “Our Lady Invoked at

---

63 Bridgett, ed., *Our Lady’s Dowry*, 1. “The origin of this title of honour, conferred by popular assent as much as by royal command had been lost over the centuries, yet in the Middle Ages official documents frequently referred to England as “Our Lady’s Dowry”’. *The Story of Catholic England*, 47.

64 Hayes, “The Holy House of Loretto”, *The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* X, no. iii, v, vi (1885): 89-95, 155-59, 169-70. Hayes was familiar with Our Lady’s English shrines, the most famous being Walsingham; others included Aylesford and Buckfast Abbey. Such shrines altogether were estimated to number thousands before the Reformation. In 1850, when Hayes joined the Wantage Community of Saint Mary the Virgin, only 250 ‘Lady Chapels’ remained in England and Wales.


66 The *Franciscan Annals* praised this work of Bridgett, which Hayes had recognised years earlier, when he preached at the 1893 re-dedication of England to the Mother of God at London’s Oratory. "The Dowry of Mary", *The Franciscan Annals and Tertiary Record* XVII, no. 199 (1893): 221.

67 For example, Alexander of Hales and others mentioned in the *Collectanea Anglo-Minoritica* and in Wadding’s famous *Annales Minorum*. Bridgett, ed., *Our Lady's Dowry*, 24-25.
Death which was based on Bridgett’s chapter thirteen by the same title, Hayes selected only the first four of his twenty-two pages and she deleted his footnotes. In the same year, Hayes’ Annals had a four-page article called “Our Immaculate Mother’s Joys”. The sixteen pages of Bridgett’s third chapter were entitled “Our Lady’s Joys” but only the content of the first two and last two pages of the original chapter were included. Hayes changed the original heading to another encapsulating two traditional Franciscan devotions, namely the Immaculate Conception and the Joys of Mary. Scholarly references were omitted yet key names, like Saint Peter of Blois and St. Anselm, were retained in her article. In keeping with the Annals’ Franciscan direction, Bridgett’s illustration of humility was included through reference to ‘the first celebration of the Christmas crib by Saint Francis in Greccio’. In the 1887 issue, the title of Bridgett’s chapter six was used, “Our Lady’s Glory”, the editor skipped over the first eight pages of the original, then used four pages which she rearranged, omitted a few Latin words, then rounded it off with the omission of Bridgett’s next two pages. The three patterns indicate that the editor accomplished her task with a clear sense of purpose and confidence in her own ability.

Bridgett’s praise of Miss Adelaide Procter’s ‘purified imagination’ confirmed the inclusion by Hayes of this poet’s verse in the Annals. Hayes, known for her love of reading and poetry, omitted printing Bridgett’s Marian quotation from Wordsworth’s version of Chaucer’s prioress who said:

‘Lady, thy goodness, thy magnificence, 
Thy virtue, and thy great humility, 
Surpass all science and all utterance; 
For sometimes, Lady, ere men pray to thee, 
Thou go’st before in thy benignity, 
The light to us vouchsafing of thy prayer, 
To be our guide unto the Son so dear.’

---

68 Hayes, "Our Lady Invoked at Death", 106-09. 
69 Bridgett, ed., Our Lady's Dowry, 368-71. 
70 Hayes, "Our Immaculate Mother's Joys", 355-58. 
71 Bridgett, ed., Our Lady's Dowry, 356. 
72 Ibid., 102-15. 
74 Bridgett, ed., Our Lady's Dowry, 7, f'n 6.
In *Our Lady’s Dowry* this apostle of the pen also wrote against the anti-Catholic writer, Hallam, and offered a contradiction to Mrs. Jameson. The *Franciscan Annals*’ editor, like Hayes but later, appreciated Bridgett’s work and published his “Merit of Martyrdom”. Burns and Oates, at the conclusion of *Our Lady’s Dowry*, advertised Bridgett’s *Infamous Publications: An Answer to Mr. Lecky and Mr. Fitzgibbon*, which further serves to show that Bridgett’s works were intended for the apostolate for the ‘diffusion of good books’, to which Hayes also was committed.

Another clerical writer was Mgr. Louis Gaston de Ségur (1820-81), prelate, French apologist and Franciscan Tertiary. Hayes recognised Mgr. de Ségur’s Franciscan and other literary works at the beginning of her editorial career while in subsequent years the Italian *Franciscan Annals* confirmed him as one of their four most important contributors. Much was written about Mgr. de Ségur because of his personality; he was constantly quoted in the Italian *Franciscan Annals* as an undisputed authority on Third Order Franciscan spirituality.

Before Hayes commenced a translation on Gaston de Ségur’s life, she wrote an article explaining the importance of the young Gaston de Ségur’s priestly work. He was a leader in the ‘Christianising of the teeming world of the young artizan life of Paris’, and in the rescuing of youth and workers from evil and ‘the socialists of the day’. The translation was ‘From the French’, *Mgr. de Ségur - Souvenirs et récits d’un frère*, written by Gaston de Ségur’s brother, Marquis de Ségur, and it was presented by Hayes in a fourteen-part serial. The translation, with little editorials by Hayes, began:

---

75 Ibid., 19.
76 Ibid., 393.
77 Ibid., 102. The author refers to Mrs. Anna Brownell M. Jameson who claimed that the title, Our Lady’s Dowry, first became appropriated to Mary in medieval times.
80 Mgr. de Ségur became blind in his thirties but his affliction did not prevent increased writings and publications.
81 Besides the French Mgr. de Ségur the other three major contributors were Italians, Timothy of Brescia, Venanzio of Lagosanto and Rocco Zagari.
82 Finauro, "Annali Francescani", 64-65.
Few names in our time have been more honoured among Catholics than that of Mgr. de Segur, the ‘blind saint’; and his brother, the Marquis de Segur, has earned the gratitude of all those who have penetrated more deeply into the sanctuary of that holy life than would have been possible except by the guidance of the loving and skilful hand which has penned the deeply interesting Souvenirs d’un frère.  

Mgr. de Ségur wrote for the people rather than for learned scholars and his spirited ascetical works had a popular style that aimed above all to spread the true principles of Catholic spirituality. There has been previous discussion in this thesis of Mgr. de Ségur’s literary ability, his contribution (through Hayes’ translation) of the six-part Annals’ serial on “The Third Order of St. Francis” and Hayes’ further 1883 editing of this translation. The Annals’ editor in her first volume also included a translation of Mgr. de Ségur’s teaching on indulgences.

Analysis of the religious poetry in Hayes’ Annals shows that, from among six contemporary priest contributors, Henry A. Rawes and William F. Faber made the highest contribution. There were a number of personal and professional reasons related to Hayes’ choice. Hayes knew Rawes, an original member of Manning’s Oblates of St. Charles at Bayswater. Qualified with an M.A. and D.D., Rawes produced numerous poems and hymns, religious books and translations, with his best work preserved in Foregleams of the Desired: Sacred Verses, Hymns, and

86 For example, “Holy Communion” or “Popular objections against the Encyclical” noted in Irish Ecclesiastical Review, October 1864-September 1865, 197, 397.
87 The editor’s Bayswater Franciscan Sisters read two of Gaston de Ségu r’s books in French, also English versions on St. Francis and St. Clare. MFIC library, Braintree, Essex. Mgr. de Ségur’s works were disseminated widely and many were translated into different languages.
90 The six were Henry A. Rawes, William F. Faber, Edward Caswall, Francis Stanfield, Matt Russell and Henry N. Oxenham. A notable absence among these contemporary clerical poets’ names is that of Cardinal Newman yet from his circle of poet friends the editor included Fr. Faber, Emily Bowles, Aubrey de Vere and Lady Georgiana Fullerton.
91 It was common knowledge that Rawes had been an Anglican minister, converted in 1856, and was ordained the next year. He was directed by Manning to be pastoral leader in the poor district of Notting Hill. Ward, The Life & Times of Cardinal Wiseman, 354.
Hayes published at least eleven of Rawes’ poems from 1883 to 1893. Characteristic strains of Rawes’ deep devotion are heard in this reflection on Isaiah, IX, 3:

What the rapture of Thy presence,
What its blessedness may be,
In Thy Father and Thy Spirit
Evermore to gaze on Thee:
Thought of man can never fathom,
Tongue of man can never tell,
But thine Angels and Thy Ransomed,
Rapt, adoring, know it well.

This same poem was selected for publication a year later by Orby Shipley in his *Annus Sanctus*. Shipley acknowledged his gratitude for numerous contributions to editors of Catholic journals, and it is likely that Hayes borrowed some poetry from the same sources. When Hayes needed a poem for a May number, May being traditionally Mary’s month, she chose Rawes’ work on “The Month of Mary” with its homely simplicity of language and awareness of nature’s beauty, as exemplified in:

The fertile fields, the freshness of the spring,
The song of birds, the voiceless songs of flowers,
Sunshine and sprinkling showers,
Are Nature’s gifts at Mary’s feet, and bring
Thoughts of a lovelier Eden and the day
Which passeth not away.

---

92 *Foregleams of the Desired*, published in London by Burns and Oates, was by 1881 into its 3rd edition; this edition was in Hayes’ possession. MFIC archives, Rome.

93 As indicated previously, more of Rawes’ poems may have been included but further identification is either impossible or fraught with difficulties.


95 Shipley, ed., *Annus Sanctus*, 35. Shipley’s *Annus Sanctus* provides the names of 40 contributors, 16 of whom are to be found in Hayes’ *Annals*; he used a symbol or initials for 7 contributors, 2 of which Hayes also used.

96 Ibid., 20.

Hayes selected Rawes' poetic hymns, often marked with a strain of mysticism, and appears to have been in agreement with Manning who believed that the use of English hymns was one of the most effectual means of spreading and keeping alive the devotion of the faithful. In Rawes, Hayes had chosen a contributor whose prayer was like hers:

May all who read these lines stand one day, glorified in the Beloved, before the Throne of God, where there is the beauty of peace, and see Jesus, ‘the DESIRED,’ in the house of the glory of the Lord.

Faber (1814-63), renowned preacher and spiritual writer, was also an outstanding hymn writer and, in selecting his verses for the *Annals*, Hayes showed both wisdom and foresight as his verses attained leading success in shaping the spirituality of countless Catholics for a century. However, Faber’s verses in the *Annals* were lengthy, so while it is possible to find the same Faber poem shortened in hymnology, the latter was not the source of Hayes’ selection. Hayes probably took Faber’s verses from his own volume of poems, or from Catholic periodicals.

In her own desire to reach out spiritually to others through the *Annals*, Hayes selected a Faber poem that in part expressed this desire in “The Infant Jesus”:

Art Thou, weak Babe! My very God? Oh I must love Thee then,
Love Thee, and yearn to spread Thy love among forgetful men.

---

99 Ibid., 24. Hayes’ own final words in life were, ‘I desire my God’. Chaffee, "Memories", 59.
100 To this day English-speaking Catholics over fifty years of age can recall Faber’s hymns, e.g., “Jesus My Lord, My God, My All”, “Faith of Our Fathers”, “Mother of Mercy, Day by Day” or “Hail, Glorious Saint Patrick”. The highly popular St. Basil’s Hymnal contained 35 of Faber’s verses accompanied by tunes ranging from Hadyn to traditional melodies. Willan, ed., *St. Basil's Hymnal*.
101 Nine extant poems, definitely by Faber, were approximately two pages in length.
102 An example of this was the *Annals*’ poem “The Assumption” with ten stanzas which can be found in hymnology as “Sing, sing, ye Angel Bands” with six verses. Frederick W. Faber, "The Assumption", *The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* X, no. viii (1885): 240-41. Willan, ed., *St. Basil's Hymnal*, 66.
Evidence shows that Faber’s poetry was published in the *Annals* between 1884-88; “Desire for God” is an example of Faber’s personal approach to a personal loving God, as in the lines:

> For the heart only dwells, truly dwells with its treasure,  
> And the languor of love captive hearts can unfetter;  
> And they who love God cannot love Him by measure,  
> For their love is but hunger to love Him still better.  

Faber had a special devotion to the ‘Precious Blood of Christ’, reflected not only in his establishment of a Confraternity by this title and in his work of spiritual reflection, *The Precious Blood* (1860), but also in his poem chosen by Hayes for the *Annals*. “Hail Precious Blood” was a translation from Italian. Faber, known for his accurate theological doctrine, conveys this in “Forgiveness of Injuries” as in the lines:

> Yes! Saved and saints we all will be;  
> All of us, Lord! Will come to Thee;  
> Dear heaven! The work for thee is done, -  
> How easily, how sweetly won!  
> Yes! Thou art ours, eternal heaven!  
> For we forgave, and are forgiven.

Hayes opted for Faber’s doctrinally sound, subjective and personal verses over a wide choice of vigorous dogmatic verses, many in Latin, by another Oratorian, Edward Caswell. Caswell’s verse became known through his hymns and Hayes included his “Hymn for the Ascension”. Hayes opted not to include Caswell’s

---

110 Among Caswell’s principal works was his *Lyra Catholica*, a translation of all of the Breviary and Missal hymns with some others; it was reprinted in 1884 but not selected by Hayes for the *Annals*.  
translation of the famous “Stabat Mater Speciosa” attributed to the Franciscan poet, Jacopone da Todi, and published in the contemporary Franciscan Annals. Just as Rawes, Faber and Caswall did not exhaust the impressive list of well-known nineteenth-century clerical poets, neither did they in the Annals, for Hayes also included the verses of Matt Russell, Francis Stanfield and Henry Oxenham yet omitted John H. Newman and Henry Ryder. Russell’s lines were frequently full of thanks to God for life’s simple things and reminded the reader that ‘In each moment my heart can discover a Fatherly Hand on my head’. The editor selected these poets’ verses mainly to highlight a Church feast - Christmas, Easter or New Year - and to promote a special devotion to the Sacred Heart, the Crib or the Precious Blood.

113 Matt Russell, brother of Lord Russell, was Jesuit longstanding editor of the Irish Monthly; during this time he accepted, like Hayes, contributions from de Vere, Bridgett, Drane, Fullerton and Mulholland. Francis Stanfield is best remembered for his hymns e.g., “O Sacred Heart! Our Home” and “Sweet Sacrament Divine”. Willan, ed., St. Basil’s Hymnal, 26, 38. Henry N. Oxenham (1829-88) educated at Harrow and Oxford was an English controversialist and poet who moved in the Manning, Lockhart, Pusey and Dollinger circle, published a number of works and wrote for The Rambler and The Saturday Review.
114 Shipley’s selection of J. H. Newman’s verses provides some insight into this omission; many he chose were Latin hymns from the Sacred Offices, not suitable for the Annals’ purpose. Henry Ryder was a Birmingham Oratorian.
Chapter 8

The Editor and More Contributors – Franciscan Tertiaries and other Laity

Third Order Secular Franciscans

Hayes' inclusion of contemporary women’s prose and poetry was contrary to the general pattern in Victorian journals where, though a significant number of women were journalists and writers, their contributions were far outweighed by male contributors.¹ The Annals valued women’s contributions and the names of three Tertiaries, Hon. Mrs. Fanny Montgomery,² Lady Georgiana Fullerton and Lady Herbert of Lea grace its pages. Hon. Mrs. F. Montgomery’s major prose contributions spread from volume one to seventeen, the year before her death. Her Annals’ obituary contains the following:

The general reader is doubtless acquainted with one or more of her interesting works of fiction My own Familiar Friend, The Bucklyn Shaig, etc. It seems hardly credible that the same hand should have also given us such proof of deep study in dogmatic theology as is afforded by her really valuable works The Divine Sequence, The Eternal Years and The Divine Ideal of which the late Archbishop Porter said ‘that they would survive the bulk of the literature of the century.’ Perhaps no other woman has more ably mastered subjects with which few men, even, outside the priesthood, have attempted to grapple.³

In the Annals’ volume one, Hayes acknowledges three selections from Montgomery’s The Divine Sequence, publishing them to encourage readers to believe that God is

¹ Lloyd Davis, "Journalism and Victorian Fiction", in Victorian Journalism: Exotic and Domestic, ed. Barbara Garlick and Margaret Harris (St. Lucia, Brisbane: Queensland University Press, 1998), 201.
² The Hon. Mrs. F. Montgomery, eldest daughter of the 1st Lord Leconfield, had in 1842 married Alfred Montgomery by whom she had two daughters, Mrs. Finch of Burley-on-the Hill and the Marchioness of Queensberry, Mrs. Douglas. When the daughters married, their mother, who previously was separated from their father when she embraced Catholicism, was free to write, travel and assist church/charitable groups. Besides her outstanding generosity to Hayes, she supported the Crawley Franciscan Capuchins who on her death and at her request buried her, ‘vested in the Franciscan Tertiary habit’, in their church. Mrs. R. Vansittart, “In Memoriam”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XVIII, no. iv (1893).
³ Ibid.: 122. The Bucklyn Shaig was reviewed in the Athenaeum by Geraldine E. Jewsbury on 28 October 1865. Athenaeum Index: Contributor Record, City University, http://www.soi.city.ac.uk/~asp/v2/contributors/contributorfiles/JEWSBURY, GeraldineEn…; accessed 7 February 2004. English-born George Porter (1825-89) was Archbishop of Bombay; previously he had lived and ministered among the literary Mayfair Jesuits of Farm Street and the many converts known to Mont-
revealed through Mary and the Church. In the same volume, on Saints and Church infallibility, another three articles were introduced, ‘By author of The Divine Sequence’, suggesting just how well Montgomery’s book was known and respected in Catholic circles. Montgomery’s deep study in theology is evident in a serial of three Annals’ instalments published under the Marian title so much associated with Hayes’ journal, “Mary Immaculate, Queen of the Angels”. Both editor and author’s wish to spread devotion to Mary, the Mother of God, was evidenced also in the prose rendering of “The Magnificat”. Hayes, in her desire to further the knowledge of God’s love and to draw a response in love, published articles from Montgomery that reflected Franciscan devotional life. Examples of this include articles on God’s love, love of the Sacred Heart of Jesus, the Eucharistic presence of love and love’s proof in the Stations of the Cross.

Fr. Faber, a favourite of Hayes as we have seen for providing short reflective passages in the Annals and well-known to Catholic readers because of his popular devotional books, provided the words of inspiration for one of Montgomery’s articles which began:

‘I would fain persuade some one - one would be good enough - to love God a little more for His own dear sake.’ – Faber’s All for Jesus.

Would to God, my dear reader, that one might be you!

It is such a happy thing to love God! It is riches in poverty, health in sickness, life in death.

---

Just look into your own heart, and see if you cannot make room somewhere, for a little more love of God. If one little spark of love once gets in, it will soon set all your heart in a glow, and burn out the bad, or the unhappy thoughts which so often trouble you. And, oh! how can you help loving God? Why, He is always loving you! And all He has ever done in this great wide universe of His Creation, He has done to show you His love. The earth is full of God’s love …

Montgomery and Hayes were very familiar with Faber’s writings and like him they wanted to share their spirituality, optimism and devotion with ordinary Christians. Montgomery displays this unison in spirituality, friendship with God and with each other, in her article on the Eucharist. The author explains Fr. Herman Cohen’s fervour in distributing the Eucharist to French soldiers during the Franco-Prussian war and then requests the Annals’ readers to allow her to share a personal experience. Montgomery provides a unique insight into her ministry with Fr. Cohen and Hayes at Spandau, near Berlin, when they nursed sick and dying French prisoners of war. Fr. Cohen planned to write music for Montgomery’s concluding Eucharistic poem but died while ministering in Spandau.

This author’s ability to weave some of her life experiences into her writings is evident in another contribution. Montgomery’s “My Aunt’s Journal” is an amazing article constructed around a character named Emm, Aunt Catherine’s desire to assist him, and her waiting for letters from him. It is a beautiful piece of literature that contains poetic descriptions of the Italian countryside, striking imagery, deep philosophical insights, and revelations of the author’s ‘three lives’ which are attributed in the story

---

9 Montgomery, ”The Love of God”, 152. Newman also admired Faber’s All for Jesus (1853) - the first of his six major books on spirituality, saying, ‘The name of his first book is like a note in music; in all his writings, in all his teachings, there is the same strain throughout - All for Jesus’. Bowden, The Life and Letters of Frederick William Faber, D.D., 466.

10 Shaw, Companion to the Diary, 69-70.

11 Montgomery, ”Corpus Christi, the Feast of the Most Blessed Sacrament”, 191. Cohen, a German Carmelite convert from Judaism, was an accomplished musician and author of Thabor (1870) - five collections of sacred songs with accompaniment - ministered to London Catholics in the early 1860s. He was well known by Wiseman and Manning; Londoners, with Hayes and Montgomery, read the headline news about his conversion. Zimmerman, Hermann Cohen, accessed. In biographical works on Hayes, Montgomery and Hayes’ presence in Spandau was unknown; Berlin yes, but not Spandau. This is another example of how the Annals revealed new facts about Hayes.

12 Montgomery, ”Corpus Christi, the Feast of the Most Blessed Sacrament”, 191.

to Aunt Catherine. The story supposedly was written by Aunt Catherine’s nephew who travelled to her Naples home after her death and through the reading of a diary-type manuscript learnt of his aunt’s long concern for Emm - the other beneficiary of her will. This story, published by *The Month* in September of 1883 and by Hayes with the exception of four pages in the following three months, reveals the riches of Montgomery’s mind and heart. It also indicates her philosophy of life, understanding of people and especially her faith in a loving God who answered Aunt Catherine and others’ prayers. The author’s intention is clear at the conclusion of part one:

> What bliss will it not be in Heaven to recognise the souls our prayers benefited while on earth. And to see upon them the refulgence of those graces, the gift of which to them God exacted through us in those (sic) of intercession.

In “My Aunt’s Journal” there is also a line, ‘What we have once touched sticks to us’, expanded by Montgomery in other contributions that exhibit a psycho-religious approach in dealing with children: “Early Influences”, “Improvement of Character” and “Good Impulses and Moral Influence”. No reference was found in Hayes’ *Annals* to Montgomery’s book, *Misunderstood*, yet it, like these *Annals* contributions, shows the author’s deep understanding of and love for children. Montgomery’s articles helped to raise awareness of parental influence on young children: ‘lessons which linger on the heart of a full-grown man long after the lips that pronounced them are silenced for ever’. The editor’s teaching background and Catholic belief that ‘grace builds on nature’ found Hayes including Montgomery’s articles on early education reminding adults of children’s need for moral and religious training. These articles, forerunners

---

14 The ‘three lives’ refers to life in Italy, America and England. The editor was fully aware of the accurate description of Belle Prairie: ‘My second life lay in the far West, on the banks of the Mississippi, in a large quaint convent, built chiefly of wood, and with a church attached to it, a farm-yard close by, a well-stocked garden, many flowers for the altar, and … women who are the friends, the teachers, and the guides of all the country round. … children of St. Francis. … The large-hearted Mother Superior, the person in the world who best knows me, the person in the world I best love …’ *Ibid.*: 373-74.

15 Emm, so the reader learns in the final paragraph, was also known as Captain C. and later Fr. Ambrose of the Franciscan Order.

16 Montgomery, ”The Month”, 107-28. A. Montgomery, the initial for Alfred - her ex-husband’s name - is the author’s signature in *The Month* but in the *Annals* the initial F. for Fanny (Florence) is mostly used. The story is so convincing that this researcher at first thought that Fanny Montgomery’s ‘mysterious’ nephew wrote it about her.


of today’s theories on child psychology and adult religious education, contribute in no small measure to the religious and educative nature of Hayes’ *Annals*.

Montgomery’s ability to write on a broad range of religious topics is evidenced again in her historically based contribution, “Letter of Saint Hilary to his Daughter”, which introduces the reader to ‘A Bourbon Princess in Hindustan’. Religious fervour and Franciscanism are poured out in Montgomery’s seven-part story of Blessed Angelina Marsciano, foundress of the Third Order Regular of St. Francis, whose associated Franciscan membership Montgomery cherished. Of Montgomery’s single longest running contribution, “Clare; or, The Child of Our Lady of the Angels”, twenty-four instalments have survived, though some are no longer extant. Appearing in volumes one to four, the tale represents a children’s reading genre; the author with her understanding of young readers also usually presents in small segments. The tale’s main character, Clare, not St. Clare, was a seventeen year old living with her family in a plantation mansion by the sea on a tropical West Indies’ Island. The story resonates with the vibrancy of youth. Christian virtues and values are presented, for example, ‘But there is a gleam of light behind every cross, and strength proportioned to its weight’. The author’s ability to write a lively narrative is demonstrated in the teenagers’ excitement over the arrival of a priest-relative who would share mission stories and Eucharist with them:

In one instant the joyful cry arose from each one of the little party, “Father Bernard! dear Father Bernard is come to see us!” “How glad Aunt Gertrude will be!” exclaimed Clare. “And what fun we shall have!” cried Charlie: “no more dull time! We will make him talk and tell stories all day long.”

---

23 For young readers the large heading was meant to attract their attention - ‘To Our YOUNG ASSOCIATES of Our Lady of the Angels’.
24 Montgomery, "Clare - a Tale", 225.
25 Ibid., no. i: 32. (Punctuation for conversation left as in original).
Another example of this genre, ‘to our young Associates of Our Lady of the Angels’, is sub-headed “Blessed Imelda, Patroness of First Communicants” but the genre disappears in the early 1880s. A final example of Montgomery’s flexible contributions is a pilgrimage story, “La Sainte Baume, St. Mary Magdalene’s Retreat”. The evidence is compelling: Hayes’ evangelising mission was strengthened and made more fruitful because of Montgomery’s ‘sixteen years of constant contributions both in prose and poetry’ to the *Annals*.

When Hayes wanted to enrich her *Annals* with devotional poetry she turned again to her friend and ‘singularly gifted’ writer, Fanny Montgomery. A contemporary view of her important contribution, related in her obituary, was written by Mrs. R. Vansittart and published by Hayes:

> Mrs. Montgomery was a fervent Tertiary of S. Francis, a most devoted Benefactress of the Association of S. Anthony, and for 16 years a constant contributor both in prose and poetry to the *ANNALS OF OUR LADY OF THE ANGELS.*

So Montgomery stood out as the ‘constant contributor’ while other Tertiaries, including Lady Georgiana Fullerton and J. A. Jackman, each contributed only a few extant poems, but there may have been more. These committed Tertiaries brought deep spiritual insights and devotional reflection to the *Annals*. Franciscan devotions, associated with Montgomery’s Franciscan Tertiary membership, are often evident in her verse, as found for example in her five 1874 poems. The prayerful final lines

---

26 Montgomery, "Blessed Imelda, Patroness of First Communicants", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* I, no. x (1874): 317-18. Montgomery’s signature was not attached but clues provide evidence of her work.

27 Montgomery, "Pilgrimage to La Sainte Baume", 6-10.

28 Vansittart, "In Memoriam", 122.

29 Some Tertiaries who contributed simply signed their work ‘A Tertiary’ or used only their initials. This abbreviated style of Tertiary authorship was common in other Franciscan journals.

30 These devotions were discussed previously; devotion to Christ’s presence in the Eucharist, to the crib and to Christ’s sufferings and death on the cross.

of “The Manger,” like so much of Montgomery’s devotional poetry, certainly suited Hayes’ religious journal, as seen in the following:

A sinner kneeling at an infant’s cot,
    I call on Thee,
A sinner at the Cross, forget me not,
    But plead for me.
Mother of God! Commend me to thy Son
    As here I bend
And oh! Commend me when my task is done
    And life shall end!  

In December and January numbers, Hayes needed Christmas themes so Montgomery provided, for example, “A Christmas card and the reply”33 and “The Nativity”.34 Devotion to the Holy Name of Jesus was propagated greatly in the fifteenth century by the Franciscans, St. Bernardine of Siena and St. John Capistran, and Montgomery’s poem, “The Holy Name”, encourages the reader in this devotion. This poem shows sensitivity to nature and serves as a reflection on change, as seen in the lines:

No longer wistful, with an anxious gaze,
    Like timid hare, scenting the morning breeze,
And peeping through the covert of tall weeds
    To catch the early dawn: No longer thus
My Soul stands peering thro’ a twilight mist,
    And dreading dangers from receding night
Fears to start forward and salute the day.

Sometimes I marvel at the change, and miss
    The ebb and flow, the dappled light and shade,
The tricks of fancy, and the eager quest
    Of those unquiet and unfruitful days.
I ask why am I changed? And to my lips
    Fresh from my heart, there rushes up one thought,

One Name, so full of awe, so full of love.\textsuperscript{35}

Montgomery strengthens traditional Marian devotion, expressed in English poetry for many centuries,\textsuperscript{36} through “The Statue of Our Lady and the Divine Infant” which commences, ‘Oh sweet combination of Mother and Maid!’\textsuperscript{37} Marian devotion is encouraged in the poem, “The Two Journeys” which begins:

\begin{quote}
Three mighty kings once cros’t \[sic\] the desert wilds,
Their treasures to unfold
At Mary’s feet, and for the holy Child
Myrrh, frankincense and gold.

They trod the way that I again would tread,
The way that leads to God;
Their help shall be a star above my head,
Their aid my staff and rod.

I come to seek thee, Lord! wher’er thou art,
I’ll seek my God! For thee
The gift I bring is my poor life and heart;
Thou gavest the same for me! \textsuperscript{38}
\end{quote}

While Brett’s outnumber Montgomery’s poetic contributions, there is compelling evidence that both these women wrote original poems for the \textit{Annals}.\textsuperscript{39} Some \textit{Annals’} poetry is identical to that in Catholic hymn books, not so Montgomery’s; the richness of her contribution suggests that just as Wordsworth influenced the

\begin{footnotes}
\textsuperscript{35} Montgomery, "The Holy Name", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} VIII, no. iv (1883): 111.
\textsuperscript{36} The earliest vernacular poetry to celebrate Mary is credited to Cynewulf, before the time of Alcuin and of Charlemagne, who wrote glowingly of "the purest woman throughout all the earth" in verses of \textit{The Christ}. Herbert Thurston, \textit{Devotion to the Blessed Virgin Mary}, New Advent - Catholic Encyclopedia, http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/15459a.htm; accessed 5 February 2004.
\textsuperscript{37} Montgomery, "The Statue of Our Lady and the Divine Infant", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} XIV, no. ii (1889): 60. The poem was dated 26 October 1888 and readers were told that the statue was ‘over the Portal of the Duomo of Florence’.
\textsuperscript{38} Montgomery, "The Two Journeys", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} II, no. iii (1875): 470-71.
\textsuperscript{39} This conclusion is based on wide research and the evidence available. The archives at Dublin’s Poor Clare Convent held no records of Brett’s poetry in 2001. Montgomery’s poems could not be found in contemporary religious periodicals, neither \textit{The Month}, \textit{The Messenger of the Sacred Heart}, \textit{The Irish Monthly}, the English \textit{Franciscan Annals}, the \textit{Irish Franciscan Tertiary}, nor \textit{The Irish Ecclesiastical Record}. The work of other \textit{Annals’} contributors was located in these named periodicals.
\end{footnotes}
devotional poetry of John Keble, she was in turn influenced in her youth by Keble, as were many other converts. Every Christian story should end with a Resurrection; Hayes did not overlook Montgomery’s Resurrection poem, the title of which reflects Abraham’s words, ‘Give me a burying place that I may bury my dead out of sight’. The poem concludes:

Give me a grave so deep  
    That they may rest with me;  
For they must lie with my dead heart  
    In healing sleep.  
    Till out of night  
We shall all pass, O risen dead!  
    Into God’s sight.

Montgomery’s high profile contemporary Lady Georgiana Fullerton, a Tertiary since 1856 and distinguished for her prose, contributed only a few poems according to extant records. Hayes included the lovely poem “Sister Clare” which is a long and touching work telling of the Irish famine, the people’s religious faith and the kindness of Sr. Clare who, guided by a child, delivered food to her starving family. The response to the child’s plight reads:

“Enough, my child; come, wipe your eyes!  
    They will not die to-day,  
Nor yet to-morrow. God Forbid!  
    He hears us when we pray.”  
The Nun has ta’en her basket up,  
    Cathleen has led the way,  
To where the fisher’s cottage stands,  
    Within the lonely bay.

---

40 Keble was professor of poetry at Oxford from 1831 to 1841; *The Christian year* (1827), his volume of poems for Sundays and feast days, was a major tool during the Oxford Movement and familiar to converts from Anglicanism.
41 Genesis 23, 4.
Her welcome stores are soon displayed;
A wonder 'tis to see
How patiently the children wait,
All hungry though they be.
“God bless you,” sighs the father; “may
The Heavens be your bed!”
And “Glory be to God on high,”
The mother softly said.44

Also outstanding among Tertiary contributions was Lady Elizabeth Herbert of Lea.45 Known to sign herself M. E. H., it was under these initials that she entered volume one of Hayes’ publication.46 The Christian life of Lady Elizabeth Herbert of Lea47 is reflected in the kind of religious and secular literature she produced - books, articles and translations including numerous biographies and autobiography; all were intended to spread her convert faith and to inspire others.48 Hayes depended on this woman’s significant contribution for twelve years. “The Marshall: or, a good Confession” and “The Brigand Chief: or, the Penitent Son” were presented in the same month of 1875.49

The author’s most significant contribution, “Life of Mary Cherubini Clare of St. Francis”, was serialised by Hayes from May 1878 to March 1880.50 The book, Life of Mary Cherubini Clare of St. Francis, had been written by the Assisi Superior of St.

---

44 Fullerton, "Sister Clare", 333.
45 Mary Elizabeth Ashe A’ Court (1822-1911) moved in the highest early Victorian social circles and married Sidney Herbert, a politician who became Secretary of War.
46 Lady Elizabeth Herbert, "Human Respect or What Will People Say?", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels I, no. ix (1874): 255-63. She is suspected of contributing some articles, signed simply ‘A Teritary’.
47 Lady Herbert shared her husband’s social concerns during the Crimean campaign, walked London’s streets with Miss Stanley looking for nurses to accompany Florence Nightingale, supported Sisters of Mercy and nurses departing for the Crimea yet, in the midst of activity, maintained a prayerful relationship with her God. Sugg, Ever Yours Affly, 230.
48 Lady Herbert’s husband, once an Oriel man, was acquainted with Newman but five years after Sidney Herbert’s death (1861) it was Manning, the couple’s friend, who received her into the Catholic Church. The writer decided to become an apostle of the pen not only to support religion’s cause but also to better finance her seven children.
50 The 1878 Annals’ index shows nine articles; for 1879 only the May index and May text are extant yet one serial part covered pages 153 -157; the first three months of the 1880 index show the final three parts.
Clare’s Convent, then prefaced and translated by Lady Herbert. Hayes, with her special love for Assisi and the Poor Clares there, would have been particularly sensitive to this story and to the fact that the proceeds from the book’s sale assisted the Italian nuns suffering from government persecution. Before this lengthy serial concluded, Hayes in her first 1880 number commenced another serial by Lady Herbert entitled “A Saint in Algeria”. Again in 1882 and 1883 Hayes acknowledged Lady Herbert’s religious contribution of “The Priest of the Eucharist” while the writer’s single articles describe the author’s pilgrimage visits to the holy places. A modern writer listed Lady Herbert among nineteenth-century ‘Nunnish Ladies’, a term created by Newman, and claimed that Fr. Herbert Vaughn, later Cardinal, not only critiqued some of her work but that they both spiritually guided and helped each other. As a Franciscan and an authoress of many years, well-known in Catholic circles in Rome as well as London, Lady Herbert practised the Christian lifestyle she preached through her pen; she was regarded as a great promoter of many charities and worthy causes.

Lay Contributors
The contributions of E. C. Vansittart and Mrs. C. Vansittart, two lay women of deep Christian faith, assisted Hayes to carry out her mission. They accomplished this not so much through devotional or theological articles but through interesting, informative and historical stories. For the general reader, E. C. Vansittart contributed a compassionately written account of her visit to “The Refuge of Anglet”. After quoting Elizabeth Browning’s appropriate words - ‘Guide the poor bird of the snows through the snow-winds above loss’ - this writer introduces the reader to the stark reality of a French Bernardine convent, orphanage and women’s refuge. A clear

51 "Life of Mary Cherubini Clare of St. Francis", The Month and Catholic Review III (XXII), no. xi (cxxv) (1874): 363-64. This book was acknowledged also in the Dublin Review as recorded in Bishop Ireland’s scrapbook. Ireland, John Ireland Papers - Index Book (of Five Reviews) 1863-93.
52 Evidence suggests that Hayes probably knew Sr. Mary Cherubini Clare and the Italian writer as she stayed in Assisi on a number of occasions in the 1860s and 1870s.
53 A Saint in Algeria was published (1883) in book form which suggests Hayes may have had early access to the script or part of it.
54 Some articles are not extant.
56 Sugg, Ever Yours Affly, 225, 28, 30. Lady Herbert remained on friendly terms with Newman and Lady Fullerton and like the latter reflected in her writing a great admiration for the French Sisters of Charity.
57 Based on limited evidence in their work and the story of the Vansittart family who once owned the former Bisham Abbey in Berkshire, these Vansittart women appear to be sisters-in-law. Their names have not been found in contemporary journals.
message on the values of prayer and compassion characterises the article while the author shares her empathy with the abused women. In contrast, set in Germany, is a shorter tale provided by E. C. Vansittart; it is a sensitive account of a poor child and her death at Christmas.\footnote{59}

Another contemporary Catholic life story is set in Rome where E. C. Vansittart had been ‘a regular visitor at this Hospital [children’s Hospital of the Infant Jesus] for several years’. Besides providing descriptive passages about Rome’s beauty and attractions, the writer grapples with the mystery of suffering, especially the pain of disabled children in the care of St. Vincent de Paul’s Charity Sisters. The patience of the little sufferers is tenderly described and the reader’s sensitivity heightened by the story of a blind, deaf and dumb child’s response to the author’s loving touch. While encouraging and suggesting the type of donations that would bring joy to the children, the writer attempts to cope with the mystery of children’s pain in the words:

> We may well look with awe and reverence on what the world calls ‘victims,’ for ‘their Angels do always behold the face’ of our Father in Heaven, and He Who is Love, He Who said: ‘Suffer the little children to come unto Me, and forbid them not,’ must have some good reason in allowing them to suffer thus on earth. There is no bond like the bond of common and mutual suffering, nothing else brings us so near other souls, nothing else breaks down every barrier, and unites in the true sense of the word.\footnote{60}

Mrs. C. Vansittart’s introduction to the 1891 September Annals was through her translation of a “Popular Hymn to the Seraphic Father St. Francis” for which the editor published Galli’s accompanying music.\footnote{61} Mrs. Vansittart provided much entertainment in her major contributions and focused mainly on pilgrimages and English history. As she explained herself, she contributed three original tales about personal pilgrimages to ‘the three Great Sanctuaries of Tuscany’, to Mount Alvernia, Camaldoli and Vallombrosa; each one shows the author’s historical insights and reveals something of the flourishing life of Religious Orders. For Franciscan and general

\footnote{60} E. C. Vansittart, "Hospital of the Infant Jesus at Rome", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} XIV, no. v (1889): 140.
readers, Mrs. Vansittart’s two-part story about the ‘Sanctuary of the Stigmata of St. Francis’ is attractively introduced with an illustration of the event, Dante’s words on the stigmata and a short reflection on God’s mercy and love for St. Francis. It not only describes the landscape, weather conditions and accommodation but also covers centuries of religious and artistic history. Besides dwelling on Franciscan saints associated with Mt. Alvernia, the writer devotes space to explaining the hours of prayer and devotions and includes even the antiphons of Latin hymns.

The second pilgrimage was by horse-drawn carriage to the ancient Cistercian Monastery at Camaldoli whose tenth-century original founder was ‘Romuald, a scion of the family of the Onesti – dukes of Ravenna, mentioned by Boccaccio as one of the noblest families in Italy’. While telling Romuald’s story, of conversion from a life of luxury and recklessness to one of religious commitment, Mrs. Vansittart’s style captures the reader’s imagination through lively historical events and reminiscences of the monks’ skill in carving, illuminating, embroidering and goldsmith’s work. Railway problems introduce the third pilgrimage but finally the pilgrims reach the refreshing atmosphere and towering walls of the Vallombrosa monastery. The history of the old Benedictine church and the monks is unfolded including the story of one of their distinguished lay-students, Galileo, while a portion of the story depicts the country people and their contemporary activities.

Hayes’ publication of Mrs. C. Vansittart’s “Christianity under the Heptarchy: A Page from English History”, can be enjoyed still by the reader who appreciates Bede’s Historia Ecclesiastica or who delights in Canterbury’s old religious stories - especially those of St. Augustine, Queen Bertha and other interesting characters. This major contribution is lengthy but, in brief, Vansittart set out to discredit a ‘dictum’ that had been initiated by a High-Church party, that ‘All that S. Augustine did was to revive the

---

61 The editor ensured that St. Francis featured strongly in the number, as 17 September is the feast of his stigmata. Mrs. C. Vansittart, ”Popular Hymn to the Seraphic Father St. Francis”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XVI, no. ix (1891): 277-80.

62 Mrs. C. Vansittart, ”A Pilgrimage to 'La Vernia' or Mt. Alvernia”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XVII, no. ix, x (1892): 267. (Sanctuary of the Stigmata of St. Francis). Dante was a Franciscan Tertiary.


64 Mrs. C. Vansittart, ”A Pilgrimage to Vallombrosa”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XVIII, no. ii (1893): 45-54.

65 ‘Heptarchy’ meant government by seven rulers; the editor considered the total contribution worthy of 56 pages spread over 7 non-consecutive issues in 1893-4.
Faith in England a little'. The dictum had become an issue because it had been repeated by ‘one of the most advanced Ritualists in a church in S. Devon’. Vansittart, with a wealth of resources by her side, told her readers that she intended ‘to consider the state of things at the time of S. Augustine’s arrival and what he did for the nation amongst whom he found himself’. However, the author was not content to examine just the period around Saint Augustine of Canterbury; her argument went back to ‘Apostolic times’ and the second century in order to show the richness of Catholic history in England, well before the coming of Saint Augustine and his monks from Rome.

The phrase ‘journeyed to Rome’ was repeated regularly not merely to emphasise the physical journey of ‘British saints’ to Rome but also to acknowledge conversions to Catholicity. The reader is whisked through centuries up to the year ‘586, ie. quite nine years before S. Augustine’s advent’. The scene is set for the arrival of the mission of St. Augustine to reconvert England to Christianity, following the Anglo-Saxon invasions that had caused reversion to paganism. The story includes famous people and places that still fascinate modern historians. Vansittart relied partially on Lingard’s *History of England*, crediting him as a ‘very exact Catholic historian’; she supported her argument with numerous quotations from Canon Routledge to Dr. O’Connor, from Gotcelinus’ *History Magazine* to the ‘Dublin Review of January 1890’.

---

67 This had to be Bishop Phillpotts of Exeter, a Camdenian or member of the movement much concerned with ritual solemnities, church structure and decoration. This movement contrasted with the Oxford Tractarians who dwelt upon Catholic doctrines. Owen Chadwick, *The Victorian Church, Part One*, 1829-1859, 2nd ed. (London: SCM Press Ltd., 1972; reprint, paperback, Trowbridge, Wilts.: Redwood Burn Ltd., 1980), 213.
68 Resources named by the author: Bede’s fundamental *Historia Ecclesiastica* (History of the English People), books written by Protestant and Catholic writers, journals and pamphlets, including Protestants Rees, Sharon Turner and Archbishop Parker; writings of Hume, Gildras, Dr. Trench, Rev. A. D. Crake and Green; Smith’s *Ancient Geography* and his *History of England Literature* and a Romily Allen pamphlet.
69 Vansittart, "Christianity under the Heptarchy", 119.
70 Augustine arrived in 595; the Heptarchy’s period was seventh and eighth centuries.
71 Vansittart, "Christianity under the Heptarchy", 234.
72 King Ethelbert and Queen Bertha, Edwin, Lindisfarne, Columba, Queen Ethelburga, Cuthbert, Wilfrid, Hilda, Canterbury, Jarrow and Whitby.
73 A Kent historian claims that Queen Bertha’s father had controlled Tours, her mother had been a friend of Tours’ bishop and that her sister in Tours was a nun; this further confirms Queen Bertha’s connections with the St. Matin of Tours church in Canterbury, the oldest extant Christian place of worship in England. Richard Gameson, *Saint Augustine of Canterbury* (Canterbury, Kent: The Dean & Chapter of Canterbury, 1997), 12.
75 Vansittart, "Christianity under the Heptarchy", 261-63.
The author, sustaining her argument for the important link between the Roman Catholic Church and the English Catholic Church - strengthened as she illustrates by St. Augustine in earlier times - wrote:

St. Aidan was succeeded by Bishop Finan who built there [in York] a church of oak, covered with reeds, which was consecrated by Theodore Archbishop of Canterbury - another proof of the perfect solidarity of faith and communion between Rome, England and Scotland at the time.76

As in so many Annals issues, saints’ names77 proliferate in her article because Vansittart, like Hayes, recognised the influence of old stained-glass windows of Catholic saints in cathedrals and churches that were later places of Anglican worship. Vansittart’s conclusion is bolstered with facts about the ‘British Church’ that built and dedicated so many churches to St. Peter, Rome’s first pope. The author’s final reference is to the contemporary writer, Montalembert, who said of the English Catholic Church that ‘No people on earth have received the Christian faith more directly from the Roman Church and more exclusively from the monks and their agency, than the English.’78 Vansittart concludes with the statement:

Surely what is here written must accomplish its object in every honest mind and prevent any reader ever again attesting without shame that ‘all that S. Augustine did was to revive the Faith in England a little’.79

Hayes’ successor published Mrs. C Vansittart’s final allegorical contribution, thus ending the Vansittarts’ ministry of assisting Hayes’ journal in its ‘dissemination of good books’.80

A third Vansittart, Mrs. R. V. Vansittart, remembered for her “In Memoriam” on the Hon. Mrs. F. Montgomery, contributed at least seven religious poems to three Annals’

76 Ibid., no. xi: 325-26.
78 Vansittart, ”Christianity under the Heptarchy”, 145.
79 Ibid.
R. V. Vansittart’s first contribution was “The Meaning of Life” followed the next year by three poems of substantially equal length and depth, with “The Church of the Martyrs” neatly reverencing past generations of martyrs while encouraging contemporary saints-in-the-making, as in:

Sacred historians no wound record
Yet tongue is impotent to speak
The dolors, piercing like a seven-fold sword
The Heart Immaculate and meek.

Saints will be gather’d from the East and West
Chosen from cottage and from hall;
He is a Saint who always does his best:
His sphere of action may be small.

Lay women of deep Christian faith, Mrs. R. Vansittart, Adelaide Procter, Mary Howitt, Emily Bowles, Lady C. Petre and Rosa Mulholland, contributed to the Annals’ poetry far more than the lay men, Aubrey de Vere, Denis MacCarthy, Richard Williams, Dr. Reeves and John Earle. While Hayes employed the term 'women' in only two Annals’ titles, and did not comment on contemporary Irish women’s rights advocate, Margaret Cusack, she certainly included women’s contributions generously and especially through poetry. The name of Adelaide A. Procter, popular English writer of verse, ranks second after Brett in a tally list of the highest number of contributions by women poets in Hayes’ Annals. Procter, well known for contributions to periodicals, was a regular contributor to women’s publications. With regard to the

---

81 Evidence suggests that Mrs. R. Vansittart basically wrote poetry while the two other Vansittarts contributed prose; she remains something of a mystery.
86 Often only the Annals’ index, not the text, carried the poet’s name and in some years or months even this was absent. Calculations are based on evidence available.
87 E.g., Dickens’ Household Words; All the Year Round, P. J. Lennox, Adelaide Anne Procter, New Advent - Catholic Encyclopedia, http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/12450b.htm; accessed 1 September 2004. Merry

---
query as to where Hayes obtained Procter’s and other verses, a partial answer may be found in Orby Shipley’s edited *Annus Sanctus*. Shipley’s book was in Hayes’ possession after 1884. Acceptable to Hayes were Shipley’s ‘Two main objects, one being devotional and one literary’. Shipley reminded readers that he was greatly indebted ‘to editors of periodicals, specially of the *Month*, the *Messenger* and the *Irish Monthly*’ and since Hayes acknowledged reading the first two, they may well have been her source also.

Hayes included in her December 1890 issue, supported with a delicate Deberny nativity illustration, Procter’s seven verses of the “The Christmas Moon” which commenced:

The Moon that now is shining
   In skies so blue and bright,
Shone ages since on shepherds
   Who watched their flocks by night:
There was no sound upon the earth,
   The azure air was still,
The sheep in quiet clusters lay
   Upon the grassy hill.90

Hayes selected this poem from Procter’s 1862 publication of *Chaplet of Verses*, mostly of a religious nature, which raised finance to support a refuge for homeless women and children under the care of Catherine McAuley’s Sisters of Mercy. In publishing Procter’s poetry Hayes was not only furthering her aim to spread the Christian message, which Procter embodied by her practical support of charities as well as her poetry, but was in tune with the general reader’s approval of the poet.91 Besides the dozen single Procter poetry contributions that Hayes selected over a

---

91 Procter’s 1858-60 poems collected under *Legends and Lyrics* reached a tenth edition by 1866 and her works were published in America and translated into German. It was claimed that by 1877 this sympathetic woman’s poetry, praised by Dickens, was in greater demand in England than those of any living writer except Tennyson. Lennox, *Adelaide Anne Procter*, accessed.
number of years, she chose for her 1893 *Annals*, a series of her poems, “The Shrines of Mary”.\(^92\) The editor used this series of poems to preface an Italian serialised translation of a Marian theme, positioning ones at the beginning of each issue after a delicate illustration of Mary. For the ‘Young Associates of Our Lady of the Angels’ Hayes chose Procter’s long poem, “Offerings to Mary, for the Month of May” which concluded:

> Give her now - to-day - forever,  
> One great gift - the first, the best;  
> Give your heart to her, and ask her  
> How to give her all the rest?\(^93\)

The sensitive religious poem, “A Child’s Prayer”, was a translation by Mary Howitt - another ‘lost English Victorian author’ and poetess according to Joy Duncliff.\(^94\) The poem appears to have been Hayes’ tribute to this highly respected translator\(^95\) for its sentiment was in tune with the translator’s life in which she had watched most of her children die young. In the poem a mother dreams of the Christ child playing with her own child and the dream becomes a reality:

> And thus it was accomplished:  
> In a short month and a day,  
> That lovely boy, so gentle,  
> Upon his death-bed lay.  

> And thus he spoke, in dying:  
> ‘O mother dear, I see  
> The beautiful Child Jesus  
> A-coming down to me!’\(^96\)

---


\(^95\) Mary Botham Howitt (1799-1888) translated the Swedish novels of Frederica Bremer and Hans Christian Anderson’s fairy tales. The poem was published in the April volume shortly after Mary Howitt’s death.

\(^96\) Howitt, "A Child's Prayer", 108.
Hayes’ large-heartedness and convert experience made for inclusiveness as Mary Howitt and her author husband, William, followed Quakerism and spiritualism; they were known for a range of publications and produced journals including Spiritualist magazines. Like Procter whom Mary Howitt knew, she contributed at Dickens’ request to his *Household Words*. Other members of the Howitts’ social circle included Mrs. Gaskell, Tennyson, Wordsworth, Elizabeth Barrett Browning and John Keats. Hayes may have known Mary Howitt who lived with her family for many years in Rome where Mary converted to Catholicism in old age, six years before her death. While Hayes overlooked Cardinal Newman’s poetry, she included “The Epiphany” by Emily Bowles, a convert and gifted writer (1818-1904) who looked upon Newman as mentor and friend. Among her impressive literary output, Bowles wrote a life of St. Jane Frances de Chantal, translated Mrs. Augustus Craven’s long French work *The Story of a Soul*, produced a history textbook for Irish children, contributed articles to various journals including *The Lamp* and *The Month* and published a volume of poetry. The reason for Hayes’ choice is obvious because for her January issue, in keeping with the Church’s feast of Epiphany, Bowles’ poem met her criteria:

That Faith we scarce may scan,
True faith which sight outran,
And drew them o’er the lonely star-lit wild;
We see them kneeling low,
And while they worship, know
The Mother and the Son – her God and child.

---

97 The Howitts are credited with writing 180 books between them. One of the Howitts’ major works is “The Literature and Romance of Northern Europe” (London, 1852) while Mary is best remembered for the well known verse “Will you walk into my parlour said the Spider to the Fly?”.
99 To date there is no record of Hayes influencing the aged Howitt but English-speaking Catholics living in Rome carry on traditional meetings. Morton described the Howitts as industrious writers who devoted themselves to animal welfare and eucalyptus trees. H. V. Morton, *A Traveller in Rome*, 2nd ed. (London: Methuen & Co Ltd, 1959), 246.
102 Ibid., 157, 43.
103 Bowles, “The Epiphany”, 2-3. Also published, as *Three Kings*, by the *Dublin Review* in January 1874 according to Bishop Ireland’s Scrapbook. Ireland, *John Ireland Papers - Index Book (of Five Reviews) 1863-93*. 
Three extant *Annals’* poems indicate contributions by Lady Catherine Petre, who had published for the cause of God and of truth a collection of short poems, *Hymns and Verses.* Lady Petre’s verse was known for a particular sweetness and tenderness with the rhythm always correct and its metre regular as in:

```
Sweet name of Jesus: thoughts of love
Beam o’er our mortal strife;
Thou art our watch-word from above,
The solace of our life.
Let us but breathe thee to the last,
‘Till the dear voice shall call;
O death, thy bitterness is past-
Thou hast no sting at all.
```

Lady Petre’s volume was considered suited to families and religious communities so it attracted Hayes who was publishing for the religious development and entertainment of Catholic families and Franciscans. Petre’s life had involved much sorrow and her verses offered support for those carrying a cross, as in:

```
Our crosses then would never more appal-
They are so slight and small;
And we might understand the saints’ sweet cry,
‘To suffer or to die’;
And learn to watch affliction’s waves increase
With all enduring peace.
```

Aubrey de Vere, critic and essayist who published in London, was prominent as a poet among his nineteenth-century Irish contemporaries. Hayes installed de Vere as one of her major poetry contributors from 1883 to 1891 in order to enrich her

---

104 The two-part volume contained first those verses which the author wrote before her ‘conversion’, with the second part produced after that event. The collection was reviewed in a contemporary journal. W. McDonald, “Notices of Books”, *Irish Ecclesiastical Record*, October 1885, 612-13.
107 De Vere published many works, some on religious themes such as, *The Legend of St. Patrick* (1872), *St. Thomas of Canterbury* (1874), *Legends and Records of the Church and Empire* (1887) and *Legends of the Saxon Saints* (1879).
publication’s religious tone.\textsuperscript{108} Shipley, in his well known 1884 publication,\textsuperscript{109} included some of de Vere’s work but none of these were chosen by Hayes whose selection process was based mainly on the requirement for a poem that would highlight a particular Church feast or a saint’s feast-day.\textsuperscript{110} De Vere’s background prepared him well to contribute to numerous religious periodicals including the monthly \textit{Irish Ecclesiastical Review}, the \textit{Irish Monthly} and the \textit{Tablet} – all discussed earlier.\textsuperscript{111}

The editor of the \textit{Irish Ecclesiastical Record} had published de Vere’s “Sonnet on St. Peter”\textsuperscript{112} while later Hayes chose “The Feast of St. Peter’s Chains”.\textsuperscript{113} This poem, as with a number of de Vere’s poems, was honoured by Hayes with a cover page. Aubrey de Vere’s literary aim was to illustrate the supernatural and the quality of his verse was not only strong and vigorous but also musical and truly spiritual.\textsuperscript{114} In Hayes’ selection of de Vere’s poems an example of his strong and vigorous verse appears in the lines:

\begin{quote}
He willed to lack; He willed to bear;  
He willed by suffering to be schooled;  
He willed the chains of flesh to wear;  
Yet from her arms the worlds He ruled.\textsuperscript{115}
\end{quote}

The quality of de Vere’s musical and spiritual verse was exemplified in Hayes’ reprint of the lengthy “Hymn for the Feast of the Annunciation”, chosen by Hayes to celebrate the feast of Mary’s Annunciation, 25 March; this is especially seen in the verse:

\begin{quote}
\end{quote}

\begin{footnotes}
\textsuperscript{108} Thirteen of de Vere’s religious poems have been identified in the \textit{Annals} with the greatest number appearing in 1889.
\textsuperscript{109} Shipley, ed., \textit{Annus Sanctus}.
\textsuperscript{111} De Vere (1814-1902) had been a student at Dublin’s Trinity College, an admirer of Wordsworth and Coleridge, a convert influenced by Manning and Newman, and was known by the later Archbishop Vaughn. J. G. Snead-Cox, \textit{Herbert Vaughan, New Advent - Catholic Encyclopedia}, http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/15311b.htm; accessed 23 September 2003.
\end{footnotes}
Subsiding from those heavenly wings the air
Lies motionless: yet on that forehead fair
Still hangs a pearly gloom, as if the shade
Of those departing pinions
On her brow were stayed.
Still sits she on that virgin bed
From which so late she reared her head;
Forward she bends in prayer.
Her hands upon her heart are crossed;
Her heart in heavenly vision lost.
Her silver lids are closing – mark,
A tear is trembling on their lashes dark.
It falls: to earth that tear is given;
That sigh an echo finds in Heaven!116

Another contributor of special interest was the contemporary Irish writer/poet, Rosa Mulholland (Lady Gilbert) whose works became famous in secular and Catholic journals and through numerous other publications.117 Mulholland (1841-1921), under the pseudonym ‘Ruth Murray’, had her long poem ‘Irene’ accepted by Cornhill, wrote the serial, Hester’s History, for Dickens’ All Year Round and saw The Wild Birds of Killeevy first published in 1883 in the Irish Monthly. The Academy, the Spectator and other London critics warmly praised it.118 The Wild Birds of Killeevy, with its scenes of brutal evictions, was quoted in the Freeman’s Journal and cited by J. H. Murphy in Catholic Fiction and Social Reality in Ireland, 1873-1922.119

Rosa Mulholland was related to another Annals contributor, Matt Russell, Irish Jesuit priest and long-term editor of the Irish Monthly.120 Russell regarded Mulholland’s

120 Fr. Matt Russell was the brother of Sir Charles Russell, Q.C., M.P. who married Ellen Mulholland, Rosa’s sister.
lifework of writing, her apostleship of the pen, as a holy and sublime vocation.\textsuperscript{121} She was referred to as the eminent Irish litteratrice whose works are so generally read and appreciated,\textsuperscript{122} but evidence shows that Hayes included only Mulholland’s “Angels Everywhere” when she needed a poem that suited her prose theme on angels. Mulholland’s bright poem began:

There flit a myriad angels about this earth below;
And in and out our thresholds their footsteps come and go,
While in our very blindness their forms we do not know.

They sing to us in music, they smile on us in dreams -
They talk to us in echoes the worldly spirit deems
But chirruping of wood-birds and chattering of streams.\textsuperscript{123}

Katharine Tynan was a regular contributor to the contemporary Irish Franciscan Teritary, and though her love for St. Francis of Assisi was evident her name did not appear in Hayes’ Annals.\textsuperscript{124} While William B. Yeats considered two of Tynan’s poems on St. Francis among his favourites, Hayes looked elsewhere. No explanation has been found as to why Hayes omitted the notable contemporary Irish poet, Denis F. MacCarthy,\textsuperscript{125} while his fellow countryman Richard D. Williams, pseudonym ‘Shamrock’, made only one known appearance but compensation was gained by its quality and length.\textsuperscript{126} Irish antiquarian, Dr. Reeves, whose views earned much respect, made a single but significant contribution, “Rebuke to rebel Reason”.\textsuperscript{127} The ‘high authority on all matters of antiquarian investigation’ wrote:

Why this zeal to deny,

\textsuperscript{121} Russell, "Irish Monthly", iv.
\textsuperscript{123} Rosa Mulholland, "Angels Everywhere", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XV, no. i (1890): 30.
\textsuperscript{124} Katharine Tynan (1859-1931, Mrs. Hinkson) published collections of poems, over one hundred novels and five volumes of autobiography. Tynan contributed to the Irish Franciscan Teritary which in 1890 alone printed her poems “St. Francis and the Ass” and “St. Francis and the Birds”, the serialised tale “A Lost Bairn” and “Maurice and Eugenie Guerin”.
\textsuperscript{125} His poem, “For the Epiphany”, is in Shipley’s book and was chosen in 1895 by the next Annals’ editor, a fact that strengthens the idea that Hayes used this book as a source.
\textsuperscript{126} R. D. Williams, "Imitation of Dies Irae", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels XIX, no. xi (1894): 303-05. R. D. Williams, known for his promotion of Irish periodical literature, wrote devotional poetry for the Sisters of Charity as well as famous patriotic songs for his countrymen. Shipley, ed., Annuus Sanctus, 17.
\textsuperscript{127} Irish Catholic journals acknowledged his work, e.g., “Notice of Books - the Culdees of the British Isles by Dr. Reeves”, Irish Ecclesiastical Record I, no. October 1864 - September (1865): 444-49.
Honouring doubt as a faith?
Surely such scrutiny
Ferrits out nothing but death!
This is not to advance,
This is to miss the way;
This is ignorance
That buries the soul in clay.\(^{128}\)

A December Annals’ choice of John C. Earle’s poem, “Adeste Fideles”, suited the feast of Christmas.\(^{129}\) Hayes’ appreciation of the work of Earle, B.A. Oxon, echoed that of the Irish Ecclesiastical Record’s editor who praised the author’s article, “English Men of Letters”, published in the Dublin Review.\(^{130}\) Earle’s verses where printed in Shipley’s Annus Sanctus while five of his poems were published in The Oxford Book of English Mystical Verse.\(^{131}\) In the Lenten season Hayes printed Earle’s reflective “Agony of Jesus in the Garden”, which read in part:

Ah, thy tender heart perforce
Shuddered, quaked and trembled,
Feeling even then the course
Of thy pangs assembled;
All the burden of offence
On thy spirit pressing –
Who can tell what anguish hence
Every sense possessing?\(^{132}\)

Aware that the majority of Annals’ readers were American, we note that Hayes showed a clear bias towards English and Irish contributors. Hayes did not select American Christian poets who were contributing to the ‘golden age of the American magazine’. American poet, Emily Dickinson (1830-1886) for example, was just as

\(^{131}\) Nicholson and Lee, eds. The Oxford Book of English Mystical Verse, 1917. This was not the source of Hayes’ selection.
reflective in her seclusion\textsuperscript{133} as Sr. M. Josephine Brett or Mother Drane, while Whitcomb Riley wrote poetry about the Midwest with which Hayes was familiar. A prose exception was Eliza A. Starr's contributions.\textsuperscript{134} The Franciscan editor would have known that Starr befriended the Chicago Poor Clare nuns and, by her publication on their cloistered life, made these Franciscans better understood and acceptable. Starr's contribution on St. Agnes suited the editor's need, according to her pattern and aims, for a story in January when the saint's feast was celebrated. The accusation put forward by the American 'Know-nothing' Movement that non-American born religious leaders were strongly European in their thinking was accurate in regard to Hayes' choice of poetry and prose. Whatever the reason for the omission of American writers in the \textit{Annals}, it did not weaken the religious content that Hayes included in her journal nor prevent its successful propagation. Hayes' whole literary climate was more European than American; considering her life and literary background this is not surprising.

Finally, the contributors' non-competitive style in Hayes' journal, and in other religious journals, was inspirational and in keeping with their apostolate. Co-operation among the apostles of the press showed itself especially in their expressions of praise of one another's articles and literature, together with encouragement to their readers to make purchases.\textsuperscript{135} To disseminate good reading among Catholics was the desire of Hayes and her contributors. Together they opposed 'writing to writing' and helped in the mission of making a religious journal a 'powerful instrument for salvation'.

\textsuperscript{133} Mabel L Todd and T. W. Higginson, eds., \textit{Favourite Poems of Emily Dickenson} (New York: Avenel, 1978), 15.


\textsuperscript{135} "Notice of Books - the \textit{Dublin Review}: January 1882", 125.
Chapter 9

Challenges of Production and Distribution

In order to do battle with her pen through ‘the propagation of good books’ Hayes evidently weighed up the factors critical to her journal’s success. These essential factors, basically production strategies, involved reading widely, the skill of editing, availability of printing facilities in a frontier town, publication capacity with substantial financial backing, all-weather distribution plans and a targeted audience. Through consideration of these factors an analysis of her successful methods of production is undertaken here to show that Hayes was a significant contributor to Catholic journalism.

Hayes knew the importance of reading as preparation for the genre of journal she intended to publish and reading had been her delight since childhood. As we have seen, one of the texts Hayes chose to edit for her first volume was the “Life of St. Anthony” which is indicative not only of her admiration for this illustrious Franciscan saint but also of her desire to imitate Anthony’s opposition to the heresies of the times. From the outset Hayes’ monthly publication was to be a means of spreading good reading and of combatting what she understood to be the heresies of her day being propagated at the time through a deluge of anti-Christian and anti-Catholic newspapers, journals and books. Hayes responded with originality to a challenge later issued by Pope Leo XIII - ‘of this powerful engine for ruin make an equally powerful instrument for salvation’¹ - but it had to be preceded by continuous reading. Living in pioneer Minnesota and later Georgia, Hayes collected an impressive range of international material from which to select, according to her chosen criteria,² the various books, manuscripts and articles she wished to edit and publish in part or in whole.

Editing Skills

During her twenty-one years of editing material for her journal, Hayes established her main editorial offices at Belle Prairie (Minnesota), Augusta (Georgia) and in Rome’s

² As already discussed, criteria was the provision of educational and religious articles of interest to the general reader, and stories about the life and development of the Franciscans.
Trastevere. The most successful editors often modelled their publication on other journals that met a particular demand or had attracted large readership due to superior quality. There is no reason to suspect that Hayes did otherwise. Hayes had access to London’s successful models which, though not necessarily favouring Catholicism, included well-known secular journals. Often the place of publication was considered significant for nineteenth-century journals, but for Hayes, who was more focused on achieving her stated aims than on providing local stories, her place of editing and publishing was of small consequence to topics except in a few instances. However, access to Vatican and Italian materials did increase the number of articles and illustrations about Rome when Hayes published there, especially in the early 1890s.

Around the mid-1850s, when Hayes was surrounded by English journals, John Henry Newman observed that journalists ‘wrote so much and so well’, and in terms of style, he considered ‘The Times writers surpassed even Dryden and Swift’. According to Newman, if the interests of religion were to be promoted and edification was to result, then Catholic journalists needed to look first to their prose. Hayes appreciated the importance of quality prose, which included maintaining a good style and a high tone in a journal. It was Hayes’ ‘high toned and interesting’ prose, even before the first print rolled off the press, that attracted praise in the Brainerd Tribune and again after the first volume was published, when the printer ‘determined to bring it, typographically, up to the standard of its merit and high tone’.

At the beginning of her publishing career Hayes wrote many of the articles and expressed herself with flair and clarity. In addition, she edited many original articles. Her editorial approach can be seen in an article, originally by Léon de Clary, called

---

3 Sketch, indicating the exact position of the Annals’ office in the Belle Prairie Convent, before the April 1888 fire, MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 11, item 13, no. 7. ‘Augusta’ was the Barrat property, Harrisonville, in a suburb of Augusta. Trastevere’s printing address was 40 Via Garibaldi; the building still stands but as far as can be ascertained Hayes also worked at her desk in the convent nearby.


5 These instances were “A Chronicle of the Early Californian Missions”, “A Sketch of the Catholic Church in Upper California” and the serial “Alone in the Far West”, published in North America.

6 John H. Newman was aware of the costly failures of some 67 Catholic newspapers, journals and periodicals that had been launched in Britain during the first half of the nineteenth-century. Neil Byrne, “Dunne's Vision: Catholic Press Teacher of Humanity”, The Catholic Leader (Brisbane), 28 October 1992, 15.

7 Newman in Ibid.


9 Russell, “News Item”.
“Jane of Signa”,\textsuperscript{10} Hayes disapproved of the original’s long paragraphs so they were broken into shorter ones; she considered some of de Clary’s footnotes significant enough for the text and rewrote them. Hayes’ actions in this and numerous other articles indicate her confidence in editorial work. In general, Hayes showed herself to be a rigorous editor and was not prepared merely to reprint a book-chapter or another’s journal article but fashioned content in a style that met her exacting standards.

At times Hayes applied or selected the narrative style for which her friends, Fathers Hecker and Lockhart, were famous - which was to put Catholic teachings into conversational form and link them together with a narrative thread in order to produce a story. This style is similar to that adopted by the contributor Mrs. C. Vansittart and not unlike that used by Newman and other successful Catholic journalists, who applied the method of conversationally discussing a Protestant’s statement or criticism clearly used to introduce the script.\textsuperscript{11} A contemporary and regular reader of the \textit{Annals}, Bishop John Ireland, summed up Hayes’ literary skills by acknowledging her ‘talent’ and he was delighted that Hayes’ talent was used in his diocese of Minnesota.\textsuperscript{12}

As editor, Hayes was aware that all Catholic journals treating of religious or theological matters must be submitted for censorship. The official Church believed that not only was ‘bad press’ a danger to faith and morals but that it had the responsibility to ensure that all Catholic publications adhered to sound teaching, as expressed in Catholic doctrines and dogmas; hence its bishops were authorised to appoint qualified and impartial censors. Hayes’ name did not appear on the \textit{Annals}; instead each number concluded with the Church approval, ‘Cum Approbatione Auctoritatis Ecclesiasticae’.\textsuperscript{13} This censorship was required even though Hayes held an ecclesiastical Rescript, Brief and Decree approving of the \textit{Annals}’ work as a ‘Spiritual work of Mercy’ and granting the \textit{Annals}’ Confraternity of St. Anthony

\textsuperscript{10} de Clary, \textit{Franciscan Saints}, 160-64. Elizabeth Hayes, "Jane of Signa", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} XV, no. xii (1890): 349-52.

\textsuperscript{11} Owen Chadwick, \textit{Newman} (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1983), 59. Newman’s outstanding example of this approach was his \textit{Apologia Pro Vita Sua}.

\textsuperscript{12} Rev. John Ireland to Mother M. Ignatius Hayes, St. Paul, Mn., letter, 23 September 1874, MFIC archives, Rome.

\textsuperscript{13} Archival evidence shows that censors always also wrote ‘Nihil Obstat’ followed by their signature on a copy sent to them of each monthly \textit{Annals} that was then apparently returned to the editor.
canonical status. Over the years the censors’ names changed but one of special note is that of Joseph Doebbing, a highly qualified Franciscan censor, because it further underlines Hayes’ journalistic capability. Munster-born Joseph (Bernard) Doebbing (1855-1916) migrated to America from Germany during the *Kulturkampf*, was ordained and became a professor.\(^\text{14}\) He was director of the Irish College of St. Isidore in Rome when he censored Hayes' *Annals*. The fact that Doebbing in this role was delegate general, whose jurisdiction at a period extended over Capranica and St. Elia, throws light on Hayes’ letters to and from Castel St. Elia regarding her research that culminated in a pamphlet for the Friars and for *Annals*’ articles.\(^\text{15}\) These letters provide the best insight into the enormous amount of work, correspondence and translations required of Hayes to achieve accurate results when editing old manuscripts.\(^\text{16}\) Her difficulties are acknowledged in a part of Doebbing’s letter regarding proofs submitted by Hayes, which read:

> You must understand from the corrections which you may see it is deemed necessary to make, that the approval of translations from this book is a matter of no small delicacy and difficulty, because the book though containing much that is interesting and useful, is certainly a very strange book.\(^\text{17}\)

Another letter from Doebbing acknowledges Hayes’ zeal and hard work:

> I know that changes are troublesome when the work has reached a certain stage, but it has not been easy to get at the truth in regard to some matters mentioned in the first part of the little sketch, and I feel sure that your zeal will lead you to admit that this work of yours is worth doing well.\(^\text{18}\)

Time and again Hayes applied to the Vatican for its approval of new censors and papal authorities would reply saying that the undersigned authorised the named


\(^{16}\) Letters via secretaries from Franciscan ‘Convento di San Giuseppe, Castel Saint Elia’ and St. Isidore’s College to ‘Rev. Mother’, MFIC archives, Rome, section A, box 3, folder 9, no. 17.

\(^{17}\) Letter from St. Isidore’s College, 26 October 1892, signed on behalf of the ‘President’, Doebbing, by ‘Br. Nicholas OSF’. MFIC archives, Rome, section A, box 3, folder 9, no. 17.

priests ‘to re-read and sanction for publication the periodical entitled the Annals of Our Lady of the Angels’. 19

**Printing of words and illustrations**

In the fifteenth century printing was called the ‘divine art’; 20 in the next century Franciscans as far away as Mexico were committed to printing, 21 but it was through the nineteenth century’s improvements in printing and illustration techniques that the ‘divine art’ became big business. This resulted in reduced production costs and mass circulation, especially in the United States. St. Paul, the main city in Minnesota Territory, boasted of Goodhue’s Press which produced its first newspaper, the *Minnesota Pioneer* in 1849. In the 1850s Goodhue’s printers were composing lead type in a gallery while Goodhue dedicated himself to promoting Minnesota’s image, with his issues reaching major Eastern newspapers, which ensured even further circulation. 22 By coming to Minnesota Territory, Hayes was not beginning her *Annals*’ venture in a printing backwater; as already discussed, besides St. Paul, there was St. Cloud - close to where Hayes launched her 1874 mission through the medium of journalism - which had a number of printing houses.

For Hayes to have her first issue printed in January 1874, and for Mr. Russell, her printer, to be promoting her forthcoming publication in his *Brainerd* newspaper the prior December, 23 many decisions had to be completed well ahead. These decisions included layout, costs and printing matters including diversity of typefaces, paper quality, cover style, number of pages, deadlines and more. While women compositors, though few in number by comparison with men, had succeeded in some printing offices, 24 Hayes had to wait until her community expanded enough to employ young Sisters as typesetters. Meanwhile, Russell’s Brainerd establishment accomplished the printing. In the 1870s type foundries published illustrated specimen

---

19 For example, Approval of 30 January 1889, MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 14, no. 25.
21 Ibid.
books, with related costs, showing the range of typefaces from simple to ornamental and a variety of borders, corners and other stock for lead and wooden presses.\textsuperscript{25} It was in Chicago that Angela (Sr. Mary of the Angels) Chaffee learnt the printing skills that assisted Hayes to organise gradually her own printing office. Chaffee’s \textit{Memories} indicate that for a period a ‘little Pearl printing press’ was used in Belle Prairie, with Mr. Russell, their former printer in Brainerd, bringing the press monthly even in winter across the snow,\textsuperscript{26} but for the Augusta printing office better equipment was purchased in late 1878.\textsuperscript{27} However, this still meant the typesetting Sisters experienced the fatigue of standing at the case for long hours as they prepared each line of words and justified it by hand ready for the printer.\textsuperscript{28} Hayes understood the spirit of commitment needed for the Apostolate of the Press and its associated hard work of typography. In an article Hayes published her admiration for the young women, such as those of the newly founded Society of St. Paul, who sacrificed their lives for this mission.\textsuperscript{29} The few extant \textit{Annals} printed in Augusta show that Chaffee also acted as \textit{Annals’} secretary and that her work, and that of the other Sisters, was vital to the \textit{Annals}. Chaffee recalled that when Hayes was away in Rome, she was left in charge of the \textit{Annals’} work which involved:

\begin{quote}
... the arranging of the articles, proof-reading, the mailing etc. Sr. M. Agnes had charge of the composition and the binding, and Rosaline aided Frederica on the printing, also aided now and then in every department of the work. ... we were all called to Rome together... the \textit{Annals} work went on lamely ... following the counsel of the Cardinal Vicar and the Secretary of Propaganda, she (Hayes) had it transferred to Rome.\textsuperscript{30}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{25} Two such Chicago foundries were Great Western Type Foundry and Marder, Luse & Company. Books used by the Sisters were \textit{Chicago’s Great Western Type Foundry Specimen and Price List} and \textit{Specimens of Printing Type and Printers’ Purchasing Guide}. MFIC archival library, Rome.

\textsuperscript{26} Chaffee, "Memories", 26, 32.

\textsuperscript{27} Confirmed in the letters that passed between Hayes and the \textit{Ave Maria} Printing Office, MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 9, no. 16, a-g. Some Belle Prairie printing materials were transported to Augusta also. Adzire Doucette, "Memoirs of Mother M. Columba Doucette", (Privately circulated by MFIC Generalate, Rome, May 1982: written in 1950), 1.

\textsuperscript{28} This method is known as monotype. The first linotype machines were introduced in New York in 1886 but only at the century’s end was Ottmar Mergenthaler’s linotype machine invented with its automatic device. A retired Brisbane printer, R.A.Shaw, recalled learning monotype in the 1950s before proceeding to linotype, so between invention and purchase for general use, much time could elapse.

\textsuperscript{29} The three women of the Society of St. Paul mentioned were Sisters Marguerite Marie Duranteet, d. 1879; Marie Praxede Weber, d. 1884 and Catherine Pauline Sturney, d. 1884. Hayes, "The Apostolate of the Press", 164-69.
Mother M. Columba Doucette described the Rome printing office of 1885:

Mary Blais and I were employed at the composition and printing of the *Annals* while most of the other postulants were occupied at the binding, printing of addresses, etc. We were very happy together and our dear Mother Foundress did all she could to look after our comfort.  

Two years later Doucette recalled:

As soon as I was professed (13 May 1887) I was left in charge of the printing and composition of the *Annals*. Except for a couple of months spent in Assisi and about three or four months in Posillippo, Naples, I remained in Rome busy with the *Annals*. I remember going one day to Mother Foundress’ room with a proof sheet of an article …  

Illustrations and general presentation were important elements in the success of Hayes’ periodical. Hayes witnessed not only the increasing nineteenth-century use of illustrations in books and journals, but also the great appeal that illustrated articles had for readers, so she ensured that illustrations were an aesthetical component of the *Annals*. *Punch* had firmly established comic illustrations in the Victorian periodical field but, as to be expected in a religious journal, Hayes’ *Annals* were dominated by religious illustrations. The illustration had the capacity to bring an image close to the Victorian reader and, while images could be improved through the technique of lithography, wood engraving continued to dominate journal illustrations. Wood engraving contained finer detail than wood cut and had become popular for reproducing illustrations from the end of the eighteenth century.

Hayes selected, in particular, images of Christ, Mary, saints and angels. The frontispiece of the 1887 January issue was unusual with the Christ Child framed with intricate delicate figures; at the top was Christ surrounded by children, while on both sides hovered an angel and each corner was filled with a bunch of grapes (appendix

---

30 Chaffee, "Memories", 41-2.
31 Doucette, "Memoirs", 4. Doucette was 4th Superior General (1901-13); “Memoirs” end in 1913.
32 Ibid., 5. The article referred to was republished in the month Hayes died. Hayes, "Devotion to the Blessed Tongue of Saint Anthony of Padua", *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels* XIX, no. v (1894): 150.
2.1, fig. i).\textsuperscript{33} One Marian illustration (appendix 2.1, fig. ii) focused readers’ attention on “The Patronage and Cultus of the Most Blessed and Immaculate Virgin Mary”.\textsuperscript{34} The \textit{Annals}’ oldest extant frontispiece is a half-page sized illustration of ‘Saint Veronica Galiani’ and this particular mode of presentation was repeated\textsuperscript{35} (appendix 2.2, fig. i-iv). Hayes made 1886 a benchmark for illustrations by increasing the number and variety. An innovative example is a portrayal of St. Francis on Mt. Alvernia incorporating the saint’s love of creation, by setting the crucifix in a leaf background (appendix 2.3, fig. i).\textsuperscript{36} A lace-like border around a picture of St. Joseph reproduced the delicate frame formerly used for ‘St. Elizabeth of Hungary’ (appendix 2.3, fig. ii).\textsuperscript{37}

Among the various illustrations of St. Anthony of Padua, three in particular are worthy of comment. Positioned in the article, “St. Anthony’s Tuesday”, was ‘Vera Effigie di St Antonio di Padova’, a full-length illustration of St. Anthony reclining. Under it was printed in Italian and in English, ‘True likeness of St. Anthony which is venerated in Arcella under the Altar where the Saint expired in the year 1231’\textsuperscript{38} (appendix 2.4, fig. i). Another picture (appendix 2.4, fig. ii) also entitled ‘True Likeness of St. Anthony of Padua’, is explained by Hayes’ caption:

A copy of the true likeness of St. Anthony of Padua, which through the kindness of His Grace the Archbishop of Spoleto has been taken for the Association of St. Anthony, from the original fresco, preserved in the Palace della Genga in Spoleto. This fresco was brought from Padua to Spoleto in the year 1232, on the occasion of the Saint’s Canonization, and presented by the Delegates of the citizens of Padua, to the then reigning Pontiff Pope Gregory IX residing at that

\textsuperscript{33} ‘Jesus advanced in wisdom and age, and grace before God and men’, \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels}, XII, no. i (1887).

\textsuperscript{34} ‘The Patronage and Cultus of the Most Blessed and Immaculate Virgin Mary’, \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels}, XV, no. xii (1890): 361. The tiny signature on the inner image is ‘Deberny’, an artist whose work reappears in the \textit{Annals}.


\textsuperscript{37} Frontispieces: ‘St. Joseph’, \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels}, XV, no. iii, (1890). ‘St. Elizabeth of Hungary’, \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels}, XI, no. i (1886). Repeated use of blocks indicates they were stored at Hayes’ Roman printing office and re-used years later.

\textsuperscript{38} ‘Vera Effigie di St Antonio di Padova’, \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels}, XV, no. xi (1890): 321.
Hayes’ admiration for this painting, copied for the Association of St. Anthony, is significant for it is recorded in the Association’s Statutes that Hayes valued the importance of religious illustrations. Under ‘Means’ for Statute 2, Hayes wrote, ‘To print and publish good books, and pious pictures: to propagate Catholic literature …’ The Statutes of the Association, later Confraternity, became slightly changed but the ‘propagation of pious pictures’ was retained. When Hayes directed a separate printing of the Statutes, the picture of St. Anthony was prominent.

The picture of St. Anthony with the Mother and Child encircled with the words ‘Societas S. Antonii de Padua’ (appendix 2.4, fig. iii) appeared regularly because it introduced the “Intentions for St. Anthony’s Association”, followed by the “Obituary”. The “Obituary”, often introduced by the picture of a decorated cross, commenced with:

The prayers of the Clients of St. Anthony of Padua are requested for the repose of the Souls of the following Associates deceased.

Besides images, landscapes were popular also in many nineteenth-century illustrated magazines. Hayes chose vistas of churches, chapels, and places of retreat or of religious significance. Frontispiece full-page vistas appeared from the 1886 October issue introducing a delicate series on Roman buildings and churches beginning with ‘The Basilica of S. Peter and the Castle of S. Angelo, in Rome, as taken from a

---


41 ‘The object of this publication (Annals) is threefold: (a) to aid in the printing and propagation of good books and pious pictures …’ in a 5-page article on “Confraternity of St. Anthony of Padua”, n.d., MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 14.

42 Besides a reprint in the 1893 and 1894 *Annals*, the Statutes in a 12-page pamphlet included the *Annals’* print of the ‘True Likeness of St. Anthony of Padua’. ‘St. Anthony’s Press near San Pietro in Montorio Rome’ published the pamphlet, containing the Rescript, Decree and Brief originally printed in the *Annals*. ‘Near San Pietro in Montorio’ served as address for Hayes’ two establishments, printing office and convent.

43 Next were printed names, age, date and place of death with many North American towns and cities figuring prominently. The “Obituary” was printed bimonthly - appearing six times a year.
distance’, to be followed by others. The 1890 issues strongly favoured landscapes of Rome with seven different scenes framed in identical artistic style frontispieces. This impressive style is illustrated by ‘Piazza Navona and the Church of St. Agnes, Virgin and Martyr, Rome’ (appendix 2.5). Hayes’ original aim, to entertain the Franciscan reader as well as the general public, was reflected in this selection of 1890s frontispieces, for, besides the scenic public places, she included four Franciscan frontispieces. ‘The Sanctuary of the Portiuncula, in Basilica of St. Mary of Angels, Assisi’, is shown in appendix 2.6. These Franciscan illustrations were chosen to match the month in which the saints’ feasts were celebrated. ‘La Sainte Baume, St. Mary Magdalene’s Retreat’ was a full-page image that illustrated Montgomery’s French pilgrimage article of the same title.

A selection of smaller religious illustrations (appendix 2.7), like most others carrying no signature, were used creatively, such as on an issue’s title page, for an appropriate theme or to fill a spare space on a page so that a major article could begin on a new page. A set with various Marian images was used regularly and often for an issue’s title page (appendix 2.8). The Annals regularly used attractive ornamental initials for the first letter of the word at the commencement of poems or special articles. Hayes’ favourite one encased the delicate form of an angel within the ornate letter. Another method used to make the journal pleasing to the reader’s eye was the regular use of dainty borders and frames. The Sister-printer’s skill in linking fancy corners to one another by differently shaped line-work to form a frame became


45 While all 1890s issues and most 1891s commenced with a full-page frontispiece illustration, it was not until the following year that the word, ‘Illustration’ with its title, appeared in the ‘Contents’ list.

46 The 1890s Roman series in volume XV consisted of ‘Piazza Navona and the Church of St. Agnes, Virgin and Martyr, Rome’ (Jan.); ‘The Fountain of Trevi, Rome’ (Feb.); ‘Fontana Paolina, Rome’ (April); ‘The Capitol with a distant view of Church of St. Maria in Ara-Caeli, Rome’ (May); ‘Arch of Titus, Rome’ (July); ‘Piazza di Spagna and Church of the Trinita de Monti, Rome’ (Sept.); ‘One of the Fountains before St. Peter’s Basilica, Rome’ (Dec.).

47 The Franciscan illustrations: ‘St. Anthony of Padua: The Miracle of the Most Blessed Sacrament’ (June); ‘The Sanctuary of the Portiuncula, in Basilica of St Mary of Angels, Assisi’ (Aug.); ‘St. Francis of Assisi giving the Holy Habit to St. Clare’ (Oct.); ‘St. Elizabeth of Hungary’ (Nov.). Another full-page Franciscan illustration is included in the middle of “St. Anthony’s Tuesday”, Annals of Our Lady of the Angels, XV, no. xi (1890): 321.


49 The selection of smaller religious illustrations include: a trumpeting angel in an intricate decorative pattern (one of a series), the combination of Passion symbols (crown, cross and lance; inter-woven also into the 1884 cover), two angels worshiping the Eucharist, Mary framed in a decorative gateway and children with a guardian angel.
more and more evident over the years. Hayes’ Annals always adopted an undivided page layout and never, like some journals, presented its contents in columns.\(^{50}\)

Hayes’ use of illustrations grew as the years passed so that gradually a variety of religious and other suitable subjects were depicted through line drawings and half tones of different shapes and sizes in each month’s issue. This growth reflected the particular woodblock and type-foundry business with which Hayes dealt. It was a business that possessed picture and type libraries from which buyers could select, and so Hayes had increasing access to the kind of illustrations she required to match her text. Growth in the number and quality of the illustrations also reflects Hayes’ growing ability to defray the purchasing costs of wood blocks and fonts. The Annals’ cover, like most other contemporary Franciscan journals, featured a printed illustration of the Franciscan coat of arms, yet Hayes chose her own distinctive style (appendix 2.9).\(^{51}\) The Annals’ cover remained much the same in the years up to 1884 but by then illustrations needed to improve to keep abreast of other Franciscan journal covers, for example, the Irish Franciscan Tertiary (appendix 2.10, fig. ii).\(^{52}\)

For her signed illustrations, Hayes ignored line drawings and half tones of famous English artists and chose repeatedly the work of French-born Alexander Deberny (1809-1881) of Paris. While artists had depicted saints’ lives for centuries, it was Deberny’s St. Francis, St. Clare and St. Anthony that adorned the Annals. Deberny’s work, ‘St. Francis of Assisi’, showing the traditional Franciscan habit and cord, stigmata and halo of sainthood, appears in a number of issues. The illustration of St. Clare is a rare one in Franciscan literature while Deberny’s St. Anthony had to compete with numerous other more popular images (appendix 2.11). Deberny’s symbolic depictions for Mary, the Eucharist and the papacy were finely detailed and appealing while his delicate floral settings graced many pages, (appendix 2.12).

---

\(^{50}\) Woods’ religious journals of 1867-72 always had two columns. Woods, The Southern Cross and South Australian Catholic Herald, Adelaide, Sept. 20, 1867 to Aug. 20, 1869; The Chaplet and Advocate of the Children of Mary, Adelaide, May 1, 1870 to Mar. 1871; The Chaplet and Southern Cross: Advocate of the Children of Mary, Adelaide, April 29, 1871 to July 27, 1872. Among other contemporary examples, The Builder favoured three columns while the Ave Maria two.

\(^{51}\) Annales Franciscaines (appendix 2.10, fig. i), Annali Francescani and L’eco di S. Francesco D’Assisi displayed the Franciscan coat of arms in slightly different illustrative styles. This simple cover style, minus the Franciscan coat of arms, had been popularised by many contemporary secular journals, e.g., The Builder, Strand Magazine and the Gentleman’s Magazine and Historical Review. North (ed.), The Waterloo Directory of English Newspapers and Periodicals 1800-1900, accessed.

Deberny’s daintily etched nativity scene with its reverent angels was applied by Hayes to illustrate two poems, “The Christmas Moon”, and later “The Nativity” (appendix 2.13, fig. i). By comparison, the contemporary English Franciscan Annals contain far fewer illustrations yet they produced a larger remarkable nativity scene by the artist, W. T. Beane Piux. Procter’s poem, “The Angel of Prayers”, was illustrated by Deberny’s image of an agile angel carrying a large fish (appendix 2.13, fig. ii).

Two contrasting Assumption illustrations, in the same 1894 Annals issue, are a line-drawing frontispiece, ‘The Glorious Assumption of Our Blessed Lady’, and Spagna’s illustration of Mary’s Assumption that introduces the article “St. Anthony Defender of the Assumption of Our Lady” (appendix 2.14). Other extant Annals’ illustrations that bear signatures include three religious pictures - a monstrance surrounded by angels and signed F. Simon S., an angel in knight’s armour watching at a bedside by L.B., and a Papal Coat of Arms signed B.L. Hayes’ commitment to religious illustrations in her journal with their related costs and work contrasts with the boast of the Franciscan Annals’ editor who wrote in 1893 that the friars aimed to make their publication ‘the cheapest of magazines’. The meaningful illustrations in Hayes’ Annals set the publication apart, provided added pleasure to the reader and dignity to the religious content. Hayes, through her arduous search for appealing illustrations, lived out the words of another pioneer who said, ‘I am ready to … wear out my head for the Apostolate of the Press’. The successful publishing of the Annals by Hayes and her ‘Members of the Third Order Regular of Saint Francis of Assisi’, as the covers acknowledged, was a source of admiration to others. St. Paul’s bishop

54 ‘The Inauguration of the Devotion to the Crib by St. Francis of Assisi, at Midnight, December, 24, 1224’. Franciscan Annals V, no. 60 (1881): 334. The woodcutter provided only his initials, F.B.
believed the *Annals*’ work would be repaid with fruitful results while Savannah’s bishop recommended the *Annals* to all in his diocese, describing them as interesting, well written and ‘replete with useful and edifying information’.

Publishing – including finance

Hayes had a recipe for success when so many other secular and religious journals failed. Besides Hayes’ ability as a talented prose writer and the commitment of the members of her institute to this apostolate, examination suggests that the combination of three key elements contributed especially to her successful publishing. Many Victorian periodicals that failed did so because of financial difficulties; it was vital to have financial stability. Hayes, from the beginning of her enterprise, had the support of her very wealthy friend, the Hon. Mrs. Fanny Montgomery who aided Hayes financially from their days together in France. In Montgomery’s obituary she is described as ‘a most devoted Benefactress of the Association of S. Anthony’ which implied ‘pecuniary aid’. A printing enterprise also needed to exhibit prudence in its expenditures, to gain regular income, and to ensure profit, and the *Annals*’ publishers achieved this. The survival of Hayes’ institute, which depended so much on the *Annals*’ income, was proof of this financial success. Many contemporary journals contained advertisements in order to gain income that would supplement subscriptions and balance the expenses but the only advertisement ever printed in the *Annals* was one for itself which, with slightly varied format, appeared irregularly. As *Annals*’ secretary for much of the period under discussion, Sr. Chaffee’s involvement was a key factor in financial matters.

Regularity was considered another key element in successful publishing. Chaffee confirms Hayes’ regularity in the early days, including always being on time with her material for printing:

---

60 Bishop Thomas L. Grace, St. Paul, letter to Mother M. Ignatius Hayes, 29 August 1879, MFIC archives, Rome.
61 Bishop William Gross, Savanna, Georgia, letters to Mother M. Ignatius Hayes, 16 September and 10 December 1879, MFIC archives, Rome.
63 Chaffee’s support of Hayes was especially evident when Hayes’ health was frail during three periods, in 1886, in 1889 (Hayes ill in Naples) and just before her death; Chaffee carried on and the *Annals* in no way suffered. Another Sister filled the breach when Chaffee was absent visiting the USA in late 1889. de Brefhny, *Unless the Seed Die*, 179, 204-05.
It is worthy of note also that our Mother furnished Mr. Russell of Brainerd with material for publishing in the *Annals of Our Lady of the Angels*, from Rome and her other stopping places, during all the months of her absence; which was a source of wonder and admiration to Bishop Grace. Such was her industry and intellectual capacity.\(^{64}\)

Another aspect of regularity meant delivering to readers what they had learned to expect in a publication. Hayes, by her faithfulness to her aims, determined a level of expectation to which she measured up continually.

Archival materials in particular are proof of Hayes’ communication skills in regard to her publication.\(^{65}\) Chaffee in her memories highlights the earliest letters about the *Annals* from Bishop Thomas Grace.\(^{66}\) In replying to Hayes, Bishop Rupert Seidenbush communicated his approval and recommendations through numerous letters and not only for publishing the *Annals* in English but also in French and German.\(^{67}\) There in no other reference to the fact, or proof, that French and German companion issues existed. Franciscans from Teutopolis in Illinois to Calvary in Wisconsin, together with correspondents from Washington and New York, rejoiced over the *Annals* in their communications with Hayes.\(^{68}\) Archival packets of letters, cards and permissions provide some indication of the communication that was expected of Hayes in regard to every aspect of publishing. A series of incoming letters from the *Ave Maria* printing office at Notre Dame, Indiana, provide an insight into the bulk of information requested by Hayes when she planned purchasing a new press for Augusta, along with paper, ink and other printing necessities, from southern companies.\(^{69}\) Hayes over the years had a reputation for communicating face to face about her *Annals* and took advantage of railroad travel to visit and converse, for instance, going to the Santa Barbara Mission in 1873, Notre Dame (Indiana) in 1878 and when passing through New York a number of times.

---

\(^{64}\) Chaffee, "Memories", 30.
\(^{65}\) Documents, letters and papers relating to the *Annals* up to 6 May 1894 are housed in the MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 9.
\(^{66}\) Chaffee, "Memories", 25.
\(^{67}\) MFIC archives, Rome, section A, Folder 9, nos 4, 5, 9, 10 and 11.
\(^{68}\) MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 9, nos 8, 15, 12, and 14.
\(^{69}\) MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 9, no. 16, series a-g of Clarke’s letters.
Other important communications successfully engaged in by Hayes were petitions to the pope for approval of *Annals*’ censors,\(^{70}\) while intimately associated with the *Annals* work were the communications related to the Association (Confraternity) of St. Anthony of Padua. Hayes made the final decision about the amount of associates’ correspondence to be included in the regular articles, “Intentions for St. Anthony’s Association” and the “Obituary”.\(^{71}\)

**Distribution**

The *Annals*’ distribution with its emphasis on personal delivery by Zelatrices, supported by rail and sea transport, contributed highly to its success and fruitfulness. Such a service was not trouble-free as Mother Doucette recalled about New York in 1884:

> We had some sort of an office there for the *Annals* which were sent from Rome in large sacks. The Zelatrices (as the Sisters on the *Annals* apostolate were called) often had one kind of difficulty or another with the post office officials so their presence was needed to settle these problems.\(^{72}\)

From the outset, Hayes knew that her method of distribution would depend significantly on railroads and so ‘Brainerd on the Northern Pacific Railroad’ was her first choice as the town from which circulation would commence.\(^{73}\) During Hayes’ life, laws were passed providing inexpensive mailing rates for periodical literature, so she took advantage of this and mail orders were encouraged through her Brainerd post office box number.\(^{74}\) Not only was the journal destined for distribution in the USA as requests from overseas were welcome.\(^{75}\) According to Chaffee, who was one of the first Zelatrices chosen in 1878, the *Annals* was first propagated through ‘a lady’ who travelled for subscriptions and gained the first sixty.\(^{76}\) Gradually circulation became

---

\(^{70}\) For example, a request for Franciscans - Fr. Bernard the lector of sacred theology at St. Isidore College and Fr. Pietro Battista at San Pietro in Montorio - to be censors of the English *Annals* and of other Italian publications respectively. MFIC archives, Rome, section A, folder 9, no 17.

\(^{71}\) The inclusion of associates’ requests for prayers, for particular intentions or the deceased, was not unique to Hayes’ *Annals*, e.g., the contemporary *Ave Maria* did much the same through their ‘Association of Our Lady of the Sacred Heart’. A. Granger, "The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels", *Ave Maria* XIV, no. 23 (1878): 370.

\(^{72}\) Doucette, "Memoirs", 3.

\(^{73}\) The *Saint Paul Northwestern Chronicle* on August 1, 1874, p. 5. col. 1.

\(^{74}\) Hayes’ post office address was provided initially in *The Brainerd Tribune* of 27 December 1873.


\(^{76}\) Chaffee, "Memories", 26.
largest in North American cities such as New York and Philadelphia, then Boston and later Chicago. These were the cities in particular where the Zelatrices walked from home to home to gain subscriptions and then returned with the Annals. By 1890 eight full-time Zelatrices were working in the USA and this number alone indicates how Hayes’ Apostolate of the Press had flourished.

The distribution of the Annals, the collection of the Annals’ subscription, and the general work of the Zelatrices were interwoven. Hayes described her organisation of the Zelatrices’ work:

Zelatrices are those who, being so authorized by the head of the Direction, cooperate in the propagation of good books, labour to increase the number of new Associates, and collect and send into the office of the Association the subscriptions and offerings of the Associates.

The words, ‘being so authorized by the head of the Direction’, were vital since begging was prohibited and so Hayes had to ensure that her Sister Zelatrices had her authorization to distribute and personally collect money for the Annals. In 1881 Hayes obtained a Letter of Approbation for the Zelatrices and in 1886, Chaffee explained that Hayes:

… obtained a special rescript of the Sovereign Pontiff, acknowledging the work of the Association as a SPIRITUAL WORK OF MERCY, and afterwards an Apostolic Brief, raising it to the rank of a Confraternity.

---

77 The name of New York City was repeated countless times in the Annals’ obituaries over the years.
78 The number of eight Zelatrices was stated in a letter from the Little Falls Sisters to Cardinal Simeoni. Ahles, In the Shadow of His Wings, 159.
79 More on the work of the Zelatrices is found in chapter 9 of de Breffny, Unless the Seed Die, 171-233.
81 The Third Plenary Council at Baltimore in 1884 prohibited begging in any diocese without express authority of the bishop. For some clergy, Sisters and potential customers the distinction between collecting money as payment for the Annals and collecting money for charities (begging) was blurred at times.
82 Chaffee, "In Memoriam", 146-47. As early as 1882 Hayes was at pains to have her journal seen as one that was ‘honoured with the Blessing and Commendation of Our Holy Father Leo XIII and encouraged by several Archbishops and Bishops … and with the approbation of the Right Rev. Bishop of the Diocese’. Hayes, "The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels", Annals of Our Lady of the Angels VII, no. xii (1882): 366.
A copy of the Rescript was published in Hayes’ fuller article on the Association, sub-headed, ‘Rescript from the Holy Audience of July 31\textsuperscript{st} 1886’, and should have been understood by all bishops. It stated:

Our Most Holy Lord Pope Leo XIII having listened to the relation of the undersigned Cardinal Vicar, graciously acceded to the prayer of the petitioner, that the Work of printing and propagating good books for the purpose of instruction in those things which lead to the acquisition of eternal life, shall be regarded as a true Work of Mercy, which, the other conditions not wanting, will be followed by the promise of Eternal Beatitude. (Signed) L. M. Card. Vicar.\textsuperscript{83}

The Sister Zelatrices knew that they, as well as editor, compositors, printers and other workers, co-operated as Franciscans in a ministry that reached out to people through the journal and in this fulfilled a Christian work. By propagating the Annals, which meant tramping the streets in all kinds of weather, and by lodging with people away from their community, Zelatrices were Apostles of the Press. A 2001 interview with a retired Zelatrix revealed that those who visited homes of Annals’ recipients extended care and compassion to those they met besides delivering the journal. Zelatrices, also called ‘Advocates’ or ‘Sister Promoters’, knew that their unique role in the organisational structure was different from that of the Associates and the Benefactors. ‘Associates are those who have their names and surnames inscribed upon the Register of the Association and contribute towards its object’, while ‘Benefactors are those who in a more special manner give their protection and personal influence to this holy work and who also strengthen it with pecuniary aid.’ \textsuperscript{84}

The Zelatrices’ method of collection included recording in their accounts the amount of money received, then showing the deduction of their small weekly living expenses and finally sending the remaining amount to Hayes’ office. This collection system, with Sisters working in pairs, differed from that of other contemporary organisations; for example, Pauline Jaricot for the Propagation of the Faith introduced a pyramid collection system with a widely branched well-organised network.\textsuperscript{85} When the first journals were sold the subscription price was $2.00 annually for the 12 monthly

\textsuperscript{83} Hayes, “Association of St. Anthony of Padua”, 352.
\textsuperscript{84} Ibid.: 350.
issues per year, $5.00 for three annual subscriptions to one address, $10.00 for six such subscriptions, while single numbers cost 20 cents each. At the time of issue of the third volume, when the publishing in Belle Prairie became ‘exclusively the work of the Sisters themselves’, the subscription price was announced as $1.25. During the years the printing office was in Harrisonville (Augusta), Chaffee recalled that, ‘Our Annals subscriptions increased to upwards of 10,000’. The terms of subscription were then described as:

Post-free; $1.25 a year, in advance. Clubs of five to one address, $5.25; Clubs of ten ditto, $10.00. All who desire to subscribe are requested to forward their names and addresses with the amount of subscription, to the Secretary. Money may be sent either in Registered Letter or by Post-Office Order.

In 1881 the income from the Annals subscriptions more than doubled from the previous year, from $4087 to $9047. Growth in the numbers of young women joining Hayes meant a significant increase in the number of helpers for the Apostolate of the Press. Regarding 1887, Doucette wrote:

We were sixteen for Profession which number included the six novices who were clothed in April 1885. The older of the newly professed sisters were sent out as Zelatrices for the Annals, the subscriptions for which were rapidly increasing.

When Ahles examined some extant and incomplete archival account sheets, she concluded that the Annals’ income was significant, presumably including profit, and for 1887 she calculated an income of around $10,135. In 1888 and again in 1893, the Rome printing office published the yearly subscription, including postage, for the

---

88 Chaffee, "Memories", 35. Ahles in her analysis found it difficult to acknowledge the 10,000 figure because she thought that it was not until the transfer of the printing office to Rome that numbers reached this height and higher. However Ahles admitted archival evidence was lacking to refute Chaffee’s claims. Ahles, In the Shadow of His Wings, 156.
90 de Breffny, Unless the Seed Die, 169.
91 Doucette, “Memoirs”, 5.
92 Ahles, In the Shadow of His Wings, 157.
United States, as $1.25 in advance, with European subscriptions set at five shillings.\textsuperscript{93}

Even though Hayes obtained her Letter of Approbation for the Zelatrices in 1881, her fears over misunderstandings about distribution and collection were justified for it became a controversial issue. Later, some Zelatrices were disturbed when they encountered bishops who either misinterpreted or were unaware of the Letter of Approbation.\textsuperscript{94} Confusion increased when the Sisters from the Little Falls diocesan group convinced them that they did not have the necessary Church approval for their \textit{Annals} work and that they were free of their obedience to Hayes. Chaffee recorded that at this time another motivation was driving the Minnesota group, namely their desire for ‘the separation of the American houses from the Roman’.\textsuperscript{95} Perceptions and motivations were complex for those involved, resulting in seven Zelatrices joining the Little Falls group and thus lost from the \textit{Annals} ministry in 1890. This created serious repercussions, including the dramatic drop in the 1891 \textit{Annals} income, when receipts fell from $15,000 to $4,000.\textsuperscript{96} However, through Hayes’ tireless leadership, Sr. M. Anna Flannery with a new group of Zelatrices returned to the USA in January 1891;\textsuperscript{97} they overcome many and varied obstacles, resulting in the recovery of the \textit{Annals} circulation. Somewhat reminiscent of Hayes’ distribution of Oxford Movement Tracts with Puseyite women, Hayes’ method of \textit{Annals}’ distribution by women was successful. Through the subscriptions collected by the Sister Zelatrices, Hayes’ institute was able to support itself, but more importantly, Hayes continued to contribute to the mission of the Catholic Press.

\textbf{Readers}

Readers associated with Hayes’ \textit{Annals} were called subscribers, associates, clients and members, and they appear to reflect the nineteen-century readers who preferred to read periodicals to books in the ratio of ten to one.\textsuperscript{98} Hayes often used the term, ‘dear reader,’ thus giving the subscriber the feeling of being personally addressed.

\textsuperscript{93} Hayes, "The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels", \textit{Annals of Our Lady of the Angels} XIII, no. xii (1888): 386. It cannot be fully substantiated, but some time after 1888 at the Via Nicola Fabrizi office, it seems that a member’s subscription was $2.00 annually.

\textsuperscript{94} de Breffny, \textit{Unless the Seed Die}, 218.

\textsuperscript{95} Chaffee, "Memories", 57.

\textsuperscript{96} de Breffny, \textit{Unless the Seed Die}, 224-25.

\textsuperscript{97} Sr. M. Anna Flannery, an Irish woman, was the only Zelatrix from the previous group working in N. America who returned to Rome as directed by Hayes during the crisis and she set out again to make a fresh start.
with a message from the editor. When Hayes commenced her journal she stated clearly that she was writing for the ‘general reader’ and for Franciscan readers. Along with contemporary editors of Franciscan journals, Hayes believed that the Franciscans should provide quality journalism for the Third Order readers but she ventured a step further by also publishing for a wider audience. This approach meant that the Annals readers came from a larger clientele and it guaranteed greater potential for success among readers with an appetite for Catholic journalism. As time went by and the association/confraternity for the ‘propagation of good books’ was formalised through papal approval, her twin aims remained the same, namely that everyone who became a subscriber became an associate as well.

While nineteen-century journal analysts write of ‘targeted’ or ‘common’ readers, analysis here suggests that Hayes had a somewhat different approach. She wanted everyone to find God, to be a saint, as one early companion said, so she wrote for inquiring readers who desired material that would enrich their spiritual life, strengthen their Catholic faith and bring them closer to God. More than this, because every Catholic journal claimed to address this search, the number of Annals’ readers was directly related to the subscribers’ desire to share in the spiritual life of Hayes’ Franciscan Sisters and other Franciscan communities. As Hayes explained:

The Subscribers to the Annals, share in the spiritual advantages accorded to the Association of St. Anthony of Padua, under the Protection of the Immaculate Conception, Queen of the Angels, for the Publication and Propagation of Good Books, to which our Holy Father Pope Leo XIII, has granted His special Approbation. The Holy Sacrifice of the Mass is celebrated daily for the Associates, and on Saturday during the Adoration of the Most Blessed Sacrament in honour of the Immaculate Conception, prayers are offered for the same intention. They also participate in the Masses, Prayers and good works of numerous Communities of the Franciscan Order in Europe and America.99

Hayes related to her readers, as titles of articles and readers’ correspondence indicate, for instance, “To the Clients of St. Anthony” and “Thanksgiving and Obituary”; also the Annals’ created space for readers to feel personally involved

through correspondence. Readers, and at times contributors, felt integrally related to and associated with the Franciscan Sisters and their ministry. While some subscribers were religious or clerics, most were in secular employment or caring for families at home. The laity apparently valued their association with the Franciscans. How Fanny Montgomery felt part of the Sisters’ life and ministry is recorded thus:

Three young girls, full of ardour, full of the talents required specially for missionary work in a new country, ingenuous, active, brightly pious, as the children of St. Francis always must be, were professed on the first of this month of May. And there lay before me the letter assuring me beforehand how much I, and those I love, would be in their thoughts and prayers on that happy occasion.¹⁰⁰

Hayes related to her readers also through her hard-working Sister Zelatrices, who knew her personally, had been attracted by her and looked on her as a mother.¹⁰¹ Besides the assurance of prayers through Zelatrices, one advertisement informed readers that their intentions would be remembered in the sacred places of Assisi, Padua and Rome:

The subscribers to the Annals, in addition to pleasant and profitable reading, share in the spiritual advantages … The Holy Sacrifice of the Mass is celebrated for their intention every week within the Sacred Chapel of the Porziuncula in St. Mary of the Angels, Assisi; at the Shrine of St. Anthony in Padua; and in the Franciscan Chapel of the Immaculate Conception in Rome.¹⁰²

Hayes promoted her Annals by providing content that suited the readers’ spiritual needs. Franciscan Catholic readers desired to be prayed for, to join others in prayer and to hear God’s voice through spiritual reading. Vaughn’s article confirmed for readers that spiritual reading was equivalent to listening to God and that reading,

¹⁰¹ Letters of farewell from Zelatrices who joined the Minnesota diocesan community, including the seven previously mentioned, attest to this genuine love for Hayes, as in, ‘Never, never could I forget you very Revd. Mother because I have received too many graces through your favour and I thank you for all the bounty you have had for me …’ de Breffny, Unless the Seed Die, 220.
combined with talking to God, was essentially prayer. Hayes ensured that Vaughn’s article concluded with her own journalistic aspirations:

"We ought frequently to read good books, such as the Holy Gospel, the lives of the Saints, and other spiritual works, which nourish our faith and piety, and arm us against the false maxims of the world."\(^{103}\)

Many nineteenth-century readers, surrounded by a sea of journals, newspapers and books, experienced the need for concise good reading matter and lower-waged readers could stretch their budget only so far. Hayes’ publication met these criteria and also provided readers with a record of current Catholic thought as well as Catholic views for non-Catholic inquirers. The Annals also measured up to another desire of the Victorian reader, to access material of a topical nature. One way Hayes achieved this was in her many articles on the progress of new missions, particularly Franciscan ones, in America, in the United Kingdom and foreign lands. Finally and most significantly, Annals’ subscribers were more than readers with needs; they collaborated in a seven-hundred year old Franciscan way of life with its rich history, traditions, missions and Franciscan spirituality. This was the cornerstone of the ultimate success of Hayes’ mission through journalism.

\(^{102}\) Hayes, "The Annals of Our Lady of the Angels", 366. From 8 December 1888 subscribers knew that in Rome their Confraternity was ‘seated’ in the ‘Church of the Blessed and Immaculate Virgin Mary Queen of the Angels’, in the Franciscan Sisters’ Convent of ‘Villa Spada’ on the Janiculum Hill.

\(^{103}\) Vaughn, "What Are Spiritual Reading Books", 21.
Conclusion

While ‘the best documented life remains a mystery’,¹ it is hoped that this investigation of the *Annals* of Elizabeth Hayes has decreased some of the mystery surrounding her. In particular, it focusses on two crucial dimensions: one, her previously little known mission in Catholic journalism through her monthly *Annals*, and two, the career of a nineteenth-century religious woman of courage, conviction and determination. My investigation hoped to discover why Hayes acted in a different way from the majority of women religious, by committing herself to a mission in journalism, when religious Sisters of hundreds of other congregations were focused on education and nursing. It became clear that Hayes embarked on an editing-publishing career in an ambiguous cultural context for women writers, demonstrating that she was strongly and absolutely committed to the Apostolate of the Press. Hayes responded to external factors that were active in nineteenth-century society and made a significant literary contribution because of this. Knowing that she had the literary talents and aptitude for bringing to birth the world’s first Franciscan journal in English, she set out bravely to achieve her goals and was successful in a challenging profession.

Women journalists and editors have a rich history and the thesis shows dimensions of Hayes that have so long been hidden from view. Through an examination of Hayes’ foundational years, the thesis argues that she was well grounded for the literary challenge she set herself. Love of reading accompanied Hayes throughout her life and, with the assistance of different circles of literary friends, she was always surrounded by good literature. Having internalised what she read, Hayes then spread the essence of her reading through her *Annals*, motivated by her ‘propagation of good books’.

Hayes’ *Annals* have been situated here firstly amid contemporary secular journalism to show that their reason for coming into existence was determined by her perception of the power for good or evil in periodical literature. Hayes recognised the power of the press: for what the journals and newspapers printed was fast becoming the

---

¹ Concluding words on Charles Dicken’s life and work, an Australian Broadcasting Commission four-part television programme, screened in Brisbane on 1 June 2003.
people’s creed. In Hayes’ mind, the best way to counteract pernicious literature was to provide a wholesome alternative and she determined to be a propagator. The missionary spirit of Hayes and her helpers is summed up in Marguerite Durantet’s words in Hayes’ article:

“What happiness is ours! Of our own free-will we have chosen to sacrifice ourselves … to work for the restoration of the kingdom of Christ by means of the Press, in a Work which has no other ambition than to lead souls to Truth.”

Today people witness the impact of contemporary journalism and its relation to the wider processes of change. This appears comparable to Hayes’ recognition of the signs of her times when she responded through a journal, a sub-genre of periodical literature. As more nineteenth-century journals are being found in dusty archives, encouraged over the years by the efforts of researchers like Altick, Van and VanArsdel, Houghton, Altholz and North, Hayes’ Annals can now be included among them. The words of Saintsbury, at the end of the nineteenth century, acknowledging the ‘Age of the Periodical’ ring even clearer now:

Perhaps there is no single feature of the English literary history of the nineteenth century, not even the enormous popularisation and multiplication of the novel, which is so distinctive and characteristic as the development in it of periodical literature.

This inquiry has situated Hayes’ Annals in contemporary religious journalism in the countries where she lived and toiled, namely England, France, the United States of America and Italy. Analysis of non-Catholic as well as Catholic journals has coalesced to highlight the significance of Hayes’ contribution which was situated in a period of time when religious leaders of different creeds encouraged the faithful to take up the pen and fight for Christian principles and values. For Hayes to have lived at a time when the pope was himself committed to and outspoken about

---

Franciscanism, proved a bonus for one wanting to share her own Franciscan experiential insights. The situating of Hayes’ *Annals* in the arena of nineteenth-century Franciscan journals for the first time, as in this thesis, opens up the possibility of increased exploration in this area for research among Franciscan scholars.

The thesis also shows that Hayes joined in the risky business of women who put their lives on a journal’s page to claim the importance of a lived experience. For Hayes, it was the experience of being ‘a Catholic, a religious, a Franciscan’ so Franciscan ideals, spirituality, history and mission news were high on her *Annals*’ agenda as she presented the big picture to her readers. In examining Hayes’ contribution to Catholic journals, it has been possible to lift a veil of obscurity and allow her to take her place as successful editor and publisher. Through this study of Catholic journals, new light has been thrown on the network of Hayes’ international interests, concerns and communications. Her selection of Catholic articles reveals Hayes’ dedication to finding and publishing the truth, some even reflecting an element of sacrifice, for cost what it might, she and her readers were to be ‘on God’s side always’. Through the necessary research and building of an interim nineteenth-century Franciscan Journal Directory, as in chapter 5 of this thesis, Hayes has emerged not only as the first person to publish a Franciscan journal in English but also as the first Franciscan woman editor and publisher of a religious journal.

Through her commitment to the Apostolate of the Press, Hayes added her zeal to that of others who earnestly waged a war against what they believed were the evils of the Press in their time. Hayes chose her *Annals*’ content for both the general reader and for Franciscans; for the former it has been discovered that she provided original tales, historical and biographical sketches and the lives of saints and contemporary holy people. This exploration reveals that Hayes’ readers appreciated accounts of pilgrimages, stories of missionary enterprise and articles on devotions and general Catholic life. The investigation has resurrected the *Annals*’ thematic content that engaged the Franciscan readers. This revolved around the major Franciscan saints, especially Francis, Clare and Anthony, and around traditional Franciscan literature, stories and devotions.

---

5 Hayes, "Diary", 3.
From obscurity, sometimes through just a person’s initials, this inquiry has given flesh and character to a list of contributors who initially appeared lost in time but who now can again speak to readers with words of wisdom and stir their hearts. The forgotten poetry of a Dublin Poor Clare or the freshness of Fanny Montgomery’s prose are examples of contributors’ work that Hayes called forth for her publication and that now have seen a new daylight. Be the contributors women religious, clergymen, members of the secular Third Order Franciscans or other committed laity, the investigation has found that Hayes could collect their contributions, edit them well and disseminate the resulting literature to her many readers on both sides of the Atlantic.

Hayes understood that her first responsibility as a baptised Christian was to spread the name and reign of Christ more widely every day, and this she achieved through her publication. Hayes used the power of the periodical press for mission, for evangelization, for the building up of the reign of God on earth. Hopefully, this investigation has counterbalanced earlier biographers’ references to the Annals as being merely an instrument for raising funds without sufficient attention to the primary reason for production, namely adult faith education and the enjoyment of reading good literature. When so many other journals failed or became ephemeral, evidence has shown that Hayes’ successful strategies comprised the Annals’ high quality, the regularity of the publication and the distribution method involving the Zelatrices. Circulation of Hayes’ publication through her Sisters, it was found, was crucial to ensuring that countless homes welcomed the Annals.

This study has shown that Hayes’ project was enormous for it embraced not just reading widely, extensive correspondence and editing but also the responsibility for overseeing production and distribution. Hayes achieved her twin aims of providing literature of interest to the general reader and of presenting the Franciscan Order’s progress and development. Hayes emerges as an insightful and intelligent woman who clung to her belief in the Annals’ power for good, despite the painstaking work it demanded. Through this investigation, the unpublished writing of Mother Chaffee,

---

who deeply admired Hayes, has been employed to grasp better the *Annals*’ story and its influence.

By the comparative research into contemporary journals which this study has entailed, not only has Hayes’ success been enhanced but also new scholarship on nineteenth-century periodicals has been opened up and presented. This first in-depth investigation of Hayes’ *Annals* contributes to the growing scholarship on outstanding Victorian women, especially those now forgotten for their contribution to the periodical literature component of journalism so popular at the time. Hayes’ application to research, her literary talents and her capacity for work become obvious, yet her pen recorded that journalism alone would not overcome evil. Instead Hayes believed that journalism could facilitate God’s reign only when accompanied by the spirit of love, prayer and service.\(^7\) In Hayes, one has discovered not only a competent religious woman but also a true Apostle of the Press who achieved her evangelising mission through journalism.

Finally, the editor herself: Hayes alone was the initiator of her project. It has been a concern of feminist historians, who are writing women back into history, to discover women like Hayes who held their own in a man’s world. Hayes appears to have had enough confidence in herself to assume confidence as an equal when dealing with leading male figures of her time. She won the respect and admiration of her colleagues. Many great women lived in the aura of a particular eminent man; Hayes’ life gives no evidence of this.

As revealed through this search, the personality of Hayes is that of an intelligent, informed and confident woman, her own woman, who negotiated her own reconciling path. Swayed neither toward over-conservatism nor liberalism, like a bee collecting the best nectar for the hive, she knew the purpose of her mission in journalism and remained steadfast. The extent of the challenge she offered could even prove too much for some, unable to share her wider vision. Passionate, talented, self-contained and focused on her objectives - enough to frighten some who lacked her integrity when hard work and courage were necessary - she balanced her approach to others with consideration, cooperation and spiritual support. Hayes was a woman who had

\(^7\) Hayes, "The Apostolate of the Press", 76.
the capacity to elicit great loyalty in the public sphere as well as among her Sisters. This study serves to demonstrate a Franciscan woman infinitely more interesting than the nineteenth-century dominant stereotype of woman as subservient, male-dependant and debarred from the public sphere and to reveal Hayes’ fascinating personality - which to some in the past has appeared enigmatic - in a fuller, brighter and more accurate light.